2016-07-27

Ocean acidification affects fish spawning but not paternity at CO2 seeps

Milazzo, M

http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/5379

Ocean acidification affects fish spawning but not paternity at CO₂ seeps

Marco Milazzo[1,*], Carlo Cattano[1], Suzanne H. Alonzo[2], Andrew Foggo[3], Michele Gristina[4], Riccardo Rodolfo-Metalpa[5], Mauro Sinopoli[6], Davide Spatafora[1], Kelly A. Stiver[7], Jason M. Hall-Spencer[3,8]

[1] Department of Earth and Marine Sciences (DiSTeM), CoNISMa, University of Palermo, Palermo, Italy.

[2] PBSci-Ecology & Evolutionary Biology Department, Institute of Marine Sciences, University of California Santa Cruz, CA, USA.

[3] Marine Biology and Ecology Research Centre, School of Marine Science & Engineering, Plymouth University, UK.

[4] CNR-IAMC, Mazara del Vallo (TP), Italy.

[5] Institut de Recherche pour le Développement, UMR 250 ENTROPIE, Nouméa, New Caledonia.

[6] Institute for Environmental Protection and Research (ISPRA), Palermo, Italy.

[7] Psychology Department, Southern Connecticut State University, New Haven, CT, USA.

[8] International Educational and Research Laboratory Program, Shimoda Marine Research Center, University of Tsukuba, 5-10-1 Shimoda, Shizuoka 415-0025, Japan

1

28   **Abstract**

29   *Fish exhibit impaired sensory function and altered behaviour at levels of ocean acidification*

30   *expected to occur due to anthropogenic carbon dioxide emissions this century. We provide the first*

31   *evidence of the effects of ocean acidification on reproductive behaviour of fish in the wild. Satellite*

32   *and sneaker male ocellated wrasse (Symphodus ocellatus) compete to fertilize eggs guarded by*

33   *dominant nesting males. Key mating behaviours like dominant male courtship and nest defence did*

34   *not differ between sites with ambient versus elevated CO_2 concentrations. Dominant males did,*

35   *however, experience significantly lower rates of pair spawning at elevated CO_2 levels. Despite the*

36   *higher risk of sperm competition found at elevated CO_2, we also found a trend of lower satellite*

37   *and sneaker male paternity at elevated CO_2. Given the importance of fish for food security and*

38   *ecosystem stability, this study highlights the need for targeted research into the effects of rising*

39   *CO_2 levels on patterns of reproduction in wild fish.*

40

41   **Introduction**

42   Ongoing ocean acidification is an inevitable consequence of continued atmospheric CO_2

43   emissions and is expected to have profound effects on marine biodiversity and ecosystem function

44   [1]. Coping with the physiological stress of ocean acidification has metabolic costs that can impair

45   reproduction in a range of marine organisms, including fish [2,3]. Elevated CO_2 also causes striking

46   behavioural and sensory disruptions in fish, involving loss of lateralization and of learning ability,

47   reversal of olfactory and auditory functions, and impaired decision-making [4-8]. This

48   neurosensory impairment may have consequences on marine communities as increased levels of

49   CO_2 can cause juvenile fish to be attracted by predator odors they would normally avoid [5] or by

50   sounds of unfavorable habitats for settlement [7]. These effects can be rapidly reversed by

51   reducing GABA-A receptor activity [8], highlighting a link between increasing seawater CO_2 levels

52   and brain function in fish [9].

53   Successful reproduction will be essential for the persistence of marine populations as seawater

54   CO_2 levels continue to rise [10]. When cinnamon anemone fish (*Amphiprion melanopus)* parents

55   are exposed to high-CO_2 conditions their offspring do not show behavioural impairment, however

56   their potential for behavioural acclimation across generations is not fully restored, as in many

57   instances their escape performance is negatively affected [11]. Similarly, other studies showed

58   minimal potential for transgenerational acclimation in the tropical damselfish *Acanthochromis*

2

59　*polyacanthus* [12] and in several other tropical fish chronically exposed to elevated CO_2 at volcanic

60　seeps [13]. In aquaria, simulated ocean acidification increases the reproductive output of females

61　(e.g., egg production) in some fish [2,14] but not others [15]. Intense sperm competition has

62　resulted in male behavioural adaptations that may be affected by rising CO_2 levels. At present,

63　mating system structure and reproductive behaviour are critically understudied in relation to the

64　effects of high CO_2 on fish and other marine organisms [16]. Given the complex sexual behaviour

65　of many fish in the wild, there are concerns that mating behaviour and reproductive success might

66　be affected by ongoing rising CO_2 levels. The present study is the first to investigate this issue in

67　fish exposed to high CO_2 levels in their natural habitat.

68　　We used a gradient in CO_2 near volcanic seeps off Vulcano Island (Italy) [17] to examine mating

69　behaviour and fertilization success of the ocellated wrasse *S. ocellatus* (figure 1). Ocellated wrasse

70　'dominant males' build nests and provide parental care to eggs, attract females for pair spawning,

71　chase off sexual competitors ('satellite' and 'sneaker' males) [18], and sometimes refuse to mate

72　when other males are prevalent [19]. Satellite males cooperate with dominant males to attract

73　females and drive away sneakers, but they also engage in sneak fertilization of the eggs [20,21].

74　Sneaker males, which release more sperm per spawn than dominant nesting males or satellites, do

75　not cooperate or care and only attempt to sneak spawn [19]. Thus high levels of sperm

76　competition occur in the wild [20]. We filmed multiple wrasse nests at present-day Ambient-CO_2

77　conditions (~400 µatm pCO_2) and High-CO_2 conditions (~1100 µatm pCO_2) [22] (Electronic

78　Supplementary table S1), recording the number of male competitors and females visiting each

79　nest (i.e. nest composition), assessing dominant males courtship, nest defense against male

80　competitors and spawning disruptions. We counted the number of pair-spawns (involving one

81　dominant male with a female) and sneak-spawns (involving accessory males). To assess male

82　fertilization success we genotyped fin clips and embryos from nests exposed to Ambient and High-

83　CO_2 levels for paternity tests. Finally, to examine potential population differences in fish response

84　we compared nest composition, mating behaviour, and spawning at nesting sites exposed to

85　present-day Ambient-CO_2 conditions at Vulcano Island with those at Cala Isola, more than 150 km

86　away (see Methods).

87　　Given that ocean acidification may affect reproduction, cause sensorial disruptions and impair

88　decision-making in fish, our hypotheses were that elevated CO_2 levels would affect ocellated

89　wrasse reproductive behaviour, reducing dominant male pair spawns and their fertilization

90　success due to increased sperm competition by accessory males.

3

91

Methods

93 **Carbonate chemistry at study sites.** Seawater carbonate chemistry was characterized daily on

94 several visits at two nesting sites off Vulcano Island in 2012 (n=11) and 2013 (n=12) and at Cala

95 Isola in 2012 (n=14) (see Electronic Supplementary table S1 for details).

96 A 556 MPS YSI (Yellow Springs, USA) multiparametric probe was used to measure salinity and pH

97 and temperature (°C). The sensor was calibrated using NBS scale standard buffers and then soaked

98 in seawater for one hour. For each site, average pH was calculated from hydrogen ion

99 concentrations before reconverting back to pH values. Water samples for total alkalinity (TA) were

100 filtered through 0.2μm pore size filters, poisoned with 0.05 ml of 50% $HgCl_2$ to avoid biological

101 alteration, and then stored in the dark at 4° C. Three replicates were analyzed at 25° C using a

102 titration system (Mettler Toledo, Inc.). The pH was measured at 0.02 ml increments of 0.1 N HCl.

103 Total alkalinity was calculated from the Gran function applied to pH variations from 4.2 to 3.0,

104 from the slope of the curve HCl volume versus pH. Total alkalinity measurements were corrected

105 using standards provided by A.G. Dickson (batch 99 and 102). The pCO$_2$ levels were calculated

106 from pH$_{NBS}$, TA, temperature and salinity with the free-access CO_2 SYS package [23], using the

107 constants of Roy et al. [24] and Dickson [25].

108

109 **Study species and mating behaviour.** *Symphodus ocellatus* is a widespread wrasse in the rocky

110 subtidal of the Mediterranean Sea with an annual breeding season lasting from late April to July

111 [18,26]. Spawning occurs in the nest and involves small females (35-75 mm, Total Length) and

112 three alternative male reproductive types that compete to fertilize the eggs [27]. Fertilization is

113 external. Large, dominant males (81-95 mm, TL) [26] build nests with pieces of algae [28], court

114 females, and provide parental care ensuring oxygenation of the eggs by fanning, and actively

115 defending the nest from egg predators and other competing males. Females are non-territorial

116 and often swim in small groups with other females, do not participate in nest-building or parental

117 care, and during the spawning phase of a nesting cycle they visit several nests to lay a portion of

118 their eggs by brushing their genital papillae against algae. Smaller breeding males, called sneakers

119 (35-60 mm, TL), hover around various nests and try to join the female and dominant male during

120 spawning. Medium sized satellite males (61-80 mm, TL), cooperate with dominant males to reduce

121 sneaker male spawning and they also help court females and sneak spawn, getting a share of

paternity in the nest as a result [21,27]. Throughout the breeding season, each dominant male completes several nesting cycles (each of which involves nest construction, spawning and parental care) [18], lasting on average 8-10 days [26]. Females prefer nests where other females are present or have recently spawned (i.e., mate-choice coping) [29], and with fewer sneakers present [30].

Study sites, behavioural and statistical analyses. On 8-12 May 2012 and 7-12 June 2013, we observed fish reproductive behaviour at two sites off Vulcano Island (NE Sicily, Italy), where ocellated wrasse nests were exposed to present-day seawater pCO_2 conditions and those predicted by the end of this century (High-CO_2 38°25.184'N, 14°57.696'E; Ambient-CO_2 38°25.248'N, 14°57.8533'E) (Electronic Supplementary table S1). The High CO_2 and the Ambient CO_2 nesting sites were at ~450 m and ~800 m distance from the main seeping area, respectively. On 16-20 May 2012, an additional nesting site exposed to ambient CO_2 at Cala Isola (38°12.341'N 13°15.490'E; NW Sicily, Italy), 150 km from Vulcano Island, was investigated to assess inter-population differences in mating behaviour under present-day pCO_2 conditions.

Nests of *S. ocellatus* were randomly selected among those in the spawning phase (which occur over 3-4 days) of the nest cycle and filmed in Ambient (n=14) and High-CO_2 (n=18) conditions off Vulcano and in ambient conditions at Cala Isola (n=10). The same nest (and dominant male) was filmed only once, with observations typically occurring on the same days for both Ambient and High CO_2 nests along the Vulcano gradient. The 42 total behavioural observations were collected on different dives over the study period (16 days). All the nests considered were at 3-4 m depth in rocky habitat covered by brown macroalgae. Our behavioural analyses took place when light intensity and spawning activity were highest (i.e., from 10.00 to 16.00 hour). Water visibility (always exceeding 10-15 m) and tidal ranges (between 20 and 40 cm) were similar in the two nesting sites along the gradient off Vulcano island and in the additional nesting site exposed to ambient CO_2 at Cala Isola. Each nest was filmed for 10 minutes using a GoPro 3.0 camera placed on a tripod 1 m away from the nest. Five nests and dominant males from each nesting site at Vulcano Island were marked for subsequent genetic analyses (see below). Details on the standard length, weight, and age (from otoliths) of five dominant males belonging to nests exposed to high CO_2 conditions and of eight dominant nesting males from Ambient CO_2 nests are reported in the Electronic Supplementary table S2.

153   To assess the 'nest composition' we subdivided each 10-min video into 15-sec. frames. For

154   each frame we recorded both the maximum number (MaxN) of females, sneakers and satellites

155   and the total number (TN) of females and sneakers participating in reproduction or visiting within

156   1 m of the nest. MaxN is a conservative estimate to avoid repeated measurements of the same

157   individual, by recording the maximum number of individuals appearing at the same time in a single

158   frame. TotN is a cumulative estimate of all individuals recorded within each frame in a 10-min

159   video. In this case the same individual could be repeatedly counted. TotN was not assessed for the

160   satellite males, as these were the same within a single video and therefore expressed as MaxN

161   only. For each nest we recorded the number of spawns by females 10 min^{-1}, the percent of time

162   the dominant nesting male spent courting females 10 min^{-1}, the number of times the dominant

163   male chased sneakers 10 min^{-1}, and the number of dominant male spawn disruption 10 min^{-1}.

164   Exploratory data analysis following Zuur et al. [31] revealed issues of heteroscedasticity of

165   variances, structuring of residuals and/or limited ranges of data values in many of the planned

166   analyses. Analytical models were therefore selected on a test by test basis using inspection of

167   residuals and, where applicable, AIC values as criteria. To control the type I error rate attendant

168   with the number of tests involved in the study, planned contrasts of intercept coefficients were

169   used to compare factor levels where pairwise testing was required, and when appropriate the

170   robustness of influence from marginal p values ($0.01 < p < 0.05$) was confirmed by bootstrapping

171   confidence intervals. All tests were conducted using R ver. 3.2.1 [32].

172   Differences in the number of accessory males (MaxN and TotN sneakers; MaxN satellites) and

173   the number of females (MaxN and TotN females) between the two nesting sites (High CO_2 and

174   Ambient CO_2) and between the two different ambient conditions populations were modelled by

175   generalised least squares (GLS) fitting using maximum likelihood. The same approach was used to

176   test effects of nesting site (fixed factor: High CO_2 and Ambient CO_2) and satellite males (fixed

177   factor: satellites present or absent) upon the number of spawns by females 10 min^{-1}, the

178   proportion of male time spent in courtship and the number of chases performed. In all cases F-

179   tests with Type III sums of squares were used to generate p values for main effects and

180   interactions. The number of dominant nesting male spawning disruptions was only exceptionally

181   greater than one, and was therefore analysed as a binary response by binomial family GLM with

182   chi-squared likelihood ratio tests used to generate p values.

183   We also recorded the number of spawns involving one dominant male with a female (pair

184   spawns), and the spawns involving both dominant and accessory males (sneak spawns). GLS by

185   maximum likelihood was again used to determine whether the number of spawns differed

186   between types (pair and sneak), nesting sites (Ambient and High CO_2) and nests with or without

187   satellites.

188

189   **Genetic analyses and paternity assignments.** For paternity analyses, we focused on the

190   developmental stage most likely to be from the same day as the behavioural observation. Since

191   spawning tends to occur over a few days (3-4 d) and it takes 3-5 days for eggs to hatch [26]

192   depending on seawater temperature, we expected larvae to hatch at the recorded temperature

193   value about 80 hours after spawning. Therefore, we waited 2.5 days (about 60 hours) to sample

194   nests, fertilised eggs and marked dominant males and used only larvae with pigmented eyes

195   (which usually form around 60 hours after fertilization) for subsequent genetic analyses.

196   Specifically, five of the dominant males that had been observed from each nesting site were

197   captured by SCUBA diving. Fin clips were collected and fin fragments were preserved in 80%

198   ethanol for later paternity analyses. Nests were also collected to allow a comparison of the

199   number and size of eggs laid between the two nesting sites (n=200). Individual egg surface (mm^2)

200   was measured using digital photography and the open access software ImageJ was used to

201   estimate diameter to the nearest 0.01 mm. Wilcoxon rank sum tests (with continuity correction in

202   the case of egg surface area) were used to determine whether the number of eggs and their

203   surface area differed between the two nesting sites (High CO_2 and Ambient CO_2).

204   A sub-sample of embryos developed to the pigmented eye stage (n=60) was collected from

205   each nest, preserved in 80% ethanol and sent to University of Arizona Genetics Core (Tucson, USA)

206   for genotyping. DNA from 10 dominant nesting males and 585 eggs from 10 nests (n=5 at Ambient

207   and n=5 at High CO_2 conditions) was extracted using magnetic bead mediated robotic extraction

208   (Verde Labs Genomic DNA Extraction Chemistry on a Biosprint96 Extraction Robot). All samples

209   were amplified using six microsatellite loci developed for *S. ocellatus* (Soc1017, Soc1063, Soc1109,

210   Soc1198, Soc3121, Soc3200), and previously used for paternity assignment in this species [20].

211   Primer lengths were modified to allow all six loci to be used in combination in a single PCR

212   reaction. DNA was amplified using a DNA Engine Tetrad® 2 Thermal Cycler from Biorad set at the

213   following parameters: 94°C (120s); 15 cycles of 94°C (30s), 60-54°C (30s, 60°C on first cycle,

214   decreasing by 0.5°C for each subsequent cycle), 72°C (90s); 23 cycles of 94°C (30s), 54°C (30s), 72°C

215   (90s); 72°C (10 minutes). PCR product was run for fragment analysis on an Applied Biosystem 3730

216   DNA Analyzer, visualized and scored using the standard protocol for Genemarker software from

217 Softgenetics using a newly created bin-set. Peaks were then evaluated and scored visually by two

218 observers blind to sample identity. Paternity was assigned to eggs based on strict exclusion; eggs

219 that had at least one mismatch to the putative father were left unassigned to maintain a

220 conservative estimate of the fertilization success of dominant males (see Alonzo & Heckman [20]

221 for a comparison of different parentage assignment methods using these loci in *S. ocellatus*). Eggs

222 were included in the analysis only if they could be compared to the putative father at three or

223 more loci (N = 505 of 585 eggs were included in the final analysis; 62 were excluded due to low

224 levels of DNA extracted and poor amplification, and 18 because they could not be compared to

225 the putative father at three or more loci). We first analysed the paternity data (e.g. the number of

226 eggs assigned to the nesting male versus not assigned to the nesting male) using a logistic

227 regression fit by maximum likelihood with nest as a random effect due to significant

228 overdispersion of the data [33] and CO_2 condition (Ambient versus High) treated as a fixed effect

229 (using glmer from the lme4 package in R) [32,34]. Given the small sample size (n=5 nests per

230 condition), to reduce the possibility of a type I error, we also fit the model using a bootstrap

231 method following Warton & Hui [33].

232

233 **Results**

234 **Nest composition, nest attractiveness and egg characteristics at different CO_2 levels.** The

235 maximum number (MaxN) of satellites, sneakers and females visiting the nests at Vulcano Island

236 showed no differences between nesting sites exposed to different CO_2 levels (table 1; Electronic

237 Supplementary figure S1a). Similarly, the total number (TotN) of sneakers and the total number of

238 females recorded in 10-min videos did not differ between nests exposed to end-of-century and

239 ambient CO_2 (table 1; Electronic Supplementary figure S1b). Female spawning rate was also

240 unaffected by CO_2 levels (Electronic Supplementary figure S2 and table S3). Thus there were no

241 differences in nest attractiveness to ocellated wrasse females under different CO_2 levels (table 1;

242 Electronic Supplementary figure S2, Electronic Supplementary table S3). No differences in any of

243 these variables were recorded at nesting sites exposed to present-day Ambient-CO_2 conditions at

244 Vulcano Island with those at Cala Isola (Electronic Supplementary table S4). Also, there were no

245 differences in the size or number of eggs laid between nesting sites (Table 1; Electronic

246 Supplementary figure S3 and figure S4), as the Ambient-CO_2 nests had an average of 17833 (±3275,

247 S.E., n= 5) eggs and the High-CO_2 nests had 18621 (±3156, S.E., n= 5) eggs.

248

Behavioural interactions of the dominant nesting male. The percent time that dominant males spent courting females did not differ significantly between High-CO_2 (15.8% ±2.1; S.E., n= 18) and Ambient sites (21.1% ±3.3; S.E., n= 14, table 1; figure 2a). The number of times that dominant males behaved aggressively towards accessory males was also similar between nesting sites (table 1; figure 2b) with 12.6 (±3.9 S.E., n= 12) versus 16.6 (±3.1 S.E., n= 7) chasing events 10 min^{-1} at High-CO_2 compared with Ambient-CO_2 nests respectively. The disruption of dominant male spawning did not differ significantly between nesting sites (table 1; Electronic Supplementary figure S5). Similarly, no population differences in the mating behaviour of the dominant males were recorded between nests exposed to present-day Ambient-CO_2 conditions at Vulcano Island and Cala Isola (table 1).

Mating competition and dominant male paternity. Along the Vulcano CO_2 gradient, we found that the number of pair spawns (a spawning event involving only a female and a dominant male) were significantly lower at High-CO_2 (SpxSI interaction term, Table 1; figure 3; Electronic Supplementary table S5), whilst sneak spawns (a spawning event involving both dominant and accessory males) did not differ significantly between sites (SpxSI interaction, table 1; figure 3; Electronic Supplementary table S5). Spawning by satellite males accounted for the 12.5% and 17% of the total sneak spawns in the High-CO_2 (n=56) and the Ambient (n=47) nesting sites respectively, with the remainder involving sneaker males. There were no differences in the number of pair versus sneak spawns at High CO_2 nests (Contrast: pair = sneak, P =0.777; Electronic Supplementary table S5), while – as expected based on earlier studies of this species [20] – the number of pair spawns was higher than that of sneak spawns in the Ambient nests (contrast: pair > sneak, P =0.002; Electronic Supplementary Table S5) (figure 3). Such differences in pair and sneak spawning were not recorded between nests exposed to Ambient-CO_2 levels at Vulcano Island and Cala Isola (Electronic Supplementary table S4).

Genetic analyses revealed that all of the dominant males experienced extra-pair paternity; they sired 58.2% of the embryos (39.6-80.0%; n = 5) at High CO_2 nests, and 38.3% of the embryos (19.6-50.9%; n = 5) at nests exposed to ambient conditions (Electronic Supplementary figure S6). The logistic regression fit using maximum likelihood to predict the probability an egg is sired by the nesting male found a significant effect of nest condition on nesting male paternity (z value -2.248, P= 0.0245). However the pattern of increased siring success of the dominant males at higher CO_2

280 levels was not statistically significant after using a bootstrapping method to address the potential

281 for Type I errors, given the small sample size (bootstrap P value = 0.07).

282

283 **Discussion**

284   Here we show that dominant nesting males had approximately one third the number of pair

285 spawns at nests exposed to elevated CO_2 compared with nests at ambient CO_2 levels,

286 demonstrating a clear effect of rising CO_2 on the ocellated wrasse reproductive behaviour.

287 However, other dominant males' behaviours like female courtship and nest defence from intra-

288 specific (i.e., inter-male) competition were unaffected under elevated CO_2 conditions. Although

289 ocean acidification increased the risk of sperm competition in the ocellated wrasse, sneaker males

290 were unable to benefit from impaired dominant male mating as revealed by paternity tests,

291 indicating that there was probably no net loss of reproductive success for dominant nesting males.

292   Investigations into the effects of rising CO_2 effects on fish reproduction are in their infancy; the

293 few studies to date showed mixed responses when simulating ocean acidification in aquaria

294 [2,14,15]. Laboratory studies of the effects of rising pCO_2 levels in aquaria are augmented with

295 work at natural analogues for ocean acidification as they improve ecological realism, although it is

296 more difficult to determine dose-response relationships than in experiments that control

297 variations in carbonate chemistry and great care is needed to consider the possible effects of

298 confounding factors [35]. We used sites that were as similar as possible chemically (e.g. salinity,

299 alkalinity) and physically (substratum, wave exposure, currents, light levels, tidal range, depth,

300 temperature) with the one key difference being pCO_2 levels; as such this is the first study to

301 document effects of ocean acidification on fish mating behaviour in the wild.

302   We found no differences in nest attractiveness to females at different CO_2 levels [36]. Female

303 *Symphodus ocellatus* base their spawning decisions primarily on the absence of sneakers at the

304 nest, high mating activity and the mate choice of other females [36], rather than on dominant

305 male phenotype (size and colour patterns) or behaviour (ability in nest defence from intra-specific

306 competitors or courtship) [20,36]. A high number of females at a nest can in turn make it more

307 attractive to sneakers, therefore increasing the risk of sperm competition and affecting the

308 reproductive success of the dominant male [36]. We found no differences in the size or number of

309 eggs laid between nesting sites. Laboratory work on the reproductive performance of the

310 cinnamon anemone fish revealed increased egg production at elevated CO_2 – which is thought to

311 be due to stimulation of the hypothalamo-pituitary-gonadal (HPG) axis [3] – with no differences in

312   egg size at ambient (420 µatm) and end-of-century CO_2 (1032 µatm) levels, but a significant

313   decrease in egg size at moderate CO_2 (584 µatm) level, suggesting a CO_2 dose dependent

314   investment strategy of females [2]. The effect appears to be species-specific, since, as in our study,

315   in the three-spined stickleback *Gasterosteus aculeatus* egg size did not differ when exposed to

316   ambient and end-of-century CO_2 levels [14].

317   Dominant males were actively engaged in female courtship and in aggression against the

318   sneakers and satellite males at both nesting sites, however we found that the levels of seawater

319   pCO_2 expected by the end of this century did not significantly affect these dominant male

320   behaviours, which are key in ensuring its spawning success [18]. Occasionally dominant male

321   spawning was disrupted when a sneaker male caused the female to leave a nest without laying

322   eggs, and sometimes accessory males were successful in spawning alone with a female. However

323   the frequency of spawning disruptions of the dominant male did not differ between nesting sites.

324   In laboratory tests, four-day exposure to elevated CO_2 can affect both juvenile and adult fish

325   behaviour [4,16,37] and field work off Papua New Guinea has shown that chronic ocean

326   acidification disrupts the behaviour of sedentary fish at CO_2 seeps, such as those that hide in

327   anemones or coral colonies [13]. As reported in studies elsewhere, we observed that dominant

328   nesting male ocellated wrasse stayed within a small home range (10s of meters) and attended

329   individual nests for periods of 8-10 days [18] during the breeding season. Females – often

330   travelling in small groups – and sneaker males were more mobile (100s of meters). Thus the

331   dominant males near to CO_2 seeps experienced chronic exposure to ocean acidification whereas

332   more mobile males and females will have experienced acute effects. High CO_2 levels affect

333   behavioural lateralization, visual assessment and cognition in several fish species [8,9,37-39].

334   Work on escape behaviour has shown that ocean acidification affects decision-making time [8,9]

335   when fish try to escape predation [38]. Therefore, neuro-sensory impairment may be important

336   when dominant male ocellated wrasse have to make a quick decision about either to spawn or to

337   chase away sexual competitors, since these behaviours are key in ensuring the fertilization success

338   of dominant males [18]. Consistently, dominant nesting males had lower pair spawns at nests

339   exposed to elevated than ambient CO_2 levels, but sneak spawning was not affected. Although

340   ocellated wrasse sneaker males have a higher gonadal investment and release more sperm per

341   spawn than dominant or satellites males [19], genetic analyses revealed a trend towards increased

342   dominant male paternity at elevated CO_2 levels. The fact that a near significant trend was detected

343   for increased dominant male paternity at the high CO_2, despite the low numbers of nests available

344 for study, suggests that there may be an important biological effect in evidence. Given the

345 previously observed variation among nests in both sperm competition and dominant nesting male

346 paternity [20], it is possible that larger sample sizes would pin down these differences in

347 reproductive success. In addition, it is also plausible that ocean acidification differentially affects

348 sperm mobility in the three types of male wrasse; a number of studies have shown that ocean

349 acidification affects sperm in some invertebrates [40,41] although no impact has yet been found in

350 fish [42].

351

352 In summary, our observations are the first to document effects of rising seawater CO_2

353 concentrations on the sexual behaviour of fish in the wild. We expected that increased sperm

354 competition due to ocean acidification would reduce dominant male reproductive success.

355 However, genetic paternity tests showed a 20% increase in their paternity at high CO_2 sites,

356 suggesting that sneaker and satellite mates were at a disadvantage. These results raise questions

357 around potential effects of increasing CO_2 levels on gametogenesis and sperm competition, on

358 embryonic development and on survival of different males' descendants. Work on the effects of

359 ocean acidification on the reproductive fitness of marine fish must be a priority given their

360 importance for ecosystem stability and for food security and livelihoods in coastal communities.

361

362 **References**

363 1. Wittmann AC, Portner H-O. 2013 Sensitivities of extant animal taxa to ocean acidification. *Nat.*
364 *Clim. Change* **3**, 995–1001.

365 2. Miller GM, Watson S-A, McCormick MI, Munday PL. 2013 Increased CO_2 stimulates
366 reproduction in a coral reef fish. *Glob. Change Biol.* **19**(10), 3037–3045.

367 3. Heuer RM, Grosell M. 2014 Physiological impacts of elevated carbon dioxide and ocean
368 acidification on fish. *Am. J. Physiol. Regul. Integr. Comp. Physiol.* **307**, 1061–1084.

369 4. Munday PL, Dixson DL, Donelson JM, Jones GP, Pratchett MS, Devitsina GV, Døving KB. 2009
370 Ocean acidification impairs olfactory discrimination and homing ability of a marine fish. *Proc.*
371 *Natl. Acad. Sci. USA* **106**, 1848–1852.

372 5. Munday PL, Dixson DL, McCormick MI, Meekan M, Ferrari MC, Chivers DP. 2010
373 Replenishment of fish populations is threatened by ocean acidification. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*
374 *USA* **107**, 12930–12934.

375 6. Dixson DL, Munday PL, Jones GP. 2010 Ocean acidification disrupts the innate ability of fish to
376 detect predator olfactory cues. *Ecol. Lett.* **13**, 68–75.

377   7. Simpson SD, Munday PL, Wittenrich ML, Manassa R, Dixson DL, Gagliano M, Yan HY. 2011
378   Ocean acidification erodes crucial auditory behaviour in a marine fish. *Biol. Lett.* **7**, 917–920
379   (2011).

380   8. Domenici P, Allan BJM, McCormick MI, Munday PL. 2012 Elevated carbon dioxide affects
381   behavioural lateralization in a coral reef fish. *Biol*. *Lett*. **8**, 78–81.

382   9. Nilsson GE, Dixson DL, Domenici P, McCormick MI, Sørensen C, Watson SA, Munday PL 2012
383   Near-future carbon dioxide levels alter fish behaviour by interfering with neurotransmitter
384   function. *Nature Clim. Change* **2**, 201–204.

385   10. Sunday JM, Calosi P, Dupont S, Munday PL, Stillman JH, Reusch TBH. 2014 Evolution in an
386   acidifying ocean. *Trends Ecol*. *Evol*. **29**(2), 117–125.

387   11. Allan BJM, Miller GM, McCormick MI, Domenici P, Munday PL. 2014 Parental effects improve
388   escape performance of juvenile reef fish in a high-CO_2 world. *Proc. R. Soc. B.* **281**, 20132179.

389   12. Welch MJ, Watson S-A, Welsh JQ, McCormick MI, Munday PL. 2014 Effects of elevated CO_2 on
390   fish behaviour undiminished by transgenerational acclimation. *Nature Clim*. *Change* **4**(12),
391   1086–1089.

392   13. Munday PL, Cheal AJ, Dixson DL, Rummer JL, Fabricius KE 2014 Behavioural impairment in reef
393   fishes caused by ocean acidification at CO_2 seeps. *Nature Clim*. *Change* **4**, 487–492.

394   14. Schade FM, Clemmesen C, Wegner KM. 2014 Within- and transgenerational effects of ocean
395   acidification on life history of marine three-spined stickleback *(Gasterosteus aculeatus) Mar*.
396   *Biol*. **161**(7), 1667–1676.

397   15. Forsgren E, Dupont S, Jutfelt F, Amundsen T. 2013 Elevated CO_2 affects embryonic
398   development and larval phototaxis in a temperate marine fish. *Ecol*. *Evol*. **3**(11), 3637–3646.

399   16. Nagerlkerken I, Munday PL. 2016 Animal behaviour shapes the ecological effects of ocean
400   acidification and warming: moving from individual to community-level responses. *Glob.*
401   *Change Biol.* **22**(3), 974–989.

402   17. Boatta F, D'Alessandro W, Gagliano AL, Liotta M, Milazzo M, Rodolfo-Metalpa R, Hall-Spencer
403   JM, Parello F. 2013 Geochemical survey of Levante Bay, Vulcano Island (Italy) and its suitability
404   as a natural laboratory for ocean acidification studies. *Mar. Poll. Bul.* **73**, 485-494.

405   18. Taborsky M, Hudde B, Wirtz P. 1987 Reproductive behavior and ecology of *Symphodus*
406   (*Crenilabrus*) *ocellatus*, a European Wrasse with 4 types of male behavior. *Behaviour* **102**, 82-
407   118.

408   19. Alonzo SH, Warner RR. 2000 Allocation to mate guarding or increased sperm competition in a
409   Mediterranean wrasse. *Am. Nat.* **156**, 266–275.

410   20. Alonzo SH, Heckman KL. 2010 The unexpected but understandable dynamics of mating,
411   paternity and paternal care in the ocellated wrasse. *Proc. R. Soc. B.* **277**, 115–122.

412   21. Stiver KA, Alonzo SH 2013 Does the risk of sperm competition help explain cooperation
413   between reproductive competitors? A study in the ocellated wrasse (*Symphodus ocellatus*).
414   *Am*. *Nat*. **181**(3), 357–368.

415   22. Meinshausen M, *et al*. 2011 The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions from
416   1765 to 2300. *Clim. Change* **109**, 213–241.

417   23. Pierrot DE, Wallace DWR. 2006 MS Excel Program Developed for CO_2 System Calculations.
418   ORNL/CDIAC-105a. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National
419   Laboratory, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tennessee.

420   24. Roy RN, Roy LN, Vogel KM, Porter-Moore C, Pearson T, Good CE, Millero FJ, Campbell DM.
421   1993 The dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at salinities 5 to 45 and
422   temperatures 0 to 45° C. *Mar. Chem.* **4,** 249–267.

423   25. Dickson AG. 1990 Standard potential of the reaction: AgCl(s) + 1/2 H_2(g) = Ag(s) + HCl(aq), and
424   the standard acidity constant of the ion HSO_4^- in synthetic seawater from 273.15 to 318.15 K. *J.*
425   *Chem. Thermodyn.* **22,** 113–127.

426   26. Lejeune P. 1985 Le comportement social des Labride´s mediterrane´ens: etude ecoethologique
427   des comportements reproducteur et sociaux des Labridae mediterraneens des genres
428   *Symphodus* (Rafinesque 1810) et *Coris* (Lacepede 1802). *Cah*. *Ethol*. *Appl*. **5**, 1–208.

429   27. Warner RR, Lejeune P. 1985 Sex change limited by parental care: a test using four
430   Mediterranean labrid fishes, genus *Symphodus*. *Mar*. *Biol*. **87**, 89–99.

431   28. Sinopoli M, Cattano C, Chemello R, Timpanaro A, Timpanaro V, Gristina M. 2015 Nest building
432   in a Mediterranean wrasse (*Symphodus ocellatus*): are the algae used randomly chosen or
433   actively selected? *Mar. Ecol.* **36**(4), 942–949.

434   29. Alonzo SH. 2008 Female mate choice copying affects sexual selection in wild populations of the
435   ocellated wrasse. *Anim. Behav.* **75**(5), 1715–1723.

436   30. Alonzo SH, Warner RR. 2000 Dynamic games and field experiments examining intra- and inter-
437   sexual conflict: explaining counter-intuitive mating behavior in a Mediterranean wrasse,
438   *Symphodus ocellatus*. *Behav. Ecol.* **11**(1), 56–70.

439   31. Zuur AF, Ieno EN, Elphick CS. 2010 A protocol for data exploration to avoid common statistical
440   problems. *Methods Ecol. Evol.* **1**, 3–14.

441   32. R Core Team. 2016 R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for
442   Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. URL http://www.R-project.org/.

443   33. Warton DI, Hui FKC. 2011 The arcsine is asinine: the analysis of proportions in ecology. *Ecology*
444   **92**(1), 3–10

445   34. Bates D, Maechler M, Bolker B, Walker S. 2015 Fitting Linear Mixed-Effects Models Using lme4.
446   *J. Stat. Softw*. **67**(1), 1–48.

447   35. Cornwall CE, Hurd, CL. 2016 Experimental design in ocean acidification research: problems and
448   solutions. *ICES J. Mar. Sci.* **73**(3), 572–581.

449   36. Alonzo SH. 2004 Uncertainty in territory quality affects the benefits of usurpation in a
450   Mediterranean wrasse. *Behav. Ecol.* **15**(2), 278–285.

451   37. Jutfelt F, Bresolin de Souza K, Vuylsteke A, Sturve J. 2013 Behavioural disturbances in a
452   temperate fish exposed to sustained high-CO_2 levels. *PLoS ONE* **8**(6), e65825.

453   38. Chivers DP, McCormick MI, Nilsson GE, Munday PL, Watson SA, Meekan MG, Mitchell MD,
454   Corkill KC, Ferrari MC. 2014 Impaired learning of predators and lower prey survival under
455   elevated CO_2: a consequence of neurotransmitter interference. *Glob. Change Biol.* **20**(2), 515–
456   522.

457 39. Chung W-S, Marshall NJ, Watson S-A, Munday PL, Nilsson GE. 2014 Ocean acidification slows
458   retinal function in a damselfish through interference with GABA$_A$ receptors. *J. Exp. Biol*. **217**,
459   323–326.

460 40. Havenhand JN, Schlegel P. 2009 Near-future levels of ocean acidification do not affect sperm
461   motility and fertilization kinetics in the oyster *Crassostrea gigas*. *Biogeosciences* **6**, 3009–3015.

462 41. Caldwell GS, Fitzer S, Gillespie CS, Pickavance G, Turnbull E, Bentley MG. 2011 Ocean
463   acidification takes sperm back in time. *Invert. Reprod. Dev*. **55**, 217–221.

464 42. Frommel AY, Stiebens V, Clemmesen C, Havenhand J. 2010 Effect of ocean acidification on
465   marine fish sperm (Baltic cod: *Gadus morhua*). *Biogeosciences* **7**, 5859–5872.

466

467 **Ethics.**

468 All experiments were carried out in accordance with institutional and national (law 116/1992)

469 guidelines concerning the use of animals in research.

470

471 **Data accessibility.**

472 All data and supplementary material are deposited in Dryad digital repository

473 (doi:10.5061/dryad.3vk01).

474

475 **Author's contributions**.

476 MM, CC, and JMH-S conceived the project; MM, CC, DS, MG, and MS collected the data; RRM

477 performed the carbonate chemistry analyses; MM, CC, SHA, AF and KAS analysed the data; MM

478 and CC wrote the initial draft of the manuscript; all authors contributed to the final version. The

479 order of authors from 3 to 9 was determined alphabetically.

480

481 **Competing financial interests.**

482 The authors declare no competing financial interests.

483

488

489 **Acknowledgements**.

494   **Figure captions**

495

496   **Figure 1.** A dominant male ocellated wrasse ready to spawn with the female

497   in a nest off Vulcano Island.

498

499   **Figure 2.** Mating behaviours of dominant males at the sites with different CO_2 levels. (a) Average

500   time spent (%) by the dominant male in courting females and (b) average number of dominant

501   male nest defence (chasing) events 10 min^{-1}. In both cases there are no differences between High

502   CO_2 vs Ambient nesting sites. Error bars $\pm$ 1 Standard Error.

503

504   **Figure 3.** Number of dominant male spawns (pair spawns) and sneak spawns at High and Ambient

505   CO_2 nests. Means with different letters (a, b) were significantly different in the pair-wise planned

506   contrasts (see also Table 1). Error bars $\pm$ 1 Standard Error.

507

508

Table 1. Summary of statistical analysis of nest composition and success, reproductive output, mating behaviour and spawning of ocellated wrasse (see methods for test details)

Nest composition			df	t	P
MaxN		Satellites	1,31	0.820	0.418
		Sneakers	1,31	1.568	0.125
		Females	1,31	0.885	0.488
TotN		Sneakers	1,31	0.771	0.445
		Females	1,31	0.778	0.441
Nest success			df	F	p
N. of spawns by females (SI x SA interaction)			1,28	12.041	**0.002**
Satellite present *(t= 1.259, P= 0.218)*					
Satellite absent *(t= 4.107, P<**0.001**)*					
Eggs (reproductive output)			df	W	p
N. of eggs/nest			1,8	11	0.841
Surface			1,398	21066	0.352
Behavioural interactions of the dominant nesting male			df	F	p
Courtship (%time)			1,28	1.829	0.187
N. of chasing events against accessory males			1,15	0.479	0.499
Inter-male competition			df	Chisq	p
Dominant nesting male spawn disruption			1	0.547	0.459
			df	F	p
Number of spawns (SP x SI interaction)			1,63	8.928	**0.004**
Pair *(t= 3.282, P= **0.002**)*					
Sneak *(t= 0.515, P= 0.609)*					

Only comparisons between the two nesting sites exposed to different CO_2 conditions (i.e., High CO_2 vs Ambient CO_2 nesting sites) off Vulcano island are reported (see electronic supplementary Tables for full analyses and for inter-population analyses between ambient nesting sites). When an interaction term was significant, the results of pair-wise planned contrasts between High CO_2 vs Ambient levels are reported in brackets. SI: Nesting Site (with two levels: High CO_2, Ambient); SA: Satellite (with two levels: present, absent); SP: Spawn Type (with two levels: Pair spawn, Sneak spawn). Significant results are in bold.