Lead in exterior paints from the urban and suburban environs of Plymouth, south west England

Andrew Turner* & Kevin R. Solman

School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences
Plymouth University
Drake Circus
Plymouth PL4 8AA
UK

*Corresponding author. Tel: +44 1752 584570; Fax: +44 1752 584710; e-mail: aturner@plymouth.ac.uk
Abstract

The dry weight concentrations of lead in paints on a variety of structures in the urban and suburban environs of a British city (Plymouth, south west England) have been determined in situ and ex situ by field-portable x-ray fluorescence spectrometry. Lead was detected in 221 out of 272 analyses, with overall median and mean concentrations of 4180 μg g\(^{-1}\) and 29,300 μg g\(^{-1}\), respectively, and a maximum concentration of 390,000 μg g\(^{-1}\). The highest concentrations were observed in extant paints on poorly maintained, metallic structures, including railings, gates, telephone kiosks and bridges, in various yellow road line paints, and in paints of varying condition on public playground facilities (ramps, climbing frames, monkey bars). Occupants of households in the vicinity of structures that are shedding leaded paint are at potential risk of exposure from paint particles being tracked in on shoes while children in contact with leaded paints in playgrounds and recreational areas are at potential risk from the direct ingestion of paint flakes. Since the issues highlighted in the present study are neither likely to be restricted to this city, nor to the UK, a greater, general awareness and understanding of the sources and routes of exposure of exterior leaded paint is called for.

Keywords: leaded paint; chromium; urban; bridges; telephone kiosks; playgrounds
1. Introduction

Because of the well-documented toxic effects of lead, and in particular those that impact on the development of young children, the use of leaded products has been restricted or phased out over the past few decades (Mansson et al., 2009; Bierkens et al., 2011). In the domestic setting, a significant vehicle for Pb poisoning has been the inadvertent or deliberate ingestion of household paint particles containing various leaded pigments (Jacobs et al., 2002; Su et al., 2002). Consequently, the Pb content of consumer paints has come under close scrutiny in the scientific literature and by regulators and limits on its concentration in formulations have been progressively revised downwards. In the US, the current limit for Pb in consumer paints has been set at 90 ppm (CPSC, 2011), and although several countries have since adopted similar thresholds, the Global Alliance to Eliminate Lead Paint (GAELP) has a goal of eradicating Pb in paint by 2020 (Kessler, 2014).

An additional source of Pb exposure in the home environment is from contaminated external geosolids, like soils and road dusts, that are airborne or tracked in on shoes and clothing (Alradady et al., 2003; Hunt et al., 2006). External solids are often contaminated with residual Pb associated with its past use in gasoline (Zahran et al., 2013; Datko-Williams et al., 2014), but an additional source that has received less attention is extant leaded paint on exterior structures, and in particular on constructions in poor condition and where paint is readily flaking from the substrate through weathering and deterioration of the binder (Weiss et al., 2006). Flaking paint in the external environment may also pose more direct risks to contractors repairing or repainting structures (Jacobs, 1998), and to children if poorly maintained painted
surfaces are encountered within or in the vicinity of recreational areas (Mathee et al., 2009).

In a previous study, a variety of metals in paint flakes sampled from a number of structures in the centre of Plymouth, a coastal city in south west England, were measured by inductively coupled plasma (ICP) spectrometry following acid digestion (Turner and Sogo, 2012). Despite many leaded pigments having been either banned or voluntarily removed from non-consumer paints in the UK by the 1990s, we discovered concentrations of Pb in many samples that exceeded the US urban abatement action level of 5000 µg g\(^{-1}\) (Horner, 2004). This finding has prompted us to hypothesise that leaded paint may be a pervasive problem in this city and in the British urban and suburban environments more generally. Accordingly, the present investigation employs a field portable x-ray fluorescence (FP-XRF) spectrometer, configured in a plastics mode and with a thickness correction algorithm for the analysis of thin layers, to allow a greater throughput of paint analyses on a wider range of structures in Plymouth. Measurements are made both in situ and ex situ and, although we specifically target Pb, we also measure Cr because of its occurrence in many leaded pigments. The results are used to provide an inventory of the types of structures on which leaded paint is likely to be encountered in the city and in the UK, and to address the potential sources of Pb exposure to the general public from paint in the urban and suburban settings.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Sampling and sample locations
Fifteen urban and suburban regions of Plymouth (population ~ 250,000) that provided a wide geographical coverage of the city were visited between February and April of 2015 and during periods of dry weather. In each region, as many paints on public structures and facilities and on municipal and commercial buildings (excluding private residences) that were directly accessible from the roadside or pavement were examined using a FP-XRF spectrometer. On site, painted wooden, metallic and tarmacked surfaces, including gates, railings, bridges, roads, buildings, posts, playground facilities, pillar boxes and K6-type telephone kiosks, were photographed, position-fixed and coded, and the colour, condition and degree of layering of paint recorded. Surfaces that were in reasonable condition were measured in situ while those that were visibly flaking were sampled directly or from fragments that had accumulated on the ground using a pair of stainless steel tweezers. Where distinct layers of paint or distinct components or colours were observed on a single structure, multiple measurements were made or multiple samples collected. Samples were stored individually in labelled specimen bags and returned to the laboratory in a sealed polyethylene box.

2.2. XRF analysis
The outer surfaces of the paint fragments and painted structures were analysed for a variety of metals, of which Pb was the focus of the present study but Cr was also considered, by energy dispersive FP-XRF spectrometry using a battery-powered Thermo Scientific Niton XRF analyser (model XL3t 950 He GOLDD+).

For in situ measurements (n = 58), a smooth, regular area of the painted surface was wiped clean and dry using a medical-grade wipe before the XRF nose, including the
measurement window and proximity sensor, was positioned firmly against a
measurement area of 8 mm in diameter. Surfaces were measured for a period of 200
seconds (100 seconds each for the main and low energy ranges) by depressing the
trigger mechanism of the instrument. Spectra up to 50 keV were quantified by
standardless analysis in ‘plastics’ mode and with a thickness correction of 50 μm to
yield metal concentrations in parts per million (μg g⁻¹) and with an error of 2σ (95%
confidence). Data were subsequently transferred to a laptop computer in the
laboratory using Thermo Scientific Niton data transfer (NDT) PC software.

For the analysis of paint fragments in the laboratory (n = 224), the XRF was securely
fixed into a bench top accessory unit and connected via USB and a remote trigger to
the laptop. Individual samples were carefully placed on to a SpectraCertified® Mylar
polyester 3.6 μm film using a pair of tweezers and with the outer face downwards,
before the slide was positioned centrally over a 3 mm small-spot collimator above the
detector. Measurements were activated through the laptop under conditions identical
to those described above and with concurrent transfer of data through the NDT
software.

The Niton XLT3t GOLDD+ series analysers define detection limits that are specific
to the characteristics of the sample and the counting time in terms of 3σ;
measurements are reported where concentrations exceed this threshold and detection
limits are provided otherwise. Detection limits specific to the paint samples and
analytical conditions of the present study were about 8 μg g⁻¹ and 15 μg g⁻¹ for Pb and
Cr, respectively. No XRF reference paints exist that report Pb concentrations on a
w/w basis above 100 μg g⁻¹. However, analysis of NIST SRM2579a paint films that
are defined by a wide range of Pb concentrations on a mg cm$^{-2}$ basis ($x$) returned results in $\mu$g g$^{-1}$ ($y$) that were directly proportional to certified values ($y = 3.2\times10^4x; r^2 > 0.999; p < 0.01$). For an evaluation of absolute accuracy, a reference plastic manufactured by Niton (PN 180-554, 13 mm thick polyethylene disk impregnated with metals) was analysed in quadruplicate and without thickness correction. The mean measured Pb concentration ($\pm$ one sd) of 944 ($\pm$12) $\mu$g g$^{-1}$ compared with an added Pb concentration of 1002 ($\pm$40) $\mu$g g$^{-1}$, while the mean measured Cr concentration ($\pm$ one sd) of 1090 ($\pm$12) $\mu$g g$^{-1}$ compared with an added concentration of 995 ($\pm$40) $\mu$g g$^{-1}$.

Since Pb and Cr were measured both on painted surfaces in situ and on flakes returned to the laboratory, a comparison between the two approaches was made on a number of surfaces where intact areas were adjacent to visibly flaking areas. Despite possible differences between adjacent areas in terms of thickness of application and degree of corrosion, coupled with any potential confounding effects associated with the underlying substrate itself, good agreement was observed between Pb concentrations measured across a range of surfaces ([ex situ] = 1.40* [in situ]; $r = 0.921, n = 10, p < 0.01$); for Cr, a weaker relationship based on fewer analyses was observed that was nevertheless significant ([ex situ] = 0.58* [in situ]; $r = 0.630, n = 6, p = 0.05$). Note that in the cases where painted surfaces were measured by both approaches, only those determined in situ have been reported below.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Structure description and classification
A summary of the type, number and colours of the painted structures examined in the present study is given in Table 1. A total of 224 structures were measured and a total of 272 analyses for Pb were performed, with the numerical difference reflecting multiple analyses of different regions or layers of the same structure. The most common categories examined were railings (all metal and including various fences) and posts (mainly metal and encompassing street posts, lamp-posts and traffic posts) which were a variety of colours; likewise, gates (including gate posts) and downpipes were mainly of metal construction and were painted in a number of colours. Playground facilities embraced a variety of brightly coloured installations, such as roundabouts, ramps, climbing frames, monkey bars and the supporting posts of slides and swings, while painted areas of public and commercial buildings of various ages included walls, doors, window frames and window sills. The iconic K6-type cast iron telephone kiosks and metallic pillar boxes of different designs were always red, whereas the painted (road) surfaces of highways, car parks, pavements and manhole covers, were mainly yellow-orange. Bridges were the largest structures examined and consisted of footbridges over roads and railways, road bridges over disused railways and disused rail bridges over roads. Miscellaneous structures not categorised above included fire hydrants, bollards, waste bins and benches. In general, and among the structures examined, the surfaces of the telephone kiosks and bridges were observed to be in the poorest condition with what was perceived to be extensive flaking of multiple layers of paint and visible accumulations of paint fragments on the ground. For this reason, measurements of different layers or regions of paint were made on all kiosks and on the majority of bridges. Other constructions
on which multiple measurements were performed included several multi-coloured playground facilities, and various buildings, posts and railings.

3.2. Lead concentrations and distributions

Table 2 summarises the concentrations of Pb in paints on the different types of structures. Overall, Pb was detected in 221 cases (or 81% of all analyses), with concentrations spanning more than four orders magnitude (ranging from 20 μg g⁻¹ to about 390,000 μg g⁻¹) and exceeding the US urban abatement action level of 5000 μg g⁻¹ in 104 instances (or 38% of all analyses). The median, grand mean and standard error for all measurements were 4,180 μg g⁻¹, 29,300 μg g⁻¹ and 3,560 μg g⁻¹, respectively, but where median concentrations were used to summarise multiple measurements of the same structure (and n = 175), respective values were 2,700 μg g⁻¹, 20,500 μg g⁻¹ and 2,770 μg g⁻¹. Skewness and excess kurtosis for the entire dataset were +3.03 and 12.0, respectively (or +2.52 and 6.70, respectively, for data based on the number of structures measured), indicating a highly skewed, leptokurtic data set whose variability is due to a relatively small number of extreme differences.

For a given type of structure and for all measurements made on such, concentrations of Pb were highly variable and in most cases distributions were positively skewed, with median concentrations of a few thousand μg g⁻¹ for most constructions but an order of magnitude greater for bridges and telephone kiosks. Individual concentrations of Pb greater than 100,000 μg g⁻¹ were determined in 21 cases. Namely, the lowest painted layers of a number of telephone kiosks (that may have been base paint primers); paints of various colours on the parapets of two road bridges over a disused railway and a disused railway bridge over a road; two yellow-orange ‘no parking’
lines; a green downpipe on the exterior wall of a small industrial estate; the yellow railing of a ramp in a playground; the lowest painted layer of a red pillar box; two yellow car park posts; and black and green flakes sampled from cast iron railings surrounding a hospital and cemetery, respectively.
Table 1: Classification and colour coding of the structures examined in the study.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structure</th>
<th>black</th>
<th>blue</th>
<th>brown</th>
<th>green</th>
<th>grey/silver</th>
<th>red/pink</th>
<th>white</th>
<th>yellow/orange</th>
<th>multiple</th>
<th>no. structures</th>
<th>no. analyses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bridges</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downpipes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gates</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>23</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pillar boxes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>playgrounds</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>posts</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td></td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>35</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>railings</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>roads</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>telephone kiosks</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>9</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miscellaneous</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>total</strong></td>
<td><strong>27</strong></td>
<td><strong>11</strong></td>
<td><strong>4</strong></td>
<td><strong>36</strong></td>
<td><strong>24</strong></td>
<td><strong>42</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
<td><strong>46</strong></td>
<td><strong>15</strong></td>
<td><strong>224</strong></td>
<td><strong>272</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2: Distribution and summary statistics for Pb concentrations (µg g⁻¹) among the different structures measured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>no. undetected</th>
<th>&lt; 10²</th>
<th>10²-10³</th>
<th>10³-10⁴</th>
<th>10⁴-10⁵</th>
<th>&gt;10⁵</th>
<th>min.</th>
<th>max.</th>
<th>median</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>bridges</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>223,000</td>
<td>30,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>buildings</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>33</td>
<td>9,850</td>
<td>573</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>downpipes</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,810</td>
<td>104,000</td>
<td>4,480</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>gates</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td>166</td>
<td>28,800</td>
<td>1,650</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pillar boxes</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>171,000</td>
<td>2,820</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>playgrounds</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>115,000</td>
<td>1,170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>posts</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>175,000</td>
<td>2,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>railings</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>198,000</td>
<td>4,280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>roads</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td>50</td>
<td>142,000</td>
<td>5,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>telephone kiosks</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td>510</td>
<td>389,000</td>
<td>43,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>miscellaneous</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>74</td>
<td>97,200</td>
<td>982</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>total</strong></td>
<td><strong>51</strong></td>
<td><strong>19</strong></td>
<td><strong>54</strong></td>
<td><strong>55</strong></td>
<td><strong>72</strong></td>
<td><strong>21</strong></td>
<td><strong>20</strong></td>
<td><strong>389,000</strong></td>
<td><strong>4,180</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 summarises the Pb results according to colour classification. (Note that samples and surfaces from the multi-coloured structures listed in Table 1 have now been divided into their component colours.) Lead was measured in all colour categories, and the percentage of cases in which Pb was detectable ranged from less than 65 for grey/silver and white surfaces to more than 90 for blue and red/pink surfaces. Median concentrations ranged from about 400 \( \mu g \ g^{-1} \) for grey/silver paints to more than 25,000 \( \mu g \ g^{-1} \) for red paints, and with the exception of blue paints, colour categories were not normally distributed with positive skewness and positive excess kurtosis.

3.3. Leaded pigments and the occurrence of Cr

The wide dispersion of Pb concentrations among the different colours and ages of structures suggests that a number of leaded compounds are encountered in the paints analysed. Before being phased out or restricted in use, leaded pigments were used in paints for colour, opacity and corrosion inhibition, and, in combination with other metal compounds, as driers (Abel, 2000). Some commonly employed leaded pigments include the primers, red lead, \( 2PbO \cdot PbO_2 \), and basic lead silicochromate, \( PbSiO_3 \cdot 3PbO \cdot PbCrO_4 \cdot PbO \), white lead, \( 2PbCO_3 \cdot Pb(OH)_2 \), a pigment that turns black on exposure to sulphurous gases in the atmosphere, lead chromate, a series of yellow and orange pigments that can be pure \( PbCrO_4 \) or mixed phase \( PbCrO_4/PbSO_4 \), molybdate red, \( Pb(Cr,S,Mo)O_4 \), and chrome green, \( PbCrO_4/PbSO_4 \cdot FeNH_4Fe(CN)_6 \), a co-precipitate of lead chromate and Prussian blue.

It is clear that many of these Pb-based pigments also contain hexavalent Cr, itself a cytotoxin and genotoxin (Wise et al., 2006). Chromium was detected in 106 paints,
with median, minimum and maximum concentrations of 443 μg g⁻¹, 24 μg g⁻¹ and 33,800 μg g⁻¹, respectively, and a distribution that displayed positive skewness and excess kurtosis. Chromium was detected in 99 cases in which Pb was detected and these results are plotted as a scatter chart in Figure 1. Here, data have been coded according to colour, although no clear trends or groupings are evident on this basis. Also shown in the figure are ratios of Pb to Cr (on a w/w basis) for the pigments with the lowest and highest ratios of these metals (namely, about 4 for pure PbCrO₄ to about 24 for basic lead silicochromate). Many of the data lie within these two end-points, consistent with the use of a variety of Pb-Cr pigments in the paints. Data with ratios of Pb:Cr exceeding 24, including those containing significant quantities of Pb and no detectable Cr (e.g. many bridge paints; data not shown), suggest the use of leaded pigments that do not contain Cr, like white lead and the primer, red lead, while data with ratios of Pb:Cr below 4 suggest the existence of additional, unleaded but Cr(III)-bearing pigments (e.g. chromium oxide, Cr₂O₃, and cobalt blue, Co(Al,Cr)₂O₄). Relatively low ratios of Pb:Cr and the general dispersion among the data may also be attributed to the heterogeneous but preferential weathering and dissolution of Pb over Cr from PbCrO₄-based pigments (White et al., 2014).
Figure 1: Concentrations of Pb versus concentrations of Cr in the different coloured paint samples. The lines represent the Pb to Cr mass ratios in lead chromate (4:1) and basic lead silicochromate (24:1).
Table 3: Distribution and summary statistics for Pb concentrations \((\mu g \text{ g}^{-1})\) among the different colours of paint measured.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Colour</th>
<th>no. undetected</th>
<th>&lt; 10^2</th>
<th>10^2-10^3</th>
<th>10^3-10^4</th>
<th>10^4-10^5</th>
<th>&gt;10^5</th>
<th>min.</th>
<th>max.</th>
<th>median</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>black</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>119</td>
<td>158,000</td>
<td>982</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>blue</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>66,100</td>
<td>5,860</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>brown</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1,750</td>
<td>184,000</td>
<td>21,600</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>green</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>198,000</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>grey/silver</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18,600</td>
<td>398</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>red/pink</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>389,000</td>
<td>25,600</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>white</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>202,000</td>
<td>2,780</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>yellow/orange</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>175,000</td>
<td>4,680</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.4. Implications for exposure and the local environment

This study has revealed a wide range of Pb concentrations in painted surfaces of a variety of both contemporary and historical structures in the urban and suburban environs of a British city. The highest concentrations (in excess of 100,000 µg g\(^{-1}\)) were often associated with relatively old, metallic (cast iron and steel) structures that were observed to be in a poor state of repair and that often had distinct layers of flaking paint resulting from aging, weathering and abrasion of the surface. In these cases, Pb concentrations were usually highest in the lowest, and presumably oldest, layers, an effect exemplified by the distribution of Pb concentrations among the different coloured or shaded surfaces of a road bridge in Figure S1 and a telephone kiosk in Figure S2. This effect may be attributed to the reduction in the Pb content of progressively newer paints (including the use of leaded primers as the oldest basecoat), or to an increase in the degree of weathering of non-leaded components of the paint with increasing age. A more surprising observation, however, was the high incidence of concentrations that exceeded the urban abatement action level of 5000 µg g\(^{-1}\) (Horner, 2004) on painted surfaces that were largely intact and that appeared to have been applied relatively recently. Examples of the latter included a range of facilities in children’s playgrounds (one installation was date-stamped as March 2009), posts and bollards used to demark the entrances of car parks, several small, sprung entrance gates to recreational facilities, and bright yellow paint on the footway of a pedestrian bridge.

From an environmental standpoint, flaking of leaded paint will result in both the direct (particulate) and indirect (through dissolution-readsorption) contamination of local soils, road-dusts and pavement dusts. Contamination of surface waters may
occur indirectly through the gradual dissolution of Pb from paint flakes into rainwater, an effect accentuated by low pH and the presence of natural and anthropogenic complexants, and the subsequent transport of aqueous Pb by storm-water drains (Davis and Burns, 1999). Human exposure associated with flaking leaded paint may be a concern for residents and schools in the immediate vicinity of structures in a poor state of repair (Weiss et al., 2006). In the present study, private houses were observed within 20 m of many of the structures in the poorest condition and whose painted surfaces were associated with the highest concentrations of Pb; we also noted that one of the railings shedding paint and containing Pb at a concentration in excess of 25,000 µg g⁻¹ served to enclose a school play area. In these cases, Pb may enter the indoor environment as fine, airborne dust and through paint flakes and contaminated soil tracked indoors on shoes and clothing. Track-in and soil resuspension appear to be the main vehicles for the introduction of external Pb into the contemporary household (Laidlaw et al., 2014) and flaking paint from external structures (and in particular, metallic railings and elevated steel structures like bridges) has been identified as a major contributor to these routes (Weiss et al., 2006; Lucas et al., 2014). The potential for Pb to be tracked into the household is also a concern for families of contractors involved in the repair, maintenance or restoration of structures containing extant leaded paint (Virji et al., 2009) and for members of the public who use telephone kiosks that are in a poor state of repair and that have significant accumulations of paint flakes on the floor.

Perhaps the greatest concerns arising from our research are the wide occurrence and high concentrations of Pb in paints on public playground facilities. Here, the risks are greatest for peeling or chalking paint on structures that children are in direct contact
with, like poles, rails, climbing frames and monkey bars, and to infants under 72 months old because of their tendency to mouth foreign objects and the relatively high absorption of Pb in their gastrointestinal tract (Kennedy et al., 2014). Lead poisoning in a 5-year old child resulting from the biting and ingestion of paint chips from playground equipment in Montreal was described by Health Canada (1994), with the recommendation that painted surfaces be carefully stripped using solvent and repainted using lead-free paint. Leaded paint has since been reported on equipment in contemporary public play-parks in Japan (Takaoka et al., 2006) and South Africa (Mathee et al., 2009) but the present study appears to be the first to document its occurrence in Europe.

From the discussion above, it is clear that the general findings of the present study are unlikely to be specific to the city of Plymouth or to the UK. Thus, since the phasing out of leaded gasoline, exterior paint, in itself or as a component of contaminated soil dust, may represent one of the most significant routes of Pb exposure in the urban and suburban settings. Despite guidance and regulations on the use and removal of paint containing Pb being incorporated into governmental policy (e.g. Health and Safety Executive, 2002), a greater awareness of the pervasiveness of exterior leaded paint is required, both for the public and for employers dealing with the renovation, repair, maintenance or decoration of a wide variety of painted facilities. In particular, means of reducing the inherent risks and managing and regulating Pb in paint on public structures and facilities need to be more clearly and robustly addressed by the relevant authorities and stakeholders.
Acknowledgements

We acknowledge the support of Mr Joe Levermore and Ms Emily Kearl, UoP, during sampling and analysis of the playground paints. This study was funded partly by a UoP Marine Institute grant.

References


Jacobs, D.E., Clickner, R.P., Zhou, J.Y., Viet, S.M., Marker, D.A., Rogers, J.W.,
Zeldin, D.C., Broene, P., Friedman, W., 2002. The prevalence of lead-based paint
hazards in US housing. Environmental Health Perspectives 110, A599-A606.

prevention of lead poisoning in children: a cross-sectional study to evaluate state
specific lead-based paint risk reduction laws in preventing lead poisoning in children.
Environmental Health 13, 93; DOI: 10.1186/1476-069X-13-93

Environmental Health Perspectives 122, A96-A103.

Identification of lead sources in residential environments: Sydney Australia.
Environmental Pollution 184, 238-246.

Etchevers, A., Mandin, C., Sebille, V., 2014. Source contributions of lead in
residential floor dust and within-home variability of dust lead loading. Science of the

Mansson, N., Bergback, B., Sorme, L., 2009. Phasing out cadmium, lead and


White, K., Detherage, T., Verellen, M., Tully, J., Krekeler, M.P.S., 2014. An investigation of lead chromate (crocoite-PbCrO₄) and other inorganic pigments in
aged traffic paint samples from Hamilton, Ohio: implications for lead in the environment. Environmental Earth Science 71, 3517-3528.
