2007

Migration & Economy in Cornwall

Burley, Stuart James

http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/2160

http://dx.doi.org/10.24382/3997

University of Plymouth

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.
Migration & Economy in Cornwall

By

Stuart James Burley

A thesis submitted to the University of Plymouth
in partial fulfilment for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

School of Law & Social Science
Faculty of Social Science & Business

November 2007
Abstract

Cornwall is arguably the poorest county in England, but since the 1960s it has been the recipient of some of the highest levels of in-migration. The result of this has seen Cornwall experience some of fastest rates of population growth. This has taken place in the context of counterurbanisation, a process that has been argued to be economically beneficial. Cornwall therefore seems to provide two paradoxical conditions; first, comparative economic poverty has not deterred large numbers of people wishing to live in the county and second, sustained population growth seems to have failed to lift Cornwall from economic poverty.

This thesis is an empirical piece of research that analyses the underlying processes of in-migration in Cornwall. This explores the characteristics of in-migrants drawing predominantly on secondary data from the ONS Longitudinal Study and the Census. It also considers a range of additional sources of socio-economic data to contextualise Cornwall’s in-migration.

By comparing the processes of in-migration in Cornwall with other areas it is clear that environmental reasons underpin the strategies of many in-migrants and they are often characterised by low levels of economic dynamism. However the analyses also examine in-migrants at a number of spatial scales and this reveals a high level of heterogeneity of migrant flows within the county.
The findings of the thesis serve to highlight some of the complexities and multidimensionality of counterurbanisation particularly in regard to how causal processes may be spatially and temporally variable and how the effects may be unequally distributed across time, space and for different sub-groups.
Acknowledgements

First and foremost I would like to offer my extreme gratitude to my principle supervisor Malcolm Williams whose guidance, advice and support has been invaluable. I am also sincerely grateful to Malcolm Brown and Carole Sutton who have helped me endlessly during some difficult times. I could not have hoped for a better supervisory team.

I would also like to thank the Economic and Social Research Council (ESRC) and Cornwall County Council, the CASE partner, for funding the research (Award: PTA-033-2003-00048). I am also grateful of the help of Chris Marshall and the staff of the Centre for Longitudinal Study Information & User Support (CeLSIUS).

A number of people have helped me along the way. Firstly, thanks to Zoë James for her encouragement and ensuring me that my concerns were ‘quite normal’. Also thanks to Kevin Poulton for risking the wrath of personnel and giving me that most precious commodity, time. I’m also appreciative to Kathryn Meredith for her patience on the number of occasions when I needed to discuss the merits of various datasets.

Finally, this would not have happened without the love and support of Sarah.
Author’s Declaration

At no time during the registration for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy has the author been registered for any other University award without prior agreement of the Graduate Committee.

This study was financed with the aid of a studentship from the Economic and Social Research Council (Award: PTA-033-2003-00048).

Conference presentations:

“In-migration to Cornwall: Stepping off the treadmill”, presented at the British Society for Population Studies Annual Conference, Southampton, September 2006

“Cornwall: Poor yet popular, popular yet poor”, presented at the Periphery and Policy Conference, Truro, April 2006


Word count of main body of thesis: 76,997

Signed

Date 20th May 2008
Contents

Abstract i
Acknowledgements iii
Author’s declaration iv
Contents v
List of tables ix
List of figures xi

Introduction 1

1 Counterurbanisation and rural in-migration 9
1.1 Introduction 9
1.2 Counterurbanisation 10
  1.2.1 The pattern of counterurbanisation – population change 11
  1.2.2 The pattern of counterurbanisation – migration 16
  1.2.3 Rural Areas 17
1.3. The process of counterurbanisation 19
  1.3.1 The causes of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration 20
    1.3.1.1 Environmental explanations 20
    1.3.1.2 Economic explanations 24
    1.3.1.2.1 The changing geography of employment 26
    1.3.1.3 Environmental & economic explanations 29
  1.3.2 The composition of counterurbanisation 30
    1.3.2.1 Age & life cycle 30
    1.3.2.2 Social class 34
    1.3.2.3 Economic position 37
    1.3.2.4 Housing 39
    1.3.2.5 Rural in-migration and the escalator region 41
1.4. Impacts of counterurbanisation 42
  1.4.1 Demographic impacts 42
  1.4.2 Economic impacts 46
    1.4.2.1 Exogenous growth 46
    1.4.2.2 Endogenous growth 49
    1.4.2.3 Multiplier effects 51
    1.4.2.4 Loss of social capital 52
  1.4.3 Housing impacts 54
  1.4.4 Social impacts 58
    1.4.4.1 Social class 58
    1.4.4.2 Deprivation 60
1.5. Summary 63

2 Counterurbanisation and in-migration in Cornwall 66
2.1 Introduction 66
2.2 The rurality of Cornwall 66
2.3 The pattern of counterurbanisation in Cornwall 70
2.4 The economic and demographic history of Cornwall 1800-1960 77
2.5 The process of counterurbanisation 1960s & 70s 84
2.6 Counterurbanisation from the 1980s 97
  2.6.1 Decline of staple industries 97
3.7.2.3 Tenure 183
3.7.2.3.4 Qualifications 184
3.7.2.3.5 Occupational class 185
3.7.2.4 Disclosure control and data modification 1991 and 2001 186
3.7.2.5 Migration data for the small area analyses 189
3.7.2.6 Limitations with the migration datasets 195
3.7.2.7 Additional data for small area analyses 197

4 Counterurbanisation and in-migration in Cornwall: macro-level analysis 201
4.1 Introduction 201
4.2 Comparative case studies 202
4.2.1 Wiltshire 202
4.2.2 West Wales and the Valleys (WW&V) 205
4.3 Migrant characteristics 1991-2001 207
4.3.1 Migrant frequencies 208
4.3.2 In-migrant origins 209
4.3.3 Age structure 212
4.3.4 Economic characteristics 214
4.3.4.1 Economic activity and inactivity 215
4.3.4.2 Full-time employment 220
4.3.4.3 Part-time employment 221
4.3.4.4 Unemployment 222
4.3.4.5 Self-employment 223
4.3.4.6 Occupational class 224
4.4 Summary of LS findings 230
4.5 The Peoples Panel findings 231
4.6 Economic change and population change from the 1960s Cornwall and Wiltshire compared 236
4.7 Why has in-migration been consistently high in Cornwall despite economic poverty? 240
4.8 Why it is that in-migration has failed to bring about economic prosperity in Cornwall? 242
4.9 Can in-migration be claimed to be economically beneficial for Cornwall? 247
4.9.1 Economic performance and population growth in Cornwall and WW&V 248
4.9.2 In-migration and the labour market 250
4.9.3 In-migration and the housing market in Cornwall 257
4.10 Summary 261

5 In-migration in Cornwall: micro level analysis 264
5.1 Introduction 264
5.2 District analyses 265
5.2.1 Population growth and economic performance 1993-2003 265
5.2.2 Population growth, employment growth and economic performance 1998-2003 266
5.2.3 Economic dynamism of in-migrants 268
5.2.4 District level summary 270
5.3 Sub-district analyses 271
5.3.1 Defining in-migrant groups by economic dynamism 271
5.3.2 Spatial and demographic characteristics of dynamic in-migrant destinations 272
5.3.3 Socio-economic profile of destinations 275
5.3.4 Socio-economic performance of destinations 278
5.3.5 Economically strong in-migration – strong socio-economic profile 280
5.3.6 Economically strong in-migration – strong socio-economic performance 283
5.3.7 A further distinction for the least economically dynamic in-migrants 285
  5.3.7.1 Economically weak in-migration – weak socio-economic profile 289
  5.3.7.2 Economically weak in-migration – weak socio-economic performance 290
5.3.8 Sub-district summary 292

6 Discussion 295
6.1 Introduction 295
6.2 Research question 1 295
  6.2.1 Industrial restructuring transformed rural economies towards high growth sector 296
  6.2.2 Job-led in-migration 297
  6.2.3 Prospects for endogenous growth 299
  6.2.4 Limitations and considerations 302
    6.2.4.1 Are Cornwall’s in-migrants less economically dynamic through choice? 302
    6.2.4.2 Why hasn’t Wiltshire had environmental migration? 303
6.3 Research question 2 305
  6.3.1 Identifying an association between economic performance and population growth 305
  6.3.2 Direct employment growth 306
  6.3.3 Indirect employment growth 306
  6.3.4 A turning point or a temporary phenomenon? 307
6.4 Research question 3 309
  6.4.1 District analyses 309
  6.4.2 Small area analyses 311
    6.4.2.1 Migrant dynamism and socio-economic profile 311
    6.4.2.2 Migrant dynamism and socio-economic performance 313
    6.4.2.3 Implications of the association 314
    6.4.2.4 Limitations 317

7 Conclusions – Issues for counterurbanisation 321
7.1 Introduction 321
7.2 Counterurbanisation is temporally complex 321
7.3 Counterurbanisation is spatially complex 323
7.4 Counterurbanisation is different for different people 324
7.5 Concluding remarks 328

Bibliography 330

Appendices 339
List of Tables

1.1: Physical and social features of the destination for urban-to-rural migrants 22
1.2: Population change, 1993-2003, for broad age groups, by district type % for decade 45
2.1: Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly Population by Defra rural classification 2005 70
2.2: Population change in Cornwall 1951-1991 71
2.3: Population growth in Cornwall, 1984-2005 71
2.4: Components of population change 1981-1991 & 1991-2001 75
2.5: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 1980-81 76
2.6: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 1990-91 76
2.7: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 2000-2001 76
2.8: Decadal population change, England/Wales & Cornwall 1801-61 78
2.9: Total and annual net in-migration in Cornwall 1961-81 85
2.10: Reasons for migration moves to Cornwall 95
2.11: Change in employees in Cornwall 1984-1989 101
2.12: Claimant count change 1984-1989 102
2.13: Change in employees by sector 1984-1989 103
2.14: Employment change 1989-1993 105
2.15: Claimant count change 1989-1993 106
2.16: Change in Employees by sector 1989-1993 107
2.17: Change in employees 1991-2001 110
2.18: Self-employment 1994-2001 110
2.19: Claimant Count 1991-2001 112
2.20: Sectoral change in employees 1991-2001 114
2.21: Gross Domestic Product change 1991-2000 115
2.23: Key employment characteristics 2001 119
2.24: In, out and net migration in Cornwall, mid-years 1980/81 – 2000/01 121
2.25: Percentage in FT employment male in-migrants & non-migrants 132
2.26: Change in age profiles 1971-2001 and predicted change to 2028 138
3.1: Derivation of occupational class from 1991 SEG and 2001 NSSEC 161
3.2: Matrix of small area building blocks 176
3.3: Occupational class derivations for in-migrants 193
4.1: Population change thousands by study area 1991-2001 204
4.2: Components of population change thousands by study area 1991-2001 204
4.3: Economic indicators in 2001 by study areas 204
4.4: Total LS sample 1991-2001 by migrant type 208
4.5: 2001 resident population by migrant type 209
4.6: In-migrant age structure (age in 2001) 212
4.7: % LSMs economically active aged 36-55 in 2001 215
4.8: % LSMs economically inactive (retired/full-time students/looking after the home) aged 36-55 in 2001 217
4.9: % LSMs economically inactive (permanently sick or disabled) aged 36-55 in 2001 218
4.10: % economically active LSMs in full-time work aged 36-55 in 2001 220
4.11: % economically active LSMs in part-time work aged 36-55 in 2001 221
4.12: % economically active LSMs in unemployment aged 36-55 in 2001 222
4.13: % economically active LSMs in self-employment aged 36-55 in 2001 224
4.14: % LSM HRPs by occupational class aged 26-64 in 2001 – Cornwall 227
4.15: % LSM HRPs by occupational class aged 26-64 in 2001 – Wiltshire 227
4.16: % LSM HRPs by occupational class aged 26-64 in 2001 – WW&V 228
4.17: % LSM outright home owners aged 46-65 in 2001 229
4.18: Migrant status in PP and LS samples 233
4.19: Age of in-migrants in PP and LS samples 233
4.21: Change in manufacturing, service and total employment by intercensal decade 1961-01 238
4.22: Manufacturing, service and total employment by intercensal decade 1961-01 238
4.23: Change in population and employment by intercensal decade 1961-01 240
4.24: Ratio of employment change to population change by intercensal decade 1961-01 240
4.25: FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by value of sector (2004) 244
4.26: FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by pay of sector (2004) 245
4.29: Change in FTE’s by sector 1998-2003 251
4.31: Change in business units employing 1-4 employees 1998-2003 257
5.1: Change in population and GVA 1993-2003 by district 266
5.2: Change in population, employment and GVA 1998-2003 by district 268
5.3: Economic dynamism of in-migrant LS members by district in 2001 269
5.4: In-migrant groups – most and least economically dynamic 272
5.5: Demographic characteristics of in-migrant destinations 275
5.6: Socio-economic profile of migrant destinations 275
5.7: Labour market participation by migrant destinations 276
5.8: Quality of labour market participation by migrant destinations 277
5.9: Socio-economic performance by migrant destination 278
5.10: Performance of labour market participation by migrant destinations 280
5.11: Performance of labour market quality by migrant destinations 280
5.12: Key characteristics of dynamic in-migrant areas by area type 283
5.13: Socio-economic profile of economically weak in-migrant destinations by destination type 286
5.14: In-migrant characteristics of economically weak in-migrant destinations by destination type 288
5.15: Socio-economic performance of economically weak in-migrant destinations by destination type 291
List of Figures

1.1: % Change in size of broad age groups, 2003-2028 46
2.1: Urban and Rural classification of unitary authorities and local authority districts 68
2.2: Natural change in Cornwall 1974-2004 74
2.3: Seasonal unemployment in Cornwall 1991-2000 113
2.4: Average gross weekly earnings of full-time adult male employees 1981-2001 118
2.5: In, out and net migration in Cornwall, mid-years 1980/81 – 2000/01 123
2.6: In, out and net migration in Cornwall by age, 1985 – 2001 124
2.7: Migration between 1981 and 1991 by age of migrants in 1981 125
2.8: Migration into and out of Cornwall 2000/01 by single year ages 127
4.1: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – Cornwall 209
4.2: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – Wiltshire 210
4.3: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – WW&V 210
4.4: In-migrant age structure (age in 2001) 212
4.5: Reasons considered important by in-migrants aged 16-64 in the decision to move to Cornwall 236
4.6: Proportion of FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by value of sector (2004) 245
4.7: Proportion of FT employees in service industries Cornwall and Wiltshire by pay of sector (2004) 246
4.8: Total GVA % change per annum (1995-2003) 249
4.9: Population % change per annum 1995-2003 249
4.10: Total visitor trips to Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly 1981-2005 253
4.11: Domestic and overseas visitor spend in Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly 1992-2005 254
4.12: Registrations annual as % of total VAT stock 1995-2003 255
4.13: Average annual house price differential between semi-detached houses in London & South East and Cornwall 1995-2003 259
4.14: Annual net migration in Cornwall 1995-2003 259
4.15: Annual % increase in the price of semi-detached properties in Cornwall and London & the South East 1995-2003 260
5.1: Cornwall by local authority districts 265
5.2: Destinations of the most dynamic in-migrants 273
5.3: Destinations of the least dynamic in-migrants 274
Introduction

The thesis

This thesis examines the dynamics of in-migration in Cornwall in an attempt to explore two seemingly paradoxical conditions: first, why it is that Cornwall has been a substantial recipient of in-migration despite it being one of the most economically depressed regions in Britain, and second, why dramatic levels of population growth have done little to lift Cornwall out of comparative poverty. The enquiry aims to explore these apparent contradictions in the theoretical context of the causes and impacts of counterurbanisation.

Counterurbanisation

Since the 1960s and 1970s most industrialised nations in the Western world reported a turnaround in the prevailing tendencies of population concentration towards a pattern of deconcentration. The phenomenon was termed counterurbanisation by Berry (1976), implying the antithesis of urbanisation. Though the exact definition of counterurbanisation has been subject to considerable debate (see Champion, 1989) there seems to be a general consensus of recognising counterurbanisation as a situation where there is a negative correlation between settlement size and net migration rates (Fielding, 1982) or settlement size and population change rates, with migration being but one, though usually dominant, explanation of that change (Champion, 1990).

Despite fluctuations in the pace of population deconcentration (Champion, 1998), counterurbanisation has been the dominant trend in Britain for almost half a century. While
migration has been the dominant component of counterurbanisation it is not simply the
result of the individuals moving from the largest to the smallest areas, neither does it
consist of a unidirectional flow of individuals moving to smaller areas. Champion and
Atkins (1996) were able to show that individuals move up as well as down the settlement
system but, importantly, the net effect of migration between areas results in a general
‘cascade’ of migration moves down the urban hierarchy. Essentially, each area in the
settlement hierarchy gains population from those areas above it and loses population to
those below (Champion, 2005). Consequentially, since the 1970s counterurbanisation in
Britain has resulted in rural areas consistently experiencing the fastest rates of population
growth (Champion, 1994; 2006).

Possible explanations for counterurbanisation continue to attract considerable debate
(Mitchell, 2004). No fewer than 17 separate reasons were summarised by Champion
(1989), the majority of which will be examined in the following chapter. Suffice it to say
here that the various reasons given for rural in-migration, the feature of critical importance
for this thesis, have been categorised into two key themes by Buller et al (2003); residential
preference and employment. Residential preferences generally explain the prevalence of
rural in-migration as a response to deep-seated notions about the ‘rural idyll’ (Lowe et al,
1995) where rural areas are particularly favoured for their social and physical amenities,
(Halfacree, 1994). However, as Champion et al suggest, “the most important change in
recent years is the transformation in the geography of employment” this is evidenced by the
fact that “the vast majority of households moving into rural England contains people who
are in work” (Champion et al, 1998, p. 95). The argument can therefore be made to suggest
that while residential preferences have been important, it has been the growth in employment in rural areas which has enabled individuals to exercise these preferences.

The growth in rural employment can be seen to be linked to three broad processes. Firstly, Fielding (1982) argues that deindustrialisation led to a geographical dispersal of production activities during the 1950-80 period as employers sought cheaper and more reliable workforces in rural areas to maintain profitability. Often underpinned by government subsidy, exogenous growth in rural areas led to an increase in the quantity and quality of jobs which stabilised rural out-migration and increased in-migration (ibid). Secondly, entrepreneurial and self-employed in-migrants have been shown to directly generate additional employment within rural areas (Findlay et al, 2000) reflecting the importance of endogenous economic development in rural areas from the 1980s onwards (Fielding, 1998). And third, increases in the populations of rural areas resulting not just from in-migrations of local workers, but also commuters and retirees (Cross, 1990), have had multiplier effect of indirectly creating jobs by adding to the demand for goods and services (Findlay et al, 2000). In praise of the economic impacts of counterurbanisation Fielding claims that

"It transformed rural economies. It brought in new income in the form of more and higher wages, and it changed occupational structures away from declining sectors and towards high growth ones. This led to a virtuous circle of development assisted by the local multiplier effects of the new investments", (Fielding, 1990, p. 236).

Counterurbanisation and Cornwall

In a geographic sense and on aggregate, Cornwall is undoubtedly rural. It is also the most peripheral English county in terms of journey time from other large population centres (ARO, 2004). It is plausible therefore to categorise Cornwall at the lowest end of the
settlement hierarchy indeed there is precedent for this within studies by Boyle (1995) amongst others. Since the 1960s Cornwall has experienced one of the highest levels of population growth of any county in England, an increase which has been solely the result of in-migration. In terms of the geographic and demographic evidence there is certainly a compelling argument to regard Cornwall as a classic case of counterurbanisation. The problematic regards the economic evidence. Williams (2003) showed that Cornwall has high unemployment, the lowest GDP, the lowest wages and the highest level of bankruptcies in Britain (Williams, 2003, p. 56). Population growth in Cornwall has coincided not with economic prosperity but with economic degeneration, leaving Cornwall as one of the poorest areas in England (ibid). It is this conundrum which serves as the principal focus of attention.

Aims

The first aim of the thesis is to explore the characteristics of in-migration in Cornwall. This will be used to address the primary question:

1. Why it is that in-migration has been consistently high in the face of economic poverty and why has in-migration failed to bring about economic prosperity?

This will include a comparative analysis of in-migration in Cornwall with that of two other case study areas; the county of Wiltshire and the Nomenclature of Territorial Units for Statistics (NUTS) region West Wales and the Valleys. Wiltshire provides an example of an economically prosperous rural county that has experienced large-scale population growth
from in-migration. West Wales and the Valleys serves as an example of a similarly economically poor area that has not experienced large scale population growth from in-migration. This will examine the distinctiveness of Cornwall’s in-migration compared to that of a successful area and to that of a poor area.

There are two other research questions which are addressed in the thesis. The first seeks to investigate the economic contribution that in-migration may have made in Cornwall, again drawing comparisons with West Wales and the Valleys as a similarly poor region but one which has not experienced high levels of in-migration.

2. Can in-migration be claimed to be economically beneficial for Cornwall?

The third research question aims to examine the heterogeneity of population growth and in-migration processes within Cornwall. This seeks to identify the destinations of contrasting types of in-migration at the sub-county and sub-district level of analysis and investigates the socio-economic profiles and performances therein.

3. To what extent is Cornwall spatially diverse in regard to population growth, in-migration and socio-economic performance?

The research is based on data from the 1991 and 2001 Censuses, the Office for National Statistics (ONS) Longitudinal Study (LS) and additional sources of contextual social and
economic data. The analyses will also examine primary data from a panel survey conducted during the research.

Chapter summary

Chapter one positions the research problem within the wider theoretical context of counterurbanisation. It begins by discussing some of definitional problems of counterurbanisation and highlights the importance in separating the pattern of counterurbanisation from the processes that underpin it (Champion, 1998). This distinction then dictates the structure of much of the chapter with the pattern of deconcentration trends in Britain outlined first and the underlying processes discussed thereafter. The processes of counterurbanisation focus on possible causes of migration, the composition of migrants and the implications of these aspects, primarily upon rural areas.

Chapter two explores the migratory and economic profile of Cornwall. It begins by questioning the rurality of Cornwall and puts forward its counterurbanisation credentials. Following an account of Cornwall's migratory and economic history, discussion on the causes and composition of in-migration is separated into two chronological sections. The first examines 1960-1980 when structural explanations seem most dominant and in-migration was largely explained by exogenous economic growth. The 1980s and 1990s are examined in greater depth with an account of economic fluctuations, a local government policy of population-led growth and an examination of more contemporary migration trends. Attention is then given to the characteristics of in-migrants through the 1980s,
drawing heavily on the study by Williams et al (1995) and followed by a consideration of
the impacts of in-migration from the 1980s onwards.

The methods comprise the third chapter and begin with a brief overview of secondary data
analysis and the main data sources; the Census and the LS. The chapter then addresses, in
order, the research methods used to answer each key question. It details the problems of
data availability and issues of temporal and geographical comparability. It is necessary to
deploy proxy variables for many of the analyses and the strengths and weaknesses of these
are evaluated.

The fourth chapter represents the first of the two analysis chapters and addresses the first
two research questions. This opens with an account of the two comparator areas assessing
the suitability and relevance of each. The main body of the chapter focuses on the
demographic and socio-economic characteristics of in-migrants in each area. The analyses
then consider structural economic explanations which may explain both the different
economic outcomes and the migratory profiles of Cornwall and Wiltshire. The final section
considers the possible benefits of in-migration for Cornwall using a comparative analysis
with West Wales and the Valleys.

The second analysis chapter addresses the third research question and examines the
heterogeneity of in-migration and socio-economic performance at the district and sub-
district level. Both spatial levels of analysis reveal an association between the economic
dynamism of in-migration and socio-economic profile and performance. The sub-district
analyses are examined in greater to depth and reveal two separate type of economically weak in-migration; one that appears to consist of equity rich individuals and one which constitutes some of the most disadvantaged individuals.

Chapter six provides a discussion of the evidence. Each key research question is considered in terms of what the analyses have shown, how the findings fit with other research and the limitations and implications of each analysis. The conclusions are outlined in the final chapter. This aims to contextualise the story of Cornwall’s in-migration within a broader consideration of counterurbanisation. This highlights the applicability of the findings in terms how we theorise about counterurbanisation.
Counterurbanisation and rural in-migration

1.1 Introduction

The study of human migration in the developed world continues to attract attention from a range of academic disciplines including geography, demography, sociology, economics and political science. Interest extends beyond academia to policy makers and practitioners in the public and private sectors who seek to better understand the causes, characteristics and effects of migration. The study of migration has taken on increasing significance in recent times as it becomes ever more the most important component in population change, particularly in countries such as Britain where natural change rates have become gradually more stable (Champion & Fielding, 1992). However the various potential impacts of migration transcend the comparatively simple role it plays in population change rates and its role in the development of the economy and society often raises important theoretical and policy issues (Stillwell et al, 1992). Champion and Fielding (1992) make a succinct case for its importance:

"it has consequences for the structure and composition of the population, for the level and nature of the pressure on the housing stock and public services, for the efficient operation of the labour market and wider economy, and for the 'behaviour' of local communities in terms of purchasing, voting, socialising, travelling and the many other aspects of daily life" (Champion and Fielding, 1992 p. 1).

Arguably it is necessary to understand the patterns and processes of migration in contemporary society to be able to better understand society itself. The duality of migration is that it serves not only as a reflection of changing processes of economic and social development (Stillwell et al, 1992) but also an agent in the shaping of social geography (Fielding, 1992). Central to both these sentiments is the fact that there is often a strong degree of selectivity to migration in terms of the demographic, social and economic characteristics of those that move and those that do not. Also, recent history has taught us
that the phenomenon of migration itself is changeable and this contributes to its growth in interest (Champion and Fielding, 1992).

This chapter seeks to provide a review of the knowledge of recent migration trends with the central focus on counterurbanisation and rural in-migration. There follows a focus on the causes of counterurbanisation, followed by an examination of the characteristics of rural in-migrants, culminating with a discussion of evidence on the possible impacts of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration.

1.2 Counterurbanisation

During the 1970s the paradigm of population concentration and urbanisation came under scrutiny as Beale (1975) an American agricultural economist found that many rural areas in the U.S. that had long been synonymous with depopulation, now exhibited population growth. What was known as the ‘population turnaround’ of rural areas and slowed growth rates of metropolitan areas was later found to be occurring within many developed nations both in Western Europe (Fielding 1982) and further afield (Vining & Kontuly 1978). Berry’s (1976) publication coined this phenomenon as ‘counterurbanisation’. Heralding it as a turning point and the new dominant pattern of population distribution he defined it as, “a process of population deconcentration…a movement from a state of more concentration to a state of less concentration”, (Berry 1976, p17).

It is important to stress that Berry’s definition should be seen as only a starting point in the conceptualisation of counterurbanisation because it offers nothing in the way of how
population concentration and deconcentration should be operationalised (Champion 1998). Indeed, counterurbanisation has long been seen as being conceptually contentious with some claiming it to be a chaotic conception (Halfacree 1994; Champion 1992) and others claiming it to be a “stretched and diluted catch-all phrase” (Cloke 1985, p.14) which is reflected in the inconsistencies in its usage. The aim here is not to repeat the debates on the conceptualisation of counterurbanisation that have been discussed at length elsewhere, (Mitchell 2004; Champion 1989; Dean et al 1984). However it is important to note that Champion (1989) suggests that the conceptual debate is made all the more complex by the failure to distinguish between the pattern and process of counterurbanisation, the former being the actual identifiable trends in population deconcentration, and the latter the explanation, causes or processes underlying deconcentration (ibid, p24). The review of literature here assumes the same position so a separate discussion on the possible underlying processes of counterurbanisation is dealt with later. First the aim is to highlight some of the substantive evidence for the pattern of counterurbanisation within Britain which will emphasise some of the different spatial methods by which it has been identified.

1.2.1 The pattern of counterurbanisation – population change

Though the early signs of counterurbanisation were first identified in the US, it is claimed that population deconcentration was occurring far earlier in Britain. Champion argues that “Britain was in the vanguard of the population turnaround, with the first stages of the rural population recovery being evident during the 1950s and the metropolitan migration reversal occurring at the beginning of the 1960s”, (Champion 1994, p.1504). Early studies by Champion (1981) and Robert and Randolph (1983) measured counterurbanisation as a
negative relationship between settlement size and population change and suggested
counterurbanisation to be occurring within Britain during the 1960s and 70s. In contrast,
Vining and Kontuly (1978) found no evidence for counterurbanisation in Britain at this
time. Importantly, the contrasting findings were not so much a reflection of what was
actually happening in Britain, rather the different ways in which studies sought to measure
it. The methods of Champion (1981) and Robert & Randolph (1983) used local authority
districts as the geographic framework identifying general trends of slow or negative
population growth in metropolitan areas and conurbations and a large swing from
depopulation to growth in many of the remote, largely rural areas. Vining and Kontuly
(1978) used only a broad ‘core’ and ‘periphery’ distinction, built from regional building
blocks, which failed to capture the more subtle shifts in deconcentration.

Some have argued that counterurbanisation must represent deconcentration as a ‘clean-
break’ from the past and not simply ‘spill-over’ growth as an extension of metropolitan
areas (Coombes et al, 1989). Robert and Randolph (1983) argued for a distinction between
metropolitan ‘spill-over’, in what they regard as further decentralisation, and that which is
actual population deconcentration. However Champion (1989) indicates that this is not an
easy definition to make and that arguably the best solution is to classify the whole of the
national territory into functional zones or spheres of metropolitan influence. This was
carried out for Britain by Coombes et al (1982) at the Centre for Urban and Regional
Development Studies (CURDS) at Newcastle University whereby individual centres of
employment and surrounding commuting zones were defined as separate Local Labour
Market Areas (LLMAs). Each LLMA was then analysed in terms of its location,
commutability, and overall dependence on the main urban areas of Britain. The end result was a functional, urban hierarchy of LLMAs consisting of Metropolitan Dominants, Metropolitan Subdominants, Metropolitan Rural, Freestanding Urban and Freestanding Rural.

Other studies also involved settlement systems on similar principles of functionality to that of LLMAs such as that of Boyle (1995). Here, Boyle took the local authority classification of Webber and Craig (1976) and adapted it to distinguish between ‘remote rural districts’, those areas that were within 65km of large urban centres, and ‘most remote rural districts’ which were beyond 65km and where commuting levels were likely to be low. Other studies used a simpler settlement classification distinguishing counties in terms of metropolitan status and density (Champion and Atkins, 2000). Essentially the majority of studies identifying counterurbanisation reflect Champion’s call to “examine population shifts within a geographical framework which represents the settlement system in functional terms” (Champion, 1998 p. 27).

In terms of existing evidence, Champion (1994) conducted one of the most substantial reviews of counterurbanisation in Britain utilising the LLMA framework to examine population growth from the decennial Censuses of 1951-91. The findings emphasise how Britain was indeed at the forefront of the population turnaround during the 1950s as Freestanding LLMAs shared the same level of growth as Metropolitan areas at 5% despite a marginal decrease in Freestanding Rural areas of 0.5%. During 1961-71 the growth rate in metropolitan LLMAs decreased to 3.5% while growth in Freestanding LLMAs jumped to
8.6%, 3.3% above the national average growth rate. Moreover the Freestanding Rural areas had switched from depopulation to population growth at a rate of 5.7%. The following decade the trend was even more pronounced as the populations of metropolitan areas actually decreased by 2.3% compared to an average national growth of 0.6%. Although the rate of population change was slightly lower in the Freestanding LLMAs at 6% compared to the previous decade, it was actually 5.4% higher than the national average. Again the strong growth was largely attributable to a high growth rate of Freestanding Rural areas which had now climbed to 9.4% (ibid, p1508). While evidence from the U.S. showed that population growth in metropolitan areas began to exceed that of non-metropolitan areas during the 1980s, interpreted as a return to urbanisation (Frey 1993), counterurbanisation continued in Britain, albeit at a lesser pace than in the 1970s. Metropolitan areas in Britain during 1981-91 recovered somewhat from the period of depopulation in the previous decade to record growth rates of 0.4% with this being due to the resilience of London more than the other metropolitan areas. That said, Freestanding LLMAs still continued to grow at 6.0%, 4.5% above the national average, and the growth rate remained highest in the Freestanding Rural areas at 7.9%, (Champion 1994, p1508).

Population deconcentration therefore occurred in each decennial decade in Britain from 1961-91, confirming counterurbanisation as the new dominant trend in population redistribution. More recent analyses by Champion (2005) showed that counterurbanisation remained prevalent in the 1991-01 with rural areas continuing to record the highest growth rates. Moreover, with the exception of the substantial rate of growth in London, metropolitan areas continued to experience the lowest rates of population change.
It is important to emphasise here that although the last 4 decades display a clear counterurbanisation pattern there are substantial inconsistencies at the finer units of analysis. Firstly, there are important differences between the North of England and the South. All areas in the South increased in population during 1991-01, albeit largely still reflecting growth rates across the urban hierarchy consistent with counterurbanisation. However, inconsistent with counterurbanisation is that growth rates of cities and towns were larger in the South than those of rural areas in the North (Champion 2005). This reflects a general trend in North to South population redistribution that has been consistent from the 1970s (Stillwell et al 1992).

There are also important regional differences with the population in remote rural districts in the South East recording a growth rate of 6.0% during 1981-91 compared to a growth of 11.0% in East Anglia (Champion 1994 p1513). Moreover, although rural areas, in aggregate terms, experienced a high rate of population growth between 1991 and 2001, remote rural areas actually recorded a lower growth rate than accessible rural areas (Champion, 2005). Finally, Weekley (1988) provides data from 1971-81, when growth of remote rural areas was generally shown to be at its zenith, and shows that Powys, cited as being a beacon of counterurbanisation, actually had more than a third of parishes lose population. These findings do not undermine the significance of counterurbanisation rather that there will be anomalies at different geographic frames of reference.
1.2.2 The pattern of counterurbanisation – migration

The substantive findings discussed so far highlight the prevalence of counterurbanisation in Britain and the importance of defining geographical frameworks by which to identify it. Moreover, each study mentioned shared the same method to test for counterurbanisation, viewing it as a negative relationship between settlement size and population growth. Given the decline in birth rates in the last 30 years it is the role of migration, rather than natural increase that has played a far more prominent role in the differential growth rates of different areas (Champion 1993). This is acknowledged by those who focus predominantly on population change (Robert & Randolph 1983, Champion 1987, 1994), but for many it is the relationship between settlement size and net migration which is used to identify counterurbanisation, such as in Fielding’s (1982) study of Western Europe and most of the national case studies featured in Champion (1989).

One of the main advantages with using net migration as the focus of counterurbanisation studies is that it is able to provide a greater level of understanding and further specificity on the pattern of population deconcentration. Champion and Atkins (1996) used 1990-91 Census migration data to show that the pattern of population deconcentration was occurring as a result of net migration exchanges down the urban hierarchy. They showed that the weakest levels of population growth at the highest point of the urban hierarchy and strongest gains at the lowest levels were not simply caused by a single and uniform direction of migration from top to bottom but rather operate in a step-wise fashion. Essentially gross flows move up and down the urban hierarchy but importantly the net flows generally ‘cascade’ down the urban hierarchy with each area in the settlement
hierarchy gaining population from those areas above it and losing people to those below. More recent findings by Champion (2005) looked at internal migration patterns in England and Wales between 1998 and 2001 and further confirmed the cascade effect with 88% of all net migration flows directed down the urban hierarchy. Moreover, it was shown that it is not simply a ‘spillover’ effect, with each area gaining from the one area above it in the urban hierarchy, but that the majority gained population from nearly all areas further up the hierarchy. Such assertions may be inferred from analyses of population change but only by looking at net migration flows can it be readily confirmed.

In summary, the substantive findings paint a picture of Britain as having been strongly imbued in counterurbanisation over the last 40 years. The methods used to identify counterurbanisation also seem to imply a definition; that which is a pattern of deconcentration within the settlement system, that is not further suburbanisation, where smaller or rural areas are growing faster than larger metropolitan areas and where migration seems to be the dominant cause of population shifts down the urban hierarchy. Clearly rural areas play a significant role in counterurbanisation with the implication being that they are at the lowest end of settlement hierarchy. However, the definition of rurality has also been subject to some debate so it is necessary to draw briefly upon some of these points before discussing the processes of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration.

1.2.3 Rural Areas

One may expect there to be a fairly common and generic understanding of what we consider to be ‘rural’ but it is necessary to recognise that there has been considerable debate
as to its definition. Some of these definitions are outlined by Halfacree and Boyle (1998) with ‘the rural’ being defined as a set of socio-cultural relations, as a locality with specific social structures or as a social representation of space (ibid, p. 3-4). Cloke et al (1995) suggest that ‘the rural’ now signifies middle-class, in itself an allusion to the effects of selective rural in-migration. Hoggart (1988) goes as far as to suggest that the concept of ‘the rural’ is a hindrance and argues against the possibility of a “unidimensional conception of rurality” (ibid, p. 39). The aim here is not to enter into this debate but to signify to the reader the usage of the term in this thesis. This follows the lead of Champion and Watkins (1991) in assuming the generic understanding described by Hoggart; “small settlements separated by belts of open countryside” (Hoggart, 1988 p. 36). This concept of rurality can be operationalised using measures of population density as is generally the case in the Rural and Urban Area Classification for England and Wales produced by the Countryside Agency et al (2004).

Hoggart’s appraisal of rural definitions does however raise a valuable point in regards to the existence of “intra-‘rural’ locality differences” (ibid, p.39). As Champion et al state,

“even in relation to deep countryside, it is important to recognize that this itself features a great diversity that is only partially captured by drawing a distinction between rural areas that are relatively accessible from metropolitan centres and inter-city motorways and those that are more remote” (Champion et al, 1998 p. 94)

Essentially, Wiltshire and Cornwall may both be identified as rural but it is only the latter that is remote. This issue is addressed in functional geographic frameworks such as the LLMAs devised by Coombes et al (1982) and also to an extent by the distinction between accessible-rural and remote-rural areas (see Defra, 2004). Nevertheless, it is important to
acknowledge the heterogeneity that can exist between rural areas, particularly in regard to the effect this may have on in-migration.

1.3. The process of counterurbanisation

The pattern of counterurbanisation in Britain is widely accepted but the sheer volume of literature relating to the explanations, dynamics and effects of counterurbanisation, in essence the process, indicates its ongoing appeal for study. It is these explanations, dynamics and effects to which attention is now drawn.

While Champion (1998, p. 36) states that “in-migrants clearly form the most important single component of counterurbanisation” he quite rightly points out that rural in-migration is not necessarily synonymous with counterurbanisation. Firstly rural in-migration may not equate to rural population growth if out-migration exceeds it. Secondly, counterurbanisation involves moves down every level of the urban hierarchy not just rural in-migration. Halliday and Coombes (1995) give the example of how an anti-metropolitan move from Crawley to Plymouth may represent counterurbanisation yet this is certainly not rural in-migration. Clearly explanations for counterurbanisation should focus on urban out-migration and moves down the settlement hierarchy as well as rural in-migration. However this thesis focuses on rural in-migration with counterurbanisation serving as the theoretical context, so the following discussions are understandably biased towards rural in-migration.
1.3.1 The causes of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration

1.3.1.1 Environmental explanations

The first thing to say about environmental explanations is that there appears to be deep-seated opinions in British society in regard to notions about urban and rural living. Lowe et al (1995) suggest that Britain has long been imbued by a sense of anti-urbanism. They argue that the British accord particularly high cultural status to the countryside illustrated by recurring adjectives such as 'traditional', 'timeless', 'civilised' and 'noble' (ibid, p. 65). The general appeal of the countryside over urban areas was found within a study of public opinion in England by the Countryside Commission (1997). Over half of the sample questioned wanted to live in a village or the countryside whereas only a quarter actually do so (cited in Champion et al 1998).

The vast majority of environmental explanations relate to residential preferences expressed by migrants in a number of surveys on motivational drivers. As mentioned above, counterurbanisation involves large numbers of people moving away from more built-up areas as well as rural in-migration. Some of the 'push' factors of urban areas have been cited by migrants as overcrowding, road traffic, noise, declining living conditions, high house prices, crime, vandalism and disillusionment with the 'rat-race' (Halliday and Coombes, 1995; Halfacree 1994; Perry et al, 1986). That said most motivational research and environmental explanations focus on the 'pull' factors behind rural in-migration, a review of which can be seen in Boyle et al (1998). A few interesting studies are considered here.
First there is evidence of environmental motivations specifically relating to in-migration in Cornwall. Perry et al (1986) conducted a number of interviews with recent in-migrants to West Cornwall asking respondents to give reasons that they felt were important in their decision to move to this choice of destination. The most important factors raised were 'preferred environment', 42%, 'rejoin relatives/friends', 40% and 'enjoyed previous holidays', 38%. The importance of rejoining relatives or friends is no doubt largely explained by the high proportion of return migrants in their study. When only 'new settlers' are analysed the percentage quoting preferred environment increased to 47% while those citing having 'enjoyed previous holidays' as important was as high as 49% (ibid, p. 93). Clearly the migrants' reasons for moving to West Cornwall indicate that environment is an important attraction.

A similar analysis of reasons given for in-migration to nearby Devon was carried out by Halliday and Coombes (1995). Unlike Perry et al, they found that employment was cited as the single most important reason for in-migration to Devon. However, on closer inspection, of the most commonly cited motivations it was 'scenery' that featured more than any other reason (ibid, p. 441-2). This highlights one of the methodological problems associated with these studies in terms of how much the explanation should be rooted in the main motive as opposed to the wider agenda for the migration decision and destination choice.

This point is explored more fully by Halfacree (1994) in his study of in-migration to rural Devon and Lancashire. He argues that migration to rural areas is often bound-up in a plurality of reasons and that by asking respondents solely for their most important motive
suppresses important secondary reasons; with these commonly being a desire to live in more rural residential environments (ibid, p. 169). When asked to provide all reasons for moving from urban origins to the rural destinations Halfacree found two categories to be more substantial than all the others, these being the physical quality of the environment, 59%, and the social quality of the environment, 41% (ibid, p. 179). Furthermore Halfacree actually explored these basic definitions in depth to provide a more comprehensive understanding of the rural appeal. The key physical and social features of the destinations are summarised in the following table.

Table 1.1: Physical and social features of the destination for urban-to-rural migrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key ‘physical’ features of the destination for urban-to-rural migrants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The area was more ‘open’ and less crowded; one no longer felt hemmed-in by houses. There was a more ‘human’ scale to things</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. It was a quieter and more tranquil area, with reduced traffic noise and less ‘hustle and bustle’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The area was cleaner, with fresh air and an absence of traffic pollution and smog</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. The aesthetic quality of the area was higher views green fields, aspect, beauty. There was stimulating ‘spiritual’ scenery</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The surroundings were more natural, with an abundance of flora and fauna.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key ‘social’ features of the destination for urban-to-rural migrants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. The area allowed one to escape from the ‘rat race’ and society in general. This was underpinned by a degree of utopianism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. There was a slower pace of life in the area, with more time for people. There was a feeling of being less pressurized, ‘trapped’ and crowded, and of being ‘able to breath’.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The area had more community and identity, a sense of togetherness and less impersonality. The general idea of ‘small is beautiful’ came across here.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. It was an area of less crime, fewer social problems and less vandalism. There was a feeling of being safer at night.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. The area’s environment was better for children’s upbringing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. There were far fewer ‘non-white’ people in the area.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The area was characterized by social quietude and propriety, with less nightlife, fewer ‘sporty’ types, etc.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Halfacree 1994, p. 180 (emphasis in the original)
In the same study, Halfacree (1994) also makes clear an interesting point that the attraction of the rural environment varies in importance depending on the distance of migration with 90% of longer distance urban to rural migrants citing the physical quality of environment compared to 67% of short distance in-migrants. However, short distance in-migrants were more likely to cite the social quality of the environment than long distance migrants, 50% and 36% respectively (Halfacree 1994, p. 177). As well as the distance of migration impacting upon migratory motives Hardill and Munn (1996) emphasise the importance of considering differences between rural areas, particularly with regard to whether it is accessible to an urban centre or if it is a truly peripheral locale. The suggestion is that the rural idyll is a stronger motivating factor for those migrating to peripheral areas than those moving to accessible rural areas. This provides another example of the problematic nature of examining migrant motivations. The studies are almost always localised in design and subsequent findings may be limited in terms of further application to other locations.

One final study which leads conveniently to the next section was that Bolton and Chalkley (1990), a survey of 226 recent in-migrant households in North Devon. On being asked to provide the main reason for moving, 58% of in-migrants cited non-economic rather than economic motives. The reason of 'lifestyle change', which included the prospect of a less pressurised way of life and to escape the urban rat race, accounted for the most popular reason given overall, 23%. When asked to explain why North Devon was their favoured destination economic reasons became more important, the most frequent reason given being 'voluntary job/career related' which accounted for 30% of respondents (ibid, p. 38). The important point here is that migrants seemed to move for environmental reasons but chose
North Devon because employment opportunities enabled them to realise that lifestyle change. Essentially, while there appears to be a vast array of studies which indicate preferences for rural living the degree to which individuals are free to achieve this may be largely dependent on “autonomous changes in economy and society at large” (Champion, 1998 p. 33).

1.3.1.2 Economic explanations

The environmental explanations discussed thus far essentially assume that counterurbanisation, specifically rural in-migration, is generally people-led rather than job-led or voluntarist rather than non-voluntarist (Champion, 1989). However, Cross (1990) suggests that the explanations for counterurbanisation, as an acted-out preference for rural residences, overlook the lack of power that an individual has in making these decisions. Essentially, structural explanations imply that the choice of location is governed less by the agency of migrants themselves and more by social, political and, most importantly, economic changes in wider society. The following discussion focuses on the theorising and studies that lend support to a more structural and economic explanation of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration.

One of the simplest and most persuasive arguments for an economic explanation is that the vast majority of households moving to rural areas contain individuals that are either employed or are seeking work (Champion et al 1998). Consequentially, the provision of employment opportunities would seem to be a key explanatory factor. The implied importance of the job-led, rather than, people-led proposition appears to gain support from
Boyle et al (1998) in their suggestion that labour migration has been the focus of more studies in capitalist societies as opposed to human migration. Moreover, although residential preferences have been frequently cited by migrants as important in their decision to move into rural areas, employment factors have often been found to be the single most important reason (Halliday and Coombes 1995) and the strongest cause overall for long-distance, interregional migration (Owen and Green 1992; Dixon 2003).

The neoclassical economic model of migration, or the neoclassical equilibrium theory, stipulates that migration flows are an economically functional process and serve to balance differential unemployment rates and earnings across regions, (Perry et al 1986). Put simply, it is claimed that areas with high unemployment and/or low earnings will lose labour to areas with low unemployment and/or high earnings. The effect of the transfer in labour migration is therefore said to be a mechanism to bring equilibrium to regional differences in the labour market. However, the facts bear out that many rural and non-metropolitan areas in Britain have experienced net migration growth despite low earnings and high unemployment whereas the opposite has often been the case in metropolitan areas (Fielding 1982; Cross 1990). This model therefore seems to be more at odds with counterurbanisation rather than serving as an explanation.

Given that counterurbanisation occurred at a particular point of time, Lewis (1998) claims that some theorists sought to root an explanation in the specific economic conditions of the 1970s, particularly the energy crisis and various recessions. One of the main reasons why counterurbanisation should be seen to accompany recession is that it is due largely to the
large flow of return migrants, moving away from metropolitan areas and returning to their homelands. There seemed to be some evidence to support this in South Wales (McNabb, 1979) and Scotland (Bell and Kirwan, 1979). However, Perry et al (1986) suggest (despite the presence of a high proportion of return migrants) that it was usually first time settlers that were moving to these areas and that they were often the social classes that were least impacted upon by recession. They continue by drawing the point that counterurbanisation was low at a time when the recession effects had largely dwindled and, furthermore, counterurbanisation was seen to be reducing in the early 1980s despite the sharp increases in unemployment. Fielding (1998) supports this criticism by indicating that counterurban migration has been highest during economic boom periods and lowest during recessions, the opposite of what recession theory suggests.

1.3.1.2.1 The changing geography of employment

Fielding (1982) provides arguably the most persuasive structural economic explanation of counterurbanisation in terms of it being linked to the changing geography of production. The proposition originates from the work of Massey (1979) who suggests that until the 1960s the spatial division of production consisted of regional sectoral specialisation whereby the main branches of economic sectors were spatially concentrated in specific regions. Fielding claims that during the 1960s and 1970s the regional sectoral specialisation was partially replaced by a new spatial division of labour in which regions became less synonymous with the goods or services they produce, instead becoming more specialised with the functions of their labour forces (Fielding 1992, p. 231). Essentially, firms began to decentralise their production activities away from metropolitan areas as a response to
increased competition. In what has been described as internal colonialism by Perry et al (1986), the decentralisation of production entailed the retention of corporate and decision-making centres in metropolitan areas, moving research and development activities to prestige environments nearby and scattering the routine branch-plant activities to more rural and peripheral regions. The decentralisation of routine activities was most commonly associated with manufacturing although it includes some routine service activities too. The obvious benefit for employers was that it capitalised on labour forces in rural areas that were ready to except lower wages, utilised reserves of female labour and were generally more malleable given a history of declining employment opportunities (Fielding 1982, p. 31). The key explanation for counterurbanisation here is that it reflects a deconcentration of employment where “key decisions which affect the distribution of population are not taken by ordinary people but by large organisations”, (Fielding 1992, p. 231). Essentially, the jobs moved to the rural areas and the people followed.

An additional incentive for firms to relocate and branch out through the 1960s and 1970s was government regional policy. Pratt (1994) suggests that the most significant Acts to be passed were the Local Authority Land Act, the Finance Act and the revised Local Employment Act, all in 1963, which paved the way for a more active development policy in many rural and peripheral areas in England and Wales. With the allocation of Regional Policy Assisted Area status many rural and peripheral areas were able to attract branch-plants given the incentive of development funds made available as a result of national and EU policy (ibid). This demonstrates that the conditions and premise for Fielding’s model of
counterurbanisation was therefore not solely governed by economic imperatives but by policy also.

The evidence for the industrial restructuring argument is fairly compelling. Between 1960 and 1991, overall Britain lost almost 43% of manufacturing jobs however rural areas had around 250,000 more manufacturing jobs over the same period, reflecting an increase of 45%, (North 1998, p. 167). Moreover, in further support of Fielding’s claims, the largest growth in rural industries over this period was within the service economy (Seymour 2001). Essentially the decentralisation of manufacturing and service industries over the three decades meant that by the start of the 1990s, rural areas in England had similarly proportioned industrial structures as the country as a whole (Countryside Agency 1999).

In an extension to his original argument, Fielding (1998) maintains the centrality of labour migration in the explanation of counterurbanisation but suggests that the regional gains and losses through migration now depend less on the regional linkages of production. Instead, he claims that in the post-Fordism era there exists a third spatial division of labour, that of regional functional disconnection whereby the production linkages of firms are more likely to be connected with suppliers and consumers in other countries, (Fielding 1998, p. 45). An example of this can be seen in the outsourcing of routine customer services to the subcontinent and the large-scale importation of manufactured components. Fielding suggests that much of the labour migration is now increasingly dependent on the ability of a region to attract capital and labour which is globally mobile (ibid p. 45). However he does continue by suggesting that the legacy of Fordism is the near equalisation of the ‘social
wage' from public sector employment and the welfare state and this, he claims “helps maintain people in locations that may otherwise suffer poverty and mass out-migration” (ibid, p. 46). In this sense it seems that the decentralisation of manufacturing and services may be a less important pull factor for in-migration than it was through the 1960s and 70s yet the legacy is an employment structure that makes rural in-migration viable.

1.3.1.3 Environmental & economic explanations

It may be a falsehood to dichotomise between environmental or economic explanations as sole explanations. Sole emphasis on environmental explanations and residential preferences too easily ignores “the strong bond of economic necessity which tie people to certain locations” (Fielding, 1998 p. 43), and yet a wholly economic explanation may be overly deterministic. Importantly, although Fielding (1998) argues economic reasons to be the prime cause of counterurbanisation he does not dismiss the importance of environmental reasons. Indeed, Champion quite rightly suggests that explanations “do not fall neatly under one or the other of the two headings but are ranged across the spectrum from one extreme to the other” (Champion, 1998 p. 33). An example of this is that counterurbanisation and rural in-migration has fluctuated over time. Fielding (1998) argues that counterurban migration flows increase and decrease during booms and downturns in the South East housing and labour market cycles respectively. Essentially, as Champion et al (1998) suggest, caution is needed in extrapolating trends which may ultimately be temporally dependent.
In summary, while counterurbanisation and rural in-migration may be spatially variable according to the type of rural area in focus (Hardill and Munn, 1996) so too may it be temporally variable. Further complexity relates to how rural in-migration may be different in cause, and indeed effect, depending on the characteristics and motives of the individuals involved, as Lewis suggests, "the inducements to migrate do not exert their force equally" (Lewis 1998, p. 150). For this reason the following section examines evidence on the composition of rural in-migrants.

1.3.2 The composition of counterurbanisation

1.3.2.1 Age & life cycle

In as much as it is necessary to recognise that rural in-migrants are by no means homogeneous (Champion, 1998) there are some distinguishable similarities which can be identified at an aggregate level. Firstly, evidence is fairly unequivocal in identifying retirement migration as a substantial feature of counterurbanisation. In an analysis of net migration in 33 rural districts, Cross (1990) revealed that during the 1980s retirement migration had been a very influential factor in counterurbanisation, although within the same chapter he qualifies the argument by stating that it is by far the sole explanation. Warnes (1992) expands upon this by focusing on the origins and destinations of elderly migration. He showed that the highest rates of elderly out-migration are concentrated within the London metropolitan area and provincial conurbations such as Birmingham and Manchester and where previously destinations had tended to focus on the home-counties and traditional south coast counties now the highest rates of elderly in-migration are in peripheral rural areas.
While the changes to the geography of employment have led to the expansion of most rural labour markets they nevertheless still tend to be lower-skilled with limited in the quality job opportunities (Green and Hardill, 2003). The fact that retirees feature prominently in counterurban flows is likely to be a reflection of them being less constrained by employment prospects, indeed statistical evidence would suggest as much. With the use of Poisson modelling techniques Millington was able to show that "responsiveness to spatial labour market disparities declines through the lifecycle whilst the converse is true of housing and amenity effects" (2000, p. 521).

Champion and Atkins (2000) studied migration down the urban hierarchy focusing on three county types; metropolitan, high density non-metropolitan (HDNM) and low density non-metropolitan (LDNM). The findings showed there to be a noticeable peak of net movement from metropolitan counties both to HDNM and LDNM counties around retirement age, with this being identifiable in both the 1971-81 and 1981-91 decades. This trend was also identifiable in movement from HDNM to LDNM counties but retirement aged movement was far more prominent in the 1981-91 decade with the 55-59 cohort (65-69 at the end of the decade) accounting for the largest net movement of any cohort (Champion & Atkins 2000, p. 5). However, this too emphasised that retirement migration, whilst important, is far from being the only explanation of overall migration down the urban hierarchy. The same study shows that the largest peak of net movement from metropolitan to HDNM and LDNM counties is within the 20-34 cohorts (30-44 by the end of the decade) both for 1971-81 and 1981-91. This is suggested to be a stage in the lifecycle associated with
suburbanising “to have a house with a garden for children to play in...the relatively large volume of under 10 year olds supports this assertion”, (ibid p. 5).

More recent analyses have also picked up on the importance of family households in the counterurbanisation process. Champion & Shepherd (2006) look at net migration in a typology of wards between 2000/1. While rural wards gained in pre-retirement and retired-aged individuals the biggest net gain was from individuals aged 30-44 and 0-15 years old, both cohorts contributing almost double the rate of net migration than any other cohort (ibid, p. 25). This was also found to be the case by the Commission for Rural Communities in which people aged 0-9 and 30-44 were found to be the most important contributors to rural in-migration between 2004/5 (CRC, 2007 p.13). Clearly then, while retirement migration does seem to play a substantial part in counterurbanisation, it is actually people in the later working-ages and families with children that are the most notable contributors to rural in-migration. This undoubtedly shows that the majority are not free of employment constraints, though it may represent a time in the life stage when employment starts to become less important compared to residential preference. Indeed, in terms of families, Perry et al found that many of Cornwall’s in-migrants considered the location important because it was ‘better for children’ (Perry et al, 1986 p. 94).

The other important feature of counterurbanisation is the fact that net population growth is occurring in rural areas in spite of a consistent and very large net out-migrant flow. Champion and Townsend (1990) showed that in 1987, 15 out of 17 counties in England with the highest level of net migration also had a net loss of 16-19 year olds. This has been
shown to be a recurring feature of the migratory profile of rural areas. The Commission for Rural Communities (2007) distinguished districts based upon how urban or rural they were, resulting in a typology of districts that included three levels of rurality. In all three cases rural districts were net losers of individuals aged 15-19 and in the case of the two most rural district types, they were also net losers of people aged 20-24 (ibid, p. 14).

Studies of migration differentials and age within Britain have emphasised the fact that young adults are by far the most likely groups to migrate and that a high proportion of moves are associated with the transition from school to higher education (Owen & Green 1992, p. 37). Champion et al (1998, p. 68) point to the findings of Rees et al (1996) and suggest that the outflow of late adolescents from rural areas is commonly directed to areas close to higher education facilities. The transition to work has also been cited as a substantial driver of young adult mobility (Owen & Green 1992). Stockdale’s (2004) study supports this as a third of young out-migrants were motivated by employment, moving either to neighbouring towns or cities or to metropolitan areas further afield such as London. Finally although youth out-migration in pursuit of education and employment is fairly prolific within rural areas it is not necessarily homogenous. Jones’ (1999) study of rural out-migration showed that most young out-migrants were children of previous immigrants while those that remained were more likely to have had parents who were locals. A similar finding was identified in Cornwall by Aldous (2002).
1.3.2.2 Social class

Increased levels of geographical mobility in Britain have been shown to be closely associated with individuals in the highest occupational classes both at an intra-regional and inter-regional scale, (Owen & Green 1992). Much of the counterurbanisation literature has focused on the socio-economic characteristics and the majority of evidence indicates a clear class component for rural in-migration (Lewis 1998, p.150). One interesting field of enquiry is the role that the changing geography of employment has played in this.

Taking Fielding’s (1982) assumption that employment decentralisation has been the prime cause of counterurbanisation it is possible to propose that the social class composition of counterurban in-migrants will reflect the growth in the particular employment sectors most affected. This point has been made by Fielding (1992; 1998) in a study of the social composition of inter-regional migration. Using the ONS Longitudinal Study, Fielding examined the social composition of migrants moving from the metropolitan South East region to the two non-metropolitan regions of Southern England, the South West and East Anglia, over the 1971-81 decade. Compared to all inter-regional migrants over the same period, migrants to the two non-metropolitan regions were marked out by an increased likelihood to be in the two middle classes, the service classes; professional, technical and managerial workers, and the ‘petite bourgeoisie’ incorporating self-employed individuals and owners of small and medium sized businesses (Fielding 1998, p. 50). Migrants to the South West and East Anglia were far less likely than average to be in the working class groups of white collar non-manual and blue collar manual working class. Essentially, Fielding seems to support the claim of counterurbanisation as a response to employment
decentralisation, particularly growth in the service sector, by highlighting the dominance of service class migrants involved in the process. Another interesting finding was that migrants also displayed a strong propensity to change from service class to petit bourgeoisie when moving to the non-metropolitan regions suggesting that the shift into self-employment is also an important aspect of counterurban migrations (Fielding 1990).

The importance of middle-class migration in counterurbanisation can be seen to be in operation within the rest of England and Wales too. When looking at migration from metropolitan to LDNM counties Champion and Atkins (2000) showed the proportion of migrants in professional and managerial occupations to be far higher than the national average in contrast with those migrants in low level blue collar jobs. Hoggart (2000) suggests a cautionary note about the possibility that this phenomenon is exaggerated stating that the South East in particular accounts for a large overrepresentation of these types of migrants. Nevertheless the high proportion of professional and managerial migrants involved in rural in-migration has also been found to be consistent within a number of small area studies outside the South East region, (Perry et al 1986; Bolton & Chalkley 1990; Cross 1990). There have been suggestions that this may be largely due to multinational companies relocating managers and professionals (Champion et al 1998) which implies a job-related process for counterurbanisation to be important. Others have suggested that the middle-classes hold notions of the rural idyll particularly strongly (Thrift 1989; Lowe et al, 1995) and given the restricted planning policies and subsequent high house prices in sought-after rural locations access may be limited to those social groups who can afford it (Cloke et al 1991).
Some studies have suggested that rural in-migration may be associated with a downward shift in occupational class. Hoggart (2000) showed the most common class characteristic, associated with rural in-migration, was a withdrawal from the professional and managerial classes. A case study by Bolton and Chalkley (1990) also seemed to suggest that for some in-migrants in rural areas an economic downshift into less highly paid work may be accepted as a trade-off for their residential preferences. This may reflect the findings of Fielding (1998) whereby the move into self-employment was particularly pronounced and where a move away from the metropolitan South East region to a non-metropolitan region may represent a 'step-off' the social mobility escalator (Fielding 1991). More will be said on this later. The study of Perry et al (1986) also implies a social downshift with rural in-migration and suggests that the desire to be 'one's own boss' supersedes upward mobility. However it is also important to consider that a downshift may be an unintended consequence of rural in-migration. This may pertain to migrants who move first and seek work second and are over-optimistic about the scale of highly qualified opportunities. This was indeed found to be the case with some of Cornwall's in-migrants (Buck et al, 1993).

Finally, it is necessary to reiterate here that out-migration is occurring from rural areas and it too is fairly selective consisting largely of skilled manual and unskilled workers (Buller et al 2003, p. 20). Furthermore, while the high rates of young out-migration from rural areas was described above to be closely associated with children of in-migrant households, it has also been found to be class related. Two case studies of rural out-migration in Scotland by Jamieson (2000) and Stockdale (2004) both found similar patterns with young people of
middle-class families having the strongest propensity to migrate. It is important however, to consider how social class interacts with educational aspirations particularly as it has been suggested here to be highly linked to young out-migration from rural areas. The fact that further or higher education accounted for 70% of out-migrants in Stockdale’s (2004, p. 175) sample seems to confirm this.

1.3.2.3 Economic position

As it was outlined above, the majority of rural in-migrant households contain individuals who are in work (Champion et al, 1998). In a study of urban to rural migration in England during 1990-91, Findlay et al showed that 43% of in-migrants were employed and 6% were self-employed after moving (Findlay et al, 1999 p. 12). This was also the general finding in Stockdale’s (2000) study of in-migration in two rural and peripheral areas in Scotland. Though the sample included 'urbanising', 'counterurbanising' and 'lateral' rural in-migrants it showed that 51% were employed and 9% were self-employed (Stockdale et al, 2006 p. 359). These findings would seem to suggest that employment is an important and necessary component for the majority of rural in-migrants.

The degree to which rural in-migrants utilise local employment however may vary from across different types of rural areas. Cross (1990) found that longer-distance commuting was prevalent amongst rural in-migrants in 1970s, particularly for rural districts that were accessible to larger urban areas. This was also found to be the case in the study of Findlay et al where 29% in-migrants in South Warwickshire, next to the West Midland
metropolitan area, commuted (travelled more than 20km to work) compared to only 12% in East Devon (Findlay et al, 1999 p. 40).

The study of Champion and Atkins' (2000) also suggests that counterurbanising in-migrants were fairly average in terms of labour market activity on arrival in LDNM areas. Although they displayed marginally lower rates of economic activity this was due mostly to there being a larger share of retirees. Employment and unemployment levels were fairly similar to national proportions. However, as the study used longitudinal data it meant that migrant characteristics at the position of origin could be analysed. An important point to note here is that while in-migrants economic position more or less reflected the national picture after moving, these were far higher before moving. As such, migration is shown to be associated with a marked decrease in labour market participation between 1981 and 1991 (ibid, p. 11). This seems to indicate a degree of 'downshifting' in terms of labour market participation, much like the trends identified with changes to social class, although again it is impossible to know if this was intended or not.

Finally although the majority of rural in-migration involves working-age employed people, this may mask the existence of what some have termed as 'consumption-led migration' (Bell 1995) whereby working-age migrants are able to choose to live in comparatively cheap locations that are rich in amenities because they are relatively free of work constraints, (Champion et al 1998). This may relate to those making a pre-retirement migration where employment concerns may be short-term compared to residential preferences. Ultimately pre-retirement strategies may be difficult to ascertain from the
economic position of migrants alone but it is an assertion that certainly gains support in the findings of Perry et al where many seemingly entrepreneurial in-migrants in Cornwall were actually uninterested in business growth and tended to operate in a semi-retirement interest (Perry et al, 1986). However 'consumption-led migration' may better explain the unemployed, as standardised benefits payments stretch further in non-metropolitan areas, and the self-employed who can work from home more than most (Champion et al, 1998, p. 86). Indeed this last claim seems to be substantiated in part by the fact that rural areas attract those that a high level of self-employees, if not at the point of origin then increasingly at the point of destination, (Fielding 1992).

1.3.2.4 Housing

The impact of counterurbanisation and rural in-migration on housing has probably attracted more attention than any other theme and these issues will be examined later. Here the aim is to examine the evidence pertaining to the housing characteristics of rural in-migrants.

Firstly it is necessary to draw attention once again to Champion and Atkins (2000) study. This shows that 68% of in-migrants moving from metropolitan areas to LDNM counties were in owner occupied housing before moving in 1981 compared to only 63% nationally (ibid, p. 8). Moreover, the transition in tenures over the course of the migration served to increase the level of owner occupiers by 11% by 1991. While this was in line with the national trend it still contributed to the fact that counterurban in-migrants in LDNM counties were more likely to be in owner occupied housing than the population of LDNM counties as a whole (ibid, p.8-9). These findings are widely supported by other studies.
which suggest that the tenure of owner occupancy is found to be proportionally more prevalent within counterurban migrants compared to the population as a whole, (Boyle, 1993).

These findings were also reflected in the study of rural in-migration in Scotland by Stockdale et al (2000). Interestingly their study also showed the comparative housing advantages exhibited by in-migrants in terms of accommodation type and size. The findings show that 69% of incomer migrants were living in detached housing in the destination compared to only 60% of the long-term population. In terms of house size, 34% of incomer migrants were in houses of four or more bedrooms while this accounted for 29% of long-term residents (ibid, p. 254). If conventional wisdom suggests that detached housing is the most desirable form of accommodation then rural in-migrants can be seen to do particularly well.

Evidence on the relationship between housing, counterurbanisation and rural in-migration however is not simple. Champion et al (1998) highlight how variations in house prices may act as a constraining factor to migration, particularly for owner occupiers. They draw attention to Bover’s (1998) argument that during booms in the housing market home owners in the South East\(^1\) were disinclined by the prospect of missing out on further price hikes and/or the prospect of not being able to return while during downturns it was hard to sell properties. However, if counterurban migrations are intended to be permanent

\(^1\) The South East region is claimed to be the principle source region of counterurban flows – see Fielding (1998)
relocations then the prospect of returning ceases to become a factor. Indeed, house price booms may actually be enabling of such moves rather than constraining them.

Hamnett (1992) suggests that housing in the owner occupied market is now seen by its commodity value as well as use value and proposes that a move from a high price area to a low price region can release equity. This may be of greatest appeal for those who are less motivated and constrained by employment such as the pre-retired, retired and to a lesser extent families with children; all three having been shown to be prominent counterurbanising rural in-migrants. While Hamnett (1992) does explicitly state that there is a lack of empirical evidence related to migration decisions based on house prices, there may be some support in the commodification argument in the logit analyses by Thomas (1993). He showed that non-job movers and retirees were deterred from moving to areas of high house prices whereas there was no effect on job movers (ibid, p 1266). This would make seem to make sense as migrants moving for jobs may be more prepared to face the trade-off of higher housing costs in favour of greater incomes. Alternately, income gains would be less significant for in-migrants whom work has become of lesser importance and they would in fact be incentivised by potential equity gains in the housing transaction.

1.3.2.5 Rural in-migration and the escalator region

It is important to reiterate the heterogeneous socio-economic characteristics of rural in-migrants and those described here are the similarities which are identified in aggregate terms. That said the characteristics of rural in-migrants do seem to fit fairly well with Fielding’s (1992) assertions about the relationship between spatial and social mobility.
Fielding claims that the South East as an ‘escalator region’ enabling individuals to achieve rapid social mobility. The key point is that he claims that some individuals, presumably of high occupational class, ‘step-off’ the escalator near to retirement and move to an environmentally-attractive non-escalator region such as the South West. In doing so they ‘cash-in’ assets by selling a comparatively expensive property in the South East and buying within a low priced area (Fielding, 1991 p. 4). Champion rightly points out that Fielding infers this process from the characteristics of individuals moving to and from the South East rather than from a longitudinal study of the same individuals through time (Champion et al. 1998 p. 97). However the process of stepping-off the escalator may hold true for certain rural in-migrants given that rural in-migration has been shown here to be associated with pre-retirement aged individuals, the higher occupational classes and high levels of owner occupancy.

1.4. Impacts of counterurbanisation

The discussion on the causes and dynamics of counterurbanisation underpins this next section in which attention is focused on the possible implications of counterurbanisation, but more specifically rural in-migration. This will examine the some of the commonly discussed implications of counterurbanisation on rural areas in regard to demography, economy and labour market, social and housing effects.

1.4.1 Demographic impacts

Clearly the most obvious and dramatic demographic effect of counterurbanisation for rural and peripheral areas is the increase in population. Without in-migration rural areas would
revert to depopulation, not just through out-migration but by natural change as rural
districts had an excess of deaths over births between 1991 and 2001 of 18,600 (Buller et al.,
2003). Given that population growth alone has a wide range of implications effecting
changes within the labour market, housing market and service provision, to mention but a
few, these effects will be discussed in separate sub-sections. Here the focus will lie purely
with the compositional changes that are brought about by the selective inflows and
outflows from rural areas.

The previous discussions have shown that the pattern of counterurbanisation involves net
migration population growth in rural areas, however it is also essential to recognise that net
migration may “mask a variety of more complex changes taking place within rural areas”,
(Champion & Watkins 1991, p. 9). While net-migration growth merely represents a surplus
of in-migrants over out-migrants, the previous discussions have shown how the
demographic compositions of the two migratory flows differ substantially and it is this that
provides one of the most obvious examples of how migration can be a force for change.
Counterurbanisation has specifically contributed to the redistribution of people between age
groups (Champion, 1993) with some of the most extreme effects being experienced in rural
areas.

As discussed above, rural in-migration is prevalent among the pre-pensionable,
pensionable-aged and the middle working-age with their children while out-migration is
predominantly young working-age individuals. The net effect is that rural areas reflect an
exaggerated picture of the wider population in terms of an ageing population, (Buller et al
2003). On the face of it, the large growth in middle-age people and children, most commonly family units, would seemingly offer some resolution to this ageing process yet this has actually been claimed to be adding to the ageing process rather than relieving it. The evidence discussed above showed how the out-migration of young adults was disproportionately fuelled by children of previous in-migrants. Champion and Shepherd (2006) agree with this and claim that while many children grow-up to leave rural areas, most parents stay behind for the duration of their lives 'ageing in place', moving from pre-retirement into retirement and old-age (ibid p. 24). Essentially, it may be argued that middle-age families and children provide only a short-term fillip to the age profile of rural areas.

At a national level there is little controversy in the demographic ageing that has, and will continue to characterise Britain. The evidence suggests that the age-specific internal migration flows associated with counterurbanisation has accentuated this phenomenon within rural areas and is likely to continue to do so. Champion and Shepherd (2006) show the differential rates of population change within a typology of districts in England during 1993-2003 (table 2). This shows how rural districts had a substantially higher rate of growth for the three oldest age groups and a larger percentage decrease in the 15-29 cohorts compared to urban areas and the national average. It is also clear that there is an increase in 0-14 year olds in rural districts compared to the overall decline nationally and the large decrease in urban areas. Furthermore when looking at the more detailed urban and rural typology, it is clear that the rate of increase in the three oldest age groups is associated with the increasing rural nature of a district and that the highest increase for 0-14 year olds is
experienced in the most rural of all districts. The percentage change over 1993-2003 therefore shows how rural areas are marked by the growth and decrease in those age groups that are most synonymous with rural in-migration.

Table 1.2: Population change, 1993-2003, for broad age groups, by district type, percent for decade

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>District type</th>
<th>All ages</th>
<th>0-14</th>
<th>15-29</th>
<th>30-44</th>
<th>45-59</th>
<th>60-74</th>
<th>75+</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>-1.8</td>
<td>-8.0</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>-3.4</td>
<td>-5.9</td>
<td>13.4</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>-5.8</td>
<td>9.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>-12.5</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>20.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Major Urban</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>-2.6</td>
<td>-4.7</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>8.8</td>
<td>-7.5</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Large Urban</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>-5.9</td>
<td>-7.4</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>-5.4</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Urban</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>-2.9</td>
<td>-7.1</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Significant Rural</td>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>-12.0</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>14.0</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural-50</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>-13.6</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>6.3</td>
<td>20.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rural-80</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>-11.9</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>21.2</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>21.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Champion and Shepherd also provide the projected population change by district type for 2003-2028. Figure 1.1 shows that England as a whole is predicted to increase across the three oldest age groups but particularly for those aged 60 years and over. Of particular interest is the notable gradient of increase in the 60 years and above population, particularly for the 75+ cohort, which runs inversely to the urban hierarchy. Clearly while the ageing process is consistent across all the area types in England, the effect of age-specific migration flows in rural areas contribute to the fact “that rural areas are in the vanguard of this process”, (Champion & Shepherd 2006, p. 32). It may therefore be argued that rural in-migration compensates for negative natural change at the same time as strengthening that trend.
1.4.2 Economic Impacts

1.4.2.1 Exogenous growth

Admittedly, changes to the geography of employment from employment decentralisation were arguably causes of rural in-migration rather than effects however on the basis that the two are linked it seems worthy of mentioning the economic impacts here.

Fielding (1982; 1990; 1998) explains how employers in manufacturing and service industries sought to achieve greater profitability by locating firms increasingly in rural areas. These areas also appealed on the basis of lower land costs, cheaper and more reliable and manageable workforces and local authorities that encouraged investment. This led to a marked increase in employment opportunities in many rural areas as new offices and factories sprung-up. As has been highlighted earlier, the evidence suggests that growth in
manufacturing in rural areas did indeed outperform that of urban areas between 1960 and 1991 (North, 1998) and growth in the service sector was equally impressive (Seymour 2000). Fielding provides a number of blessings resulting from the employment increases. He suggests that,

"people with poorly developed skills...could now find work locally...an increase in female activity rates enhanced household incomes...for ordinary working people in rural areas counterurbanisation brought higher wages, less un- or underemployment...it transformed rural economies...it brought in new income in the form of more and higher wages, it changed occupational structure away from declining sectors and towards high growth ones...this led to a virtuous circle of development assisted by the local multiplier effects of the new investments" (Fielding, 1990 p.234-6).

While the growth in employment in rural areas associated with counterurbanisation can certainly be viewed as a blessing, Pratt (1994) suggests they were nevertheless subject to a somewhat exploitative core-periphery relationship. Indeed, Fielding accepts that employment decentralisation was not just a spatial fix but it was also temporary. He states that "the recession in the 1970s led to the closure of many rural branch-plants. Often the service-class employees would be redeployed but, typically, the other employees would be less fortunate" (Fielding 1990, p.237). The argument can be made that the most peripheral rural areas were particularly vulnerable, not just because it was here that branch-plants were most common but because investment in these places had been underpinned by state-financial assistance (Fielding, 1982). While it may be argued that the longer-term gains in employment off-set the loss of a minority of branch-plants, there is evidence to suggest the closures may have been more harmful than could have been anticipated. Perry et al (1986) suggest that in Cornwall the closures of branch-plants had the effect of 'importing' unemployment because a large proportion of in-migrants who moved to the county with the new factories and offices decided against leaving when they closed or relocated. This had
the effect of increasing competition in a burgeoning labour force during a time of uncertainty in the local labour market.

A note of caution also applies to the degree that rural economies were transformed. Evidence has shown that the long-term trend over the last 40 years has seen decreasing levels of employment in primary industries with the occupational structures of rural areas coming better to reflect the national picture (Countryside Agency, 1999). However this should also be viewed with a level of caution because, as Fielding states, the nature of decentralisation still retained an urban to rural bias in terms of the value of production stages. He argues that corporate headquarters were retained in metropolitan regions and accessible rural areas became favoured locations for much of the research and development operations while the lower-end routine activities were more commonly sited in the peripheral rural areas, (Fielding 1990, p. 231). One possible effect of 'distance-decay' in the quality of decentralised activities is that although remote rural areas show a similar occupational structure to accessible rural areas and urban areas, average household and individual income is nevertheless notably lower than in accessible rural or urban areas (DEFRA, 2004). Therefore, while increased employment and sectoral convergence is likely to have improved income levels in rural areas, comparative income differentials still appear to be particularly prevalent in the more remote areas. Green and Hardill (2003) provide a number of reasons for this. They suggest that rural areas have a low proportion of knowledge-intensive occupations which are high value, the occupations in the service sector are skewed towards the lower value personal services rather than the professional and technical occupations and extensive part-time employment is often low wage and may
actually contribute to increased unemployment particular seasonally, (ibid, p. 14). Again, these issues are not necessarily an impact of rural in-migration but they may reflect the unequal spatial distribution of exogenous growth, growth which is argued to have been the prime generator of counterurbanisation (Fielding, 1982).

1.4.2.2 Endogenous growth

Employment growth may not only be exogenous and initiated by large firms relocating activities. Stockdale argues that “the prospects for endogenous development are inextricably linked to contemporary migration processes” given that migration can add or remove valuable human resources (Stockdale, 2006 p. 357). Findlay et al (2000) are fairly unequivocal in their optimism about the job-generating potential of in-migration for rural economies. This optimism is based upon two studies of rural in-migration in England and Scotland and relates to the direct growth of employment from in-migrants’ businesses and additional job growth through their effect on increasing demand for goods and services.

In both studies Findlay et al (1999; 2000) focused mainly on self-employed in-migrants as individuals who are bringing jobs rather than taking jobs on arrival. In England 22% of in-migrant heads of household (HOH) were self-employed while 21% were so in the Scotland study. In the England study 81% of self-employed in-migrants employed no additional labour but of the 19% that did a total of 244 additional full-time jobs were created (Findlay et al, 1999 p. 62). In Scotland the percentage employing additional staff was 44% which created 110 additional jobs (Findlay et al, 2000 p. 344). Both studies indicated important differences to job-generating potential depending on the sector that in-migrants worked in
with the professional services created the most additional jobs and primary industry activities creating the least. This optimistic picture is not shared by all rural areas however as Stockdale found only 9% of in-migrants to be self-employed in depopulating rural areas thereby limiting the potential for endogenous business creation (Stockdale, 2006 p. 359).

One of the most interesting aspects of the two studies conducted by Findlay et al (1999; 2000) was that the dominant reason given by self-employed in-migrants for moving to rural areas was ‘quality of life’ rather than economic reasons. Moreover, in the case of the England study, 41% of self-employed in-migrants had been full-time employees before moving. Findlay et al suggest that “migration to a rural area was part of their life goals in shifting to becoming self-employed, and that setting up a business was, in part, an outcome of the migration process” (Findlay et al, 1999 p. 61). As such they observe that “quality of life and rural economic growth can therefore be seen as complementary to one another” (Findlay et al, 2000 p. 343).

It should also be noted that other research into the entrepreneurship of rural in-migrants has painted a somewhat less optimistic picture. Studies by Brown (1987) and Shaw and Williams (1987) both highlight examples of rural areas in which lifestyle-orientated in-migrants often enter into tourism entrepreneurship but few have formal business goals, experience or expertise. Indeed, this was somewhat reflected in the entrepreneurial in-migrants identified by Perry et al (1986) where few rural in-migrant businesses operated beyond a semi-retirement interest and most employed few people beyond their own family unit. The importance of entrepreneurial attitudes should therefore not be assumed to go
hand in hand with self-employment. Indeed Stockdale draws attention to a quote by Cecora (2000) stating that “all entrepreneurs are self-employed but not all self-employed persons are entrepreneurs” (in Stockdale, 2006 p. 356).

1.4.2.3 Multiplier effects

Leaving aside the direct job growth associated with rural in-migration, growth in the population alone can be said to have benefited many rural areas. At the most basic level, the population turnaround can be claimed to have halted or reversed the negative effects associated with rural depopulation. This is manifest in a loss of public services such as schools, health provision and transport as well as the closure of local shops and other community amenities (DETR, 2000). The other side to the argument is that population growth in rural areas resulting not just from local workers, but also commuters and retirees, has had a multiplier effect of indirectly creating jobs by adding to the demand for goods and services (Findlay et al, 2000). While the two studies of Findlay et al (1999; 2000) were unable to measure indirect multiplier effects of rural in-migrants they did show that in-migrants directly generated a number of additional private service jobs although these were most frequently lower skilled, lower wage, part-time jobs such as cleaners, gardeners and childminders. Indeed, they suggest that the job generation potential of the wider in-migrant flow was substantially less beneficial to economic growth in rural labour markets when compared to that of the self-employed in-migrants.

The size and nature of rural population growth can also be argued to have increased consumer spending within the rural private sector. Fielding argues that small and medium
sized businesses increased their market due to the arrival of large numbers of service class customers with high incomes and retirees with high disposable incomes from company pensions (Fielding, 1998 p. 55-6). It could also be argued that those in-migrants who benefited from favourable house price differentials at their point of origin compared to those in rural areas also had large disposable incomes by realising equity. However analyses of expenditure patterns by Findlay et al (1999) suggest that only a small proportion of in-migrant expenditure actually gets spent locally. They compared the proportion of in-migrants and long-term residents shopping within their immediate neighbourhood and those who made their purchases in neighbouring urban areas or out of town shopping centres. Although they found that both groups carried out the majority of their purchases, in the form of weekly food shopping, out of town and in neighbouring urban areas, long-term residents purchased more locally than did migrants” (ibid, p. 65). While these trends in expenditure patterns relate just to England, similar findings were identified in Scotland too (Stockdale et al, 2000).

1.4.2.4 Loss of social capital

A final point to note about the economic effects of counterurbanisation relates not only to the impact on the rural labour market of those people moving in but also the implications of those people that rural areas continue to lose. As discussed earlier, counterurbanisers and rural in-migrants are disproportionately higher skilled individuals including professionals, managers and those in the service classes (Champion & Atkins, 2000) and this represents “a valuable source of human capital” (Stockdale, 2006 p. 356). However, what has also been brought to light previously is that rural areas continue to be net losers of young
working age adults, (CRC, 2007). Whether young people move away for education (Owen & Green, 1992) or for better work prospects, (Stockdale, 2004) Terluin claims that “the outflow of the economically active suggests a pessimistic economic climate and erodes the human resource base” (2003, p. 340). The fact is that rural labour markets are still comparatively low-skilled and job opportunities are limited in terms of quality (Green and Hardill, 2003). The implication can therefore be made that the most dynamic young people in rural areas are obliged to seek social promotion elsewhere while the limited number of higher skilled jobs are frequently taken by highly skilled in-migrants.

The possible implication for rural economies, of this seemingly paradoxical relationship, is argued by Green and Hardill (2003) to be “the emergence of a ‘low skill equilibrium’: a situation in which employers compete in low value added markets and demand relatively low skills from employees, which is ultimately reflected in the supply of skills”, (ibid, p. ii). This seems to present rural economies with a dilemma; up-skill the labour market and the current labour force do not have the skills for the jobs, they are more than likely going to be taken by in-migrants, however, up-skilling the labour force would lead to the skilled moving away in search of a higher skilled labour market. A significant challenge facing rural economies at present would therefore seem to be how to simultaneously achieve a higher value, higher skilled, labour market whilst balancing this with the local specificity of training and skills of the labour force, (ibid, p. iii). Without this being achieved it may be argued that rural areas will continue to rely largely on in-migrants to fulfil skill shortages and continue to lose human capital in the form of some of the most potentially dynamic and
entrepreneurial young adults (Stockdale, 2006). The loss of young out-migrants may also be related to housing issues so it is these impacts to which attention now turns.

1.4.3 Housing impacts

The housing impacts associated with counterurbanisation may be viewed both positively and negatively. Fielding (2000) argues that the increased population and subsequent demand for land and property in rural areas benefited those in a position to sell. Farmers and small landowners were said to have enhanced their wealth considerably while more substantial landowners often became agents of development and investment in local towns and industrial estates, (ibid, p. 235). Moreover, Fielding claims that in-migrants brought with them an enthusiasm to restore and renovate many disused or dilapidated properties giving the physical geography of rural areas a much needed fillip. On the downside he suggests that for those not fortunate to be owners of land or property and for many on low incomes the price of houses and rents increased to levels beyond their means. The impact of this was said to be felt most by the younger generations who could not compete with the purchase power of the in-migrating members in the professional and service classes. Indeed Fielding claims that “paradoxically, at just that moment jobs were more available than they had been for a century or more, young people were being forced out of the villages and small towns towards the cities, because it was there that large stocks of poor but affordable housing were to be found”, (ibid, p. 236).

This issue has attracted much attention. Findlay et al (1999) go as far as stating that “there is widespread agreement that housing – specifically housing affordable to ‘locals’ – is the
foremost social issue arising in the context of urban to rural migration in the UK” (ibid, p. 67). Most of the literature pertaining to the problems of housing availability and affordability in rural areas focuses on the 1980s and thereafter. Nevertheless, Lowe et al (1997) suggest that the combination of increased demand and restricted supply for rural land created housing shortages in rural areas as early as the 1960s. However the 1980s saw a wealth of research beginning to focus on the problems of access to rural housing faced by those on lower incomes, (Shucksmith, 1981; Phillips & Williams, 1982; Cloke & Thrift 1987).

Counterurbanisation has arguably been a direct contributory factor to an increased demand for rural housing not only by increasing rural populations but also by the household formations of rural in-migrants. It has been argued above that counterurbanisation has exaggerated the ageing of rural population profiles. This results in added pressure on private housing as under-occupancy of housing is fairly prevalent among older people in rural areas and results in diminished stocks of family-sized accommodation (Phimister et al, 2003). While the stereotypical view is often that migrants have pushed up rural house prices, a view supported by 64% of long-term residents and even 54% of migrants in the study by Findlay et al (1999 p. 86), it is not mono-causal. Coinciding with increasing demand for rural housing, Bramley suggests that “environmentally orientated planning policies have restricted the supply of new housebuilding, pushing up prices dramatically and excluding new households of local origin from the owner-occupation market” (Bramley, 1995, p. 6). While it is true that rural house prices will differ geographically to
some degree, it is the fact that incomes remain substantially lower in rural areas (Defra, 2004) that compounds the problems of affordability.

It may be claimed that many rural in-migrants are better placed to outbid longer-term residents as they are likely to have greater incomes to call upon. Indeed, the higher purchasing power of migrants is supported by income analyses carried out by Stockdale et al (2000). However, the higher purchasing power of in-migrants relates not only to income. Rural in-migration has also been shown to involve a high proportion of retirees and fewer young people. Therefore this will represent fewer first time buyers and will contain a high proportion of people that are likely to have amassed a larger amount of equity, given the later stage of their housing career. Add to this the possibility that migrants may have accrued large monetary gains by selling in a high priced area and buying in a comparatively low priced area (Hamnett, 1992) and migrants may be in a more advantageous market position than income measures alone suggest. Regardless of the reasons behind migrants' higher purchasing power, the patterns of tenure and property type discussed here seem to imply a level of advantage amongst rural in-migrants. Findlay et al (1999) show that in-migrants in rural areas were not only more likely to be in the larger and detached thus desirable, properties, they also enjoyed higher levels of ownership compared to longer-term residents (ibid, p. 68). Moreover, the purchasing power of in-migrants may shed some light on recent findings by the CRC whereby 43% of house sales in the most rural districts were cash-sales and that net migration was found to be a strong inter-related factor (CRC, 2007 p. 4).
A further issue is that at the same time as market prices for private housing increase beyond local affordability levels, the supply of rented accommodation is small and shrinking (Bramley, 1995). According to the 2001 Census social housing is reported to account for just 12% of the rural housing stock compared to 21% in urban areas (CRC, 2007, p. 33). Other research suggests that dramatic reductions in public sector housing were particularly marked in rural areas due to the introduction of Right to Buy (RTB) and the subsequent faster take-up and greater sales in rural areas of public-owned properties (Pawson & Watkins, 1998). Moreover, Milbourne (1998) claims that there was often ambivalence and inertia on the part of local authorities in the provision of new social housing. While the Registered Social Landlord (RSL) scheme sought to provide housing associations and replenish public housing stocks, Hoggart (1993) suggests that the urban centres were the largest recipients of this and that RSL schemes have failed to impact upon the housing need of rural areas. Essentially then the problems of availability and affordability have been due to sectoral supply, (Clark, 1997) to the extent that the Commission for Rural Communities (2007) have estimated that an extra 14-19,000 affordable homes are required annually in rural areas to meet current demand.

While the lack of supply is more attributable to planning conditions than to counterurbanisation directly, Long (2004) suggests that in-migrant middle class households have been “instrumental in effectively utilising planning policies to limit rural housing”, (ibid, p. 114). Having moved to their ‘rural idyll’ it is claimed that in-migrants will often go to considerable effort to protect it from further expansion or development, (Murdoch & Marsden, 1994) so that ‘Not-In-My-Back-Yard’ (NIMBY) coalitions gain strength from
politically and socially astute in-migrants. Therefore it may be argued that counterurbanisation has contributed to increasing the inability of many rural residents to gain access to the owner occupancy market. It can be argued that in-migration has added demand directly to the private market, indirectly to the public market and plays a role in opposing new supplies of housing which may alleviate the housing needs in rural areas. With the countryside being less accessible to certain groups Murdoch (1998) suggests that rural areas will become increasingly socially homogenous, a debate which will be turned to in the following section.

1.4.4 Social impacts

1.4.4.1 Social class

Given the class-selectivity of rural in-migration (discussed above) and with the pressures on affordability, Shucksmith (2000) claims that many rural areas increasingly become the exclusive preserve of the higher income classes (Shucksmith, 2000). The theme of rural areas becoming increasingly ‘middle-class territory’ has been taken forward most prominently in the work of Phillips (1993) and Murdoch and Marsden (1994). Even Hoggart (2000), while suggesting that claims of a dominance of middle-classes in the country are largely exaggerated, also recognises that the number of people in professional and managerial occupations in rural areas has increased absolutely and relatively.

The effect of rural in-migration on the social restructuring and recomposition of rural areas has often been referred to as a process of gentrification. Phillips suggests that rural gentrification is often taken to mean a dual process of “middle-class in-migration or
colonisation and the displacement of the working class” (2000, p. 1). The effect of such has been argued to have led to increasingly homogeneity in the social complexion of rural areas as a result of in-migrants replacing the ‘indigenous’ population (Murdoch, 1998). It has also been claimed that new incoming populations have sought a post-productivist and consumption-based rural way of life (Halfacree and Boyle, 1998), investing in the rural idyll which may often be contested by the local populations who were still focused upon agricultural-based activities (Halfacree, 1994). One site of possible contestation is in the running of community institutions whereby affluent newcomers may be more zealous in exerting their idealised view of rural community life at the expense of that of poorer locals, (Murdoch and Marsden, 1994). However while Findlay et al (1999) found that rural in-migrants, particularly those on high incomes, were pro-active in local community activities, there was scant evidence to suggest that in-migrants took over the running of local affairs (ibid, p. 79-80). That said, the proliferation of the middle-classes in rural England led Cloke et al (1995) to suggest that notions of middle-class and rurality have become evermore discursively connected whereby previously middle-class was used to signify rural, now rural was becoming increasingly used to signify middle-class.

On the one hand, rural gentrification can be viewed as being positive for the physical environment, seemingly fitting Fielding’s (1990) assertions that in-migrants were instrumental in improving rural environments through investments and renovations of old buildings. However, it can also be claimed that the process of gentrification can act to exclude lower income groups from rural areas. Smith and Phillips (2001) suggest that although it begins with small-scale purchases and renovation of cheap and dilapidated
properties it soon becomes more commercial and the subsequent commodification of rural idyllic properties leads to escalating house prices. This is also partly due to the fact that gentrifiers themselves actively restrict further housing developments through participation of the land-use planning system (Phillips, 1993) they serve to keep housing demand high. In this respect rural gentrification may be seen to amplify what Shucksmith states as being the “geographical segregation between rich (in attractive rural areas) and poor (in the cities)”, (Shucksmith, 2000 p. 8). Taking a slightly more cautious viewpoint Buller et al suggest “in what might be portrayed as their increasingly narrow social homogeneity, rural communities are arguably less inclusive than they were leading, for example, to pronounced divisions...between the agricultural community, ever more encapsulated, and an ex-urban rural residential class” (Buller et al, 2003, p. 42).

1.4.4.2 Deprivation

Given that the evidence suggests that rural areas are becoming increasingly middle-class and the preserve of higher income groups, it may therefore seem counterintuitive to point toward a growing literature on problems of rural deprivation. Nevertheless, a great deal has been written in recent years on the deprivation and social exclusion faced by people living in rural Britain, see particularly CRC (2006) and also Shucksmith (2003) for a review of recent research findings. However, rather than focusing on all themes of deprivation and exclusion in rural areas, is necessary here to attempt to draw out those aspects which may be in part related to rural in-migration.
It is useful first to emphasise what the concepts of deprivation and social exclusion actually mean because as Cloke et al suggest the concepts have often been used as a “catch-all for various problematics” without reference to their meaning or defined signifiers (Cloke et al, 1995, p. 212). Townsend (1987) suggests that the concept of deprivation can be applied to a process whereby people lack the resources which are customary to the society in which they belong. People therefore suffer deprivation if they are unable to attain customary material resources such as housing, household facilities and diet but it also relates to a lack of customary social resources such as education, employment and health care provision. As such, deprivation is a relative concept but it is also more than just a lack of income or material wealth even though this may be its most common cause. Social exclusion is generally taken to represent what can happen when an individual experiences multiple aspects of deprivation which results in limiting their access to customary levels of social, economic and political participation.

The largest evidence base for recent deprivation levels in England is the Index of Multiple Deprivation (IMD) 2004 (ODPM, 2004). The 2004 IMD showed that most deprived areas in England are found in urban areas with only 6% of residents in the most deprived areas living in rural areas despite their 28% share of the national population (Defra, 2004 p. 43). However, Commins (2004), amongst others, have stressed that rural deprivation is characterised by invisibility because it is widely dispersed as opposed to urban deprivation which is largely concentrated in limited geographical areas. Interestingly, the invisibility of deprivation may also be accentuated by the process of rural in-migration and subsequent

---

2 The IMD measures geographical concentrations of deprivation across a number of domain indices such as income deprivation, health deprivation and education deprivation. This gives area-level measurements of deprivation levels for Super Output Areas (please see the methods section for a more in depth discussion).
compositional changes. Cloke et al (1995) suggest that as rural areas are becoming more affluent due to the influx of wealthy middle-class newcomers this helps to conceal persisting deprivation within much of the longer-term population. Shucksmith (2003) claims that the ecological fallacy of area-based rural deprivation levels is even more evident in the more socially heterogeneous rural areas because, as Bradley (1987) suggested, it is in rural rather than urban areas that the poorest live cheek-by-jowl with the most affluent. This sentiment is echoed by Champion and Watkins who suggest that while the rich and poor have always lived closely in the countryside, “what is different today is that the poorer groups are often outnumbered by the relatively wealthy and their plight is frequently forgotten” (Champion and Watkins, 1991, p. 16). Therefore, the selectivity of relatively wealthy in-migration may well contribute to the rural poor becoming increasingly ‘statistically marginalised’ (McLaughlin, 1986). The issue therefore relates to how deprivation levels are concealed within rural areas and this is said to be partly due to the nature of in-migration and subsequent compositional change.

Although the arguments suggest that rural deprivation is often hidden, various studies and research has highlighted some of the specific issues facing rural populations. Whereas only 1% of rural areas fall in the bottom 10% of overall most deprived areas, of the bottom 10% of areas suffering most deprivation in regards to ‘barriers to housing and services’, 48% are rural (DEFRA 2004 – annex b). Some of the issues relating rural in-migration to ‘barriers to housing’ have already been discussed however rural in-migration may also play a role in terms of barriers to housing. The CRC suggest that,
“there have been significant levels of in-migration to rural areas and these ‘incomers’ are predominantly affluent, high car-owning households, many of whom commute to urban areas for work and undertake many other activities such as shopping and recreational activities in these urban areas too, thus making very little use of the local facilities that do exist...and...thus making those public transport services that are available less viable” (CRC, 2006, p. 172).

We may therefore suggest that the high mobility levels and under-usage of local transport and services may have knock-on effects in terms ‘mobility deprivation’ and therefore ‘opportunity deprivation’ for the less mobile members in rural communities. Indeed, the CRC states that “transport provides access to the services and facilities that are a key part of most people’s lives such as employment, education, health services, shopping and leisure” (2006, p. 180). For those for whom mobility may be most restricted, those on low incomes and the unemployed, diminished transport services may be particularly harmful in terms of access to jobs or training opportunities (Shucksmith, 2000). Admittedly there is no evidence of a direct causal link between a mobile class of incomers and the loss of public transport but the inference is not unreasonable.

1.5. Summary

In summary, there is little debate that counterurbanisation is the dominant trend of population distribution in Britain and this has wide implications for rural areas. Though there is compelling evidence to suggest that environmental migration explains a large part of rural in-migration it has nevertheless been facilitated by changes to employment and in some cases the housing market. In short it is too simplistic to draw a dichotomy between environmental and economic explanations.
On an aggregate level, rural in-migration seems commonly associated with working-age families and pre-retirement and retirement aged families. Rural in-migrants seem to be commonly drawn from the higher occupational classes and they are likely to own their own homes. Necessarily there will be exceptions to these trends but the characteristics do seem to suggest that rural in-migrants more often than not fit the profile of individuals for whom the work/life balance may have shifted slightly to the latter.

Counterurbanisation and rural in-migration can be seen to have been associated with exogenous-led employment growth, in the early stages at least. Rural in-migration is shown to have significant potential for endogenous economic growth particularly if in-migrants are self-employed and entrepreneurial although the two are not necessary linked. Other than direct job growth in-migration may have a multiplier effect to the benefit of increased expenditure and subsequent employment growth. Housing is shown to be a substantial issue particularly in terms of rural in-migration limiting the access of 'locals' or poor individuals to rural housing markets. Finally, the compositional changes associated with rural in-migration can be argued to have contributed to rural areas becoming more middle-class and affluent. Furthermore, gentrification may be acting to both diminish and conceal deprivation in rural areas at the same time as compounding problems of mobility and opportunity deprivation for others.

Ultimately it is important to recognise that the causes and impacts of rural in-migration may vary according to the type of rural area under focus. Champion et al (1998, p. 63) suggest that the important attributes of areas such as "housing markets, job
markets...and...residential amenities...are perceived and acted upon in varying ways by
different population sub-groups”. Add to this the variability of time and the complexity of
counterurbanisation and rural in-migration comes into greater focus.
2 Counterurbanisation and in-migration in Cornwall

2.1 Introduction

The chapter begins with an outline of Cornwall’s position in the settlement system both in terms of its rurality and its remoteness. This is followed by a look at the pattern of counterurbanisation in Cornwall from the 1960s onwards. It is important to contextualise both the pattern and process of counterurbanisation against the specific economic and demographic history of Cornwall up to the 1960s. Section 2.4 deals with this.

The rest of the chapter is devoted to an examination of the process of counterurbanisation in Cornwall. This is divided into two main sections. The first focuses on the counterurbanisation process from 1960 to the late 1970s. The second section is more substantial and discusses evidence about the process from the 1980s onwards. This includes an in-depth appraisal of Cornwall’s economic characteristics at this time.

2.2 The rurality of Cornwall

Anecdotally Cornwall would no doubt feature in the minds of most people as rural. Indeed, the discourse used in countless tourism publications would seem to support this. However some claim that it is deceptive to simply think of Cornwall as rural (Biscoe in Rural Economic Strategy, 2003) so it is necessary to consider Cornwall in regard to some of the operational and conceptual definitions of rurality mentioned in the previous chapter.
In what seems to be the most frequently used operational definition of rurality, an area may be deemed to be rural if it has characteristics such as small settlement patterns, a low density of population and being some distance from large metropolitan areas in that it is fairly peripheral in the national settlement framework. Firstly, population density in Cornwall is below average at “1.4 persons per hectare compared to 2.1 persons per hectares in the South West and 3.8 persons per hectare in England” (Rural Economic Strategy, 2003, p. 9). Secondly, a description of Cornwall's geographical location by the Local Intelligence Network for Cornwall (LINC, 2005) emphasises its remoteness in terms of distance. The westernmost town of Penzance is 290 km from Bristol, the nearest main metropolitan area, and London is 450 km away. The city of Plymouth, on the Cornwall-Devon border is the nearest large city outside the county, nevertheless this is still 125 km from Penzance (ibid, p. 1).

Distance from metropolitan areas is not the only indicator of its peripheral location. Cornwall is also comparatively ill-served by transport links. The Local Transport Plan of Cornwall County Council (2006) states that the South West region’s main centre of Bristol is generally more than three hours travel by car, or four hours by train, from Cornwall’s administrative centre in Truro. Furthermore, a rail journey from London to Truro takes the same time as London to Glasgow, despite being 50% of the distance (ibid p.1). Finally, it also has methodological precedence in that every district in Cornwall was classified as being the ‘most remote rural’ type in the study by Boyle (1995). Figure 2.1 shows the old urban and rural classification in which Cornwall is clearly both rural and remote.
Though Cornwall is clearly rural and remote at the county level Perry (1993) suggests that it contains a fairly unusual configuration of urban and rural settlement patterns. He claims that as Cornwall never developed one central dominant conurbation "it is not a polarised region like neighbouring Devon" where the majority live in or near the urban concentrations of Plymouth, Torbay or Exeter with the remainder of the county relatively sparsely populated. He also points out that "it is not a homogenous region like parts of rural Wales, Scotland or Ireland with small agricultural market centres" (ibid, p. 24). Instead, Cornwall's settlement pattern falls somewhere between the two. The county has a wide
spread of small towns and villages with only a third living in towns of over 10,000 residents compared to four fifths in England and Wales (LINC, 2003). There are nine such towns and all but two lie in the centre and west of the county reflecting the historic pattern of industrialisation (Perry, 1993). At the other end of the scale around a fifth live in small settlements of less than 1,000 residents, another fifth live in villages of between 1,000 and 2,000 and over a quarter live in larger villages and small towns with populations between 2,000 and 10,000 (LINC, 2003).

The heterogeneity of Cornwall's settlement pattern is captured to a certain degree in table 2.1. This shows the 2005 Defra typology of local authorities based on the 2004 rural and urban classification of Census Output Areas. Large market towns are considered as being rural in this typology so only the district of Kerrier appears to have any 'urban population'. Excluding large market towns, rural areas still account for a substantial proportion of the population ranging from 44% in Kerrier to 84% in mainland Cornwall. This compares to 34% of the South West region as rural and only 19% nationally. Furthermore, it is apparent that mainland Cornwall is characterised by a high proportion of what is classified as dispersed population, the most 'rural' category of all. This ranges from 10% in Kerrier to as high as 20% in the district of North Cornwall compared to 6% for the South West and just 3% for England as a whole.

---

3 This is generally due to the area having historically been the dominant location for industrial metalliferous mining, consisting of the towns of Camborne and Redruth combined with the intervening communities.

4 Throughout the thesis the focus is on mainland Cornwall only omitting the Isles of Scilly unless otherwise stated.
Table 2.1: Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly Population by Defra 2005 district typology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Total Pop (000s)</th>
<th>Total Urban Pop</th>
<th>Large Market Town Pop</th>
<th>Rural Town Pop</th>
<th>Village Pop</th>
<th>Dispersed Pop</th>
<th>Total Rural (excluding Large Market Towns)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Isles of Scilly</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>93.2%</td>
<td>6.8%</td>
<td>100.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Cornwall</td>
<td>80.8</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>15.9%</td>
<td>31.2%</td>
<td>32.7%</td>
<td>20.1%</td>
<td>84.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caradon</td>
<td>79.7</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>17.8%</td>
<td>42.8%</td>
<td>25.3%</td>
<td>14.1%</td>
<td>82.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penwith</td>
<td>63.1</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>22.2%</td>
<td>32.7%</td>
<td>21.5%</td>
<td>13.6%</td>
<td>67.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restormel</td>
<td>95.5</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>44.0%</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
<td>17.7%</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>56.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrick</td>
<td>87.8</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
<td>54.5%</td>
<td>12.2%</td>
<td>22.5%</td>
<td>10.7%</td>
<td>45.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerner</td>
<td>92.5</td>
<td>43.1%</td>
<td>13.3%</td>
<td>11.8%</td>
<td>21.7%</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td>43.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>4,928</td>
<td>50.6%</td>
<td>15.3%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
<td>13.8%</td>
<td>6.4%</td>
<td>34.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England</td>
<td>49,142</td>
<td>73.1%</td>
<td>7.6%</td>
<td>9.1%</td>
<td>7.2%</td>
<td>3.1%</td>
<td>19.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Cornwall & Isles of Scilly Convergence Programme (2006)

2.3 The pattern of counterurbanisation in Cornwall

There is fairly conclusive evidence which shows that Cornwall was indeed at the vanguard of the counterurbanisation phenomenon from the outset. Cornwall had previously been characterised by depopulation for almost one hundred years (Mitchell, 1993) but as table 2.2 shows, this reversed in the 1950s with growth increasing dramatically in the following decades. Cornwall’s counterurbanisation trends are made apparent in the work of Champion (1987) in which he examines the population change of all counties in England and Wales and local government regions in Scotland for four periods in time, 1971-74, 1974-78, 1978-81 and 1981-1984. Cornwall features in the top quintile for percentage annual population growth for each period except 1978-81, when it appeared in the second quintile (ibid, p. 385). Moreover the study of counterurbanisation in Cornwall by Perry et al (1986) shows that “from 1961 to 1981 the population grew by a quarter and the rate of increase in the 1970s was double that of Devon and the South West region as a whole” (ibid, p. 42). The evidence from these sources therefore shows that population growth in Cornwall has been substantial since the 1960s both in relative and absolute terms.
Table 2.2: Population change in Cornwall 1951-1991

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population Growth (n)</strong></td>
<td>+ 1,750</td>
<td>+ 40,490</td>
<td>+ 43,800</td>
<td>+ 38,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population Growth (%)</strong></td>
<td>+ 0.5%</td>
<td>+ 12.1%</td>
<td>+ 11.7%</td>
<td>+ 11.2%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mitchell (1993, p. 142)

It is possible to extend Champion's (1987) analyses and examine the extent of absolute and relative population growth in Cornwall for more recent years. Table 2.3 uses ONS mid-year population estimates (MYE) to examine population growth in Cornwall over four periods, 1984-90, 1990-96, 1996-2001 and 2001-2005. For the period as a whole, between 1984 and 2005, the annual population growth rate in Cornwall was twice the national rate resulting in the gain of almost 80,000 people. Moreover, when this growth rate is compared with all 46 counties in England, including metropolitan counties such as London and Greater Manchester, only Cambridgeshire, Lincolnshire and Northamptonshire had a larger annual growth rate. As was the case with Champion's (1987) analyses, only once, during 1990-96, was Cornwall not in the top quintile for population change. This is largely explained by the low migration rates at the start of the 1990s when population mobility was inhibited by a housing market-led recession (Mitchell, 1993). More will be said on this later.

Table 2.3: Population growth in Cornwall, 1984-2005

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Population Growth (n)</strong></td>
<td>+ 30,000</td>
<td>+ 11,200</td>
<td>+ 21,200</td>
<td>+ 17,300</td>
<td>+ 79,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Annual Population Growth (%)</strong></td>
<td>+ 1.1%</td>
<td>+ 0.4%</td>
<td>+ 0.9%</td>
<td>+ 0.9%</td>
<td>+ 0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>England Population growth (%)</strong></td>
<td>+ 0.4%</td>
<td>+ 0.3%</td>
<td>+ 0.4%</td>
<td>+ 0.5%</td>
<td>+ 0.4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS mid-year population estimates (2007)
Although Cornwall has clearly experienced strong rates of population growth from the 1960s onwards, there were intra-county variations in the rates of population change. Perry et al (1986) showed that the initial growth in the 1960s took place first within the three central districts of Kerrier, Carrick and Restormel, specifically occurring in the larger towns. Growth in these districts peaked in percentage and absolute terms during the 1960s, though they continued to grow through the 1970s. In the three more ‘rural’ districts of Penwith, North Cornwall and Caradon, population loss was not turned to gain until the 1960s but growth then accelerated through the 1970s. This is largely explained by the fact that Kerrier, Carrick and Restormel include what Perry et al (1986) call the ‘urban core’ of Cornwall (ibid, p. 48-50). Mitchell (1993) shows that the larger towns accounted for a disproportionately large share of Cornwall’s population growth in the 1960s but this reversed over time. He showed that the larger towns’ share of overall growth had fallen from over a half in the 1960s to around a fifth by the 1980s while rural areas increased their share from around a third in the 1960s to over a half in the 1980s. Essentially the counterurbanisation pattern characterising Cornwall as a whole also came to be identified within the county at the very local level, as there was a shift over time from urban to rural areas (Mitchell, 1993 p. 146). However, the opening of the Tamar Bridge in 1961 cannot be understated in Caradon’s population growth. The increased ease of transport to and from Plymouth is likely to have facilitated a large amount of suburbanisation growth from Plymouth commuters.

Analyses of the period under study will be focused on in greater depth later, however over the last 25 years spatial growth rates have continued to be mixed across the county, though
growth has tended to be fastest in the east of Cornwall (LINC, 2003). North Cornwall and Restormel have recorded by far the highest rate of absolute and percentage growth between 1981 and 2004 which is argued to reflect the high level of house-building within these districts, itself partly influenced by more permissive planning policies (Miller, 2006).

Cornwall clearly provides a classic example of counterurbanisation, at least in terms of population growth. It is also possible to show that this has been solely the result of migration. Figure 2.2 shows that aside from one instance in 1987, Cornwall has recorded a higher rate of deaths over births in every year from 1974 to 2004, resulting in a negative rate of natural change. Indeed the study by Perry et al (1986) showed that growth between 1961 and 1981 was due to migration rather than any change in the number of births over deaths. They also stress that out-migration, particularly by the young, actually continued apace during this period but this was more than offset by the large numbers moving in (ibid, p. 43).
The importance of the migration component for population growth over the last two census decades can be seen in the following tables. Between 1981 and 1991 the population of Cornwall grew by 45,100\textsuperscript{5} resulting from a net migration gain of 50,100 more than counterbalancing a net loss of 5,000 people through natural change. Population growth was slightly less between 1991 and 2001 at 30,600 due to a larger decrease through natural change and a smaller net migration gain. Nevertheless, both decades show Cornwall as being characterised by negative rates of natural change and rates of net migration growth that are far beyond that experienced nationally or for the South West region as a whole.

\textsuperscript{5} These figures are from mid-year population estimates which were revised following the 2001 Census hence why the increase is larger than what Mitchell showed (table 2.2) which were Census counts.
Table 2.4: Components of population change 1981-1991 & 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Natural change</td>
<td>Migration / Other change</td>
<td>Natural change</td>
<td>Migration / Other change</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>N 000's</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N 000's</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>N 000's</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>426.4</td>
<td>-5.0</td>
<td>471.5</td>
<td>-1.2</td>
<td>502.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>4,381.4</td>
<td>-6.1</td>
<td>4,688.2</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>4,934.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eng &amp; Wales</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>-49,634.3</td>
<td>885.2</td>
<td>50,748.0</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>52,084.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Key population and vital statistics (2003), table 3.1

It is possible to take the analysis one step further by examining the extent to which population growth in Cornwall has been caused by net migration gains ‘cascading’ down the urban hierarchy. This is conducted using the same county-level classification as in Champion and Atkins’ (2000) study. Areas are classified as metropolitan, high density non-metropolitan (HDNM) or low density non-metropolitan (LDNM). Champion and Atkins’ study used the ONS Longitudinal Study to capture net migration which has advantages over one-year ‘snapshot’ migration data, a point that will be discussed in greater depth later. However this analyses use special migration statistics from the Census to examine net migration exchanges between Cornwall and the different area types for three periods, 1980-81, 1990-91 and 2000-01.

The following tables show that Cornwall gained in population from net migration with metropolitan and HDNM areas in all three periods. Cornwall gained least from exchanges with other LDNM areas in 1980-81 and actually had negative net migration in 1990-91 and

---

6 These analyses focus on migration exchanges between Cornwall and other counties in England. Champion & Atkins included areas from Wales too.
2000-01. The tables clearly show that migration gains in Cornwall have been predominantly from areas higher up the urban hierarchy and thus counterurbanisers have been a strong feature of Cornwall’s migratory profile. In summary, the strong population growth in Cornwall has resulted predominantly from net migration flows from areas higher up the settlement hierarchy. There can be little doubt that Cornwall is clearly a recipient of counterurbanisation.

Table 2.5: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 1980-81

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County type</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Out-migrants</th>
<th>Net migration to Cornwall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metropolitan</td>
<td>3174</td>
<td>1676</td>
<td>+1502</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>5402</td>
<td>3801</td>
<td>+1601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>4936</td>
<td>4454</td>
<td>+482</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Table 2.6: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 1990-91

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County type</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Out-migrants</th>
<th>Net migration to Cornwall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metropolitan</td>
<td>2602</td>
<td>1589</td>
<td>+1013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>4432</td>
<td>3401</td>
<td>+1031</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>4398</td>
<td>4614</td>
<td>-16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 1991 Census: Special Migration Statistics (Set 2)

Census output is Crown copyright and is reproduced with the permission of the Controller of HMSO

Table 2.7: Migration flows between Cornwall and other county-types 2000-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>County type</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Out-migrants</th>
<th>Net migration to Cornwall</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Metropolitan</td>
<td>3235</td>
<td>1985</td>
<td>+1250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>6716</td>
<td>4196</td>
<td>+2520</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low density non-metropolitan</td>
<td>6244</td>
<td>6550</td>
<td>-306</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Special Migration Statistics (Level 1)

Census output is Crown copyright and is reproduced with the permission of the Controller of HMSO
2.4 The economic and demographic history of Cornwall 1800-1960

Before an in-depth assessment of possible explanations for counterurbanisation in Cornwall there is value in assessing the county’s fairly unique economic and social history. The reason for doing so is twofold, firstly, the claim can be made that Cornwall underwent a process of industrialisation through the 1800’s which was comparatively unique and which serves as the context and antecedent condition for some of the more recent economic developments. Secondly, migration patterns and the internal economy of the county can be shown to have been closely related long before the counterurbanisation period. The aim therefore is to outline the economic and demographic conditions in Cornwall from the start of the 1800’s up to the onset of the counterurbanisation era in the 1960’s.

Cornwall has a rich heritage in the mining of non-ferrous metals, particularly copper and tin. Deacon (2001) argues that the mining of these two materials, coupled with endogenous developments in technological and engineering means, led to Cornwall becoming one of “Europe’s early industrial regions” by the turn of the nineteenth century (Deacon, 2001 p. 155). The dominance of mining in Cornwall was such that the proportion of Cornish workers reliant on the industry had grown from a quarter in 1750 to around a third by the middle of the 19th century (Deacon and Payton 1993 p. 64). Mining was also beginning to have important effects on the settlement pattern in the county. Deacon (2001) suggests the 1841-61 period saw an increasing “urbanisation of the central mining district…while the population of Cornwall only grew at 8%...the urbanising parishes of Camborne, Redruth and Illogan grew by almost 30%” so that it “appeared to be on the way to creating an
unambiguous central place for Cornwall” (ibid, p. 195). However, such was the success of Cornish mining that by the 1830’s Cornwall began to export not just their metals, specialised equipment and technology, but also its people.

In what has been referred to as ‘Great Emigration’ (Payton, 1999) Cornish miners began to seek mining opportunities elsewhere, some in England and Wales but most commonly in international destinations. This led to the emergence of Cornish ‘diasporas’ around the world but particularly in Australia, the US and South Africa (Williams, 2003). Although this period was characterised by continued population growth in England and Wales through increased numbers of births over deaths, in Cornwall growth was tempered by a high level of net out-migration. The rate of decadal population change in Cornwall is compared to England and Wales in the table 2.8. It shows that while emigration may have begun in the 1830’s it was the decades of the 1840s and 50s in which it really gathered pace.

Table 2.8: Decadal population change, England/Wales & Cornwall 1801-61

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>England/Wales</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>Percentile difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1801-11</td>
<td>+ 14.6</td>
<td>+ 14.7</td>
<td>+ 0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1811-21</td>
<td>+ 18.1</td>
<td>+ 18.4</td>
<td>+ 0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1821-31</td>
<td>+ 15.8</td>
<td>+ 15.4</td>
<td>- 0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1831-41</td>
<td>+ 14.5</td>
<td>+ 13.6</td>
<td>- 0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1841-51</td>
<td>+ 12.7</td>
<td>+ 3.9</td>
<td>- 8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1851-61</td>
<td>+ 11.9</td>
<td>+ 3.9</td>
<td>- 8.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Deacon (2001, p. 218)
The mid-nineteenth century therefore provides the first seemingly paradoxical pattern of migration in Cornwall as it experienced net out-migration at a time of economic prosperity. The onset of the emigration in Cornwall from the 1830s is largely explained by the discovery of metal reserves and subsequent mining fields developing in the US, Australia and South Africa. It is reasonable to suggest that the effects of globalisation were being felt in Cornwall at a very early stage as Cornish emigration may be viewed as a response to the ‘pull’ of growing international demands for skilled labour. Indeed, as Deacon suggests, the nineteenth century saw capital and labour becoming increasingly mobile and it is unsurprising that new mining regions sought the skills, knowledge and labour of the then dominant mining region, (Deacon 2001, p. 229). In this respect the emigrants were a migratory elite group, “skilled workers who became a political class and labour aristocracy elsewhere” (Williams, 2003 p. 57). The second half of the nineteenth century saw emigration as a response to an economic downswing in Cornwall. This was partly due to an economic downswing globally and the collapse of the copper market in Cornwall in the 1860s and recurrent crises in tin mining through the 1870s and again during the 1890s due to a surplus in the global market (Deacon, 2001 p. 314).

On a more general note, Payton (1995) has argued that the Cornish economy became particularly vulnerable to wider economic change because it never actually managed to industrialise fully. He suggests that Cornish industrialisation was “imperfect, over-specialised and incomplete” (Payton, 1995, p. 61). Williams (2003) emphasises how the “roots of industrialisation were not deep” as “the absence of coal meant that Cornish

---

7 The other paradoxical example is the high rates of net in-migration from the late 1970s onwards which took place largely in the face of economic depression.
industry was both reliant on imports of fuel and was unable to develop secondary
manufacturing industries” (ibid, p. 57). But arguably one of the more damaging aspects to
the Cornish economy was caused by emigration. Deacon suggests that all industrialising
regions need to reach a critical mass whereby economics of conglomeration and
interdependent diversity take effect, “linking service trades to the manufacturing
specialisation and markets to suppliers” (Deacon, 2001 p. 196). However he suggests that
this failed to happen in Cornwall due to the slowdown in population growth from continued
emigration. He claims that the failure to assert one central large city and a persisting
settlement pattern of small and fragmented local markets meant that diversification could
never take place (ibid, p. 199-200). This again heightens the important and historical
linkages between the economic development of Cornwall and its migratory profile.

The decline and eventual collapse of large-scale mining in the latter stages of the nineteenth
century did not lead to sudden industrial decline. Williams argues that it was actually “more
gentle and interspersed with periods of prosperity” (Williams, 2003 p. 58). Nevertheless
Cornwall was undoubtedly in the process of de-industrialisation at this time. This is partly
indicated by an increase in the proportion of men employed in agriculture or fishing
between 1861 and 1881 (Deacon, 2001, p. 196). Indeed, agriculture and fishing continued
to thrive until well after the Second World War while it should also be noted that some
mines continued to remain open until the 1990s and a relatively large scale china clay
mining operation continues (Williams 2003). The effect of de-industrialisation was to
further increase the income gap between Cornwall and England and the effect upon
population movement, which has been argued here to have been closely linked to economic
decline, was to fuel it further. For many Cornish families emigration was the only solution to the lack of opportunity while many moved to other areas in Britain to the point where the exodus was running at 60,000 per decade at its height between 1860 and 1880 (Mitchell 1993, p. 136). Despite increases in natural change rates, for much of the 100 years up to the Second World War the population of Cornwall fell by 16%, from its high point of 369,000 in 1861 to just 309,000 in 1939. This is even more marked when compared to the national population which doubled over the same period (ibid, p. 136).

It should be stated here that although the mining sector contracted through the nineteenth century and large-scale out-migration continued to characterise Cornwall right through the turn of the century and into the 1920s and 1930s (Mitchell, 1993 p. 138), Perry (2001) suggests that some diversification did take place in industries such as food processing, explosives, ship building and there was continued exportation of mining equipment and some successes in agriculture and fishing. Indeed, Deacon suggests that "economic reality was not all depression after the 1860s" (Deacon, 2001 p. 317). It was also at this time that tourism began to take a foot-hold in Cornwall. The arrival of the railway in 1859 led to the further establishment of Penzance as a resort and the emergence of Newquay and St Ives as new resorts (Shaw & Williams 1993, p. 85). The expansion of tourism gathered pace through the 1920s and 1930s as personal mobility became greater through increased car ownership and incomes rose in Southern England enabling people to holiday more frequently and travel further (ibid, p. 86). This had the effect of increasing development in coastal settlements which gave rise to marked demographic effects. While Cornwall as a whole was characterised by population decline, local patterns of population growth were
not so homogenous with coastal parishes growing by over 3% between 1921 and 1931 compared to a county growth rate of less than 1% (ibid, p. 86).

During the Second World War the population of Cornwall grew by around 60,000, largely attributable to the arrival of evacuees and, to a lesser extent, armed forces personnel. Although the vast bulk of these temporary residents left by the end of the war, some did remain in Cornwall and, coupled with a natural increase in the population, the county had grown by around 23,000 between 1939 and 1951 (Mitchell, 1993 p. 137). Similar to the interwar years though, Perry suggests that growth was largely confined to coastal resorts of Newquay, Falmouth, Bude and Looe by over 15% (Perry, 1993 p.25).

In economic terms Cornwall can be said to have had a good war. It was a period of unaccustomed prosperity for Cornwall as all its basic industries were given the chance to meet increasing demand for products in the absence of some overseas competitors (Perry, 1993 p. 29). During the 1950s economic growth was apparent across a number of industries. Granite and slate quarrying increased, china clay production climbed by 25%, the building trade was resurgent with public authorities financing municipal estates, engineering growth was focused in the export of mining and construction equipment as well as ship repairs and tin mining enjoyed a renaissance from the quadrupling of prices following the outbreak of the Korean War. Unemployment had also dropped to an historic low at this time (ibid, p. 29). Presumably the swell in population at this time also helped drive the service economy.
The economy in Cornwall in the 1950s remained in good shape. The low level of unemployment effectively brought large-scale emigration to an end as people who no longer looked elsewhere for work. Demographic trends for the period showed that the high levels of out-migration had dropped substantially for all but young adults (Mitchell, 1993 p. 139). Cornwall continued to experience what had been identified to be happening for some time, the in-migration of people who were retired, or close to retirement. However what was shown to be different for the early part of the 1950s was that the numbers moving in were beginning to exceed those moving out and as with previous years, much of the growth seemed to be due to 'amenity-orientated' migration as growth was really confined to the coast (Mitchell, 1993 p. 139). This was arguably related to the arrival of mass tourism in Cornwall which gave greater exposure to the natural amenities available and brought the comparatively low living costs in these coastal resorts to national attention. Indeed, such was the extent of development in resort towns that by the end of the decade the Council were declaring certain areas saturation zones where further development was to be discouraged (Williams & Shaw, 1993 p. 87).

It is important to recognise that not all of Cornwall underwent growth. On the contrary, the populations of rural areas continued to decline. Furthermore, while the post-war boom period of the early 1950s undoubtedly gave a taste of prosperity Perry (1993) suggests that the economy had already begun to exhibit the hallmarks of post-industrialism. This was particularly evident by the increasing proportion of the workforce employed in the service sector, particularly related to tourism, compared to other industrial sectors (Perry, 1993 p. 30). He suggests that this was partly accentuated by migration trends as "the long-term
drain of entrepreneurial talent...competitive ability and industrial enterprise" led to the “channelling of efforts into the tourist and retirement sector at the expense of manufacturing industry” (Perry, 1993 p. 31). A final point of Perry’s less than optimistic view of post-industrial Cornwall was that the economy not only lacked the mass consumer-orientated industries that bought affluence to Southern England but also lacked any internal sources of funding and revenue in terms of banks and building societies (ibid, p.30-1). Even disregarding the omens of how post-industrial Cornwall may look, the late fifties saw a strong return of external competitors in Cornwall’s traditional industries combined with a diminishing internal agricultural labour market. As such unemployment began to rise once more reaching a winter level of around 10% and despite the early signs of population growth net migration remained close to zero for the 1950s as a whole (ibid p. 51). This gave the impression that population stagnation or even a return to decline looked a more likely prospect than growth (Mitchell, 1993 p. 139).

2.5 The process of counterurbanisation 1960s & 70s

As shown in table 2.2, the population turnaround in Cornwall may have begun in the 1950s but it was the 1960s that the trend became most apparent. During the 1960s the population of Cornwall grew by over 40,000, a rate of gain never previously experienced, only for it to be surpassed by a further growth of nearly 44,000 in the 1970s. Mitchell (1993) shows that natural change played a part in the growth through the 1960s to the tune of 3,000 people but that it was net migration to which it was overwhelmingly attributable (ibid, p 141). Table 2.9 shows the rate of total and annual net migration in Cornwall for five year periods between 1961 and 1981. From this we can see that an annual rate of net migration 4,425
culminated in a total net growth of 88,520. However it is also clear that the period was characterised by fluctuations in the migration rate. Mitchell’s (1993) analyses shed further light on these, he states that net migration growth started at around 1,500 in 1961-62 and built up to around 4,000 by 1965-66 where it remained relatively consistent until 1971-72 (ibid, p. 140). Net migration in Cornwall soared in the early 1970s so that between mid-1971 and mid-1974 there was an increase of 23,000 people entirely through migration. The remainder of the decade saw annual migration drop from the exceptional level of around 8,000 to between 4,000 and 5,000 although this rate was halved for the 1979-81 period (ibid, p.143).

Table 2.9 Total and annual net in-migration in Cornwall 1961-81

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>Net In migration</th>
<th>Net In migration</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Annual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961-66</td>
<td>14720</td>
<td>2940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1966-71</td>
<td>22870</td>
<td>4570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971-76</td>
<td>31780</td>
<td>6360</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976-81</td>
<td>19150</td>
<td>3830</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961-81</td>
<td><strong>88520</strong></td>
<td><strong>4425</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Cornwall County Council Structure Plan (1997)

The fluctuating rates of the first 20 years of counterurbanisation in Cornwall serve to generate some thoughts on the specific underlying processes at work. The following discussion outlines a case to suggest that environmental and economic explanations may have been important for counterurbanisation in Cornwall.

Just when the economy began to be heading toward another downturn, the 1960s saw Cornwall experience its second economic boom of the 20th century. While fishing and tin mining both enjoyed resurgence, at least in terms of increased prices, it was a
manufacturing renaissance that spearheaded the boom in the economy (Perry, 1993 p. 51). Though this seems to question Perry’s largely pessimistic assertions on post-industrial Cornwall with regard to the scarcity of indigenous enterprises, it was in fact exogenous growth in manufacturing that was important rather than indigenous efforts.

During the 1960s Cornwall became the beneficiary of a wide range of government regional aid packages. The first type of assisted area status were Development Districts, areas defined by high unemployment into which most of Cornwall was categorised. Later in the decade the government strengthened regional aid considerably and all of Cornwall became a Development Area with the exception of the South East corner neighbouring Plymouth, this becoming an Intermediate Area receiving slightly less assistance (Perry, 1993 p. 48). The regional aid packages consisted of investment grants, subsidies for employers and various training allowances which it was hoped would make Cornwall an attractive destination for businesses to move to. The regional policies were evidently very successful as new factories dramatically increased employment in Cornwall due predominantly to the decentralisation of branch plants from the South East and Midlands. Such was the scale of growth that where manufacturing had entered into long-term decline nationally, in Cornwall manufacturing employment rose by almost 60% in the 1960s up to the mid-70s compared to a 14% loss in the previous decade (Perry et al 1986, p. 67). While the formation of indigenous enterprises remained low at this time production decentralisation, specifically branch plants, contributed as much as 60% of all new factories and two thirds of additional employment (Perry, 1993 p. 52).
On immediate examination, the process of counterurbanisation in Cornwall therefore seems to largely reflect the employment-led process described by Fielding (1982)\(^8\). This would assume that population growth at this time would generally be explained by a large inflow of employers and employees.

This assertion can be examined in greater depth. Using Census data from 1966-71 Perry et al (1986) show that there was a net inflow for each five-year working-age group, the implication being that the vast majority would have either have been seeking work or may even have been transferred to Cornwall with their current employer. Indeed both assertions are credible. Perry suggests that around 10% of the labour requirements of new factories were directly transferred from outside Cornwall, these mainly being managers and specialist operatives, while many further vacancies were supplemented by in-migrants moving on their own initiative (Perry, 1993, p. 63). Furthermore, a survey of factories in West Cornwall conducted by the Cornish Industrial Development Association (CIDA) showed that up to 50% of skilled employees had moved from outside of the county (ibid).

Further evidence also suggests that counterurbanisation in Cornwall at this time was structural in cause, employment-led and linked to wider economic forces. In latter part of 1973 the OPEC oil price crisis brought an end to the economic boom in Cornwall. The decentralisation of manufacturing factories slowed as government aid began to be refocused once more on inner cities. As a result, the rate of new factories appearing in Cornwall became substantially less (Perry, 1993 p. 54). Significantly, this corresponded with a marked slowdown of in-migration in Cornwall post-1974 (Mitchell, 1993) and a

\(^8\) See 1.3.1.2.1 (previous chapter)
return to the net loss of the young and better educated who sought better job prospects outside the county (Perry 1993, p. 64). Both trends suggest that employment-led migration had been making a reasonable contribution to inward migration but it was temporary and in part artificially stimulated and unstable.

While employment opportunities do seem to provide a reasonable explanation of migration patterns in Cornwall for the first 15 or so years of counterurbanisation, Williams (2003) argues that other factors were arguably more important. He claims that while some immigration was indeed the result of the encouragement of manufacturing growth "it was in fact a minority compared to those moving as an indirect effect of growth of tourism" (ibid, p. 59). Growth in incomes, increased leisure time, increasing entitlements to paid holiday leave and improvements in transport all combined through the 1960s to bring about a golden age for British seaside tourism. Indeed, tourist visitors in Cornwall were estimated to have increased to 2.1 million in 1964, an increase of 50% on the number ten years previous (Williams & Shaw, 1993 p. 87). Tourist numbers continued to increase into the 70s, climbing above the three million mark and only dipping in the middle of the decade following the first OPEC oil crisis (Perry, 1993 p. 52). The link between tourism and immigration is far from simple however as it seems to cut across both economic, employment-led migration as well as environmental, people-led migration.

Although the studies of Shaw and Williams (1987) and Elzey (1998) were conducted later than the 1960s and 70s it is possible that they indicate an earlier precedent; that the growth of the tourism industry directly contributed to employment creation and that these jobs
were most commonly filled by in-migrants. Shaw and Williams (1987) found that during the mid-1980s 55% of all tourism businesses in a sample of Cornish towns were owned by in-migrants. In the mid-1990s Elzey (1998) found that over 80% of tourist enterprises in Newquay were run by a person who had originated from outside of Cornwall. Though these relate to the 1980s and 90s Williams (2003) argues that the tourism sector has long been dominated by in-migrants.

If tourism has acted as a direct facilitating mechanism for in-migration we may suggest that population growth may have been higher in Cornwall compared to other counterurbanisation areas where the tourism sector was not so strong. However it is not just the direct effect of tourism that is important. Regional aid, it may be argued, was not the only driver of production decentralisation in Cornwall. While government assistance may well have made it possible to transfer businesses to rural hinterlands, tourism may have served to give Cornwall an edge over other areas. It can be argued that tourism acted as a vehicle by which the environmental attraction of Cornwall and its low costs of living were advertised to potential incoming businesses. A survey of owner-managed manufacturing units in West Cornwall showed that nearly all incoming business owners had thought of operating from Cornwall while on a previous holiday and the majority gave little thought to locating anywhere else (Perry, 1978). This is particularly interesting given that equivalent government assistance was being offered in other hinterland areas such as lowland Scotland and Mid-Wales, both of which enjoyed far more favourable transportation networks to other parts of Britain (Perry, 1978). Such location decisions therefore seem to be only partly related to economic and employment considerations and appear to introduce the
notion that the owners of incoming businesses in Cornwall were exercising a personal residential preference.

The arrival of mass tourism in the 1960s is also claimed to have been significant in the movement of other types of in-migrants; those driven less by economic considerations. Perry (1993 p. 52-3) suggests that tourism was likely to be an important factor in explaining the sharp rise in second-home owners and retirees. Both groups may well have experienced previous holidays which would have given them an awareness of Cornwall as being amenity rich but with a low cost of living. Both groups would have been largely unconcerned by employment opportunities in their decision to relocate, and both undoubtedly contributed to population increases through the 1960s and early 70s.

Essentially counterurbanisation in Cornwall undoubtedly coincided with an economic boom and production decentralisation through the 1960s and early 70s but the discussion suggests that this may not have been the only process at work. While employment-led migration appears to be a fairly persuasive explanation, it is also likely that individuals were moving irrespective of employment opportunities. In a Department of Employment study of West Cornwall between 1961 and 1976 McNabb (1979) showed that employment increased by 26%, compared to an overall decline in Britain over the same period. While much of the employment growth can be explained by the relocation of manufacturing firms, some growth would also have occurred as a multiplier effect of increased demands on the service sector. However, the significant point of McNabb’s study was that while

---

\(^9\) It is likely that second home owners would have become retirement migrants though we cannot know this for sure.
employment growth in Cornwall grew rapidly, unemployment in Cornwall also grew at a faster rate than nationally. Unemployment in Cornwall rose from 1.8% to 9.2% compared to an increase from 1.1% to 5.5% in Britain (cited in Perry 1993 p. 62). Essentially, Cornwall was a strong performer in terms of job creation and yet it still failed to meet the labour demands of a growing population.

Perry suggests that this was in part due to post-industrialism. He suggests that while new jobs were undoubtedly created by the inward movement of businesses in manufacturing and tourism and by the multiplier effect on the service economy, employment losses in the traditional male-orientated industries such as farming, fishing and extractive industries continued apace. Perry claims that the new jobs more than offset the numbers lost but the net result was to produce a mismatch between the new labour supply and the skills of the existing labour force (Perry, 1993 p. 62). This resulted in many of the new jobs being filled by in-migrants with the requisite skills, indeed this was shown to have been the case in the CIDA survey, mentioned above. Furthermore Williams (2003) argues that many of the new jobs created, particularly in the service sector, were mainly female and part-time, not to mention seasonal for those in the tourist-led service sector (Williams, 2003). Therefore while job creation was running at a very high level at this time, it is debatable whether they were the ‘right types’ of jobs for much of the male, indigenous population.

Another hypothesis for why labour market supply failed to meet demand in Cornwall is relates to an arguably more individualist migration stream. Though it may be the case that in-migrants moving to Cornwall to take up jobs in the manufacturing boom served
indirectly to increase unemployment, Williams (2003) suggests that they were also supplemented by a continuous flow of working-age in-migrants who were unconnected to the employment boom and indeed continued to move in large numbers in years of economic decline through the late 70s and 1980s. The fact that unemployment rose during an unprecedented increase in jobs may point towards an inflow of working-age people who speculated on the possibility of employment. Indeed Perry (1993, p. 63) suggests that “employers became familiar with the sight of waiting rooms full, in holiday times, with visitors enquiring about permanent jobs”. However, the picture for the remainder of the 1970s seems to provide an even more compelling argument.

As has already been stated, the Cornish economy went into a downturn following the OPEC oil crisis in 1973, the effects of which persisted throughout the remainder of the 1970s and were worsened to a much greater degree in the wake of the second oil crisis during 1978-9 (Perry, 1993 p. 56). The main long-term casualty of this was manufacturing as almost all the gains made in the post-war period were lost. The inflow of branch-plants began to dry up but worse still was the fact that Cornwall was what Perry (1993, p. 57) describes as being a “classic case of dependent industrialisation”. The reasoning for this is that takeovers of firms and the nature of the branch plant economy meant that as much “around three quarters of manufacturing employment in the county was directed from head-offices or main factories elsewhere” (Perry et al, 1986 p. 73). As such, Perry et al (1986) suggest that Cornwall was among the first to feel the pinch of rationalisation tactics in the face of global economic competition, resulting in the relocation and closures of many local units. Moreover, while some of the previous in-migrants who had moved with the factories
chose to leave following closures, Williams (2003) suggests that the majority remained to compete for jobs with an increasingly burgeoning labour force. These factors culminated in a period where unemployment levels soared by 55% between 1976 and 1981 (Perry, 1993 p. 55). And yet, as table 2.9 shows, net inward migration continued throughout these 5 years, albeit at a reduced pace of just over 19,000. It is this period which marks the beginning of Cornwall’s second seemingly paradoxical relationships between economic prosperity and migration.

Using National Health Service data, Perry et al (1986) were able to show that in-migration to Cornwall between 1976 and 1981 was overwhelmingly due to working-age people both in terms of a total and net inflow, with the exception of a net loss of 15-19 year olds. It seems counter-intuitive for working-age people to choose to move to an area with such unfavourable levels of unemployment and wages. One possible explanation is that Mitchell (1993) shows that Cornwall was attracting a high proportion of people in the upper social groups at this time so given what has been said about the skills gap in Cornwall their chances for employment may have been better than most. Whether they would have arrived in Cornwall forearmed with this knowledge however is debatable. An alternative, and widely accepted view, points towards a more environmental migratory process at work. This was highlighted by two very useful surveys which examined the motivations of in-migrants around this time, the findings of which are shown in table 2.10.

The Cornwall County Council Migration Survey (1975) looked at the reasons given for moving to Cornwall by 400 in-migrants spread across the county. A slightly later survey
conducted in 1983 by Perry et al (1986) identifies 1400 responses from in-migrants living in central and western Cornwall regarding the reasons they felt were important for moving to the county. What is particularly noticeable is that both surveys confirm the others’ findings in that those non-economic factors, in terms of the pull of a ‘preferred environment’ and ‘country life’ and the push of ‘escaping the rat race’, were cited as the top two important reasons. Given that Cornwall has long been a low wage economy it is maybe unsurprising that ‘better wages’ featured in the least, and second least likely reasons in both the 1983 and 1975 surveys respectively. Interestingly, it seems to confirm the important role that tourism plays in the desire to live in Cornwall as the 1983 survey shows that ‘previous holidays’ features as the fourth most cited reason. Moreover, and although not shown here, when Perry et al (1986) isolated just those in-migrants who had moved to Cornwall for the first time, ‘previous holidays’ became the most important reason given. However, the significant point to note is that economic reasons generally can be seen to be secondary in importance compared to socio-environmental explanations in both surveys. Assuming that the last four categories, ‘job security’, ‘job prospects’, ‘better wages’ and ‘transferred with work’ are economic, the average rank given is 8 out of 10 for the 1975 survey and 9 out of 12 for the survey in 1983.
Table 2.10: Reasons for migration moves to Cornwall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason</th>
<th>CCC 1975</th>
<th>Perry et al 1983</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>%</td>
<td>rank</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better/preferred environment</td>
<td>67</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Country life/escape rat race</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Be near family/friends</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return to homeland</td>
<td>Not asked</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous holidays</td>
<td>Not asked</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for children</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for health</td>
<td>Not asked</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sport/recreation</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job security</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job prospects</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better wages</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transferred with work</td>
<td>Not asked</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Mitchell (1993, p. 154)

This evidence seems to indicate the importance of environmental explanations for counterurbanisation in Cornwall as most in-migrants seem to be exercising a preference of residence. It should also be recognised however that changes to the economy and the high rate of job creation, particularly through the 1960s and 1970s, may well have created the opportunity for such moves to be realised. Ultimately though, the high rate of unemployment particularly between the mid-70s and early 80s certainly didn’t seem to deter migrants either. In this respect it may be argued that population growth was in fact a double-edged sword as it was both the key to employment creation and a contributory factor in the rise of unemployment. This is best illustrated by the fact that the service sector almost offset a 14% loss of manufacturing employment and a 5% decrease in agriculture between 1976 and 1981. However although employment only dropped by 300, unemployment rose by 6600 (Perry, 1993 p. 55).
This is not to say that all in-migrants were job-takers. It should be noted here that environmental migration has been shown to be a favourable condition for endogenous employment growth as entrepreneurial and self-employed in-migrants may lead to direct employment growth (Findlay et al., 2000). Indeed this would seem to reflect the findings of the survey by Perry (1978) where many owner-managed manufacturing units were moving to Cornwall citing previous holidays as a deciding factor for their choice of location. However it is also important to consider that not all self-employed persons are entrepreneurial. Indeed the findings of a survey in the late 1960s by Spooner (1972, p. 213) suggested that the economic behaviour of many of Cornwall’s incoming business owners were ‘satisficing’ rather than being ambitious towards expansion. These findings were supported by Perry et al. (1986) in the 1983 survey whereby self-employed in-migrants operated in a semi-retirement interest where the main aim was to ‘be one’s own boss’ and to escape the ‘urban rat race’ rather than being entrepreneurial. Therefore while not all ‘lifestyle’ counterurbanisers were competing for employment even those that could potentially create direct jobs may have lacked the economic dynamism required.

In summary, the first 15 years of counterurbanisation in Cornwall certainly appeared to operate at two levels of explanations. Firstly, production decentralisation undoubtedly led to a high rate of job creation in Cornwall and population growth may be seen as a result of employers and employees moving in. However the evidence suggests that inward migration was also largely motivated by environmental concerns as well as economic. The biggest indication of this is in the continued in-migration in the late 1970s when unemployment
had soared. The aim now is to evaluate the available evidence to examine the process from the 1980s onwards.

2.6 Counterurbanisation from the 1980s

2.6.1 Decline of staple industries

One marked effect of the 1978-81 recessionary period was that Cornwall increasingly saw its higher level and better paid jobs transferred out of the county through the 1980s. The closure of branch-plants left a lop-sided manufacturing base reliant on low-technology and unskilled, low wage labour. Administration jobs were also being lost as re-organisation of public bodies such as South West Water and Devon and Cornwall Police were centralised out of the county (Deacon et al, 1988 p. 56). Moreover, national and international pressures led to cuts in jobs in mainstay industries such as farming and defence (Perry, 1993 p. 57). Other large firms began to feel the pinch of national and international competition, the workforce at Compair at Camborne, once the largest single employer in West Cornwall, was just one eighth in 1986 of what had been in the 1960s (Deacon et al, 1988 p. 56).

Worse still, in 1987 tin prices crashed leaving mines uneconomic with Geevor, one of the largest, shedding labour first and eventually closing a few years later. By the mid 1990s all of Cornwall’s tin mines had closed. Although the china clay industry continued to operate, albeit with a slimmed workforce, English China Clays International moved the headquarters to Reading marking the loss of Cornwall’s only private sector firm with a range of head-office functions (Perry, 1993 p. 58).

In earlier years when there had been dips in the fortunes of Cornwall’s staple industries, tourism had taken up the slack. To a certain extent this proved to be the case again as
tourism was estimated to have increased employment between 1984 and 1987 by 7% (Williams & Shaw, 1993 p. 93). However, there are doubts over the quality of the new jobs in that many would have been part-time rather than full-time. Moreover, these estimates should possibly be viewed with caution because tourist numbers had actually dropped to 2.8 million in 1987 from what had been 3.4 million visitors ten years previous. It therefore seemed that tourism too was feeling the pressure of foreign competition in terms of the increased popularity and affordability of package holidays abroad (Deacon et al, 1988 p. 110).

2.6.2 Economic policies and population-led growth

It is useful to take stock of the economic policies of Cornwall County Council at this point to contextualise how these economic circumstances impacted upon migration trends at this time. The Cornwall County Council Structure Plan of 1980, the first of its kind, had been developed during the 1970s at a time when manufacturing and tourist growth were at their height. As such, the 1980 Plan was an employment-led policy which sought to set the targets for population and housing that would be required to meet an expanding labour market. This seemingly rejected the policy of population-led growth advocated in the 1974 SWEPC Settlement Plan, nevertheless, Deacon et al (1988, p. 54) suggests that implicit within the Structure Plan was the idea that a sustained movement of people to Cornwall was a good thing. Perry (1993 p. 59) rightly points to the fact that although the 1980 Structure Plan was based on forecasts from the 1960s and 1970s, a time when employment growth was high, Cornwall's planners were unfortunate that its launch took place in the midst of deep recession. However, the 1980 Plan has also been criticised for the
assumptions made about the two main components of population increases. Firstly, that which derives from economic growth and secondly, that which is independent of job opportunities, comprising in the main people migrating to the County on retirement (Draft Structure Plan, 1979 in Deacon et al, 1988 p. 55).

The Structure Plan can be argued to have been flawed in two central ways. As has been shown, it was devised on the premise of employment growth, particularly manufacturing, when in fact manufacturing expansion had essentially become a thing of the past. The other flaw was in viewing in-migration as dependent on job creation and assuming that it would tail off if the jobs weren’t there. However, what has been shown above is that Cornwall has a large proportion of inward migration where economic motives are of secondary importance to socio-environmental choices. While the rate of net in-migration did indeed reduce between 1978 and 1981, as has been shown, it still remained at a level sufficient to expand the supply of labour beyond demand. Moreover, by 1983-84 it was back to its highest levels of around 8,000 people while at the same time unemployment had soared to around 20% (Deacon et al, 1988 p. 58). In-migration was actually close to the targets proposed in the 1980 Plan’s forecasts, however, employment fell well short of projections and consequentially unemployment was far higher than predicted (Perry, 1993 p. 60).

The flawed population assumptions were acknowledged in the revised Structure Plan in 1987 entitled The First Alteration. As population and housing projections were based on employment levels, following an employment-led policy would have meant restricting population and housing growth to extremely low levels, something that the government
prohibited (Perry, 1993 p. 59-60). This dictated a change from an employment-led policy to a population-led policy which would be followed up until 2001 although in reality it was until the 1997 Structure Plan superseded it. It has been argued that the population-led growth policy lacked a real strategy other than to hope that enough jobs were created, not just to cater for the increasing population but also to bring unemployment down in the existing population. The main hope was that the increased population itself would create new employment both directly by incoming businesses and indirectly by increasing service demand, in the latter case the policy was therefore tied to developing the service economy more than any other sector (Deacon et al, 1988 p. 59).

2.6.3 The economy in the 1980s

It is useful to consider the post-recession period of Cornwall's economy in more depth both to contextualise the forthcoming discussions on migration and to evaluate the policy of population-led growth. Fortunately there is also a greater amount of available data to carry out this type of assessment. The first period under examination will be the mid to late 1980s, followed by a look at the recession period at the end of the decade and into the early 1990s. Finally the 1990s will be examined up to the point that the new Structure Plan was launched in 1997.

Due to the availability of consistent data over time table 2.11 looks at employment change from 1984 to 1989 from the Census of Employment. This was a period in which the recessionary effects of the crash in the late 1970s had waned and economic growth had once again begun to reassert itself. This is evident by the fact that the employment growth
in Britain had increased by nearly 7% and by almost 13% in the South West region.

Employment growth in Cornwall was also on the up, increasing by over 12,500 jobs. This growth rate of 10% was therefore higher than in Britain but not quite at the regional rate of growth. However, highlighting only the total employment growth masks an interesting trend. Of the 12,500 news jobs in Cornwall, over 10,000 were female part-time while male jobs, both full and part-time, decreased. The South West region had an increase in the rate of full-time jobs and male full-time and part-time jobs beyond that experienced nationally. However, Cornwall performed worse with regard to both male employment and full-time employment than was the case regionally or even nationally.

Table 2.11: Change in employees in Cornwall 1984-1989

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th></th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1984</td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>Change</td>
<td>Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>59,850</td>
<td>58,750</td>
<td>-1,100</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>7,250</td>
<td>6,950</td>
<td>-300</td>
<td>-4.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>67,100</td>
<td>65,700</td>
<td>-1,450</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>28,450</td>
<td>32,100</td>
<td>3,700</td>
<td>13.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>27,300</td>
<td>37,550</td>
<td>10,250</td>
<td>37.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>55,700</td>
<td>69,700</td>
<td>14,000</td>
<td>25.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>88,300</td>
<td>90,900</td>
<td>2,600</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>34,550</td>
<td>44,500</td>
<td>9,950</td>
<td>28.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>122,800</td>
<td>135,400</td>
<td>12,550</td>
<td>10.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding
Source: Census of Employment, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

It should be noted here that the Census of Employment counts only employees and not those people that are self-employed and so the table is likely to underestimate the level of employment growth to a certain extent. Perry is in little doubt about the contribution of
self-employment in Cornwall through the 1980s. He reports that self-employed men increased by almost 8,000 and more than offset the loss of full-time male employees (1993, p. 73).

Table 2.12 shows claimant count data, derived from the number of people claiming unemployment benefits. Although it is not a direct indicator of unemployment it is the best available proxy data for Cornwall at this time. Though we cannot know for sure, the increase in self-employment in the 1980s seems to be the best explanation for why male unemployment reduced in Cornwall by over 5,000 between 1984 and 1989 despite the reduction of nearly 1,500 male employees. It is also possible that some males would have left the labour market for early retirement or may have been reclassified as long-term sick. However, the overall rate of decrease in unemployment in Cornwall was still below that of the South West region or Britain as a whole. This was the case for both male and female unemployment rates.

Table 2.12: Claimant count change 1984-1989

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>-5,365</td>
<td>-33.0</td>
<td>-55,401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>-7,825</td>
<td>-31.6</td>
<td>-83,097</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Claimant counts, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

Analysis of sectoral change from 1984 to 1989 (Table 2.13) sheds some light on the reasons behind the growth of female and part-time employment and the decrease in full-time male employees. The huge loss of over 7,000 jobs in agriculture, forestry and fishing is likely to explain the decrease in male employees in Cornwall at this time given that it is a
male-dominated sector. The growth of over 18,000 employees working in the service sector more than offset this loss, indeed the growth rate of service sector employment in Cornwall far outstripped the national growth rate and was even higher than that of the South West region. Almost half of the growth in the service sector is attributed to ‘other service industries’ which grew by 39% compared to 19% regionally and 13% nationally.

Due to confidentiality stipulations it is not possible to show a further sectoral breakdown but the large increase of other service industries is almost solely attributable to school education and social welfare and community services. This partly reflects the assertions of Perry (1993, p. 58) who suggested that the 1980s saw a boom in the emergence of private nursing and residential homes for the elderly in Cornwall as many tourism proprietors turned to this industry as tourist numbers dipped. Nonetheless what this shows is that the service sector was the strongest driver of employment creation, particularly those services which are inextricably connected and fluctuate depending on changes to population size. In this respect it could be argued that population-led growth did indeed occur through the 1980s.

Table 2.13: Change in employees by sector 1984-1989

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Service Industry</th>
<th>Cornwall n</th>
<th>Cornwall %</th>
<th>SW n</th>
<th>SW %</th>
<th>GB n</th>
<th>GB %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture, forestry and fishing</td>
<td>-7,100</td>
<td>-97.5</td>
<td>-5,000</td>
<td>-10.3</td>
<td>-44,200</td>
<td>-12.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy and water supply</td>
<td>-250</td>
<td>-13.2</td>
<td>1,150</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>-155,900</td>
<td>-25.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing industries</td>
<td>1,050</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>-650</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
<td>-182,950</td>
<td>-3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>350</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>6,600</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>40,200</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution, hotels/catering; repairs</td>
<td>4,600</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>67,700</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>490,750</td>
<td>11.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport/communication, banking, finance</td>
<td>3,800</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td>70,050</td>
<td>31.4</td>
<td>688,900</td>
<td>20.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public administration and defence</td>
<td>1,200</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>14,650</td>
<td>13.3</td>
<td>-13,550</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other service industries</td>
<td>8,850</td>
<td>39.0</td>
<td>46,650</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>565,400</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>- All Service Industries</strong></td>
<td>18,500</td>
<td>21.7</td>
<td>199,100</td>
<td>19.3</td>
<td>1,731,450</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>12,550</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>201,150</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>1,388,600</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding.

Source: Census of Employment, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)
2.6.4 The recessionary period

The end of the 1980s and early 1990s saw a new UK and world recession take effect. Inflation and interest rates soared as a result and this led to a crash in house prices and a general paralysis in the UK housing market. Unlike the recession 10 years previously which hit manufacturing this was to have a greater impact upon white collar activities in southern England than on blue collar industries in the North (Mitchell, 1993 p. 143). Many new businesses that had been established through the growth period of the 1980s began to fail, many local shops and sub-offices closed and larger developers withdrew their interests in Cornwall causing builders and building merchants to suffer lean periods or even bankruptcy (Perry, 1993 p. 61).

Table 2.14 again uses Census of Employment data to compare employment change in Cornwall to that of the regional and national trends. Unfortunately there are no data on the changes to the number of self-employed people at this time so the analysis focuses just upon employees. Also, while the worst of the recession arguably bit between 1989 and 1992 this analysis focuses on the 1989-93 period as there are no readily available data for 1992. The recessionary period hit employment in Cornwall to the tune of almost 3,500 jobs in Cornwall between 1989 and 1993. This was a lower rate of job-loss than nationally and fairly characteristic of the regional trend. The overall number of jobs lost was solely attributable to the loss of over 7,000 male full-time employees which was a slightly larger decrease than in the South West or for Britain as a whole. Female full-time employment actually increased marginally which was not reflected at the regional or national scale. Interestingly, despite the large number of male jobs lost, the number of male part-time jobs...
grew by over 1,500. This reflected an increase of 22% which was far more than was the case in Britain or even within the South West region.

Table 2.14: Employment change 1989-1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1989</td>
<td>1993</td>
<td>Change</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>58750</td>
<td>51650</td>
<td>-7100</td>
<td>-12.1</td>
<td>-10.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>6950</td>
<td>8,450</td>
<td>1550</td>
<td>22.3</td>
<td>18.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>65600</td>
<td>60,150</td>
<td>-5550</td>
<td>-8.4</td>
<td>-8.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>32150</td>
<td>32500</td>
<td>400</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>37550</td>
<td>39,300</td>
<td>1750</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>69700</td>
<td>71,850</td>
<td>2150</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>3.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>90900</td>
<td>84,200</td>
<td>-6700</td>
<td>-7.4</td>
<td>-7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>44400</td>
<td>47,800</td>
<td>3300</td>
<td>7.4</td>
<td>11.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>135350</td>
<td>132,000</td>
<td>-3400</td>
<td>-2.5</td>
<td>-2.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding.
Source: Census of Employment, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

Quite expectedly the number of people unemployed increased in Cornwall during the recessionary period. Table 2.15 shows that unemployment increased by over 80% meaning that there were over 11,500 more claimants in Cornwall in 1993 compared to 1989.

Interestingly, unemployment did not increase to the same extent in Cornwall as it did in the South West region although it was worse than for Britain as a whole. Around 85% of Cornwall’s unemployment increase was due to male claimants, a similar proportion to that experienced regionally and nationally. Despite Cornwall doing less badly than the South West as a whole through the recessionary period, it still maintained an unemployment rate of 9.6% in April 1993 compared to 8.5% nationally and 8.1% regionally. With this in mind
it is possible that the increase in unemployment in Cornwall was less bad because it may have already 'bottomed out' though we cannot know this for sure.

Table 2.15: Claimant count change 1989-1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>10,004</td>
<td>102.5</td>
<td>102,897</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>1,785</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>20,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11,789</td>
<td>80.8</td>
<td>123,297</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Claimant counts. ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

It is not possible to show the full breakdown of sectoral change during the recessionary period due to confidentiality issues. However table 2.16 shows some of the key changes to the industrial structure and while the period was marked by an overall loss of jobs it is clear that some sectors still grew during this time. The key loser in terms of jobs was manufacturing, this was the case regionally and nationally but it was all the more extreme in Cornwall with a loss of over 7,000 jobs at a rate of decrease of 31%. Despite the recession the service sector grew in Cornwall between 1989 and 1993 by 2,500 jobs. However this was below the rate of increase experienced nationally and especially regionally. On closer inspection this is largely because the distribution sector and public administration and defence sectors decreased at an unusually large rate. This indicates two things, first that the dip in tourism seemed to affect Cornwall particularly badly and second, that national expenditure on defence was beginning to reduce leading to the withdrawal of armed forces occupations from Cornwall. Indeed, if the analysis singles out 'other service industries' for attention, Cornwall can be shown to have done extremely well with an increase of over 5,000 jobs and a rate of increase that was almost double that of the South West region. In this respect, it may be argued that the policy of population-led growth and
the growth in associated services, shielded Cornwall from what could have been a more
hard-hitting recession.

Table 2.16: Change in Employees by sector 1989-1993

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sector</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing industries</td>
<td>-7,250</td>
<td>-30.9</td>
<td>-89,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All services industries</td>
<td>2,500</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>64,550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution, hotels/catering, repairs</td>
<td>-3,050</td>
<td>-6.8</td>
<td>-12,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport/communication, banking, finance</td>
<td>1,750</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>41,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public administration and defence</td>
<td>-1,400</td>
<td>-15.3</td>
<td>850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other service industries</td>
<td>5,200</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>34,450</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding

Source: Census of Employment, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

2.6.5 The economic circumstances of 1990s

2.6.5.1 Employment characteristics

Having outlined the economic circumstances of Cornwall through the recessionary period
of the late 1980s and early 90s attention will now focus on the performance of Cornwall’s
economy through the entirety of the 1990s. This period will be examined at length as it is
the main period of study for the thesis.

Throughout the counterurbanisation period from the 1960s onwards Cornwall has been a
recipient of regional assistance as an Assisted Area. Through the 1960s and 70s most of
Cornwall was designated as Development Districts, and later, the Development Area
funding scheme with West Cornwall qualifying for the most substantial assistance as a
Special Development Area. Through the 1980s regional assistance was given to areas
defined as Rural Development Areas or Industrial Development Areas, with part of
Cornwall qualifying as the former, part as the latter and some areas as both (Perry 1993, p. 48).

Most designations of regional support, up until the 1990s, were based predominantly on unemployment levels, something from which Cornwall has suffered greatly. However, the 1990s saw Cornwall receive increased levels of structural funds from Europe that were designated not just on the basis of unemployment but on the level of economic structure and performance. Aside from a purely substantive point, the designation of funds based on absolute and relative economic under-performance, commonly expressed as a measure of gross domestic product (GDP), highlighted what had long been the case; that Cornwall had a low value economy and its residents suffered some of the lowest levels of income. More will be said on this later in this section.

One such programme was Objective 5b, the aim of which was the 'promotion of rural development by facilitating the development and structural adjustment of rural areas'. This was allocated to rural areas with below average levels of economic development, sizeable employment in the agricultural sector; and low levels of agricultural incomes. The whole of Cornwall qualified for two rounds of Objective 5b funding which was directed at part of the South West region, the first was between 1989 and 1993 incorporating Cornwall and Devon and the second round ran from 1993 to 1999, again incorporating all of Cornwall, approximately half of Devon and around a quarter of Somerset. This consisted of £182.5 million in EU structural funds which were to be match-funded by other public and private
bodies with the aim to raise the level of income per head, lower unemployment, increase the number of jobs and businesses, and boost wages (ODPM, 2004 p. 5).

Whether or not a result of EU structural funds Table 2.17 shows that the 1990s heralded a change in fortunes for Cornwall in regard to employment growth. In 2001 there were an additional 36,000 employees in Cornwall compared to ten years previous. This was a growth rate of 27% which far outstripped the regional and national rate of growth. Cornwall also performed better than the South West or Britain in the rate of both full-time and part-time jobs. Interestingly Cornwall managed to stem the haemorrhage of full-time male jobs. Indeed, the increase in full-time employees was actually greater than the increase in part-time male jobs. It should however be pointed out that part-time employment and, to a lesser extent, female employment still increased absolutely and proportionately more than full-time and male employment over the course of the decade.
Table 2.17: Change in employees 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1991-01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Change</td>
<td>Change</td>
<td>1991-01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>52150</td>
<td>60700</td>
<td>8550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>8,500</td>
<td>15,950</td>
<td>7450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>60,700</td>
<td>76,650</td>
<td>15950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time</td>
<td>32550</td>
<td>36450</td>
<td>3900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>39,750</td>
<td>55,950</td>
<td>16200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>72,300</td>
<td>92,400</td>
<td>20100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Full-time</td>
<td>84,700</td>
<td>97,150</td>
<td>12450</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time</td>
<td>48,300</td>
<td>71,900</td>
<td>23600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>133,000</td>
<td>169,050</td>
<td>36050</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding.
Source: Annual Employment Survey/Annual Business Inquiry. ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

Table 2.18: Self-employment 1994-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Annual quarterly average 1994</th>
<th>Annual quarterly average 2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>workforce</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>52,500</td>
<td>26.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South West</td>
<td>361,500</td>
<td>16.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Britain</td>
<td>3,225,000</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Labour Force Survey. ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

While Cornwall appears to have done particularly well in terms of the growth in employees, the same cannot be said with regard to self-employment. Table 2.18 shows data from the Labour Force Survey detailing the number of self-employed people between 1994 and 2001 – no earlier years were available. Between 1994 and 2001 Cornwall saw a reduction in the number of self-employed people in the county to the tune of over 15,000. This was a decrease of 29% which was four times that of the South West Region and eight times the national rate. Given that overall employment growth was so high it is likely that...
many of Cornwall's residents changed status from self-employed to employees although this cannot be known for sure. Nevertheless, given that self-employment was so high in 1994 at 26% of the workforce, the large decrease didn't diminish the fact that by 2001 self-employed people remained a substantial proportion of Cornwall's labour force.

Although self-employment decreased throughout the decade, Cornwall still appeared to have done well in terms of growth of employees and the picture for unemployment also reads well. Table 2.19 shows that unemployment decreased in Cornwall by almost 12,000 people. Admittedly the base data for the analysis is taken from the recessionary period of 1991 when unemployment was particularly high. Nevertheless the rate of decrease for average monthly unemployment was nearly 61% outstripping that of the national rate which was 57%, however, compared to the national trends Cornwall's female unemployment did less well than its male rate. The first point of particular interest is that unemployment decreased by a lower rate than it did in the South West region, this being the case for male and female unemployment. What is interesting about this trend is that the previous table showed that Cornwall out-performed the South West in terms of new employees and yet it still did worse in terms of unemployment. Such a trend seems to suggest two possible scenarios. First that the labour supply and demand imbalance, that has characterised Cornwall for some time, still continues to have an effect. Another reason why unemployment did not decrease to the extent that most would have hoped may be because of the unusually large decrease in self-employment in Cornwall. Again, it cannot be known for sure that self-employed people did not in fact become employees rather than become
unemployed indeed Williams argues that Cornwall is characterised with “a very high level of employment loss through business failures” (Williams, 2003 p. 56).

### Table 2.19: Claimant Count 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>15143</td>
<td>5660</td>
<td>-9483</td>
<td>-62.6</td>
<td>-67.4</td>
<td>-56.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>5121</td>
<td>2210</td>
<td>-2911</td>
<td>-56.8</td>
<td>-65.2</td>
<td>-57.3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>20264</td>
<td>7870</td>
<td>-12394</td>
<td>-61.2</td>
<td>-66.9</td>
<td>-57.0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Claimant counts, ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

Figure 2.3 is taken from the Cornwall County Council 1997 Structure Plan Review and it highlights another important factor to consider in any discussion of Cornwall’s unemployment rates. The fact that tourism plays a large part in the economic performance of Cornwall means that there are invariably seasonal fluctuations in unemployment. The graph shows that this is not the case for Great Britain and while there is some seasonal fluctuation for the South West it is minimal compared to the peaks and troughs experienced every summer and winter in Cornwall. However the graph does also appear to suggest that this had begun to become less pronounced towards the end of the decade.

While table 2.19 showed that Cornwall reduced unemployment by a greater rate than was the case nationally, the graph shows that this was really due to the latter half of the decade. Indeed, unemployment seems to have been heading towards convergence with the national rate further on through the 1990s so that by July 2000 summer unemployment in Cornwall was similar to that of Britain at around 4%. While these trends were indeed fairly
encouraging for Cornwall it should also be stated that compared to the unemployment in the South West region as a whole Cornwall appears to have done little to close the gap.

Figure 2.3: Seasonal unemployment in Cornwall 1991-2000

Unemployment Workforce Rates January and July 1991 - 2000

Source: Cornwall County Council 1997 Structure Plan Review 2002

Again, the analysis of sectoral change takes account of just the manufacturing and service sectors due to confidentiality issues, however, conveniently these are the sectors in which there were important changes. Table 2.20 shows that there seemed to have been a small renaissance in manufacturing in Cornwall through the 1990s. Manufacturing employment increased by over 5,000 jobs at a rate of growth of 34%. This is in stark contrast to the fact that there was no overall change regionally and a decline nationally. However, consistent with the trends from the 1980s, growth in service industries dominated overall employment growth through the 1990s increasing by over 30,000 jobs at a rate similar to regional and national growth. Most notable however, are the differences within the service industries. Public administration, health and education accounts for over half of all service sector
growth with a further third taken up by distribution, hotels and restaurants. While the latter category was not unusual in its growth, public administration, health and education grew at twice the regional rate and three times the national growth rate. In contrast, Cornwall did unusually badly for employment in transport and communication and banking, finance and insurance, arguably the highest value service industries.

Table 2.20: Sectoral change in employees 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sectoral Change</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>SW</th>
<th>GB</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing industries</td>
<td>5,100</td>
<td>33.7</td>
<td>700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All services industries</td>
<td>30,050</td>
<td>27.8</td>
<td>380,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Distribution, hotels and restaurants</td>
<td>10,600</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>131,050</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Transport and communications</td>
<td>-850</td>
<td>-12.9</td>
<td>19,900</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Banking, finance and insurance, etc</td>
<td>450</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>107,550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Public administration, education &amp; health</td>
<td>17,150</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>88,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Other services</td>
<td>2,700</td>
<td>51.0</td>
<td>32,900</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Totals and percentages may not add up due to rounding

Source: Annual Employment Survey/Annual Business Inquiry. ONS Crown Copyright Reserved (from Nomis July 2007)

2.6.5.2 Economic performance

In terms of the performance of the labour market Cornwall seems to have done relatively well overall during the 1990s. Job growth was high and unemployment decreased, particularly in the latter years. However the fact that the decrease in unemployment was not as large as that in South West despite a better rate of job growth suggests that the imbalance between labour demand and labour supply still persisted to an extent. Furthermore, Cornwall predictably still suffered from a notable increase in winter unemployment. While the economy has done relatively well in terms of the quantity of employment it is still necessary to examine the quality or strength of the Cornish economy beyond employment and unemployment measures and this can be done in a number of ways. This is analysed
first by examining the rate of absolute and relative growth in Gross Domestic Product (GDP)\textsuperscript{10} over the period.

Owen Nankivell, an ex-Treasury economist, compiled local area analyses of GDP change for Cornwall for the period 1991-2000. Table 2.21 shows that while national rates of growth for GDP at this time were running at an average of 5.3 per annum Cornwall’s growth rate was slightly lower at 5.1\% per annum. While an overall growth of Cornwall’s economy has taken place, the fact that this growth was slightly slower than average means that Cornwall’s GDP per capita actually decreased between 1991 and 2000 relative to the national GDP per capita.

Table 2.21: Gross Domestic Product change 1991-2000

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>68.9</td>
<td>66.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Nankivell (2002)

Table 2.22 focuses on the percentage share of GDP output across sectors from 1991 and 2000. While the proportions, and change in proportions, may be partly reflective of employment and changes to employment within each sector, it is not necessarily the case. Essentially it possible that one sector may actually grow in terms of GDP output share without any change in employment numbers in that sector.

\textsuperscript{10} GDP is essentially the market value of all goods and services produced in any given area minus the costs of producing them. It is similar to Gross Value Added (GVA) which is explained in greater depth in the methods chapter.
Turning first to changes in GDP output, a greater proportion of GDP was accounted for in 2000 by manufacturing, construction and the service sector industries of wholesale/retail and education. None of these sectors increased their share to the same degree nationally and given that the output share of manufacturing decreased nationally Cornwall looks to have done well here with what is a high value sector. Growth in output share nationally was dominated by real estate and other business activity. Cornwall contrasts here as real estate and business activities was the biggest loser in terms of GDP output share followed by financial services, with both these being two of the more high value sectors.

Turning attention to the GDP output share in Cornwall in 2000, it is clear that while manufacturing increased over the decade, both in terms of jobs (table x) and GDP output, manufacturing related GDP was still a lot lower in Cornwall than nationally as was real estate/other business and transport and communications, all of which are high value sectors. The sectors which contribute an unusually high share of GDP output in Cornwall include construction and the service industries of hotels and catering, wholesale and retail, education, health and social work. The service industries mentioned can all be argued to be relatively low value sector. Therefore, GDP output share in Cornwall would appear to be skewed towards the lower value sectors and away from the high value sectors which may be partly responsible for the poor level of GDP per capita in the county.
Table 2.22: Gross Domestic Product Share of Output 1991-2000 (%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture/Forestry</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>-0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fishing</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mining and Quarrying</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>2.9</td>
<td>-1.8</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>10.7</td>
<td>13.1</td>
<td>21.3</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>-2.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electricity/Gas/Water</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>-1.2</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale/Retail/Repair</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotels and Catering</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>-1.6</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport &amp; Communications</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
<td>-0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial Services</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
<td>-2.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real Estate/Other Business</td>
<td>17.0</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td>23.1</td>
<td>-2.3</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Administration</td>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>2.4</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health and Social Work</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>6.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other Community Services</td>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>1.2</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gross Domestic Product 100.0 100.0 100.0 100.0 0.0 0.0

Source: Nankivell (2002)

Another important gauge of economic well-being in Cornwall, certainly at a more individual level, relates to levels of earnings. Figure 2.4 shows that the level of weekly earnings for full-time male employees in Cornwall has long been below both that of the regional and national levels. Most notable however is that while earnings in Cornwall have been increasing since 1981, the gap with the regional and national level has actually increased and this has been particularly apparent for the 1990s more so than the 1980s. In 1981 Cornwall’s average weekly full-time male earnings were 16% below earnings in Britain, by 1990 this had increased to 18% but by 2001 the gap was at the highest level of 26%. Earnings in the South West, while being slightly lower than national levels, have increased at roughly the same rate as nationally meaning that the disparity between Cornwall and the South West region has also increased by much the same proportion. It is therefore clear that while Cornwall has experienced strong levels of employment growth in
In the 1990s, in terms of relative earnings, Cornwall has in fact become poorer. This is arguably one of the most pressing concerns for the Cornish economy.

**Figure 2.4: Average gross weekly earnings of full-time adult male employees 1981-2001**

Arguments raised by CIDA claim that the sheer rate of growth of working-age people in Cornwall have served to keep earnings levels substantially below that of regional or national levels (cited in Perry, 1993 p. 56). This explanation therefore points to the importance of the imbalance in labour demand and supply. Another explanation also relates to the economic circumstances of the 1990s discussed thus far. Nankivell (2003, p. 7) states that a high proportion of service sector jobs, women employees, part-time employees and self-employed all serve to keep income levels down. As has been shown thus far, and is summarised below, Cornwall is high on all these criteria.
Table 2.23: Key employment characteristics 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>South West</th>
<th>Great Britain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Services as % of total employees</td>
<td>81.8</td>
<td>78.9</td>
<td>79.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Women as % of total employees</td>
<td>54.7</td>
<td>49.8</td>
<td>49.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part-time as % of total employees</td>
<td>42.5</td>
<td>34.7</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employees as % of labour force</td>
<td>16.7</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>11.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ¹ Annual Business Inquiry, ² Labour Force Survey

2.6.5.3 Summary of Cornwall’s economy through the 1990s

Cornwall picked itself up from the recession-hit start of the decade and, with the help of Objective 5b European funding, went on to generate employment at a faster rate than was achieved nationally or even within the South West region. As with the previous decade, service sector employment dominated job growth, particularly in health, education and the distribution and retail industries, although manufacturing also performed well contrary to national and regional trends. However, some problems still persist within the Cornish economy such as unemployment, particularly in winter, and while the numbers of unemployed did decrease, the rate was less than that for the region. In terms of the strength of the economy measured as GDP, growth was below the national rate and, with the exception of manufacturing and construction, growth in output was unusually high in the lower value service sectors. Such a trend served to further cement the Cornish economy as being one which is skewed towards the lower value sectors. Moreover, earnings continue to be well below regional and national levels and rather than narrowing, the gap actually increased through the 1990s. Possible explanations for this relate to a proposed imbalance in labour demand and supply and a labour force with a high proportion of service employment, female employees, part-time employees and self-employees.
2.6.6 The process of counterurbanisation in Cornwall in the 1980s and 1990s

This section focuses on the process of counterurbanisation and in-migration in Cornwall from the 1980s. This considers the rates of migration to and from the county and discusses evidence on demographic and socio-economic characteristics of in-migrants. Finally, there will be a consideration of the possible impacts of in-migration in Cornwall in terms of demographic, housing and economic implications.

2.6.6.1 Migration trends

The table below is derived from National Health Service Central Register data which counts de-registrations and re-registrations of individuals across Health Authorities in England and Wales. There are limitations with the data\textsuperscript{11} but they provide the most commonly used means of assessing internal migration in England and Wales and are useful in identifying migration patterns to and from Cornwall.

One of the first things to say about net migration in Cornwall from the 1980s is that it has fluctuated considerably. Consistent with what Mitchell (1993 p. 150) has said, fluctuations in net migration in Cornwall have been the result of volatility in inward migration rather than any dramatic changes in out-migration. Table 2.24 shows that out-migration has had a range of about 5,000 with a low point of 12,000 in 1982-83 and a peak of nearly 17,000 in 1997-98. In contrast, inward migration was lowest in 1991-92 at around 13,000 and highest in 1988-89 at around 25,000 resulting in a range of 12,000. Another interesting aspect is that despite the fact that in-migration has outstripped out-migration at an average of around 4,500 per year it is nevertheless important to appreciate that the rate of out-migration from

\textsuperscript{11} See methods chapter
Cornwall has always been comparatively high. Indeed, the fact that there has been such a high rate of both in and out-migration means that Cornwall has had a very high rate of population turnover.

Table 2.24: In, out and net migration in Cornwall, mid-years 1980/81 – 2000/01

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Period</th>
<th>In</th>
<th>Out</th>
<th>Net</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1980-81</td>
<td>17400</td>
<td>12800</td>
<td>4600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981-82</td>
<td>16650</td>
<td>13260</td>
<td>3390</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982-83</td>
<td>15670</td>
<td>12040</td>
<td>3630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983-84</td>
<td>17390</td>
<td>13050</td>
<td>4340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984-85</td>
<td>18900</td>
<td>13100</td>
<td>5800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1985-86</td>
<td>18600</td>
<td>12230</td>
<td>6370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1986-87</td>
<td>20650</td>
<td>14120</td>
<td>6530</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987-88</td>
<td>21780</td>
<td>14540</td>
<td>7240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1988-89</td>
<td>24850</td>
<td>15940</td>
<td>8910</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1989-90</td>
<td>20890</td>
<td>15960</td>
<td>4930</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1990-91</td>
<td>18260</td>
<td>13980</td>
<td>4280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991-92</td>
<td>13350</td>
<td>12720</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1992-93</td>
<td>17080</td>
<td>14230</td>
<td>2850</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1993-94</td>
<td>16790</td>
<td>13990</td>
<td>2800</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994-95</td>
<td>18699</td>
<td>14884</td>
<td>3715</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1995-96</td>
<td>18930</td>
<td>15744</td>
<td>3186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1996-97</td>
<td>20565</td>
<td>15937</td>
<td>4628</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-98</td>
<td>20712</td>
<td>16768</td>
<td>3944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1998-99</td>
<td>20016</td>
<td>16352</td>
<td>3664</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999-2000</td>
<td>21060</td>
<td>16354</td>
<td>4706</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-01</td>
<td>21228</td>
<td>15938</td>
<td>5290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80/81-90/91</td>
<td>211040</td>
<td>151020</td>
<td>60020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90/91-00/01</td>
<td>206690</td>
<td>166997</td>
<td>39693</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80/81-00/01</td>
<td>399470</td>
<td>304037</td>
<td>95433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annual average</td>
<td>19022</td>
<td>14478</td>
<td>4544</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: NHSCR from Cornwall County Council

To identify the fluctuations in migration flows in Cornwall it is useful to also consider figure 2.5. First, it is clear that net migration was higher in the 1980s when it averaged at around 5,500 per year compared to just over 3,500 in the 1990s. This was due both to a higher number of in-migrants and fewer out-migrants in the 1980s compared to the 1990s. Indeed the number of people moving into and out of the county moved closer together in the 1990s. However, the early 1980s represented a time when population turnover was at a
fairly low point. This is reflected by the below average rate of in, out and net migration for 81/82 and 82/83 and is seen as being a result of the recessionary period (Mitchell, 1993 p.143). Thereafter, between 83/84 and 86/87 the rate of in-migration increased almost year-on-year and, coupled with a below average rate of out-migration, net migration climbed steadily. This culminated in the peak period for net migration of over 7,000 for 87/88 and almost 9,000 the next year resulting from nearly 22,000 and 25,000 in-migrants respectively. Mitchell (1993 p. 143) suggests that this was a time when there was an upsurge in house prices, beginning first in the South East and then rippling out thereafter. He suggests that moving to Cornwall suddenly became a far more attractive prospect for owner occupiers in that region as their homes had gone from being worth typically around 25% more than houses in Cornwall to over 70%. More will be said later on the relationship between housing and migration in Cornwall however, data on the origins of in-migrants at this time suggested that the South East did indeed become an even more important donor region for Cornwall’s inward flow.

In-migration and net migration both dipped after the 88/89 year but still remained above average until 90/91. This was of course the period which saw a new UK and world recession take effect when unemployment soared and an increase in inflation and interest rates led to a crash in house prices and a general paralysis in the UK housing market. The economic conditions at this time, particularly within the housing market, seem to explain why out-migration, and particularly in-migration, in Cornwall hit a low point in 91/92 leading to the smallest net migration gain in over 30 years.
For most of the 1990s after the recessionary period movement into Cornwall generally increased year-on-year which resulted in corresponding increases in net migration. However, while in-migration was increasing, between 92/93 and 95/96 it was nevertheless considerably lower than what it had been through the middle to late 1980s and this was reflected in the comparatively low rate of net migration. Eventually when the inflow reached the highest point yet of the decade in 96/97 of around 20,000, for no obvious reason out-migration was also a high point and remained high until 99/00 so net migration at this time remained well below average. During the final two periods 99/00 and 00/01 in-migration had reached its highest point for over ten years at around 21,000. Out-migration over this period also seemed to stabilise. Although it ran at quite a high rate, at around 16,000 people a year, the large inflow meant that net migration once again climbed above the average rate of growth for the whole 20 years.

Figure 2.5: In, out and net migration in Cornwall, mid-years 1980/81 – 2000/01

Source: Cornwall County Council
2.6.6.2 Age of migrants

Using the NHSCR data once again, it is possible to look at the age profile of Cornwall’s migratory flows. The data available only goes so far back as 1985 so figure 2.6 shows the average annual numbers for in, out and net migration between 1985 and 2001. The picture confirms the general acceptance of migration as being a working-age phenomenon as both in and out migration is dominated by people aged between 15 and 59. In-migration is highest amongst those aged 30-59 while out-migration is dominated by the 15-29 cohorts. The result of this is that the largest net gains in Cornwall have been in the 30-59 cohorts which grew by over almost 3,000 a year although the 0-14 and 60+ groups also both recorded net gains of around 1,000 per annum. Despite the high numbers of 15-29 year olds moving into Cornwall the large numbers moving out have resulted in a net decrease in this cohort of around 500 a year. These patterns are largely confirmatory of other studies on counterurbanisation and of rural places, particularly the net loss of young adults despite overall large gains in net migration (Champion & Townsend, 1990; CRC, 2007).

Figure 2.6: In, out and net migration in Cornwall by age, 1985 – 2001
Of course these cohorts are large but a useful study by Williams et al (1995) entitled ‘Movers and Stayers’ provided a more detailed breakdown of migration flows. This provided an analysis of the nature of migration to and from Cornwall between 1981 and 1991 and used the ONS Longitudinal Study to analyse the characteristics of migrant flows. The age profile of in and out migrants moving between 1981 and 1991 is shown in figure 2.7.

Figure 2.7: Migration between 1981 and 1991 by age of migrants in 1981

![Graph showing migration between 1981 and 1991 by age of migrants in 1981.]


This confirms the findings in figure 2.6 in terms of the dominance of working-age movers. It also shows that in-migration is particularly high for those aged 20-34 (30-44 after moving) and a general tailing off as the age groups increase. The fact that there was a very high number of young in-migrants aged 0-4 (10-14 after moving) seems to support much of the counterurbanisation findings elsewhere. The work of Champion & Atkins (2000), Champion & Shepherd (2006) and the report by the Commission for Rural Communities (2007) all showed the lesser effect of retirement migration compared to the role of working-
age migration and particularly the movement of families and children. While in-migration generally decreases with age there is actually an interesting increase in people entering Cornwall around the 50-59 age groups (60-69 after moving) which seems to indicate a retirement or even pre-retirement move. Again, consistent with the NHSCR data, out-migration is concentrated amongst the youngest adults aged 15-19 (25-29 after moving).

For more recent years it has been possible to obtain the NHSCR data on migrants relating to single-year ages. This sheds even more light on the process of migration in Cornwall. Turning first to out-migration of young adults during 2000/01, figure 2.8 shows clearly that this is dominated by people aged 18 and 19. This seems to support the hypotheses of Williams et al (1995) that this is likely to be due to individuals moving away from Cornwall in pursuit of higher education. Indeed this has often been cited as an explanation for young adult out-migration in rural areas elsewhere (Owen & Green, 1992; Stockdale, 2004). This is even more convincing when it is considered that Cornwall has always had a lack of higher education opportunities so it would not only have failed to attract university students but it also lost a great many to other parts of the country. Indeed, recent evidence by Miller (2006) has showed that since the development of a large new higher education facility in Cornwall net migration rates of young adults have changed from a net loss to a net gain since 2003.

In terms of in-migration between 2000 and 2001 the peak is for those aged 21 and 22. Miller (2006) suggests that this is likely to be attributable to university leavers returning to Cornwall. That said the in-migration rate for 18-20 year olds is also particularly high so
these trends may merely serve to emphasise the greater migratory tendencies of young adults. The other interesting aspect that we can look at in more depth is what the work of Williams et al (1995) showed in terms of an upturn in in-migration around retirement. This graph shows that this is attributable mostly to people aged between 51 and 57 as it dips again thereafter. This does indeed seem to suggest that there is a willingness to move to Cornwall just before retirement age more so than at the exact point of retirement age.

**Figure 2.8: Migration into and out of Cornwall 2000/01 by single year ages**

![Graph showing migration into and out of Cornwall 2000/01 by single year ages](image)

Source: Miller (2006)

### 2.6.6.3 Origins and destinations of migrants

Again drawing upon the 1981-91 study by Williams et al (1995) it is possible to look at the regional origins and destinations of in-migrants and out-migrants respectively. The study showed that the South West and South East regions accounted for around 70% of all migration flows to and from Cornwall. However there were differences in comparing the origins of inflows and the destinations of outflows. The South West region was marginally the most common destination for out-migrants accounting for 38% of all out-migrants compared to 35% who moved to the South East (ibid, p. 30). Most of the migration to the
South West is likely to be short-distance and is therefore readily explained. Williams et al suggested that the high proportion moving to the South East was likely to be commonly driven by prospects of better job opportunities and higher wages and, in that respect, little different to that from other economically depressed regions (ibid, p 31).

While the origins of in-migrants are also most commonly the South West and South East regions, there is a notable difference compared to out-migration. Only 25% of in-migrants came from the South West whereas almost 44% originated from the South East. Again, Williams et al (1995) explain the high proportion of South West originated in-migrants by the fact that most migration will be short distance. However it is more difficult to explain the very high number of in-migrants moving from the far more prosperous South East. They claim that this move makes little economic sense and instead argue that it adds credence to the claim that much of Cornwall’s in-migration is linked to lifestyle strategies (ibid, p. 31).

2.6.6.4 Economic profile of migrants

2.6.6.4.1 Social Class

The vast majority of counterurbanisation studies have stressed the selective nature of migration to rural and peripheral areas. In terms of in-migrant characteristics, social class seems to have generated the greatest degree of consensus with counterurbanisers generally most likely to be middle-class service workers in professional and technical occupations (Champion & Atkins, 2000; Fielding, 1998).
The evidence of counterurbanisation in Cornwall also seems to back-up the notion of a class-selective migration flow. Perry et al (1986) found in their 1983 survey that 49% of Cornwall’s in-migrants were in the top two socio-economic groups and only 10% were in the bottom two groups. This meant that they were more than twice as likely to be in the top two socio-economic occupations compared to the long-term population and were half as likely to be in the bottom two occupation groups (ibid, p. 89). Moreover, almost half of in-migrants were working in the ‘other services’ industrial sector (including tourism) compared to over a quarter of the long-term population (ibid, p. 113).

Clear evidence pertaining to class-selectivity was also found to be the case by Williams et al (1995) in their study of LS data between 1981 and 1991. Here in-migrants were found to be almost three times more likely to be in Social Class I compared to the non-migrant population and half as likely to be in Social Class V (ibid, p. 46). However, this study provided data on longitudinal change as well as snap-shot cross-sectional data. This allowed for migrant characteristics to be identified both before and after moving. The value of this analysis is that it showed how different migrant groups compared with regard to a change in class status over the inter censusal decade. While in-migrants remained more likely to be in the top social classes both before and after moving, the decade nevertheless saw a general downturn in the class status of in-migrants and this trend was not symptomatic generally, either within Cornwall’s non-migrant population or the wider population of England and Wales. A downshift in the social class of Cornwall’s in-migrants was also indicated by in the study of Perry et al (1986) which they suggested to be characteristic of a more lifestyle-orientated migratory strategy.
These findings are by no means unique to Cornwall as Hoggart (2000) also found that rural in-migration was commonly met with a withdrawal from the professional and managerial classes. Such an assertion may lend support to a process of stepping-off the social mobility escalator described by Fielding (1991). However, the degree to which such a downturn in social class is voluntary is difficult, if not impossible, to calculate as it may also be a reflection of adjustment to the job opportunities available in the destination area. Indeed as identified by Buck et al (1993) many of Cornwall’s in-migrants were actually shown to have been unaware of the parlous nature of Cornwall’s economy prior to moving.

2.6.6.4.2 Employment status

The analysis of Champion and Atkins (2000) showed that while levels of labour market participation were around average for migrants that had made a counterurbanising move, there was nevertheless a larger rate of withdrawal from the labour market over the intercensal decade than was identified nationally. The ‘Movers and Stayers’ study doesn’t confirm this to be the case for in-migrants in Cornwall between 1981 and 1991. However it may be a methodological issue rather than a substantive one as the data relates to all migrants, regardless of age. As the nature of migration is self-selecting and is biased towards the younger age groups the in-migrant group in Cornwall during 1981-91 were younger than the non-migrant group. Therefore, it is unsurprising that a higher proportion of in-migrants were economically active in 1981 and 1991 compared to the non-migrant population. However, what does seem to indicate a level of ‘under-performance’ by in-migrants in regard to labour market participation is that the rate of increase in economic
activity was only 1.6% over the decade compared to 3.3% in the non-migrant population (Williams et al, 1995 p. 42).

In a more specific analysis of the same data Williams & Champion (1998, p. 122) present a comparison of the rate of full-time employment for male in-migrants and non-migrants across several cohorts, reproduced in the table below. Table 2.25 shows that for three out of the four cohorts male in-migrants were more likely to be in full-time employment before moving to Cornwall than non-migrants at the same point in time. Only those aged 46-55 had slightly lower rates of full-time employment. By 1991, and having moved to Cornwall, male in-migrants were less likely to be in full-time employment than non-migrants in all but the youngest cohort where expectedly there was an increase. This was most notable in the oldest cohort for those aged 56-65 whereby they became half as likely to be working full-time as non-migrants. In terms of ‘inter censual performance’ in-migrants did worse than non-migrants as a higher percentage withdrew from full-time employment in the 36-65 age range. Even in the case of the youngest cohort where there was an increase in the percentage of both in-migrants and non-migrants working full-time, the latter increased by a higher percentage. So while in terms of social class in-migrants experienced a decrease in the quality of labour market participation, this seems to indicate that they also experienced a net decrease in the quantity of labour market participation and this is not wholly explained by the level of job opportunities in the county.

Although in-migrants did worse than non-migrants in terms of their withdrawal from full-time employment, they actually did better than non-migrants with regard to part-time
employment rates. Williams et al. (1995, p. 67) showed that the rate of increase of in-migrants working part-time once they had moved to Cornwall was almost twice that of the rate of non-migrants. This may suggest a trade-down in employment status and working hours by in-migrants or it could indicate a gain of female in-migrants in the labour force. Unfortunately there is no breakdown by sex so the importance of each cannot be known.

Table 2.25: Percentage in full-time employment for male in-migrants and non-migrants – Cornwall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age 1991</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Non-migrants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>56-65</td>
<td>93.7</td>
<td>25.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46-55</td>
<td>91.7</td>
<td>72.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36-45</td>
<td>91.3</td>
<td>82.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26-35</td>
<td>71.6</td>
<td>84.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


In-migration through the 1980s can therefore be seen to have involved comparatively economically dynamic individuals who then experience a decrease both in the quantity and quality of their labour market participation. Such a process seems to indicate what Perry et al. (1986) found in that social and environmental motivations, rather than economic reasons, were the most common strategies of in-migrants. McNabb (1979) had found in a 1970s study that long-term unemployment among males in West Cornwall was associated with recent in-migration. However, Perry et al. (1986) found no evidence in their 1983 survey to suggest that moves were precipitated by unemployment or redundancies or that unemployment was significantly higher for in-migrants after moving (ibid, p. 128). This was supported also in the findings of the New Household Survey (NHS) conducted by Cornwall County Council between 1986 and 1987. This showed that only 3.5% of working-age in-migrants were unemployed at the time of survey, a percentage well below that of the
county rates (CCC, 1987). This is generally in line with other counterurbanisation research which has suggested the idea of an imported unemployment process to be unfounded.

Interestingly, Perry et al (1986, p. 115) did find that the in-migration was strongly related to an increase in self-employment. They found that only 13% of in-migrant heads of household were self-employed before moving but over 30% were self-employed afterwards. This corresponds with the findings of Fielding (1992) whereby rural in-migration was found to be strongly linked to a transition to self-employment.

The link between self-employment and Cornwall’s in-migrants is an interesting factor and can be analysed in a little more depth. One issue is that self-employment may not equate to gainful employment when set in the context of a migratory strategy that trades-off pecuniary losses in favour of quality of life gains. Perry (1993) suggests that approximately as much as one sixth of the in-migrant flow through the 1980s were what he described as ‘partially employed’; individuals mingling self-employment with spells of non-employment or registered unemployment. The other less than optimistic view of self-employed in-migrants in Cornwall described by Perry (1993) relates to those individuals who moved to the county to initiate or operate small businesses. For many of these migrants Perry et al argued that the strategy behind the move (to Cornwall and into self-employment) involved the desire ‘to be one’s own boss’ rather than necessarily based upon sound business plans (ibid, p. 73). As mentioned earlier, the studies of Elzey (1998) and Shaw and Williams (1987) both confirmed that tourism was overwhelmingly the sector of interest for in-migrants looking to establish small businesses. However, the latter study confirmed that
these businesses were often short-lived family enterprises which created little or no additional employment. Moreover, both studies by Phillips and Williams (1987) and Perry et al (1986) claim that both entrepreneurs and the small business sector generally in Cornwall was marked by low economic dynamism. This seems to lend weight to a view of in-migrant self-employment as commonly involving satisficing, as opposed to profit-maximising, economic behaviour.

2.6.6.4.3 Housing

It was shown in the previous chapter that counterurbanisers tend to be highly represented amongst the owner occupancy tenure. Turning once again to the studies of Perry et al (1986) and Williams et al (1995) we can see that this is also true of Cornwall’s in-migrants. In the first study in 1983, 88% of in-migrants were owner occupiers compared to 69% of long-term residents (Perry et al, 1986 p. 88). The later study of the 1980s also showed this trend to be true as 79% of in-migrants were owner occupiers before moving and 81% were so after moving which compares to 64% and 76% of non-migrants respectively (Williams et al, 1995 p. 49). The data from this study also shows a further level of advantage that in-migrants have over non-migrants in that 26% actually owned their property outright in 1991 compared to just 15% of non-migrants (Williams, 2004, p. 6).

In-migrants to Cornwall through the 1980s were not only highly represented in terms of owner occupancy but also seemed to be accessing what may be deemed to the more desirable property types, if indeed detached houses can be used as a proxy for desirability. Williams et al (1995, p. 56) showed that 45% of in-migrant households were detached
dwellings compared to less than 39% of non-migrant households. This was also found to be the case in rural Scotland in the study by Stockdale (2000).

A very popular explanation for why in-migrants seem to enjoy comparative advantages in terms of housing type and tenure relates to Hamnett’s (1992) thoughts on the commodification of housing. He suggested that individuals may actually seek to move to a location where house prices are considerably lower than their current location. Such a move would enable owner occupiers to accrue substantial monetary gain by selling their house in a high price area and buying in a low priced region. A strategy such as this would be of greatest benefit when the price differential between regions is particularly high. This was shown to be the case in Cornwall particularly in the late 1980s when the house price differential between Cornwall and the South East, the dominant region of origin for Cornwall’s in-migrants, was particularly large. This period marked a time when houses in the South East were worth around 70% more than those in Cornwall and when in-migration from this region and net migration was at its highest point between 1980 and 2000 (Mitchell, 1993 p.143). It was at also around this time that the New Household Survey was conducted and this showed that almost 44% of all new houses were being bought by in-migrants (CCC, 1987). Moreover, in further support of this claim, in-migration dipped to its lowest levels during the house price crash in the early 1990s and in-migration of the retired, being those who were most likely to be owner occupiers, was seen to diminish more than all other age groups (Mitchell, 1993 p. 143).
The notion that in-migrants have benefited from the house price differential is largely accepted and has been cited as such by Williams (1993) and Perry (1986). However what is not known for certain is whether migrants are driven to move by the potential gains in the housing market and little empirical work has been done on this. Indeed, Perry’s 1983 survey showed that only 12% of in-migrants had cited cheaper housing as an important factor in their decision to move to Cornwall (Perry et al, 1986 p. 93). However, as discussed in the previous chapter, Thomas (1993) did show that house prices had an effect on the destination choice of individuals who were moving for non-economic reasons but not for those moving for job reasons. Given that much of Cornwall’s in-migration has been suggested to be non-job related suggests that house prices would indeed therefore play a part in the choice of Cornwall for in-migrants.

Two studies that used in-depth interviews of Cornwall’s in-migrants provided some evidence that the house price differential played a part in the strategies of in-migrants. Buck et al (1993) and Williams (1997) both suggested that owner occupier in-migrants commonly realised housing equity when moving to Cornwall. This helped many pay off mortgages in full which would go some way to explaining the high rates of outright ownership among in-migrants. It was also found that some chose to invest the realised equity into small ventures or businesses while others used it as a financial cushion while they looked for work or enjoyed time-off or partial employment. In this sense, housing may be less of a primary driver of counterurbanisers in Cornwall but rather an additional incentive which facilitates a more lifestyle-orientated migratory strategy.
2.6.7 Impacts of counterurbanisation and in-migration

There is an absence of work carried out in terms of social class impacts of counterurbanisation in Cornwall so it is not discussed here. There is also relatively little that has been said of demographic or housing impacts specifically related to in-migration in the county. As such these themes are covered only briefly and with a level of speculation. The final section relates more to the aims of the thesis and explores in greater depth some of the evidence for possible economic impacts of counterurbanisation in Cornwall.

2.6.7.1 Demographic impacts

Similar to many other rural areas, Cornwall has been characterised for some time by a net gain of all ages except young adults. As table 2.26 shows, this has actually caused an increase between 1971 and 2001 in the overall proportion of the population that is working-age. This is fairly unsurprising given the fact that the majority of in-migrants have been working-age, comprising particularly of families with young children. It also needs to be recognised that the baby-boom generation of the 1960s are likely to have swelled the working-age population in 2001 compared to 1971. However, the suggestion by Champion & Shepherd (2006) was that this in-migration profile will eventually lead to an ageing effect as many of the children of in-migrant (and non-migrant) families leave the area but the parents stay and ‘age in place’ (ibid, p. 24). Indeed the findings of Aldous’ (2002) Cornwall study support the assertion that it is often children of in-migrant families particularly that go on to become out-migrants. The argument can therefore be made that counterurbanisation in Cornwall has not increased the proportion of the pensionable ages
thus far, yet it has nevertheless set the wheels in motion for the future. Indeed this much
can be seen in the projected changes for 2001 to 2028 in table 2.26.

Table 2.26: Change in age profiles 1971-2001 and predicted change to 2028

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>0-14</th>
<th>15-64</th>
<th>65+</th>
<th>All Ages</th>
<th>15-64 (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>80,400</td>
<td>231,900</td>
<td>66,900</td>
<td>379,200</td>
<td>61%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>86,200</td>
<td>312,500</td>
<td>100,300</td>
<td>499,000</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2028</td>
<td>89,800</td>
<td>353,800</td>
<td>177,400</td>
<td>621,000</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS, Cornwall County Council

The implications of an older population in Cornwall have been suggested to lead to an
increased demand for a range of health and welfare related service, provisions for public
transport and accessibility issues” (CCC, 2006, p. 8.1). The case for increased demands on
social care is indeed compelling. In assessing Cornwall’s future welfare needs Cornwall
College (2007) emphasise the significance of an increasing older age profile below:

“Only 16% of the population is over the age of 65 but this group
- Accounted for 43% of the total NHS budget in 2003/4
- Currently occupy 65% of acute hospital beds
- Accounted for 58% of social services budgets in 2004/5 and
- Received 71% of social care packages in 2004/5”

(Cornwall College, 2007 p. 10-11)

An ageing population is also likely to impact upon housing issues in the county. The South
West Observatory state that “population ageing is likely to increase the number of single
person households and so increase the demand for housing” (cited in CCC, 2007 p. 4.9).

This point is further examined in the next section.

2.6.7.2 Housing impacts

The previous chapter (1.4.3) discussed how interest in rural in-migration and housing has
focused mainly on the impact migrants have had on housing affordability and availability.
These issues have not escaped attention in Cornwall indeed Williams argues that “in-migration, and to a lesser extent the demand for holiday accommodation, can be cited as important causal factors in Cornwall’s housing shortage” (Williams, 1993 p. 162). He continues by suggesting that the low cost of housing gave an added incentive for in-migrants, particularly those from the high priced South East and “at times the demand for houses has been insatiable” (ibid, p.161).

Interestingly there has been little empirical work on the effect that in-migrants have had on house prices in Cornwall but it has not prevented this assertion being made by politicians (Goldsworthy, 2005) and government agencies (South West Regional Assembly, 2007). Such assertions are in no doubt fuelled by the rapid house price increases in Cornwall, indeed prices grew by 268% between 1996 and 2006, the fastest growth rate in England, Wales or Scotland (Independent, 2006). Moreover, the combined effect of rapid prices increases coupled with a low wage economy has resulted in Cornwall being one the least affordable places to buy. The Joseph Rowntree foundation showed that in 2005 three of Cornwall’s districts featured in the top eleven districts with the highest house price to income ratio least affordable places, only Kensington and Chelsea was less affordable than North Cornwall (Wilcox, 2006 p. 11).

Considering the evidence discussed in this chapter we may suggest that many in-migrants would have been better positioned to compete for housing in Cornwall given that many originate from the high priced South East and they are disproportionately likely to be owner occupiers. It may even explain why in 2002 cash sales comprised a larger percentage of
total sales in Cornwall than in any other English local authority (Miller, 2006 p. 145). However, as Miller (2006) quite rightly points out, the demand in Cornwall’s housing market has been fuelled not just by high levels in-migration but by those wishing to buy second homes and others who have recently switched from the stock market to property as investment destinations (ibid, p. 39). Essentially, although it seems likely that in-migration has served to strengthen affordability problems within the county, particularly for those on low incomes in the longer-term population, the evidence cannot prove this to be the case.

2.6.7.3 Economic impacts

Firstly, tables 2.13 and 2.20 showed that manufacturing employment performed strongly in Cornwall in the two recent growth periods, 1984-89 and 1991-2001, compared to the South West and Great Britain. Admittedly we do not have the data to show this but it is quite possible that Cornwall’s strength in this sector may in part have been due to in-migrants and their businesses. Indeed the findings of Perry et al (1986) suggest that in-migration involved a high number of self-employed persons, even if they were shown to be predominantly driven by environmental motives. Interestingly, Findlay et al (2000) suggested that environmentally rich areas may have the advantage in attracting entrepreneurial in-migrants and claimed that “quality of life and rural economic growth can...be seen as complimentary to one another” (ibid, p. 343). There is of course precedent of this in Cornwall as its environmental attraction was shown to have been the dominant reason for choosing Cornwall by owners of incoming businesses in the 1970s (Perry, 1978). If this is the case then we could hypothesise that Cornwall has benefited directly from in-migration in terms of job growth in this sector.
On a negative note, table 2.16 shows that during the recessionary period of 1989-1993 Cornwall lost a higher rate of manufacturing jobs than the South West and Britain. In this respect Cornwall seems to be fairly good at attracting firms but it also fragile during times of downturn. We might also suggest that in-migrants may have played some part in this fragility too. In both the studies of Perry et al (1986) and Phillips and Williams (1987) the entrepreneurial attitudes of business-owning in-migrants were suggested to be marked by a low level of economic dynamism. Indeed, Perry et al (1986) went as far as suggesting that self-employment was often intermingled with periods of partial or non-employment and Williams et al (1988) have questioned whether in-migrant entrepreneurs lean towards consumption rather production. It could be argued that Cornwall’s environmental appeal may serve to attract a self-selecting inflow of satisficing rather than dynamic entrepreneurs. If this has indeed been the case then we may suggest that Cornwall’s entrepreneurial inflow may have lacked the dynamism required to maximise potential endogenous growth.

Another possible outcome of Cornwall’s environmental draw may be that it served to undermine one of the assumptions of the policy of population-led growth; that poor employment prospects would deter in-migration. The continued high rate of in-migration showed this not to be the case. There may be two main reasons for this. First, in-migrants have been shown to be largely motivated by environmental concerns (Perry et al, 1986) and for some the move would have been further incentivised by potential housing gains. This in itself could have been used as a cash-cushion if problems arose and indeed was found to be the case for some in-migrants in the study of Buck et al (1994). Second, in-migrants may
have considered their employment prospects to be better than most. We know from the
New Household Survey (1987) that in-migrants were less likely to be unemployed than
non-migrants so they may have been better placed to compete for jobs, particularly as the
LS analyses (Williams et al, 1995) showed they more likely to be highly skilled than non-
migrants. Nevertheless, Williams (2003) suggested that for the policy to have worked
Cornwall would have needed to continually create enough jobs for non-migrants and a
surplus for the continuing number of in-migrants. While Cornwall was indeed good at
creating employment the continued high unemployment levels indicates that in-migrants
may have added to the labour supply without sufficiently adding to the labour demand. In
this respect in-migration may have indirectly served to keep unemployment high, mirroring
what Williams states as a scenario where “Cornwall got the population without the growth”
(ibid, p. 67).

The second aspect of population-led growth, relying on the multiplier effects of in-
migration, may have been more successful. The analyses have shown that employment
growth has been strong in Cornwall and that it has indeed been strongest in the service
economy. In terms of service sub-sectors, tables 2.13 and 2.20 show that
‘distribution/retail/hotels & restaurants’, ‘education’ and ‘health’ have seen some of the
strongest rates of growth and these are areas that are closely linked to the size of a
population. However, and maybe pessimistically, these are fairly low value sectors so in-
migration may have served to strengthen and compound a low value economy. This reflects
Williams (2003) assertion that while in-migration has generated employment it likely that
these are the ‘wrong kind of jobs’.
Finally, the fact that in-migrants have shown a propensity to withdraw from labour market activity and trade-down in occupational status may contribute to a low skill equilibrium, suggested by Green and Hardill (2003). This is a condition whereby "employers compete in low value added markets and demand relatively low skills from employees, which is ultimately reflected in the supply of skills", (ibid, p. ii). They suggest that one outcome of this is the continued loss of young out-migrants who leave in search of better quality employment and represent a loss of potentially more dynamic human capital. Ultimately it may be problematic to assume that in-migrants shape the skills requirements of the labour market but the out-migration of the young has certainly characterised Cornwall's migratory profile.

In summary of the economic impacts of in-migration, it is unknown what Cornwall would look like without counterurbanisation, nevertheless it seems that the model of counterurbanisation in Cornwall changed from one which was at least partially job-led through the 1960s and early 1970s to one which has been supplemented to a larger degree by lifestyle counterurbanisers thereafter and the analyses suggest that such a model of counterurbanisation can be argued to have been a double-edged sword with regard to economic growth. The same population growth has served to generate and exceed job growth and so created both employment and unemployment. Moreover it may be argued that lifestyle counterurbanisers have not been the 'modernising elite’ for the economy that was hoped for and may have actually served to perpetuate a low value economy.
2.7 Summary

In summary, this chapter has outlined the counterurbanisation story in Cornwall thus far. Cornwall has been shown to be a rural and remote area and there is little doubt that it has been a net recipient counterurbanisation population growth since the 1960s. There may be an argument to suggest that environmental explanations have always been important in Cornwall, even during the 1960s and early 70s when exogenous growth in manufacturing units indicate the importance of employment-led explanations. Employment-led explanations seem to be less important for the 1980s onwards. Although in-migrants are still likely to be constrained by the requirement of employment, the evidence suggests that for many the work-life balance has shifted slightly towards the latter and the economic downshift coupled with housing gains may suggest a strategy of "stepping-off the escalator" for some.

The characteristics of in-migrants are similar to those identified in other rural studies with in-migration consisting largely of families and children and the later working-ages. As said, while most are in the high occupational classes there is evidence of a downshift in terms of the quantity and quality of labour market participation for some. The comparative advantage that in-migrants have in terms of housing seems to reflect Carol Williams' (2002) point about in-migrants being "equity rich" and "work poor" but this is nevertheless only part of the story. Self-employees, either at the point of origin or destination, seem to be important for Cornwall’s in-migrants and in this sense we may suggest that they directly generate additional employment, though this cannot be known for sure. Alternately there may be evidence to suggest that self-employees may be less entrepreneurial and more
satisficing with Perry (1993), amongst others, questioning if they are the modernising elite that planners may have hoped for. The evidence does however suggest that Cornwall has benefited from the multiplier effects of in-migration particularly as growth in the people-led service sectors has been strong, even if these are some of the lower value sectors.

Ultimately, it is only possible to hypothesise on the effects of migration through the 1990s based on migration studies from the previous decade. This study will update the migratory story of Cornwall for the recent decade and the following chapter will detail how this will be done.
3 Methods

3.1 Introduction

This chapter has three sections. The first of these is a discussion of the methodological issues in the use of secondary analysis, in particular the England and Wales Census and its derived datasets. The second section will discuss how one of these, the ONS Longitudinal Study, was used in the first stage of analysis to investigate counterurbanisation in Cornwall. The final section outlines the 2nd stage analyses and the methods used to identify associations between in-migration, population growth and socio-economic dynamics at a range of spatial levels within Cornwall.

3.2 Secondary data analysis

Most of the data analysed in this project is secondary data. For this reason it is necessary to begin this chapter with a discussion of its advantages and disadvantages as a methodological research technique. The aim is not a philosophical discussion, but rather to provide a pragmatic account of methodological issues arising from secondary data analysis.

Secondary analysis is the further analysis of information already collected. This information can be in the form of a dataset or as published commentaries on previous research. Secondary data analysis may be conducted on a range of different kinds of data, including data from qualitative research. However in this thesis analyses are wholly of statistical data and the methodological discussions here will be restricted to those arising from the use of such data.
Secondary statistical analysis has a number of resource advantages of economy and time and is particularly useful in single research projects. A particular advantage of secondary data and one utilised here, is that it also provides the researcher with the means to investigate particular sub-groups which may be difficult or impossible to identify otherwise. National datasets such as censuses may provide the sampling frame by which specific groups, such as migrants, may be identified for meso or micro level analysis. Moreover, it is likely that inferential statistics will need to be contextualised so national datasets may provide the opportunity to compare the characteristics of the sub-group with those of the national population, or indeed another sub-group such as non-migrants.

The United Kingdom is well provided with a range of accessible large datasets, such as those provided by the Economic and Social Data Service (ESDS) and its associated UK Data Archive provides and supports one of the most extensive archives of secondary data in the world. At the outset of the current research the UK Data Archive was searched for datasets that might enhance Census analyses, but none were found that related directly to the questions being addressed. Additionally the other major data source is the Office for National Statistics (ONS) which collect, preserve and disseminate large-scale government datasets on Britain’s economy, population and society at a range of spatial levels.

Data in government surveys is of an extremely high quality. This is due to the data collection process being informed by a high level of expertise and carried out by highly trained and well practised professionals. This results in sophisticated and considered survey
design, fieldwork and methodological development throughout the collection process (Dale et al 1988, p45). This is true of the Census which includes consultation and consideration of topics, techniques and disclosure control measures as well as one rehearsal of the data collection process and a further rehearsal of the complete Census system. Additionally the Census goes through post-validation exercises, involving post-enumeration surveys. The Census, in common with other large government surveys contains well documented information on the data collection process. This can be used to evaluate the limitations of any subsequent interpretations but it becomes even more important if the researcher wishes to manipulate the data further or to compare it with other datasets over time.

Longitudinal datasets such as the ONS Longitudinal Study (LS), used in this research, have particular value because they measure phenomena prospectively rather than retrospectively meaning that responses are not subject to recall problems or post-hoc rationalisation which may undermine the validity of data. Even those time-series cross-sectional datasets, such as the General Household Survey (GHS) or indeed the Census, which may not seek to collect the exact same data at each point, nevertheless retain core questions which aim to measure the same phenomena over time. Evidence has shown with longitudinal studies especially that repeated measures over time serve to provide data that is both reliable and valid (Collett et al, 2004).

Again relating strongly to government surveys, quantitative datasets are usually drawn from surveys that are largely descriptive both in questions and answers which, combined with formalised recording procedures, arguably provides standardised data with good external
validity. Essentially the attempts to gain uniformity in the data collection process in terms of exhaustive responses and formalised coding for those responses that are more complex should serve to diminish the interviewer effect in the survey and therefore the resultant data.

The disadvantages to secondary data analysis are extremely important to highlight to guide the researcher through the considerations that need to be accounted for in the analysis process. The most obvious and inherent disadvantage of secondary data analysis is that the researcher had no part in the data collection process. Unless they are extremely fortunate their study will therefore be constrained to work with data that may not explicitly address the research problem. This may have impacts on the spatial dynamics of the research as there may be substantively useful data but which cannot be, for example, disaggregated to the geographic level of interest for the research project. Taking the example of the 1991 Sample of Anonymised Records (SARs), analysis was restricted to areas with a population of 120,000, effectively ruling out the applicability of the dataset for around 60% of local authorities in Britain and thus ruling it out as a usable dataset in the present case. Other disadvantages include the lack of researcher control over when data are collected, the choice of themes, sampling methods, the choice of what to measure and the derivation of variables and categories (Williams 2003 p. 176).

Boslaugh (2007, p. 5) claims that every dataset has its 'dirty little secrets' referring to problems that may have occurred in the data collection process, be it the response rates and the representativeness of the sample, misunderstandings between data collector and the
respondent, interviewer effects or problems during the coding and cleaning of the data. She claims that while these may not invalidate the data they nevertheless need to be accounted for by the analysis. However, it is not only potential problems in the data collection that the secondary data analysis needs account for but the whole process. This includes establishing the purpose of the study, be it a study based on describing phenomena or one that was informed by a conceptual framework. It is also important to fully understand the substantive categorisation and coding of data as well as establishing the sampling issues to assess the representativeness of the data. Finally the researcher has to assess the quality or credentials of the data which may or may not be apparent from the source of the dataset. All of these issues need to be considered to contextualise the effect they may have on subsequent interpretations and conclusions. Nevertheless, the researcher can only work with the data that exist and overall the advantages of (particularly large scale) secondary data sets outweigh the disadvantages.

Ethical considerations are not usually paramount for the secondary analyst, though some datasets may come with conditions related to anonymity. The ONS Longitudinal Study (LS) is one such dataset. Although in Britain we are fortunate to have good quality secondary datasets they are mostly individual level data and whilst this is anonymised, it would nevertheless be possible to identify individuals, in micro level analyses, were controls not in place. The LS protects the anonymity by limiting either the substantive content, in terms of the number of cross-tabulated variables, or the geographical detail which is likely to restrict the potential for those studies seeking detailed information by residential location such as migration researchers! While the Census provides fairly
detailed information at small spatial levels it too involves disclosure control methods involving the adjustment of any cells in released tables with a count less than 4. The implications for this are discussed later in the chapter but suffice it to say that the various disclosure control techniques of datasets may also either restrict the scope or even invalidate some analyses.

Having outlined a fairly generic appraisal on the benefits, costs and considerations involved with secondary data analysis attention will now be given to a more in-depth focus on a description of the two principal datasets that are used in the research, the Census and the LS.

3.3 The Census

The Census of England and Wales is decennial and conducted by the Office for National Statistics. It is the longest running continuous social benchmark of the population and while over time some questions have been withdrawn and some added it remains a powerful and unique tool for studying both a snapshot of social conditions as well as social change. If the value of the Census as a secondary dataset is considered against the criteria described above then its principal advantage is its size and coverage. It aims to be a 100% sample of people and households in the UK (though in the last two censuses it has fallen somewhat short of this ideal, with around a million persons unaccounted for, mainly in conurbations. Nevertheless it should be seen as being highly representative and, allowing for selective non-response, the findings can be generalised. A key advantage is its fine
geographical coverage level and it is therefore a valuable resource for researchers wishing to analyse subgroups either by substantive criteria, geographical criteria or both.

Census data are wholly descriptive with formalised and uniform coding throughout which therefore minimises some of the more complex problems of interpretation and analysis associated with qualitative inquiry where data more closely determined by the interpretations of the researcher. Moreover because the Census can be regarded to be a repeated measure and is subject to numerous validation evaluations the data may be said to stand up well in terms of reliability and validity.

Nevertheless there are also some drawbacks to Census data. Consultations are held with a full range of users, data providers and subject experts to take account of their informed views and to address their differing needs and expectations in a cost-effective manner. As such, the questions asked will not be determined only by their relevance to academic interest, but also by their relevance to other users, including national and local government departments and health authorities. The topic selection also is pragmatic and the number of topics limited. For example, one requested topic for inclusion is income but as yet it has failed to appear as a question in any of the Censuses. The reason for this is that individuals are assumed to object to questions that are deemed to be too intrusive with many refusing to respond. Indeed a Census Advisory Group (1999) showed that the inclusion of an income question lowered response rates to a statistically significant degree and this, it was claimed, would serve to diminish the accuracy and overall quality of the data. For the researcher who
wishes to examine income (and indeed other topics such as health) the only option is to use proxy variables and indeed this has been the necessary practice in the current research.

Although the aim of the Census is to count 100% of the population no individual Census will actually achieve this but some are more successful than others. Although more will be said on this later, both the 1991 and 2001 Censuses undercounted the population, the second more than the first. However what is important for the analyst of the data is that the undercount was not distributed across the population evenly and it was more extreme for particular groups such as young males and for specific areas, particularly city districts. This is important not just because of the sheer size of the undercount in terms of numbers but also by the fact that the level of imputation would be far higher thus diminishing the validity of data on specific people and in certain places.

Another measure that can undermine validity is that of disclosure. Some methods for preventing the disclosure of individuals in the Censuses are fairly simple but they may nevertheless impact upon the aims of the analyst. The simplest form of disclosure is the restriction of detail either in terms of substantive data or geographical output, for example, in the 2001 Census some of the most detailed tables of cross-tabulated data, such as Standard Tables (ST), are not available at the smallest level of geographic output the Output Area (OA). In the 1991 Census the same procedure was used in regard to Local Base Statistics (LBS) tables not being released for Enumeration Districts (ED). However more sophisticated disclosure techniques are also applied to outputs that contain small cell counts. In both the 1991 and 2001 England and Wales Censuses a process of cell
modification took place where the true value of a cell was adjusted up or down although the process differed between the two Censuses. Again, more will be said on this later. Needless to say the adjustment of cells can lead to error and this may be amplified or decreased depending upon the way that the analyst uses the data. Moreover, because of the risk to compromise confidentiality protection, some detailed information about the disclosure methods applied cannot be provided to users of the Census so the amount of error in the data cannot be known for certain.

A final point to note relates to the temporal nature of Census data. The Census is decennial so while it can be used to analyse time-series data to examine change the fact that it is a cross-sectional snapshot means that the data may have limited shelf-life depending on the types of studies being conducted. The data may lose value over the duration of the intercensal period and this may be even more significant for those studies which use the data to examine themes related to short-term changes. Moreover there is every possibility that conditions may be atypical during the census year. The example given above was with migration at the time of the 1991 Census. The previous chapter used NHSCR data to show that the numbers of in-migrants to Cornwall were unusually low in 1991 compared to the years before and after therefore Census data would say less about the change in numbers of migrants than NHSCR data although it contained far more detail on the nature of migration. However, given that the low rates of migration were argued to have been caused by the fall in house prices and increase in interest rates, itself an unusual phenomenon, it may be argued that the nature of migration was also atypical. While there is nothing that can be done to change the occurrence of unusual conditions during census years, it is essential that
the researcher considers any relevant conditions and accounts for their effect on any analyses, particularly those which compare censuses over time.

3.4 The ONS Longitudinal Study

The ONS Longitudinal Study links information from the Census along with information from the registration of births, cancers and deaths. It contains linked census and event data for one per cent of the population of England and Wales. Data from the original 1971 Census sample have been linked to information from the 1981, 1991 and 2001 Censuses and with information on events such as births, deaths and cancer registrations.

The original LS sample included 1971 Census of Population information for people born on one of four selected dates in a calendar year. These four dates were used to update the sample at the 1981, 1991 and 2001 Censuses and to add new members between Censuses. Routine event registrations area also linked to members of the LS. These events include births to women in the sample, cancer registrations, deaths and deaths of spouses. Given that it is geographically unclustered it is a highly representative sample.

LS Census data provides a snapshot of a sample of England and Wales every ten years, this represents around half a million people at any single Census point. While the LS provides a continuous sample spanning the 1971, 1981, 1991 and 2001 Censuses there are fewer linked records over time than at any one point in time. This is because a continuous sample relies upon LS members being enumerated at more than one point in time and as such it will exclude those who had not yet been born, those who died, those individuals who were
not resident in England and Wales at both time points and any LS members who were not enumerated by the Census for any other reason.

The strength of the LS for migration research is that it can be used to identify individuals who changed address between censuses and gives a comprehensive account of the characteristics of these people both before and after moving. This allows researchers to not only identify the nature of demographic and socio-economic change that is associated with residential change but also to assess the effect of migration on specified population profiles (Creeser, 2000 p. vi). While the LS collects information on individuals it also provides more limited information on the households of LS members and others within those households. Another important strength of the LS for migration research is that it captures residential change over a ten-year period rather than moves made within the year preceding a Census used in other Census derived migration information. The latter may therefore be more susceptible to atypical migration and short-term contextual effects.

Though the LS is clearly a valuable research tool for migration studies it nevertheless contains some weaknesses. Although it captures moves between censuses it will conceal multiple moves that occur during the intercensual period because it remains to be a snapshot picture. For example an individual may have left Cornwall in 1997 and moved back in 2000, but the LS would recognise that individual as living at the same address in 1991 and 2001 and categorise them as a non-migrant. Moreover there is no way of knowing how long an in-migrant may have been living at their new address, be it nine years or less than one. The same problem applies to changes in characteristics as an individual may be found to be
employed in 1991 and 2001 yet this might conceal periods of unemployment in the intercensal period.

Another problem with using the LS to analyse migration between two censuses relates to the linking of records. Longitudinal analysis requires there to be a complete record linkage between the censuses in question, in this case 1991 and 2001. This means that the 1991-2001 LS sample will exclude LS members who either died or were born between 1991 and 2001 as well as people who were not enumerated at either Census. This will therefore omit in-migrants and out-migrants originating from or moving to areas outside England and Wales but also those individuals missed by the Census. Finally under-enumeration was arguably more of a problem in the 1991 Census compared to 2001 and these individuals would be omitted altogether. Moreover, Champion and Atkins (2000, p. 2) have suggested that the people missed may in fact be the more migratory groups. A final point to note is that confidentiality protection procedures prevent the LS being used at particularly small spatial scales of analysis where there may be a risk of disclosing individual identities.

3.5 Research question 1

How does Cornwall’s in-migratory profile help to explain:

- Why in-migration has been so high in the face of economic poverty
- Why in-migration has failed to bring about economic prosperity
The key objective for the first research question was to investigate the dynamics of in-migration in Cornwall and compare this to in-migration in two other areas. The first is Wiltshire. Wiltshire has shared a similar pattern of counterurbanisation population growth as Cornwall and it is in the same South West region. Importantly it can be described as an economically successful area so the aim is to see if in-migration here is characteristically different to that of Cornwall. The second comparative area is West Wales and the Valleys. This provides a ‘control’ element to the comparisons as it is a similarly economically poor region.

3.5.1 The use of LS data

The LS is used in this study to examine the demographic and socio-economic of Cornwall’s in-migrants; those individuals who were enumerated at a residence outside the county in 1991 and enumerated at a Cornwall address in 2001. Two other broad comparator groups are also defined, these being the long-term population of Cornwall, individuals enumerated in Cornwall in 1991 and 2001 and likely to comprise of some earlier in-migrants, and the remaining LS sample consisting of individuals enumerated outside Cornwall in 1991 and 2001. The same migrant streams were derived for Wiltshire and West Wales and the Valleys as comparators.

Given that the LS provides a range of details about individuals at both Census points there are three key analyses that can be conducted for each migrant group. Firstly by looking at the characteristics of in-migrants in 1991 it is possible to examine the type of people that Cornwall attracts. Any distinctness can be identified by comparing in-migrants with the
characteristics of the remainder of the LS sample and indeed to the long-term population of Cornwall. This can be carried out again in 2001 to compare the characteristics of in-migrants following their move to Cornwall. The third analysis compares the characteristics of in-migrants in 1991 to those characteristics in 2001 to examine the patterns of socio-economic change associated with moving to Cornwall. It is possible to examine the distinctiveness of any changes by comparing them to the remainder of the LS sample. Importantly comparisons of socio-economic change can also be drawn between in-migrants and the long-term population. If the patterns of change are similar between these two groups then it may be argued that the structural context of Cornwall has been important however if the socio-economic change of in-migrants is distinct from the long-term population it might be argued that the process of migration itself has been important. Essentially the LS data enables an examination of who moves to Cornwall, what happens after they move and allows us to speculate about the migratory strategies of Cornwall's in-migrants.

3.5.2 Migrant characteristics

The LS sample used for the analyses was drawn from all LS members that were present at both the 1991 and 2001 Censuses. The sample does however depend upon the specific variables under examination so it is necessary to outline the characteristics being studied. After a basic examination of the numbers of migrants moving to and from each study area there is a look at the origins of in-migrants and the age-structures of in-migrant flows to each area.
Most analyses focussed on economic activity and inactivity, full-time employment, part-time employment, self-employment and unemployment. The information indicates levels of labour market participation by in-migrants and permits inferences about the economic dynamism of in-migrants. All economic analyses draw from a sample of Longitudinal Study Members (LSMs) aged 36-55 in 2001 (26-45 in 1991). This is argued to represent an optimum working-age cohort as it will contain very few retirees or people in full-time education. It is also important to draw upon this cohort for reasons of fair comparisons across each study area as the age profile of in-migrants in each area differs to a sizable degree. This is elaborated upon in the analyses chapter.

Much of the counterurbanisation literature indicates that counterurban migrants are disproportionately drawn from specific occupational classes so this trend is examined here also. There are some definitional difficulties with making comparisons on occupational class because in 2001 the National Statistics Socio-Economic Classification (NS-SEC) replaced the Socio-Economic Group (SEG) classification used in the 1991 Census. Nevertheless both provide classifications derived from employment status and occupation and it is possible to aggregate NS-SEC categories to achieve a good approximation for all SEG classes so that meaningful comparisons between the two classifications can be drawn.\(^{12}\)

Rather than focusing on all SEG classes the analyses focus on 4 aggregated categories. Hierarchical comparisons can be drawn between the highest occupational class,

\(^{12}\) Details of deriving comparable classifications of SEG and NSSEC can be found in the NS-SEC User Manual (ONS, 2005).
'managerial/professional/technical', and the lowest, 'manual and routine'. The two classes in between, 'petite bourgeoisie'\(^{13}\) and 'white collar' should not necessarily be viewed in this way. Table 1 show the categories used in these analyses along with the corresponding SEG and NS-SEC categories.

Table 3.1: Derivation of occupational class from 1991 SEG and 2001 NSSEC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Defined groups</th>
<th>1991 SEG</th>
<th>2001 NSSEC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Managerial / Professional / Technical</td>
<td>1, 2.2, 3, 4, 5.1</td>
<td>1, 2, 3, 4.1, 4.3, 5, 7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petite Bourgeoisie</td>
<td>2.1, 12, 13, 14</td>
<td>4.4, 8, 9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Collar</td>
<td>5.2, 6</td>
<td>4.2, 6, 7.1, 7.2, 12.1, 12.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual / Routine</td>
<td>7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 15</td>
<td>7.4, 10, 11, 12.2, 12.3, 12.4, 12.5, 12.7, 13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Includes armed forces & occupations not stated
**Includes long-term unemployed, never worked, FT students, occupations not coded/not classifiable

Rather than focusing on the individual level, the occupational class analysis examines the class of the LSM Household Reference Person (HRP), or Head of Household (HoH) in 1991 aged 26-64 in 2001 in order to provide a more sociologically valid picture of the household social characteristics. As the inclusion criteria in this study is all economically active LSMs, focusing on individual-level occupational class would have given far more missing cases as economically inactive LSMs would be excluded. In this sense it is also for pragmatic reasons that the HRP is the unit of analysis.

The final analysis of data from the LS relates to housing tenure, specifically focusing on the number of LSMs that own their homes outright. As the chance of owning a property outright generally increases with age comparisons of all in-migrants across each study area

\(^{13}\) 'Petit bourgeoisie' refers to the use by Fielding (1991) and equates to the NSSEC analytical classes of 'new' self-employed, employers in small organisations and own account workers.
would be invalid, given the age structure differences of migrant groups in each area. For this reason the analyses focus only on one cohort of LSMs, those aged 46-65 (36-55 in 1991).

3.5.3 Cornwall County Council Peoples Panel

Cornwall County Council (CCC) conducts a regular postal survey called the Peoples Panel (PP) consisting of a voluntary sample of around 1,300 residents. This was used to provide contextual data to support the Census analyses and is sole source of primary data in this research. This study utilised the PP sample to survey individuals about migratory histories, demographic and socio-economic change and, where applicable, reasons for moving to Cornwall. The PP survey aimed to provide similar information to that which is given in the LS so it categorised respondents as in-migrants if they had moved to Cornwall in the last 10 years, between 1995 and 2005. It also asked respondents to provide current demographic and socio-economic information about themselves and their characteristics 10 years previous. It must be said that the findings are not as robust as those from the LS as questions are asked retrospectively and answers are thus susceptible to issues of recall or re-evaluation. However, the most important aspect of the survey was to ask about motivations for moving to Cornwall which cannot be obtained through the LS. The aim was therefore to check the findings of in-migrants in the PP sample to see if they exhibited similar characteristics to in-migrants identified in the LS and if this was the case then questions on motivations for migration could be seen to be fairly valid, albeit with the problems associated with retrospective surveys.

14 Please see appendices for a copy of the survey.
Respondents were asked to tick all the reasons they felt were important in their decision to move to Cornwall. The options for possible reasons were obtained by combining all reasons found to be important in the 1983 West Cornwall Study (Perry et al 1986) and those reasons given in the 1987 New Household Survey conducted by CCC (see Mitchell 1993). A possible indication to the success or exclusiveness of the categories is that all in-migrants ticked at least one of the given options.

The PP survey was conducted in March 2005 and gained a response from 828 residents in Cornwall, a response rate of around 60%. The PP was sent out to individuals over the age of 16 but the sample received was self-selecting and biased towards individuals in the older age groups. For this reason the sample was weighted according to the expected age distribution from the 2001 Census.

3.5.4 Measuring economic structural differences

A further aim of the research question was to consider the economic structural conditions of Cornwall (as a poor area) and Wiltshire (as a prosperous area). This was to provide some contextual data on the structural processes of counterurbanisation in each area, particularly the degree to which in-migration differences may be explained by employment-led explanations but also to see how well each area fitted with structural process described by Fielding (1982). A number of additional datasets were used to measure the economies of each area. These included the Annual Business Inquiry (ABI) and its predecessors the Annual Employment Survey (AES) and the Census of Employment (CoE). The CoE, AES and the most recent ABI are all sample surveys of businesses which provide estimates of

---

15 See chapter 1, point 1.3.1.2.1
employee jobs at a range of geographic levels and are detailed by industry and by
male/female and full-time/part-time jobs. The three surveys are not directly comparable
between themselves due to changes in the methodologies however, taken separately they
are able to show change in the number of workplace-based jobs across different industrial
sectors from 1971 to the most recent period. This is particularly relevant given that
employment decentralisation of manufacturing units and growth in the service sector is
argued by Fielding (1982) to have underpinned counterurbanisation.

The structural analysis of Cornwall and Wiltshire was taken a stage further. Comparing
only the growth of manufacturing and service employment in Cornwall and Wiltshire may
conceal important differences within the individual manufacturing and service industrial
sectors. For example, the service sector comprises of a number of sub-sectors which vary in
terms of overall value to the wider economy; the financial intermediation sector being
substantially more productive than the hotels and restaurants sector for example. It is
possible therefore that Cornwall and Wiltshire may share a similar structural process of
counterurbanisation in terms of the quantity of jobs created in manufacturing and services
and yet there may be important differences in the value of these jobs. If an area had
increased employment in the higher value service sectors rather than the low value sectors
this would not only be of greater benefit to the overall economy, it may also offer the
prospect of higher paid employment. The latter may be particularly important in terms of
the role this plays in attracting a specific type of in-migration.
The analyses used the ABI to compare the sectoral distribution of employees within the broad manufacturing and service sectors for Cornwall and Wiltshire. This examined whether economic restructuring and growth in the manufacturing and service sectors had resulted in the employment structures of Cornwall and Wiltshire being concentrated in the lower value, low paid or higher value, higher paid sectors. The value of industrial sectors was measured by analysing data for the whole of England and Wales and dividing the total Gross Value Added (GVA) output by the number of full-time equivalent (FTE) employees in each sector. One weakness of this measure is that the ABI excludes self-employees so sectors with a high proportion of self-employees may appear to be slightly higher value than is actually the case. Estimating the earnings levels of sectors is slightly easier as the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings (ASHE) provides annual average earnings for FTE in each industrial sector.

3.6 Research question 2

Can in-migration be said to have been economically beneficial for Cornwall in recent years?

The aim here was to attempt to evaluate the economic contribution of in-migration in Cornwall in recent years (1995-2003) by drawing comparisons between Cornwall and West Wales and the Valleys. The reason for such a comparison was because both areas are economically similar in that they share poor economies to the extent that they receive EU structural funding, and yet they differ demographically as Cornwall has experienced high levels of in-migration and population growth while this has not been the case in West
Wales and the Valleys. The assumption is that in-migration and population growth would be associated with economic growth either as a direct cause of employment growth, be it through in-migrants generating jobs or filling jobs, or as an indirect cause of economic growth through the multiplier effect of increasing demand for goods and services.

First the analyses compared population growth and economic performance and employment growth in the two areas. This used ONS mid-year population estimates (MYEs) to measure population growth and again drew on GVA as an indicator of economic performance and the ABI for growth in FTE employees.

The second aim was to try to address the degree to which employment growth in Cornwall could be attributable to in-migration. The first method involved identifying the individual sectors that were most responsible for employment growth and discussing the extent to which growth may be attributable to either the internal demands of an increasing population or to alternative external factors. The second method involved analysing VAT registration data. This data was used as a proxy for the prevalence of business start-ups. New or incoming businesses with a turnover of over £58,000 will feature as a VAT registration however the data will also include existing businesses that have expanded to the VAT threshold as well as new start-ups so it is not a perfect measure. The assumption underpinning the analyses was that if a large number of in-migrants are relocating their businesses or starting new ones, essentially creating jobs rather than taking jobs, then we may expect that to see a notable increase in VAT registrations alongside high levels of in-migration. Finally, there was an analysis of the ABI workplace dataset to examine the
growth of 'micro-businesses'; those workplaces consisting of only 1-4 employees whereby turnover may be too small to captured by VAT registrations. Again, the rationale was the same as with VAT registrations; that we may expect to see a growth in micro-businesses if in-migration is high and if it consisted of employers rather than employees.

The final analysis considers the relationship between in-migration and the housing market. This compares annual net migration rates in Cornwall with the annual house price differential between London and the South East and Cornwall. The aim was to examine Mitchell's (1993) claim that net migration rates in Cornwall are driven in part by a widening of this differential given that London and the South East is the main point of origin for Cornwall's in-migrants. The aim was also to draw some inferences about the effect that in-migration may have on house prices in Cornwall. This involved an analysis of annual net migration, annual price differentials and the annual rate of house price increases in Cornwall compared to London and the South East. Essentially this was to see if in-migration may have benefited Cornwall's housing market.

The National Health Service Central Register (NHSCR) data is used to analyse annual net migration growth in Cornwall between 1995 and 2003. The NHSCR data measures migration by capturing deregistrations and registrations between different Health Areas in England. Although there are some weaknesses\(^\text{16}\) it contains it is the most comprehensive source of annual migration moves. House price data were derived from the Land Registry.

\(^{16}\) The data depend on patients registering at their new destination and this is shown to vary by age and sex as young children, mothers and the elderly register quickly after moving but young men take much longer. Also some students will be registered at their home address rather than where they live during term. Essentially the view is that it undercounts students and young men in particular (see ONS, 2007)
quarterly records of house sales by price and region. The house price differential equates to the £ difference in average price of a semi-detached property in London and the South East compared to the same in Cornwall. The reason for using semi-detached properties was because the LS findings for 1991-2001 showed in-migrants to be most commonly originating from this accommodation type than any other dwelling type.17

3.7 Research question 3

The first two research questions explored the relationship between in-migration and economic performance for Cornwall as a whole. As such it also considered in-migrants as one aggregated group. This section of the research aimed to identify the spatial diversity of economic performance across districts within Cornwall and related this to the in-migratory profile of each district. On identifying an association between district-level economic performance and the economic dynamism of corresponding in-migrant flows the research aimed to examine this in more depth at a finer, sub-district spatial level of analysis. This involved identifying the destinations of the most and least economically dynamic inflows and exploring the socio-economic profiles and performances of these areas. Essentially the third aim of thesis was therefore to:

- Identify the heterogeneity of in-migration and associated socio-economic factors within Cornwall

---

17 See appendix

168
3.7.1 District level analyses

The aim was to investigate the relationship between population growth, in-migration and economic growth at a district level to see if areas differ in terms of economic performance and to identify if this is associated with differences in the scale of population growth and the nature of in-migration.

The first analysis examined the pattern of population growth, using ONS mid-year population estimates and compared this with economic growth across each district using local GVA. ONS do not provide GVA estimates at the district level of analysis so the GVA data is drawn from Owen Nankivell’s Local GVA model commissioned by Cornwall County Council. Due to the time period for which district-level GVA estimates are available the period of study is 1993-2003.

The comparison looks to identify whether the districts with the greatest growth in people are also those with the strongest level of economic growth. While population growth may be expected to be associated with economic growth for the reasons already outlined, employment growth may be less well related to population growth at district-level as opposed to county level. A district may increase in residents yet these may be people who have taken up work in a neighbouring district, essentially there is likely to be a far higher prevalence of dislocation between residence and workplace when the spatial unit is smaller. The ABI resolves this difficulty to some degree as it measures the number of jobs rather than the resident population in employment however it suggests that employment growth is

---

18 The local GVA model uses the same methodology as the ONS regional and sub-regional measures of GVA, see Local Intelligence Network for Cornwall (LINC, 2007) for details
far better correlate of economic growth than population growth. Due to the availability of consistent ABI employee data these analyses were restricted to 1995-2003. The final economic analysis of districts used the Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings (ASHE) dataset to compare the median average weekly full-time earnings in each district.

LS data is used to investigate district-level differences in the characteristics of in-migrants. Essentially it aimed to examine whether the economic performance of a district is associated with the type of in-migration it receives. In-migration flows are compared in terms of economic dynamism reflected by the percentage of in-migrants that were working-age, the percentage of working-age in-migrants that were economically active and finally the percentage of working-age, economically active in-migrants that were in full-time employment.

3.7.2 Sub-district analyses
The small area analyses aimed to compare the socio-economic profile and performance of areas recipient of two contrasting types of in-migration; those with the most economically dynamic in-migrants and those areas with the least dynamic in-migrants. The data used for these analyses were drawn predominantly from the 1991 and 2001 Censuses so there are a number of issues that need to be accounted for. The first section will explain how the small area framework was devised to achieve geographical comparability between 1991 and 2001. Second, there is a discussion of the problems of substantive comparability between 1991 Census output and that of 2001 which will outline the variables being used. This will also consider the problems that disclosure control and data modification techniques have on
1991 and 2001 Census data. Third, there is an account of the migration data being used and a discussion of the limitations and problems with these datasets. The final section outlines the additional non-Census datasets used.

3.7.2.1 Defining the small areas

A key aim of the small area analyses was to identify migratory and socio-economic patterns at the smallest possible spatial scale. However there are a number of considerations which affected how the small areas were defined. In order of importance, the considerations are i) being able to obtain data that is both valid and reliable, ii) geographic comparability between 1991 and 2001 which takes account of settlement contiguity and finally, iii) typological coherence.

It was necessary to consider what Census data would be required to highlight migratory and socio-economic trends. The smallest spatial scale of 2001 census output is the Output Area (OA)\(^1\) with Super Output Areas (SOAs)\(^2\) being the next smallest unit. The reason for not using OAs or SOAs as the basis for the small areas was due to the lack of origin-destination interaction data for migration. The only interaction data released at this scale is for migrant numbers, age and sex and also concerns have been raised about the validity of some of the data released for OAs due to the effects of data modification technique, Small Cell Adjustment Method (SCAM)\(^3\). Finally, although parishes and postcodes both have the

---

\(^1\) Output Areas are the building blocks for all higher Census geography and average around 125 households and 300 residents.

\(^2\) Super Output Areas are clusters of contiguous Output Areas. There are three levels of SOAs. Lower Layer SOAs have an average population of 1,500, Middle Layer SOAs average around 7,200 and the Upper Layer SOAs are yet to be determined but are likely to average around 25,000

\(^3\) See point 3.7.2.4.
advantage of being consistent areas over the inter-censal decade, the scale of available census data for these geographies is extremely limited compared to more conventional Census geographies.

The Census smallest census geography with the largest scope of available data is the electoral ward, a sub-division of the local authority area. The data availability for wards extends to all published tabular Census output and, while not as detailed as the local authority level interaction data, the ward-level interaction data does provide reasonable scope in terms of migrant characteristics. Wards are far from perfect as statistical units as they vary in size, both spatially and in terms of population, and they are subject to boundary changes. It would be possible to achieve a more accurate and meaningful typological framework using OAs, however, for reasons of data availability for the life-time of this study, wards were the most appropriate and smallest possible building blocks to underpin the small area framework.

The analyses aimed to examine change over time between 1991 and 2001 so it was necessary to devise a spatial framework that was geographically coterminous for both 1991 and 2001 Census output boundaries. Cornwall was not alone in that ward boundaries were revised in 2003 so that all 2001 Census output related to these new wards and all 1991 output related to the old ward boundaries. The result was that some 1991 wards remained unchanged in 2003 but many did not and this presented a significant problem in defining geographically consistent areas. This was resolved in a number of ways using the
ARCView Geographical Information Software (GIS) package to visualise spatial boundary data pertaining to 1991 and 2001 Census output geographies.

3.7.2.1.1 Matching whole wards from 1991 to individual 2001 wards

As one of the key aims was to create small areas which accounted for settlement contiguity the first task was to download an Ordnance Survey digitised map of Cornwall. This gave a visual representation of contiguous settlements. Next, the 1991 ward boundaries were compared to 2003 ward boundaries and it was a simple process to visually identify those wards that had not changed and remained coterminous at both points in time. Sometimes this involved aggregating several 1991 wards to match one individual 2001 ward. None of these wards intersected contiguous settlements so this resulted in the definition of 21 small areas consisting of 21 individual 2001 wards.

3.7.2.1.2 Matching EDs from 1991 to individual 2001 wards

The second stage involved overlaying Enumeration District ED boundaries onto the 2001 ward boundaries. EDs are now designed for the data collection of a Census but in 1991 they served as the smallest geographical unit of statistical output so were coterminous to the 1991 administrative boundaries. In many cases the EDs remained coterminous with the 2001 ward boundaries so where possible the next step was to identify 1991 census geographies, comprising of wards + or - EDs, that were consistent with individual 2001 wards. This was achieved for a further 16 individual 2001 ward areas again with none intersecting contiguous settlements.

All digitised boundary data was downloaded from EDINA – UKBorders, a part of the Joint Information Systems Committee (JISC) programme of data provision for academic use.
3.7.2.1.2 Matching wards and EDs from 1991 to multiple 2003 wards

In many cases 1991 EDs intersected 2001 ward areas so it was not possible to achieve a coterminous 1991 census output for individual 2001 wards. Stage three therefore aggregated contiguous 2001 wards until they met a consistent area for which 1991 output was available, either as whole 1991 wards, aggregates of whole wards, or wards + or – EDs. It is important to point out that the process was reflexive throughout to ensure that wards that were drastically typologically different were not combined. It is also important to say here that the process limited the small areas to a maximum combination of 3 wards, any more for the sake of geographical comparability would undermined the main aim of producing a ‘small area’ framework. There was only one exception to the number of wards that could be combined and this related to where a number of wards encompassed a clear contiguous settlement pattern. When this occurred and these wards were aggregated together beyond what was necessary to achieve coterminous boundaries. This applied solely to the large towns in Cornwall where areas, such as Falmouth, had more than three wards combined to represent the town.\footnote{This was carried out not only to provide more meaningful and recognisable geographies but also with one thought to the applicability of the small area framework for subsequent studies. It was also hoped that by using recognisable geographies would also make the dissemination of findings more comprehensible, particularly to local government or Cornwall-specific interest groups.}

Admittedly the result of amalgamating 2003 ward areas meant that the areas differed to some extent in terms of spatial and population size. However, as said, this was mostly dictated by the difficulty in achieving comparable areas for 1991 and 2001 where there was no other option and also when it was deemed to be typological correct to do so as in the
case of contiguous settlements in most large towns. The aggregation of whole 2003 ward areas produced a further 25 areas with 14 areas comprising 2 wards, 5 areas with 3 wards, and the 5 largest towns comprising 4-5 wards.

3.7.2.1.3 Matching wards and EDs from 1991 to multiple 2003 wards and OAs

The last stage of defining the small area framework was concerned with the most problematic wards. The first case was the wards of Porthleven and Sithney, Wendron, and Helston South and Helston North. The only way to achieve a comparable 1991 geography for any of these wards was to combine all four. Local knowledge would inform any researcher that the nature of the wards differed to a large extent but this can also be evidenced by consulting the Rural and Urban Area Classification for Wards (RUCW)\(^{24}\). This shows that both Helston wards are labeled as ‘Urban’ while Porthleven and Sithney is ‘Town and Fringe’ and Wendron is ‘Village, Hamlet and Isolated Dwellings’. Clearly the wards differ too much to combine all four purely for geographical comparability. This was also a substantial problem throughout much of the Restormel district where a number of boundary changes tended to have a knock-on effect on other ward areas, ultimately making 12 ward areas problematic. In the case of areas that did not comprise a geography that was both geographically consistent and at least typologically similar, sticking to a maximum of three combined wards, the areas had to be constructed using 2001 OAs as well as 2001 wards. This produced a total of 11 more areas which completed the 100% geographically coterminous coverage for the small area framework. Admittedly this has repercussions on those analyses which rely upon datasets for which wards are the lowest level of output,

\(^{24}\) For the RUCW see [www.statistics.gov.uk/geography/rncdp.asp](http://www.statistics.gov.uk/geography/rncdp.asp)
essentially the Census interaction data. Therefore for the 11 small areas constructed partly
from OAs, a process of best-fit to whole ward is applied to the analyses.

Table 3.2 shows the results of the small area framework. It shows that it was possible to
build the small areas from whole wards in 85% of cases with 51% of areas being
constructed from individual wards. Overall 121 wards were aggregated into 73 areas
maintaining geographical comparability with 1991 output geographies.

Table 3.2: Matrix of small area building blocks

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1991 Census Geographies</th>
<th>1 Ward</th>
<th>2 Wards</th>
<th>3 Wards</th>
<th>4-5 Wards</th>
<th>Wards +/- OAs</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 whole ward</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multiple whole wards</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wards +/- EDs</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.7.2.1.4 Typological coherence of the small area framework

Although the typology of the small areas was considered throughout the design of the
geographic framework, a validation exercise was also conducted on completion. By looking
at the classifications of wards in the RUCW it was possible to evaluate each area that
comprised of more than one ward to see if the wards combined were typologically similar,
essentially to see if they shared the same rural/urban label. The RUCW defines the rural or
urban classification essentially by density of households with the urban-rural hierarchy
labels for wards as either ‘Urban’, ‘Town and Fringe’ and ‘Village, Hamlet and Isolated
Dwellings’. Ultimately the worst typological scenario would be to have combinations of
wards that are at either end of the hierarchy, for example an ‘Urban’ ward paired with a ‘Village, Hamlet and Isolated Dwellings’ ward. Out of a total of 26 small areas which comprise multiple wards only 6 areas have wards with different urban/rural labels. In all 6 cases the discrepancy lies in areas containing both ‘Town and Fringe’ wards and ‘Village, Hamlet and Isolated Dwellings’ wards. No areas contained wards at both ends of the urban/rural hierarchy. This would suggest that the vast majority of small areas are fairly suitable in terms of typology.

Once the geographical framework for the small areas had been finalised the next step was to use ARCGIS to perform a Geo-processing function called ‘dissolve’ which merged the spatial data of 1991 wards and EDs with 2001 Census wards and OAs to create a new spatial file representing the small area framework. All data could then be visually displayed through ARCGIS for future analyses.

3.7.2.2 Comparability between Census population bases 1991 and 2001

The 1991 and 2001 Censuses provide the vast bulk of data for the small area analyses as no other data source is as substantively and geographically comprehensive. However there are a number of issues to consider when using Census data, not least when it is used to examine changes over time. The first issue is that of the Census sample. As mentioned earlier, no census will ever manage to capture the whole population but some will manage to do it better than others. Differences between the coverage of the two Censuses and in the way each defines the base population have potentially large impact on analyses of change over time especially where measures refer to change in absolute numbers.
The first thing to say is that the 1991 Census achieved an enumeration rate of 96% of the total population. Another 2% was imputed from households where enumerators had contacted neighbours and had reason to believe that properties were occupied but where the households were wholly absent on Census night. The remaining missing 2%, the missing million, could not be imputed as not enough was known to estimate their characteristics (Champion, 1995 p. 326). Although the 1991 Census related to 98% of the total population, which was a comparable rate compared to censuses in most other developed countries, there were concerns that the missing million were over represented by young adult males, particularly within inner city areas (Simpson, 2003).

The 2001 ‘One Number Census’ (ONC) sought to obtain a census sample of 100% of the total population. The inevitable shortfall in the number enumerated was to be compensated by estimation and imputation processes following the large-scale Census Coverage Survey (CCS). The CCS, independent of the Census enumeration process and aimed particularly at the hard-to-enumerate, sought to capture those households missed in the Census. The rate of enumeration was 94% in 2001, lower than in 1991, so the CCS had to account for the missing 6%. The CCS is claimed to have been partly undermined in terms of not knowing exactly where to target the follow-up due to the delays of Royal Mail returning all Census forms (Simpson, 2003). However, even when the remaining 6% were imputed to achieve the ONC immediate concerns came to light as the total Census sample was deemed to have undercounted the total population by over 1 million when compared to the mid-2000 population estimates. Again, the missing million was fairly selective and was
geographically concentrated in London and other provincial cities and again affecting young males more than most (Simpson, 2003 p. 13).

A further problem relates to definitional differences for the base population in 1991 and 2001. The 2001 Census measured the 'usually resident' population whereas in 1991 the 'population present' was measured. This meant that visitors were enumerated as well as residents in 1991 while only residents were counted as such in 2001. The other main point of difference is that students were counted at their term-time address in 2001 but their home or vacation address in 1991. Both factors mean that the 'persons present' definition in 1991 would include a greater number of people than the 'usual resident' definition in 2001 (ONS, 2005). Where possible the analyses in the thesis examine the 'usually resident' population, excluding visitors in 1991 counts where the option is available and using adjusted data to account for the undercount and student anomalies (see below).

The problems of undercount and definition mean that population change is best measured using MYEs as they have been adjusted to achieve maximum possible accuracy and comparability in both method and coverage. MYEs are not readily available for sub-district areas but the ESRC-funded 'Estimating with Confidence' (EwC) project managed to adjust

---

25 A number of explanations were given to explain the apparent Census undercount in 2001 that threw less doubt over the coverage of the Census than first appeared to be the case. One was that the mid-year estimates rolled forward from the 1991 Census base population were too high by around 350,000 due to an overestimation of the impact of under-enumeration during the 1991 Census. Another was deemed to relate to the inaccuracy of accounting for emigration during the 1990s, particularly of young males, this resulted in a further reduction of the expected population base by around 300,000 (ONS LA Pop Review, 2004 p. 4). Though the expected population count is now deemed to have been overestimated it nevertheless appears that the ONS missed around 0.25 million (Champion et al, 2007, p. 68). Reasons for this relate to the problems with missing census forms, inaccurate address lists and the failure of the CCS to account for hard-to-reach populations particularly affecting under-enumeration of young males and specifically within cities (Simpson, LGA 2003, p. 7). These undercounts have been factored into recent MYEs but they affect all published Census output for both 1991 and 2001 raising doubts over comparisons of like-with-like population bases.
1991 Census data to create mid-1991 population estimates which corrects for undercount and transfers students back to their term-time address. The EwC data is made available for the smallest geographic output level, the Enumeration District (ED). There are also experimental population estimates released for mid-2001 population data for wards and Lower Super Output Areas (LSOAs) which adjust for the 2001 undercounts. The two datasets are largely comparable and serve as the best possible method for looking at absolute time-series population change between 1991 and 2001. All analyses of absolute population change for sub-district areas therefore utilise these two datasets.

Although the EwC data provides other corrected 1991 data for wards, such as employment status and tenure, this is not available for EDs. As 30 of the defined small areas require the ED level of output it was decided to use the original 1991 Census output for all other data rather than use two different datasets for different areas.

Because the validity of analyses on absolute change is questionable using 1991 and 2001 Census data it is necessary to highlight some of the considerations taken which minimise this effect. Firstly, all analyses apart from population numbers and age focused on the change in percentage composition rather than absolute change. Second, the nature of the undercount in terms of the areas and people most affected was shown to be similar in both Censuses (Simpson, 2003, p. 2) and Cornwall falls in the remoter, mainly rural category which was shown to be amongst the least affected by undercount of all district types (ibid, p.13). Finally, it has been shown that areas with high numbers of students and armed forces need to be analysed with caution because Census counts in these areas have been shown to
be less reliable. Cornwall has a comparatively low number of students so this is less of
problem. Cornwall does however contain a comparatively high number of armed forces
personnel, more so in 1991 than 2001, but these are concentrated mostly within Torpoint,
with smaller concentrations in Meneage and Helston and fortuitously none of the three
areas featured in the comparative analyses.

3.7.2.3 Comparability between Census variables 1991 and 2001

Any analyses of change using Censuses need to assess the comparability of variables and
these depend upon differences in the questions asked, the way answers are processed and
coded and the definitions and categorisations used in outputs. This is necessary so that the
researcher can distinguish between those comparisons which are valid and those which are
not and to be able to distinguish real change from 'artefactual' change (Champion, 1995 p.
333). Aside from the changes to the measurement of population bases, there were a large
number of changes in the 2001 Census to the questions, definitions and output
categorisations used in 1991. A full list of differences can be identified by looking at the
individual Census forms and the Census Definitions publications for 1991 (OPCS, 1992)
and 2001 (ONS, 2004). The aim in this section is to detail the comparability issues with the
1991 and 2001 Census variables used in the analyses.

3.7.2.3.1 Economic activity

To identify the extent and change of the potential labour force in each area the analyses
examined economic activity levels. An individual is deemed to be economically active if
they are working or are seeking work. The definitions of economic activity in 2001 are
largely comparable to those in 1991 but one key difference relates to how full-time students are dealt with. In 1991 all full-time students were classified as economically inactive irrespective of whether or not they were also working. In 2001 this changed so that full-time students who were also working were included into the economically active population count. To therefore achieve comparability in the 1991 and 2001 economic activity measures the 2001 count of full-time economically active students needed to be subtracted from the total number of economically active people.

It was also necessary to use tables from both Censuses which publish economic activity by age. Breakdown by age is necessary because the total economically active in 1991 refers to all those aged 16+ whereas in 2001 it counts all those aged 16-74. For this reason it was necessary to use the Small Area Statistics (SAS) table 8 in 1991 and the Standard Table (ST) 28 in 2001. The analyses examined the largest possible comparable age group available for economic activity from both Censuses which was those aged 16-64 years.

3.7.2.3.2 Full-time employment

The definition of full-time employment is fairly straightforward as both censuses define it as working over 30 hours a week. One slightly problematic issue is that the 2001 output gives self-employment by full-time and part-time but in 1991 no distinction is made between full and part-time self-employees. This meant that for the analyses to be as comparable as possible self-employees were excluded and only full-time employees were counted. There is also one other adjustment that needed to be made with the 1991 employment data. In 1991 some economically active individuals appeared as being ‘on a
government scheme' rather than being employed or unemployed but this was not a category in 2001. The choice of how to classify these people is somewhat objective as it is possible that being on a government scheme in 1991 was an initiative for the unemployed. However, the ONC defines those on a government scheme as being employed in 2001 (ONS, 2004 p.32) so the same approach was taken here with government schemes in 1991. It is however a subjective decision to label them as being full-time employed rather than part-time but there is no evidence which helps to support or refute this. Again, as with the economic activity analyses, full-time employment was compared using the SAS table 8 for 1991 and ST 28 for 2001 focusing on those aged 16-64.

3.7.2.3.3 Tenure

The census tables used to compare tenure are SAS table 58 in 1991 and the Univariate (UV) table 63 in 2001. By aggregating a number of the categories in each published output it is possible to obtain a reasonably accurate comparison for household tenure with the final categories being ‘owned outright’, ‘owned buying’, ‘social rented’ and ‘privately rented’. The 1991 table already separates ‘owned outright’ and ‘owned buying’ and it also has a category for private rented which just requires the collapsing of ‘furnished’ and ‘unfurnished’ private rented categories. The social rented category is derived by combining ‘renting from a housing association’ and ‘renting from a local authority’. The 2001 UV table publishes separate data for ‘owned outright’, ‘social rented’ and ‘private rented’. To obtain the owned buying category it is necessary to combine ‘owned with a mortgage or loan’ and the ‘shared ownership’ categories.
The problematic category in 2001 tenure output is the 'living rent free' class because there is no method of knowing with any certainty, at least for England and Wales, what living rent free would equate to in 1991. In the more detailed ST census outputs ONS have chosen to group ‘living rent free’ with ‘private renting’ but combining households that live rent free with private rented households may be misleading. In Scotland a supplementary table has been made available which focuses on just those households ‘living rent free’.

Examining this table for all Scottish council areas shows that the percentage of people reported as ‘living rent free’ that were actually in ‘social rented’ households ranged from 88% in North Lanarkshire to 17% in the Orkneys with the mean average of all council areas being 54%26. This supplementary table is not available for England and Wales so it is impossible to know with any certainty how to deal with the living rent free variable. For this reason it was deemed best to omit it from the analyses. Given that the analyses focus on percentage point change as opposed to absolute change it was hoped that the impact of omitting this category would be fairly small.

3.7.2.3.4 Qualifications

This is a fairly straightforward comparison between 1991 and 2001 outputs. This used data from the SAS table 84 and the CAS table 105. Both outputs give the percentage of people aged between 18 and pensionable age with qualifications above that of A-levels. This refers to all those people who feature in the qualification categories of a, b or c in 1991 and those in levels 4 and 5 in 2001. The only aspect that needs to be mentioned here is that the 1991 data on qualifications is derived from a 10% sample of the population being that it is a difficult topic to code. This does pose a greater risk of sampling error than is the case with

26 See http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Topics/Statistics/scotstat/environment/paper-besae-03-7
100% outputs and uncertainty in the data maybe greater when the areas of interest contain a comparatively small number of people (Openshaw, 1995 p. 9). It was however hoped that the effect of this on the quality of the analyses could be minimised as the analyses are of percentage point change rather than absolute change and there is no requirement to 'gross-up' the 10% data by a factor of ten. Moreover, the cell counts for the 10% topics have not been subject to modification as the sampling of one in 10 records is considered to be sufficient to ensure confidentiality.

### 3.7.2.3.5 Occupational class

The analysis of occupational class change is slightly more problematic than most other variables because of the available population bases as much as any definitional differences in class categories. In 2001 the National Statistics Socio-Economic Classification (NS-SEC) replaced the Socio-Economic Group (SEG) classification used in 1991. Both measures identified the employment status and occupation of respondents to provide a measure of socio-economic position. Fortunately there are published details which enable users to aggregate NS-SEC categories to achieve a good approximation for all the SEG classes so that meaningful comparisons between the two classifications can be drawn.

The same classification is used here as that for the LS analyses, see table 3.1.

There are a few remaining problems in drawing comparisons between SEG and NS-SEC. First, NS-SEC includes armed forces personnel which SEG does not. Another issue

---

27 For details of this see the NS-SEC User Manual (ONS, 2005)
28 This is likely to cause an increase in 2001 in the 'managerial' category in 2001 where there are officers, in the 'white collar' group where there are NCOs and other ranks and the 'professional and technical' group for other technical and auxiliary armed forces employees.
relates to the population base of the two Census tables. The 1991 SEG data includes all people over the age of 16 who were economically active, meaning that they were either working in the week before the Census or were unemployed and seeking work. However the 2001 NS-SEC occupational categories, not including the missing category, relates to all people aged 16-74 regardless of economic activity. Individuals aged 16-65 are given an occupational code based on their last job, as long as they were working at least 5 years prior to the 2001 Census. An occupational code was only given to individuals aged 65-74 if they were working in the week prior to the census. Essentially the difference in the population base for NSSEC occupational codes in 2001 compared to the SEG population base in 1991 is that it will contain a slightly greater proportion of economically inactive people aged 16-64 and a smaller proportion of people aged 65+. Unfortunately this is an inherent definitional incomparability which cannot be resolved.

3.7.2.4 Disclosure control and data modification 1991 and 2001

By law, published Census statistics must not reveal information about identifiable households or individuals. Techniques used to prevent disclosure include designing tabular output so that counts are not concentrated in a small number of cells, reducing the number of cross-tabulated variables in outputs and swapping samples of records with similar characteristics as was the case in 2001. Arguably two of the more important methods used is that of data suppression and modifying cell counts. These techniques are considered for 1991 and 2001 output with regard to the potential impact upon the data analysis.
One of the simplest methods of disclosure control used is the suppression of tables for areas below certain population thresholds. In 1991 the SAS were suppressed in those EDs that contained fewer than 50 usually resident persons and 16 resident households. Statistics for suppressed EDs were amalgamated with other contiguous EDs so that the number of persons and households met the threshold requirements. Fortunately none of the individual EDs required for aggregating the small areas were suppressed. Suppression of data for certain small areas was also adopted in 2001 with this being applied to any area that did not meet a threshold of 100 usual residents and 40 resident households. Again, this did not affect the analyses here because although there were some output areas in Cornwall for which data was suppressed, none prevented the full aggregation of data for the small areas defined in this study.

Another form of data suppression in the 1991 Census refers to the geographical coverage of the Special Migration Statistics (SMS). The smallest geographical level that the 1991 SMS are available for is the electoral ward. Given that many of the defined small areas in this thesis are built using EDs they are often too far removed from the ward boundaries so that 1991 SMS is deemed by the researcher to be too inaccurate for use. For this reason only the 2001 SMS are used. This is discussed later.

As stated, the other main technique of disclosure control is the modification of cell counts and this differed quite substantially in 2001 compared to 1991. In 1991 all output for areas below local authorities had a small amount of random error applied to each cell by the addition of +1, 0 or -1 in a quasi-random pattern. This small cell adjustment was carried out

\[\text{Only data for Parish profiles were released below this threshold.}\]
once for SAS tables and twice for the more detailed LBS tables so that the adjustment was anything between +2 and -2. The process of data modification differed in 2001 where only the smallest cells, those with a value of between 0 and 3, were adjusted in what is known as the Small Cell Adjustment Method (SCAM). This means that for all tables published for sub-district levels a value of 0 or 3 may in fact be a 0, 1, 2 or 3. Moreover, the sum totals of each table are the sum of the adjusted constituent counts and tables are adjusted independently so different tables measuring the same categories may not give the same counts.

Some of the impacts of cell modification are similar in 1991 and 2001. Firstly, the impact of adjustment may be particularly acute when there are a large number of cells with low counts as is more likely to be the case with analyses of small rather than large areas. For example, in outputs from 1991 the effect of adjustment is likely to be far greater when adding or subtracting a 1 from a value of 5 as opposed to 50 or 500 (Cole, 1993, p. 221). In 2001 a whole data table may consist of nothing but 0's and 3's which throws doubt over the fitness for purpose of such data, such is the concern over much of the 2001 migration interaction data (Stillwell & Duke-Williams, 2007). Second, and of equal concern, is the effect that the rounding of values has upon column and row totals because adding together adjusted cell counts may have the effect of cumulating net error. This is not only likely to be a problem in so far as aggregating cell counts but when there is also the necessity to aggregate data for different areas as is the case here.
There is no available documentation pertaining to the exact methods of data modification processes used in 1991 and 2001 to enable the researcher to quantify the level of error in findings. However there are a number of safeguards that can be put in place to try to minimise the effect of aggregating error. First it is important to use output tables with the least number of cells for the data that is required such as the UV tables rather than more detailed cross-tabulated ST or CAS tables. Second, figures should be computed from the highest possible geographic level depending on the area of interest in so far as data for a ward should be obtained from the ward table rather than the aggregation of the constituent OAs. Third, if the area of interest constitutes part of a larger area, part of a ward for example, then the data should be obtained by subtracting the smaller number of OAs from the ward total rather than by aggregating OAs (Simpson 2003, p. 6-7). All three approaches have been adhered to in the following analyses in so far as the substantive data coverage allows.

3.7.2.5 Migration data for the small area analyses

Ideally the small area analyses would use the LS to examine migrant characteristics in much the same way as the county and district analyses. Unfortunately due to the risk of disclosure it was not possible to have LS data released for the defined small areas. For this reason all small area analyses of migrants and migrant characteristics are drawn from the one-year Census information. That said the Census provides a greater level of detail on migration at small spatial scales than any other data source as it provides the numbers and characteristics of people changing address as well as providing data on the origins of migrants not just destinations. However there are a number of inherent issues with using the
one-year census migration data which impact upon both the scope of possible analyses and
the reliability of interpretations from the information.

The first thing to say about migration data in the Census is that like all other data it is only
a snap-shot of one point in time. An individual or household is generally defined as a
migrant if they changed their address in the year preceding the Census. Firstly, both the
quantity and nature of migration in any given year is likely to be affected by temporal
contextual conditions. As such, the findings from the Census will be contextually
dependent on the year the data is collected and may or may not reflect the norm. The
NHSCR derived data provides continuous annual measurements of migration in the way
that the Census cannot but it is limited both in terms of substantive detail, only capturing
information on age and gender, and in geographical coverage as it is not available for sub-
district areas. Another possible source of continuous migration data is the Labour Force
Survey but this is a fairly small sample and is therefore too unreliable for small area
analyses. What the Census migration data therefore lacks in terms of continuous coverage it
makes up for in substantive and geographic coverage.

As said above, the fact that 2001 migration data is more substantively and geographically
detailed than in 1991, all migration data used in the small area analyses are taken only from
2001 output. Moreover, it is correct to use only 2001 data given that the choice was made
to construct the small areas from 2001 rather than 1991 ward areas.
The main reason for prioritising the use of Special Migration Statistics (SMS) over the published, tabular migration output is that it provides the necessary level of specificity in terms of migrants’ origins required for the small area framework. The ward-level tabular output only shows in-migrants as having moved from within the local authority district. It cannot specify where an in-migrant has moved from another ward within the same district. Essentially the analyses aimed to capture in-migrants to areas but where a self-defined small area comprises more than one ward area the tabular output cannot distinguish between a ‘true’ in-migrant and internal migrants, these having moved from an adjoining ward but within the same defined small area. Only the ward to ward data available from the SMS can do this.

There are three different levels for which the SMS data is available. The most detailed dataset is SMS1 which provides a range of information on migrant characteristics, SMS2 provides slightly less data and SMS3 gives only counts of migrants by age and sex. Due to the spatial level of the small area analyses SMS1 could not be used so the data was derived from the ward-level SMS2 dataset. The data available within the SMS2 dataset includes five tables;

- MG201 total migrants by age and sex
- MG202 migrants by ‘wholly moving household’ or ‘other moving groups’
- MG203 ethnic group by sex,
- MG204 moving groups by NSSEC of group reference person
- MG205 moving groups by tenure.
Though the analyses did not distinguish between ‘moving groups’ it is still useful that state that ‘moving groups’ comprise ‘wholly moving households’ and ‘other moving groups’. Wholly moving households are where more than one person has moved together from the same origin household to the new destination household. Other moving groups comprise mostly of single moving people but may also contain more than one migrant as long as they came from different origins. The group reference person, as used for the NSSEC classification, refers to the oldest migrant in the household.

The research aimed to examine both the pattern and process of in-migration in small areas and given that the process of migration in Cornwall has been shown to have been selective in terms of age, labour market participation and housing tenure, these three variables were examined using the ward-to-ward flow tables MG201, MG204 and MG205.

Though table MG201 gives slightly more detail for migrants of in the youngest age groups the in-migrants were aggregated into seven cohorts, 0-15, 16-24, 25-34, 35-44, 45-59, 60-74 and 75+ with an aggregation of those aged 16-59 to represent in-migrants of working age. Table MG205 on housing tenure only provides three categories these being owner occupied, social rented and private rented so these were used in the final analyses. Table MG204 provides the broad occupational NSSEC classifications as well as the 3 residual categories for ‘never worked/long-term unemployed’, ‘full-time students’ and ‘unclassifiable’. The use of the NSSEC classification for migrants gives an indication of the quality, or potential quality of migrants’ labour market participation so the categories used for analysis omit the residual categories and focused just on those migrants who have an
occupational classification. Table 3.3 shows how the NSSEC categories were aggregated. Again, a hierarchical relationship is implied between ‘large employer/managerial/professional’ representing the highest quality of labour market participation and ‘semi-routine and routine’ representing the lowest. The difference between the quality of ‘intermediate/lower supervisory/lower technical’ and ‘small employers and own account workers’ is less pronounced and should not be viewed as hierarchical.

Table 3.3: Occupational class derivations for in-migrants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NSSEC categories in MG204</th>
<th>Categories for small area analyses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Large employers and higher managerial occupations</td>
<td>Large employers / managerial / professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Higher professional occupations</td>
<td>Large employers / managerial / professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower managerial and professional occupations</td>
<td>Large employers / managerial / professional</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Small employers and own account workers</td>
<td>Small employers / own account workers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intermediate occupations</td>
<td>Intermediate / lower supervisory / lower technical</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower supervisory and technical occupations</td>
<td>Semi-routine / routine</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Semi-routine occupations</td>
<td>Omitted from analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Routine occupations</td>
<td>Omitted from analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never worked and long-term unemployed</td>
<td>Omitted from analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full-time student</td>
<td>Omitted from analyses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not classifiable for other reasons</td>
<td>Omitted from analyses</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A final point of note regards those seven small areas that do not comprise of whole wards but include or exclude a small number of OAs. The data for migrant numbers and ages are derived mostly from the SMS2 ward-level data with adjustments made using the SMS3 OA-level data. Unfortunately there is no information on all other migrant characteristics within the SMS3 OA-level data so information on migrants’ NSSEC and tenure for these areas is derived from the SMS2 ward-level data and applies to the best-fit ward areas.
Essentially a small trade-off has been made in terms of spatial accuracy in favour of substantive coverage.

Unfortunately the ward-level SMS data does not provide any information on economic position. As the analyses are interested in looking at the quantity of migrants' labour market participation as well as quality it is necessary to draw upon the published Census tables. The Census Theme Tables (TT) 33 has information on the economic position of individual migrants and TT34 relates to the economic position of the HRP in a migrant household. The interaction data on migrants' NSSEC classification related to a household level, capturing the quality of labour market position of the group reference person, so for continuity reasons the measure of migrants' economic status will also focus on the household level in that it captures the status of the migrant household HRP. It is necessary to reiterate that the migration data on economic position from the TT tables cannot distinguish true in-migrants from internal migrants which may have moved between wards within the same defined small area. This means that while data derived from TT34 refers to in-migrants, this is actually going to include a number of internal migrants for those small areas comprising more than one ward, equating to 26 areas or 36% of all areas. The only other options would be to eliminate either the economic position data or the specifically affected areas from the analyses, both of which would diminish the substantive and spatial scale of the analyses.

In order to identify the most and least economically dynamic in-migrant flows the criteria consisted of two measurements of labour market participation and one measure of
occupational class. First, it measured the percentage of in-migrants that were economically active. Second it measures the percentage of the economically active in-migrants that are working full-time. Third it measures the percentage of in-migrants in the highest and lowest occupational classes. Essentially the first and second measures identify labour market participation and the third gives more detail on the quality of that participation. The most economically dynamic in-migrant flow is defined as having above average levels of economic activity and full-time employment and an above percentage in the large employer/managerial/professional category. The least economically dynamic inflow is that which has below average levels of economic activity and full-time employment and an above average percentage in the semi-routine and routine occupational class.

3.7.2.6 Limitations with the migration datasets

The first point to note regarding the limited nature of Census migration data is that it only captures migrants’ characteristics once they have moved. Unlike with the LS there is no information on migrant characteristics before they move so it is not possible to hypothesise about the relationship between socio-economic change and residential change. This is particularly important when focusing on socio-economic variables as opposed to demographic ones as changes to the status of economic activity levels, NSSEC or tenure are likely to coincide with the very act of migration. Unfortunately this is an inherent limitation of the one-year Census migration data and interpretations based on migrant characteristics are restricted by this.
Aside from the imputation and undercount issues of the ONS there may also be an issue regarding the coverage of migrants. Judging by past censuses, Champion et al estimate that there may be an undercount of migrants of around 10% as some individuals, likely to be a biased share, would not have declared themselves as such. They also point out that there was an imputation procedure for those individuals who failed to provide adequate information regarding their previous address. Unfortunately no information on the imputation process is available so not only is there no way of distinguishing between real and imputed flows (Stillwell & Duke-Williams, 2007) but it is also impossible to say how reliable the imputation process was (Champion et al, 2007, p. 68).

Finally it is important to recognise that the Census interaction data was generated after modification techniques were applied to all Census data. This means that migration data is subject to the same modifications, such as imputation, record swapping and SCAM that were applied to other Census outputs. However, arguably of greatest concern is the effect that SCAM has had on migration data and particularly interaction data given large origin-destination matrices inherently contain a great number of small cell counts. Stillwell and Duke-Williams (2007) show that SCAM has had a major effect at all spatial levels of migration interaction data but this is greatest for moves OA matrices given the large volume of small flows. The effect of replacing all 1’s and 2’s with 0’s and 3’s in all areas except Scotland increases the uncertainty over the reliability of the data particularly where the column and row totals of cells are multiples of 3 and where there are considerable difference between different tables measuring apparently the same flows. As with SCAM in other Census outputs there is no way of knowing the effect upon the analyses and
subsequent interpretations. The same basic rules are followed with the analyses of interaction data in that totals will be derived from the least possible number of components as possible to reduce the likely amount of error.

3.7.2.7 Additional data for small area analyses

The challenge for any researcher carrying out analyses at the sub-district level is that substantive data coverage generally decreases with geographical coverage. This is evident with Census data where categories are often dropped or aggregated for smaller spatial outputs. Given the paucity of small area data researchers are likely to face subjective decisions over the use of datasets that were not necessarily designed or best suited to the aims of specific studies, particularly where small areas have been self-defined. In many cases the subjective choice of being able to say something rather than nothing may involve making a trade-off in terms of reliability and validity. This is the case with the use of additional data from the Indices of Multiple Deprivation (IMD), model-based income estimates and, to a lesser extent, Land Registry house price information. These sources of data are hoped to provide some indication of themes not covered within the Census.

To give some indication of income differences between areas the analyses draw upon the ONS model-based estimates for income at ward level. These are experimental statistics which provide average household income levels in wards released first for 1998/99 and again for 2001/02. Although there are methodological differences between the 1998/99 and 2001/02 datasets, gross weekly household income in 1998/99 and total household

---

weekly income in 2001/02 are consistent. Both are calculated as a sum of gross earnings, self-employment, investments, disability benefits, pensions, income support and other remaining income sources.

The IMD were commissioned by the Office of Deputy Prime Minister (ODPM) to capture measures of multiple deprivation experienced at fine spatial levels. The first IMD, published was in 2000 and was derived mostly from data in 1998. The second dataset was published in 2004 with the majority of data being derived from 2001. Both IMD datasets provide an overall score and rank of deprivation for wards (2000) and SOAs (2004) within England. The overall deprivation measure is constructed from deprivation experienced across a number of domain indices including income, employment, health, education, housing, access to services, environment and crime. The 2004 IMD differs to that of 2000 mainly as a result of the inclusion of some new domains and indicators and due to the fact that the data was released for SOAs as opposed to wards which was the case in 2000. Although some of the methodological changes make comparisons of the two datasets problematic, it has nevertheless been shown that differences between 2000 and 2004 may represent real change particularly where geographic boundaries are more consistent (OPDM, 2004 p. 126).

There are only minor concerns in using the 2001/02 income estimates and 2004 deprivation levels to identify trends at one point in time. First the 2004 IMD data were aggregated to the coterminous 2001 areas by weighting the SOA IMD scores by population. For the 26 small areas which comprise of more than one 2001 ward both income and deprivation
scores were aggregated once again by the corresponding ward populations. Caution is however needed when interpreting results from the 11 areas that are built from 2001 OAs and wards as the data will relate to the best-fit whole wards for these areas. Fortunately this applied to only two areas in the dynamic in-migrant cluster and two areas in the least dynamic in-migrant cluster.

It is more problematic to look at change for income levels and deprivation. As the 1998/99 income data and 2000 IMD data relate to the 1991 ward areas the income and deprivation scores are derived easily enough again by weighting by population for those areas comprising of more than one ward. However, 28 of the defined areas are derived from combinations of 1991 wards and EDs so a far higher proportion of the data is assigned on a best-fit, whole-ward basis. To try and minimise the effects of geographic inconsistencies, and small methodological inconsistencies within the IMD data, analyses of change were restricted to looking at changes to rank position rather than absolute change.

Each area was ranked in terms of income in 1998/99 and again in 2001/02 and the change in rank position was taken as an indication of whether household income in an area improved or got worse relative to all other areas. The same process was conducted for IMD change between 2000 and 2004. The fact that the analyses were comparative would hopefully have minimised the effect of methodological inconsistencies as all areas are subject to any changes. Moreover, the analyses were conducted on the basis of looking at clusters of small areas rather than individual areas so the effect of small geographic inconsistencies should also be reduced. That said it is possible that changes in rank position
may reflect differences in spatial coverage as well as real changes. For this reason it is important to recognise that time-series analyses of these datasets are likely to be less valid and reliable than those derived from the Census and should therefore be viewed with greater caution.

The final additional data source relates to changes in house prices taken from the Land Registry records of house sales. The analyses examined the mean average house price in each small area in 2001 and displayed the rate of change in prices between 1996 and 2001, 1996 being the earliest possible date. To minimise any effects from differential types of housing stock across areas the price data was derived from the sale of terraced houses only. The spatial coverage of the Land Registry data is by postcode sector which can be applied on a best-fit basis to the defined areas with reasonable success. Unlike the income and deprivation data, the postcode sector boundaries did not change over time so while they are a best-fit to the defined small areas, there is no issue regarding geographic inconsistencies over time. One minor manipulation was required where an area was defined by more than one postcode. In these cases the average house price for an area was derived by weighting the average price in the constituent postcode sectors by the corresponding number of sales.
4 Counterurbanisation and in-migration in Cornwall: macro-level analysis

4.1 Introduction

This chapter has two sections, one for each research question. The first section attempts to address why Cornwall has been the recipient of high levels of in-migration despite its economic impoverishment and why in-migration has failed to bring economic prosperity. The second section questions the extent to which in-migration can be considered to be economically beneficial for Cornwall and focuses on the most recent period.

To address the first research question there is an investigation of the characteristics of Cornwall’s in-migrants with the use of the ONS Longitudinal Study (LS). This examines a number of key demographic and socio-economic characteristics across the in-migrant and non-migrant population. Comparisons are then drawn with two other case study areas, Wiltshire and West Wales and the Valleys (WW&V). The analyses also draw upon survey data to examine the motivations of Cornwall’s in-migrants. The focus then turns to a comparison of Cornwall and Wiltshire particularly in regard to economic and population changes from the 1960s. The research question is then addressed considering the LS data on in-migration along with the additional contextual economic and population information.

The second research question compares Cornwall with WW&V to examine the potential benefits of in-migration in Cornwall between 1995 and 2003. This begins with a comparison of population growth and economic performance in each area. Second, there is an attempt to evaluate the economic contribution of in-migrants on the labour market of
each area, paying particular attention to Cornwall. Finally consideration is given to the relationship between Cornwall’s in-migration and the housing market.

4.2 Comparative case studies

Given that Wiltshire and WW&V are used throughout this chapter as comparative case studies it is necessary to begin by providing a contextual outline of each area to justify their inclusion in the analyses.

4.2.1 Wiltshire

The county of Wiltshire is located within the South West Government Office Region (GOR) but it borders the South East GOR. Similar in size to Cornwall, it covers a total area of 348,543 hectares. It is also a predominantly rural county with four of the five constituent local authority districts classified as rural in the Rural and Urban Classification of Local Authorities. The Unitary Authority of Swindon, previously included as part of Wiltshire prior to 1996 and included in the county for the purposes of this study, is located in the North East of the county and is the major dominant conurbation of Wiltshire. Although Swindon constitutes only 6% of the landmass of Wiltshire it contributes 29% of the total population. The rest of the county is more dispersed than Cornwall with nearly half of the remaining population living in settlements of less than 5,000 people and a quarter living in settlements of less than 1,000.

31 See www.statistics.gov.uk/geography/nrudp.asp
32 See chapter 2, point 2.2
33 Information from the Swindon & Wiltshire Intelligence Network
http://www.intelligencenetwork.org.uk/default.aspx
Unlike Cornwall, Wiltshire is less remote. Not only does it have a large conurbation within its borders, it is within close proximity to the M5 and M4 motorways. This means that it is within 80 miles or less than two hours drive of both London and Birmingham and only 28 miles, a 40 minute drive from Bristol. Moreover, central London can be reached within an hour by train making it a very realistic residence for London commuters. Due to its location, the four rural districts were classified as ‘accessible rural’ under the old urban and rural classification.

The particular strength in using Wiltshire as a comparator example is because it too has experienced a rapidly growing population since the 1960s. Table 4.1 shows that both areas increased in population by more than double the average rate between 1991 and 2001. Wiltshire’s population grew by 43,400, an increase of over 7% between while in Cornwall growth was over 6%, increasing the population by 30,600. Table 4.2 shows that most of the growth in Wiltshire was caused by in-migration, in Cornwall this was wholly so. However, while Wiltshire is similar to Cornwall in regard to levels of population growth it differs economically. Tables 4.3 shows that Gross Value Added (GVA) and Gross Disposable Household Income (GDHI) per head were both well above average in Wiltshire while weekly pay was close to the national level. In contrast, GVA and GDHI per head and weekly pay were all well below average the national rate in Cornwall.

Wiltshire is an economically prosperous county that has experienced rapid population growth. As such it serves as a case study of where counterurbanisation seems to have been economically beneficial by which to compare with Cornwall. The ONS Longitudinal Study

See Defra (2004)
is used to examine if in-migration is characteristically different in each area in an attempt to explain why Cornwall has attracted high levels of in-migration despite its economic poverty and why in-migration seems to have failed to bring economic prosperity. Attention will also be given to the economic structural changes within Cornwall and Wiltshire to contextualise the process of in-migration that each has experienced.

Table 4.1: Population change thousands by study area 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Resident population mid-1991</th>
<th>Resident population mid-2001</th>
<th>Population change 91-01</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall and Isles of Scilly</td>
<td>471.5</td>
<td>502.1</td>
<td>30.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>570.2</td>
<td>613.6</td>
<td>43.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; Valleys</td>
<td>1,856.30</td>
<td>1,854.70</td>
<td>-1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England &amp; Wales</td>
<td>50,748.00</td>
<td>52,297.30</td>
<td>1,549.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Key Population and Vital Statistics

Table 4.2: Components of population change thousands by study area 1991-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Natural change</th>
<th>Migration/other changes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.s</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall and Isles of Scilly</td>
<td>-10.2</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; Valleys</td>
<td>-14.6</td>
<td>-0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England &amp; Wales</td>
<td>918.5</td>
<td>1.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Key Population and Vital Statistics

Table 4.3: Economic indicators in 2001 by study areas

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>GVA per head index of UK1</th>
<th>GDHI per head index of UK2</th>
<th>Gross weekly pay FT employees index of UK3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall and Isles of Scilly</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>107</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; Valleys</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 1ONS Sub-regional Gross value added, 2ONS Regional Trends, 3ONS Annual Survey of Hours and Earnings
4.2.2 West Wales and the Valleys (WW&V)

West Wales and the Valleys is a Nomenclature Territorial Unit for Statistics (NUTS) region. Size alone distinguishes it from Cornwall. WW&V constitutes 1,312,900 hectares accounting for 63.2% of the land mass of Wales, while Cornwall is only 355,898 hectares. It is also geographically diverse in comparison to Cornwall. It covers both densely populated valleys areas and the city of Swansea in South of Wales, as well as predominantly rural areas stretching from the unitary authority of Ceredigion in the West to that of Denbighshire in the North. It also includes large swathes of coastal settlements within Pembrokeshire in the South West of the country and the Isle of Anglesey in the North West.

Although both areas are classified as NUTS2 regions, WW&V is arguably more heterogeneous than Cornwall. The ONS area classification for local authorities\(^{35}\) shows that the valleys in the region in the South, stretching from Torfaen in the East to Swansea further West, are ‘industrial hinterlands’. The remainder of the region shares the same classification as Cornwall in being ‘coastal and countryside’, the same as Cornwall. In so far as their locations are concerned, Cornwall and WW&V are certainly similar in that they are both peripheral regions.

The diverse nature of WW&V also has implications for the demographic profile of the region. The region as a whole is not a net recipient of counterurbanisation population growth. Table 4.1 shows that the population remained the generally stable between 1991

\(^{35}\) See [http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/methodology_by_theme/area_classification/default.asp](http://www.statistics.gov.uk/about/methodology_by_theme/area_classification/default.asp)
and 2001 as small rate of natural decrease was offset by a very small rate of net migration. In this respect it is vastly different from Cornwall. WW&V is similar though in terms of its economic profile as table 4.3 shows that, like Cornwall, GVA and GDHI per head and weekly pay were all well below average the national rate. Both areas can be said to have faced problems associated with de-industrialisation and they have also been heavily reliant on declining industries such as agriculture and the extractive industries. The level of comparative economic poverty experienced in Cornwall and WW&V has led to both areas being allocated European Structural Funding, first with Objective 5b through the 1990s and second, and by far the most substantial funding allocation, Objective One which ran from 2000 to 2006.

WW&V provides a 'control' example in addressing the first research question. By comparing the similarity of in-migration in Cornwall with in-migration in WW&V it is possible to assess whether it is in-migration to poor regions per se that is distinctive rather than it being specifically distinct to Cornwall. WW&V also serves another purpose in the chapter and that is to use it as a comparative case study for the second research question.

The questions the extent to which in-migration has been beneficial for Cornwall. As WW&V is a similarly poor region with comparable levels of European structural funding and yet it has not experienced high levels of in-migration, it serves as a proxy for what

---

36 As said the region is fairly heterogeneous and certain areas, particularly Ceredigion, Carmarthenshire, Conwy and Denbighshire, were arguably recipients of counterurbanisation population growth between 1991 and 2001.

37 WW&V did not exist as a region during the Objective 5b allocation in the 1990s instead the more rural areas were recipients of the rural-centred Objective 5b funding as was the case in Cornwall while the industrial hinterlands of the WW&V region received Objective 2 funding.
Cornwall may look like without in-migration. More will be said on this later, attention now turns to the first research question and the study of in-migrant characteristics.

4.3 Migrant characteristics 1991-2001

The ONS Longitudinal Study (LS) was used to address this question to compare the migratory profile of Cornwall with that of Wiltshire and West Wales. Although this was covered in the methods it is useful to recap on the conceptual definitions of the different migrant groups. In-migrants are those Longitudinal Study Members (LSMs) enumerated outside the area of study in 1991 but enumerated inside in 2001. The long-term population includes all those LSMs that were enumerated in the area both in 1991 and again in 2001. The remainder of the sample, referred to here as England and Wales, consists of the remaining LSMs not enumerated at either Census as living within Cornwall, Wiltshire or WW&V depending on the area examined.

The LS provides Census data for each migrant group in each study area at two points in time, 1991 and 2001. Looking at the characteristics of in-migrants in 1991 shows what they looked like before moving. This shows us what type of in-migrants Cornwall attracts, how they may differ from the rest of England & Wales and indeed the long-term population already residing in the county. It also compares the nature of in-migrants that are attracted to more prosperous areas such as Wiltshire and similarly poor areas such as WW&V.

Identical comparisons can be made at 2001 to highlight the characteristics of in-migrants once residing in their destination area. Finally, it is possible to identify socio-economic changes associated with in-migration by comparing the characteristics of migrant groups in
1991 to those in 2001. It is also possible to draw some inferences about the effects of migrations because if in-migrants characteristics changed in much the same way as those of the long-term population we could suggest that the contextual conditions of the destinations have been important. If, however, in-migrants characteristics changed in a way that was inconsistent with the long-term population then socio-economic change may be better explained as an outcome of an intended migratory strategy.

The analysis begins by examining the characteristics of migrant groups in terms of the size of each group, where in-migrants have originated from and the structures of in-migrant groups in each area. The main body of the analyses investigate the economic profile of each migrant group specifically in regard to economic activity, employment status and social class. The final analysis looks at levels of outright home ownership for each migrant group.

4.3.1 Migrant frequencies

Table 4.4: Total LS sample 1991-2001 by migrant type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Migrant type</th>
<th>Cornwall n</th>
<th>Cornwall %</th>
<th>Wiltshire n</th>
<th>Wiltshire %</th>
<th>WW&amp;V n</th>
<th>WW&amp;V %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long-term population</td>
<td>3,365</td>
<td>69.2</td>
<td>3,972</td>
<td>68.4</td>
<td>12,909</td>
<td>83.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-migrants</td>
<td>839</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>1,031</td>
<td>17.7</td>
<td>1,282</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-migrants</td>
<td>660</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>807</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>1,318</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total sample</td>
<td>4,864</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>5,810</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>15,509</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.5: 2001 resident population by migrant type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Migrant type</th>
<th>Cornwall n</th>
<th>Cornwall %</th>
<th>Wiltshire n</th>
<th>Wiltshire %</th>
<th>WW&amp;V n</th>
<th>WW&amp;V %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Long-term population</td>
<td>3,365</td>
<td>80.0</td>
<td>3,972</td>
<td>79.4</td>
<td>12,909</td>
<td>91.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-migrants</td>
<td>839</td>
<td>20.0</td>
<td>1,031</td>
<td>21.6</td>
<td>1,282</td>
<td>9.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resident 2001 pop</td>
<td>4,204</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>5,003</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>14,191</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
Table 4.4 displays total LS sample for each area by migrant type. Cornwall and Wiltshire had a high proportion of LSM in-migrants at 17% and 18% respectively. The percentage of the total sample that was out-migrants was also fairly high in Cornwall and Wiltshire, particularly compared to WW&V, though expectedly this was less than the inflow. In contrast, WW&V had almost the same rate of in-migration as out-migration, both of which were low. Essentially the LS showed that population turnover was higher in Cornwall and Wiltshire than in WW&V. The net result of losing out-migrants from the sample means that in-migrants comprise 20% of the 2001 resident population in Cornwall, 21% in Wiltshire and only 9% in WW&V (table 4.5).

4.3.2 In-migrant origins

Figure 4.1: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – Cornwall

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
Figure 4.2: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – Wiltshire

- Rest of South West: 25%
- South East: 12%
- London: 10%
- East Midlands / East of England: 10%
- West Midlands / Wales: 13%
- The North: 30%

$n = 1.031$

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Figure 4.3: In-migrant origins (Standard Statistical Regions) – WW&V

- Rest of Wales: 34%
- Midlands / North West: 9%
- South East: 15%
- London: 7%
- South West: 26%
- North East / Yorkshire / East England: 9%

$n = 1.282$

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Figure 4.1 indicates that a higher number of Cornwall’s in-migrants originated from the combined London and South East Standard Statistical Regions (SSRs) than from the South West SSR in which Cornwall is situated. This was also apparent during 1981-91 (Williams et al 1995) but it is slightly unusual given that migration is generally negatively correlated with distance, with the majority of movements occurring over the shortest distance.
Like Cornwall, figure 4.2 shows that the most frequent SSRs of origin for Wiltshire’s in-migrants were London and the South East, with the South West being the second biggest contributor. This is less surprising than for Cornwall because although Wiltshire is situated in the South West Region it borders the South East. A migration of this kind may in fact only be a very short distance making little difference in terms of changes to employment or commuting. Indeed it is feasible to live in Wiltshire and commute to London and other areas of the South East. Interestingly, for the same reason we may have expected Wiltshire to attract a higher number of in-migrants from London than Cornwall but this was not the case.

In-migrants to WW&V were most likely to originate from the remainder of Wales. There was also a large proportion moving from the comparatively close Midlands and North West SSRs. Though Cornwall would appear to have had the ‘longest-distance’ in-migration of the three areas, this is largely due to it being a long way from everywhere, except Devon.
Table 4.3.3 Age structure

Table 4.6: In-migrant age structure (age in 2001)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age band in 2001</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>Wiltshire</th>
<th>WW&amp;V</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10-14</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15-19</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20-24</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-29</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30-34</td>
<td>55</td>
<td>7.5</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-39</td>
<td>74</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>114</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40-44</td>
<td>68</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-49</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>50-54</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-59</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>9.8</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>60-64</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>7.6</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65-69</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>70-74</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>75-79</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>80-84</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>1.4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>85+</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>737</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>888</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Figure 4.4: In-migrant age structure (age in 2001)

Both table 4.6 and figure 4.4 show that in-migration was unequivocally dominated by the working-ages in all three study areas. In each area in-migration also seemed to decline with...
age which would be the expected trend. Interestingly we can see that each area also
attracted a high proportion of in-migrants aged 35-44 (25-34 in 1991) and 10-14 (0-4 in
1991). This seems to confirm the general trend for rural in-migration to be largely
consisting of families and young children\(^{38}\). Where the age profiles of each area do differ
substantially is in the youngest and oldest working-age in-migrants. Wiltshire can be seen
to exhibit the most extreme example of in-migration being negatively correlated with age
with a very high percentage of in-migrants aged 25-39 and a clear peak for 30-34 year olds.
Thereafter in-migration declined sharply with age. Although WW&V had slightly fewer
young working-age in-migrants than Wiltshire it did also have a clear peak of in-migration
for those aged 30-34 which then declined with age, albeit moderately.

In some respects the age structure of Cornwall’s in-migrants contrasted markedly with
Wiltshire’s and to a lesser degree with that of WW&V. There were far fewer young
working-age in-migrants in Cornwall than in the other study areas and a peak that came at a
later age, 35-39 years. Also of great interest is that rather than in-migration declining with
age figure 4.4 shows it to have actually climbed again to a second peak with a
also showed that in-migration was concentrated within the middle working ages in 81-91,
although the high level of older working age in-migrants, identified here for 91-01, was not
apparent ten years previous.

Overall Wiltshire can be said to have had an in-migratory flow with a very high proportion
of young working age people and a low proportion of older working-age and pensionable

\(^{38}\) See chapter 1 point 3.2.1
age people. Of all those moving to Wiltshire, 71% were unequivocally of working age; 20-59 years old. Compared to Wiltshire, Cornwall had a low proportion of young working-age people, a high proportion of older working-age people and high proportion of pensionable aged in-migrants. Only 62% of Cornwall’s in-migrants were age 20-59. WW&V seemed to fall between the two with a slightly younger in-migratory profile than Cornwall but an older profile than Wiltshire with 65% of in-migrants of working age.

4.3.4 Economic characteristics

The economic analyses focus on economic activity, inactivity, full-time, part-time and self-employment and unemployment. The analyses of economic characteristics focus on just one cohort, those being the middle working-ages, aged 26-45 in 1991 (36-55 in 2001). The reason for this is that economic status and participation in the labour market is likely to be affected by the life stage of an individual. Table 4.6 showed the large variations in the age distributions of in-migrants in each area. Simply measuring the economic profile of all working-age in-migrants would give greater weight to those nearing retirement in Cornwall compared to the other study areas. Moreover the greater proportion of younger working-age in-migrants in Wiltshire and WW&V may, for example, contain a greater proportion of people in full-time education than would be the case for Cornwall. The analyses here focused on a middle working-age cohort of in-migrants, what could be termed as an ‘optimum’ working-age; they are less likely to be in either full-time education or have taken early retirement. Importantly, table 4.6 also showed this cohort to be fairly well balanced for the three areas as proportionally around one third of all in-migrants in Cornwall, Wiltshire and WW&V were in this age group.
4.3.4.1 Economic activity and inactivity

Table 4.7: % LSMs economically active aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>90.2</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>-17.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>89.1</td>
<td>83.1</td>
<td>-6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>85.8</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>-14.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.7 highlights a distinguishing feature of Cornwall’s in-migration. In 1991, before moving, in-migrants were more likely to be economically active than the same cohort nationally. There was in fact a higher level of labour market participation by Cornwall’s in-migrants compared to in-migrants in Wiltshire or West Wales. Following the move to Cornwall however there was a dramatic net decrease in in-migrant activity rates of 18% compared to a 6% decrease nationally. By 2001 Cornwall’s in-migrants were not only considerably less likely than average to be in the labour market they actually became substantially more likely to be inactive than those already residing in Cornwall. This was arguably therefore a phenomenon associated with the migration itself rather than any effect of the destination.

The evidence of the other study areas may suggest that a move to economically poor regions commonly involves individuals leaving the labour market. This was certainly the case in West Wales where in-migrant activity rates decreased by 15% over the decade. In contrast to Cornwall and West Wales, Wiltshire’s in-migrants retained higher than average

---

39 The full LS tables for each section, complete with absolute totals, can be found in the appendices.
economic activity levels in 1991 and 2001 with an average decrease over the decade of just 6%.

The unusually poor performance of Cornwall’s in-migrants was not unique to the 91-01 decade. In the previous decade in-migrants were also more likely than the long-term population to be economically active before moving, and although in-migrant activity rates increased, it was only half that of the long-term population. However, in-migrants in 81-91 still had a greater number that were economically active by the end of the decade than in the long-term population (Williams et al 1995), the same cannot be said for the more recent in-migrants. Therefore, in terms of labour market participation, the comparative poor performance of in-migrants identified in the previous decade was not only still apparent in 91-01 it had become far more acute.

The following two tables show the dynamics of economic inactivity. The first table looks at the number of LS members that were inactive due to ‘retirement’, ‘full-time education’ or ‘were looking after the home’. Although not a perfect measurement by any means, this provides a proxy variable for economic inactivity that can be claimed to be ‘voluntary’. Given that it relates to LS members aged 36-55 in 2001, any retirees are likely to have this economic status through choice rather than through compulsory retirement.
Table 4.8: % LSMs economically inactive (retired / full-time students / looking after the home) aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>14.7</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

It is clear from table 4.8 that in-migration to Cornwall was associated with a large net increase in the number of people in what can be loosely termed as 'voluntary' inactivity. Before moving a lower proportion of in-migrants were in chosen inactivity than was the case nationally but by 2001 this had risen to 8% compared to no overall change in England and Wales. Furthermore, although 'voluntary' inactivity was high in the long-term population of Cornwall in 1991 and 2001, there was no change throughout the decade so the increase seems to be unique to the in-migrant group. This was also the case in Wiltshire and WW&V whereby in-migration was associated with an increase in 'voluntary' inactivity even though the rates in the long-term populations of each area actually decreased. However the increase in 'voluntary' inactivity of around 2% in each area was far lower than that associated with migration to Cornwall.

Although there appears to be a compelling case to suggest that moving to Cornwall involves a uniquely large-scale act of 'voluntary' withdrawal from the labour market, this is only part of the picture. Table 4.9 shows the number of LS members that were permanently sick or disabled. This can be confidently assumed to represent inactivity that was 'involuntary'.
Table 4.9: % LSMs economically inactive (permanently sick or disabled) aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>12.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.9 shows that fewer of Cornwall’s in-migrants were in ‘involuntary’ inactivity than ‘voluntary’ inactivity before and after moving. However it also shows that there was a larger increase between 1991 and 2001 in the proportion of in-migrants that were inactive due to permanent sickness or disability than by ‘voluntary’ inactivity. One out of every 9 in-migrants in Cornwall aged 36-55 was inactive due to sickness or disability by 2001 compared to only 1 out of every 60 before moving. In-migrants went from being less likely than the long-term population to be in ‘involuntary’ inactivity to being more likely so after moving. This is not to suggest that moving to Cornwall is in some way hazardous to the health of individuals, more that it may be an attractive destination for people who become unable to participate in the labour market due to sickness or disability.

The examples given in the two other study areas show contrasting pictures. In Wiltshire the level of inactive in-migrants due to sickness and or disablement remained in line with that of the long-term population with both groups being less likely than average to be so. In WW&V the increase of in-migrants in this inactivity status by 2001 was actually higher than that for Cornwall’s in-migrants, consisting of 1 in every 7 in-migrants by 2001.

However, unlike the long-term population of Cornwall, the long-term residents of WW&V

---

40 See appendices for absolute numbers

218
were also characterised by high levels of inactivity due to sickness or disability in 1991 and 2001 with a large increase over the decade. What seems to be particularly noteworthy is that only Cornwall offers an example where in-migrants became more likely to be in this status than its long-term population.

The two economic inactivity tables show that in-migration to Cornwall is associated with increases in both 'voluntary' and 'involuntary' inactivity. This differs to WW&V where the decrease in labour market participation was almost solely explained by 'involuntary' inactivity. Therefore while high levels of inactivity through sickness or disablement seemed to be generally associated with in-migrants in poor regions, an increase in 'voluntary' inactivity seemed to be more characteristic of in-migration to Cornwall.

The analyses so far have focused upon overall levels of labour market participation through measures of economic activity and the dynamics of inactivity. The next tables examine the changing work status of the actual labour force within migrant groups across each area. This relates only to those LS members that were economically active both before and after moving, so the differences in the levels of economic activity that have already been discussed do not come into play. The following tables focus on the number of LS members in full-time and part-time work, self-employment and unemployment.
4.3.4.2 Full-time employment

Table 4.10: % economically active LSMs in full-time work aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>65.7</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>-2.5</td>
<td>69.1</td>
<td>70.6</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>72.8</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>78.2</td>
<td>77.1</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
<td>70.6</td>
<td>73.7</td>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>70.8</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>-1.4</td>
<td>68.5</td>
<td>73.4</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>70.9</td>
<td>72.7</td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

1Includes full-time self-employees

Table 4.10 shows that Cornwall’s in-migrants were not only far less likely than average to be working full-time, both in 1991 or 2001, they were also fewer in full-time work than in the long-term population at both points in time. Furthermore it is not something that is individual to in-migrants generally as those in Wiltshire and WW&V had higher than average levels of full-time employment.

Another important point is that each area experienced a decrease in the proportion of in-migrants working full-time between 1991 and 2001, this despite an increase in England and Wales and within the long-term populations of each area. However the decrease of in-migrants working full-time in Wiltshire and WW&V may be partly explained by labour market conditions and job availability in the two areas. Given that the rate of full-time employment of in-migrants to Wiltshire and West Wales was so high in 1991, the decrease may be evidence of convergence towards the lower level of full-time employment within the corresponding long-term populations. The same cannot be said of Cornwall. The number of in-migrants working full-time was already lower than the long-term population in 1991 and became even lower by 2001. It may be possible to infer that the poor performance of in-migrants is better explained by the in-migrants’ strategy rather than the
provision of employment opportunities in Cornwall. A similar level of poor performance was identified in the previous decade (Williams & Champion, 1998) but importantly the low levels of full-time employment pre-move, identified for 1991-01, were not apparent in 1981-91.

4.3.4.3 Part-time employment

Table 4.11: % economically active LSMs in part-time work aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.11 shows there to have been a high percentage of part-time employment in the long-term population of Cornwall, both in 1991 and 2001. This has been a consistent feature of Cornwall’s labour market for some time. Arguably the most interesting feature table 4.11 is that the high numbers in part-time employment were matched by the in-migrant population not just after the move but also in 1991, before moving to Cornwall. It therefore seems that Cornwall attracted people that were already highly likely to be in part-time employment and this is unique in comparison to in-migrants in the other study areas where part-time employment rates were very low. Migration to Wiltshire and, to a lesser extent, WW&V was associated with an increase in part-time employment but this fell well short of the level of part-time employment in the respective long-term populations.

Although this seems a fairly unique feature of Cornwall’s migratory profile, it is not a

---

41 See table 2.23
recently occurring phenomenon and was identified for the 1981-91 decade (Williams et al., 1995).

4.3.4.4 Unemployment

Table 4.12: % economically active LSMs in unemployment aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>9.6      9.7  0.1</td>
<td>5.1      2.8  -2.3</td>
<td>6.0      3.2  -2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>4.9      1.1  -3.8</td>
<td>4.0      1.7  -2.3</td>
<td>6.0      3.3  -2.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>5.0      4.9  -0.1</td>
<td>7.9      3.5  -4.4</td>
<td>5.9      3.2  -2.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

While table 4.11 showed that high levels of part-time employment for Cornwall’s in-migrants partly explained the low full-time employment rates, this table throws light on the rest of the picture and the remainder of the economically active population. In-migration to Cornwall is seen to be linked with high and static levels of unemployment. Cornwall’s in-migrants were far more likely than average to be unemployed before moving. They also had higher unemployment levels in 1991 than in-migrants to Wiltshire or WW&V as well as the long-term population of Cornwall. Although the general trend over the decade nationally was for unemployment to decrease, this did not occur for Cornwall’s in-migrants, despite an average decrease in Cornwall’s long-term population. In this sense, Cornwall’s in-migrants seemed to be directly adding to unemployment. This is in contrast to the findings of Perry et al (1986) and the New Household Survey which found that in-migrants were no more likely than the long term population to be unemployed. Although in-migrants in 81-91 were found to be more likely to be unemployed before moving there

42 See point 2.5.6.4.2
was no marked difference in the performance of in-migrants compared to the long-term population, (Williams et al 1995). This suggests that it is a more recent phenomenon.

The poor performance of in-migrants in Cornwall was similar to that in WW&V where in-migrant unemployment remained static despite a decrease in the long-term population. However unemployment was only half the rate for in-migrants in WW&V compared to those moving to Cornwall. In contrast, in-migrants in Wiltshire had low and decreasing unemployment levels, even outperforming the long-term population over the intercensal decade.

4.3.4.5 Self-employment

The final analysis of labour market participation focuses on self-employment. Much of the literature discussed in chapters one and two suggests that self-employment is commonly associated with rural in-migrants, particularly in regard to migration being associated with a movement into this economic status. Cornwall’s in-migratory profile seems to be a clear example this. Table 4.13 shows that Cornwall’s in-migrants were not only more likely than average to be self-employed before moving, but became almost twice as likely as the population of England and Wales to be self-employed once having moved to Cornwall. This represents a shift in the proportion of self-employed in-migrants over the decade that was over three times the rate nationally. It needs to be recognised that Cornwall has a high rate of self-employment and such a shift may be viewed as an adjustment on the part of in-migrants to the prevailing labour market trends in Cornwall. That said, in-migrants were

43 See point 1.3.2.3
44 See point 2.5.6.4.2
45 See table 2.23
nevertheless more likely to be self-employed than the long-term population in Cornwall after moving. A similar trend can be identified with in-migration to WW&V. Moreover, the fact that self-employment levels in the long-term population of WW&V were about average suggests that a move into self-employment may in fact be associated with migration to poor areas generally. This would seem to be supported by the evidence of Wiltshire. Despite a large increase in the proportion of self-employed in-migrants over the decade, the percentage in self-employment after moving was much closer to that of the long-term population and was far lower generally than for in-migrants in Cornwall or WW&V.

Table 4.13: % economically active LSMS in self-employment aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

1Includes full-time and part-time

4.3.4.6 Occupational class

While it is important to examine the distinguishing characteristics of migrant groups in regard to overall labour market participation it is also useful to look at the occupational class of migrants to better understand the quality of labour market participation. The following tables show the social class of individual Household Reference Persons (HRPs) aged 26-64 in 2001 by migrant groups for each area.
Each table, 4.14, 4.15 and 4.16, substantiates the findings from other studies in that rural in-
migration is strongly associated with the non-manual occupational classes. In-migrants to
all three areas were less likely than average to be in the manual / routine class before
moving with a higher than average proportion being in the managerial, professional and
technical occupations. This was also the case for all in-migrants in 2001 with the exception
of those who moved to Cornwall. Table 4.14 shows that one of the most unique features of
Cornwall’s in-migration in regard to social class is that there was a 7% net decrease of in-
migrants working in managerial or professional and technical occupations between 1991
and 2001 despite an increase of nearly 3% nationally. The proportion of Cornwall’s long-
term population in this occupational class was considerably lower than average so the
decrease for in-migrants may indicate an adjustment to labour market conditions. However,
table 4.16 shows that the long-term population in WW&V also had a lower than average
proportion of managers, professional and technical workers and yet in-migrants still did
well over the intercensal decade with a net increase of in-migrants in this class. In even
starker contrast to Cornwall, table 4.15 shows that well over half of all in-migrants to
Wiltshire were in the top social group after moving, resulting from a very large net increase
of nearly 7%.

The uniquely poor performance of Cornwall’s in-migrants is further accentuated by the
fairly high proportion in the manual and routine class in 1991 and 2001. Although the trend
in England and Wales was for a decrease in this class between 1991 and 2001 of 5%, the
tables show that the decrease associated with moving to Cornwall was only 2%, compared
to 4% for those moving to WW&V and 9% for Wiltshire’s in-migrants. The findings from

---

46 See point 1.3.2.2
the previous decade use a different framework for grouping social class and are therefore not directly comparable but in-migrants were shown to have also performed worse than average (Williams et al 1995) but not to the extent identified for 91-01.

The other most notable aspect relates to in-migrants in the petite bourgeoisie class in Cornwall, consisting of people operating small businesses and own account workers. Table 4.14 shows there to have been a very high proportion of petite bourgeoisie in Cornwall’s long-term population compared to England and Wales. Interestingly Cornwall can be seen to not only attract a higher than average proportion of petite bourgeoisie in-migrants, something that is not identified within Wiltshire or WW&V, but the proportion of in-migrants actually increased by 4% between 1991 and 2001 despite a national decrease of 1% and a decrease within Cornwall’s long-term population of 5%. This is fairly unsurprising given the prevalence of self-employment amongst Cornwall’s in-migrants. There are no data from 81-91 to compare this finding although it seems consistent with much earlier evidence from Perry et al (1986) suggesting that small family enterprises have long been associated with Cornwall’s in-migration particularly within the tourism industry.

---

47 This is likely to be the result of the occupational structure in Cornwall being that there is a comparatively large proportion of small businesses in agriculture and small-scale tourism enterprises. It is also likely to reflect the high numbers of self-employees in the county, this too being largely the result of the occupational structure.

48 See point 2.4
Table 4.14: % LSM HRPs by occupational class\(^1\) aged 26-64 in 2001 – Cornwall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational class</th>
<th>LSM HRP</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manager / Prof &amp; Tech</td>
<td></td>
<td>42.6</td>
<td>35.2</td>
<td>-7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petite Bourgeoisie</td>
<td></td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>18.4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Collar</td>
<td></td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>17.9</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual / Routine</td>
<td></td>
<td>30.2</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>-1.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total n</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>474</td>
<td>474</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
\(^1\) See table 3.1 for the derivations of SEG & NSSEC

Table 4.15: % LSM HRPs by occupational class\(^1\) aged 26-64 in 2001 – Wiltshire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational class</th>
<th>LSM HRP</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manager / Prof &amp; Tech</td>
<td></td>
<td>48.8</td>
<td>55.3</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petite Bourgeoisie</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.1</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Collar</td>
<td></td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>17.4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual / Routine</td>
<td></td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>18.3</td>
<td>-9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total n</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>602</td>
<td>602</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
\(^1\) See table 3.1 for the derivations of SEG & NSSEC

227
Table 4.16: % LSM HRPs by occupational class\textsuperscript{1} aged 26-64 in 2001 - WW&V

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Occupational class LSM HRP</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Manager / Prof &amp; Tech</td>
<td>42.8 44.1</td>
<td>1.3 23.9 27.4 3.5</td>
<td>34.9 37.4 2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petite Bourgeoisie</td>
<td>12.3 13.9</td>
<td>1.6 14.9 13.3 -1.6</td>
<td>14.0 13.0 -0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White Collar</td>
<td>16.8 17.3</td>
<td>0.5 10.7 15.3 4.6</td>
<td>12.4 15.8 3.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manual / Routine</td>
<td>28.2 24.6</td>
<td>-3.6 50.5 44.0 -6.5</td>
<td>38.8 33.8 -5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total n</td>
<td>710 710 0</td>
<td>7195 7195 0</td>
<td>239450 239450 0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
\textsuperscript{1} See table 3.1 for the derivations of SEG & NSSEC

The poor economic performance of Cornwall’s in-migrants is in sharp contrast with how they tend to fair in regard to housing tenure. Table 4.17 looks at the level of outright ownership for migrant groups in each area. As with the economic analyses it is unhelpful to compare the total level of outright home ownership of in-migrants because the different age structures of the migrant groups. Outright ownership is likely to increase with age but Wiltshire and WW&V have a larger proportion of younger in-migrants so analyses encompassing all in-migrants would not give a valid comparison. Table 4.17 therefore only examines LS members aged 46-65 (36-55 in 1991).

Table 4.17 shows that in-migrants were less likely than average to be outright home owners before moving to Cornwall, the same was also true of those moving to Wiltshire and WW&V. However, migration to Cornwall can be seen to have been associated with an increase in outright ownership that was substantially higher than which occurred in England and Wales. The increase in outright ownership was also not far off being double the rate of Cornwall’s long-term population. By 2001 Cornwall’s in-migrants had levels of ownership...
that were not only well in excess of the national average, they also exceeded ownership levels in the long-term population. Essentially, individuals who moved to Cornwall did unusually well in terms of housing tenure and this was also shown to be the case in the 1981-91 decade (Williams et al 1995).

The unusual success in outright ownership was not confined to just those who moved to Cornwall. It may be a general feature of in-migration in poor regions as in-migrants to WW&V also did better than average, albeit to a lesser extent to those in Cornwall.

However, although ownership levels for in-migrants in WW&V also increased substantially over the decade they did not exceed the level in the long-term population which was the case in Cornwall. Migration to Wiltshire is vastly different to Cornwall and WW&V.

Migration in Wiltshire is associated with an increase in outright ownership that is far more modest and is actually below the average rate of growth. After moving, the level of outright ownership among Wiltshire's in-migrants is well below the national average despite an average level of ownership in the long-term population. So while Wiltshire's in-migrants do well in terms of economic activity, work status and social class, they fair less well in terms of housing tenure.

Table 4.17: % LSM outright home owners aged 46-65 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term population</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>13.2 52.8 39.6</td>
<td>21.6 43.1 21.5</td>
<td>15.1 39.0 23.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>9.0 28.7 19.7</td>
<td>13.2 40.0 26.8</td>
<td>15.2 39.1 23.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td>13.6 47.2 33.6</td>
<td>24.3 46.6 22.3</td>
<td>14.9 38.8 23.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
4.4 Summary of LS findings

In-migration to Cornwall has been shown to consist of a high proportion of non working-age people. This was evident when in-migrants were compared to WW&V but the difference was most dramatic when compared to in-migration in Wiltshire. The net decrease in labour market participation was also three times greater for working-age in-migrants in Cornwall compared to working-age in-migrants in Wiltshire. A large net decrease in labour market participation was also apparent in WW&V though to a lesser extent than in Cornwall as fewer in-migrants were economically active before moving. One of the key differences between Cornwall and WW&V in this respect is that the latter had a large net increase in in-migrant inactivity due to permanent sickness or disability, what may indicate 'involuntary inactivity', while in Cornwall inactivity increased in both the 'voluntary' categories as well as 'involuntary' categories.

The work status of in-migrants also suggested that Cornwall's in-migrants were less economically dynamic than in-migrants in Wiltshire or even WWW&V. First, Cornwall attracted a comparatively low proportion of full-time workers. In fact they were more likely to be in part-time work or unemployment than those moving to Wiltshire or West Wales. This may suggest that Cornwall's in-migrants were already in the process of economic downshifting; they may have already had 'a foot off the escalator' before moving. Second, after moving in-migrants did not simply resemble the economic characteristics of the long-term population, a trend identified in the previous decade (Williams et al 1995). In most cases they actually took on a worse economic profile with fewer working full-time and a higher level of unemployment than the longer-term population. Third, the unusually poor
performance of in-migrants in regard to a decrease in occupational class suggests that economic downshifting was not just reflected by the quantity of labour market participation but by the quality of that participation also. Add to this story the fact that in-migration was associated with a huge increase in outright ownership and the pattern that emerges is similar to that identified by Carole Williams (1997); that Cornwall’s in-migrants are said to be ‘equity rich but work poor’.

We may argue that this trend is not the result of in-migration per se rather it is specific to Cornwall. Indeed in-migration to Wiltshire provides the most contrasting example as it has been shown to be economically beneficial for those who move there, particularly in regard to the upward shift in occupational class. Moreover, Cornwall’s in-migration does not necessarily appear to be symptomatic of migration to a poor region either. On nearly all economic measures in-migrants did worse when moving to Cornwall than when moving to WW&V. Finally, we can argue that the labour market conditions in Cornwall do not sufficiently explain the lack of ‘economic successes’ amongst Cornwall’s in-migrants as they performed as they performed worse over the decade than the longer-term population. It seems reasonable to infer that a substantial part of Cornwall’s in-migration consists of less economically motivated in-migrants. This can be examined further by considering the findings from Cornwall County Council Peoples Panel Survey49.

4.5 The Peoples Panel findings
The Peoples Panel (PP) Survey provides information on 811 residents in Cornwall. Participants provided retrospective information about their socio-economic characteristics

49 See point 3.5.3
in 1995 and also provided information about their current socio-economic profiles. In keeping with the definitions of in-migrants from the LS, individuals were classified as in-migrants if they had moved to Cornwall in the 10 years prior to the survey, between 1995 and 2005. The longer-term population were also identified as those that had been living in Cornwall between 1995 and 2005. The following tables compare the PP survey findings with that of the LS. Although there are methodological differences between the PP sample and the LS sample and given that they were conducted at different times, the findings were fairly similar. Table 4.18 shows that the proportion of in-migrants in each sample was similar, 17% and 20% for the PP and LS respectively. Table 4.19 shows that there were some differences in terms of the age of in-migrants in the two samples. Specifically, in-migrants were more likely to be aged 25-34 and over 65 years of age in the PP sample.

The trends in economic activity for individuals in the optimum working-ages were particularly notable. Table 4.20 shows that the PP sample showed a very similar trend to that of the LS whereby in-migrants were more likely than the long-term population be economically active before moving to Cornwall, but become less likely to be active after moving. The unusually large decrease in labour market participation identified with the LS data seems to be confirmed by the PP findings. The PP sample therefore appears to be a fairly reliable sample to examine the motivations given by in-migrants in their decision to move to Cornwall. This excluded those in-migrants aged 65 and over because they comprised a far larger proportion of in-migrants in the PP sample than was the case in the LS sample. The findings are displayed in figure 4.5.
Table 4.18: Migrant status in PP and LS samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Migrant Status</th>
<th>PP</th>
<th>LS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long-term population</td>
<td>628</td>
<td>83.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In-migrants</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>16.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>754</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Excludes cases where response were missing
2 Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.19: Age of in-migrants in PP and LS samples

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age of in-migrants</th>
<th>PP</th>
<th>LS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16-24 (15-24 LS)</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25-34</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35-44</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>19.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45-54</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>55-64</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>65+</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>11.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Excludes cases where response were missing
2 Source: ONS Longitudinal Study


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic activity by age in 2001 / 2005 by dataset</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>Long-term Pop</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995 PP¹</td>
<td>2005 PP¹</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All 35-54</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PP¹ Eco Active 35-54</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Eco Active 35-54</td>
<td>85.4</td>
<td>70.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All 36-55</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>255</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LS² Eco Active 36-55</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Eco Active 36-55</td>
<td>90.2</td>
<td>72.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

1 Excludes cases where response were missing
2 Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Unfortunately there are no comparable data on in-migration to Wiltshire or WW&V but it does provide an insight into the driving factors behind much of Cornwall’s in-migration. It
is clear that socio-environmental factors dominate in-migrants' reasons for moving to Cornwall. Although a quarter gave the reason of being transferred with a job there appears to be little emphasis on economic improvement as none suggested it to be a move based on better wages. Moreover, very few respondents placed importance upon housing factors in their decision to move with only one in ten in-migrants moving for cheaper housing. Life stage or family reasons seem important to a number of in-migrants particularly to move closer to friends or relatives. Of the socio-environmental reasons given the most common was the preferred environment, with over half the respondents citing this as being important but over a quarter also cited previous holidays, the importance of the climate, being better for health and the wish to escape the urban rat race.

The findings support those of Perry et al (1986) who also found that socio-environmental considerations were the most important reasons given for in-migration to Cornwall. The similar findings of the two studies not only help validate one another, they also suggest that socio-environmental reasons seem to have been important for some time. It should be recognised here that without suitable comparisons for in-migration to other areas it is unclear how unique the motivations of Cornwall's in-migrants are. It should also be noted that the Peoples Panel Survey asks in-migrants to recall their reasons for moving retrospectively and these may have been re-evaluated reasons in the light of their present knowledge of economic prospects in Cornwall. We might claim that Cornwall is fairly dichotomous in appearance. The socio-environmental amenities of Cornwall are arguably highly visible, particularly so if someone has visited as a tourist. However the economic realities of Cornwall are less visible so in-migrants may well have been unaware about the

---

30 See table 2.10
parlous nature of Cornwall’s economy before moving. This was indeed shown to be the case by Buck et al (1993). For this reason it is possible that economic considerations may have been more prevalent if migrants were questioned pre-move or at the time of the move.

Nevertheless the findings of the PP Survey suggest that the economic fortunes of in-migrants reflect a lack of economic dynamism that may not be entirely accidental. If a large proportion of the in-migrant population are moving for socio-environmental rather than economic reasons then an ‘economic downshift’ may be less surprising. Again, without comparable motivation data for Wiltshire’s in-migration inferences must be made from the LS and this showed that in-migrants are less ‘equity-rich work-poor’ and more ‘work-rich and equity-poor’. We may suggest a more economically motivated migration strategy to be taking place in Wiltshire given that it consists of a high proportion of working-age people and is accompanied by a comparatively strong performance in the quantity and quality of labour market participation. The evidence thus far suggests that while Cornwall and Wiltshire share a similar pattern of in-migration the underlying processes seem to be substantially different. Before addressing the research questions it useful to consider some additional evidence on the structural economic conditions in Cornwall and Wiltshire from the 1960s onwards.
Figure 4.5: Reasons considered important by in-migrants aged 16-64 in the decision to move to Cornwall

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reason Description</th>
<th>Cornwall (%)</th>
<th>Wiltshire (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Economic Work</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>19.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Housing</td>
<td>6.0</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Stage/Family</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>10.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-environment</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>2.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>31.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for health</td>
<td>54.3</td>
<td>27.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for children</td>
<td>29.1</td>
<td>29.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyed previous holiday</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>27.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.6 Economic change and population change from the 1960s – Cornwall and Wiltshire compared

Chapter one highlighted Fielding’s arguments about counterurbanisation being primarily explained as a job-led phenomenon. He argued that counterurbanisation was largely explained as a response to the decentralisation of manufacturing to rural areas and growth in the service economy. Table 4.21 provides compelling evidence to suggest that this did indeed occur in both areas between 1961 and 1971. Both areas, Cornwall in particular, experienced a very large rate of increase in manufacturing employment despite a decrease nationally. Wiltshire experienced a net loss of manufacturing employment between 1971 and 81, albeit at a lesser rate to that nationally, but this was compensated by a huge growth in service employment. This trend was also repeated in Wiltshire over the 1981-91 decade and to a lesser extent during 1991-01. Although Wiltshire lost manufacturing employment

51 See point 1.3.1.2.1
in each decade from 1971 onwards, table 4.22 shows that manufacturing employment was at a high level from as early as 1961. Because the rate of decrease was lower than that experienced nationally it appears that Wiltshire’s economic structure was actually stabilising or restructuring to reflect the national economic structure. Due to its comparative ‘resilience’ in manufacturing and strong growth in services, its economic structure reflected that of England and Wales by 1981.

The rate of manufacturing and total employment growth was stronger in Cornwall over the first two intercensal decades than it was in Wiltshire. It was the 1981-91 decade that saw manufacturing decrease substantially, at a rate almost as big as for England and Wales. While service employment grew at a faster than national rate during 1981-91 it was nevertheless far less than that which occurred in Wiltshire. This meant that while total employment increased at a strong rate during this decade, it was actually only half the level of job growth in Wiltshire. Table 4.21 shows that although the net growth in manufacturing was substantial during 1961-71 and, also to a lesser extent in 1971-81, it had occurred from a low base. Moreover, while service employment has always been high in Cornwall, compared to England and Wales, manufacturing never came close to accounting for the proportion of the employees in England and Wales. These findings are put into greater context when we consider the rate of population change over the intercensal decades.
### Table 4.21: Change in manufacturing, service and total employment by intercensal decade 1961-01

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>Wiltshire</th>
<th>E&amp;W</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961-71</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>9,700</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>14,370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>2,820</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>-2,280</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>18,800</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>24,200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971-81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>3,400</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>-9,750</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>18,970</td>
<td>23.5</td>
<td>33,570</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>10,620</td>
<td>7.3</td>
<td>10,810</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981-91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>-7,970</td>
<td>-29.6</td>
<td>-6,870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>24,430</td>
<td>24.5</td>
<td>44,720</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>22,770</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>44,440</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991-01</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>4,800</td>
<td>25.3</td>
<td>-1,544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>36,304</td>
<td>29.2</td>
<td>48,088</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>36,854</td>
<td>20.6</td>
<td>39,812</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### Table 4.22: Manufacturing, service and total employment by intercensal decade 1961-01

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>Wiltshire</th>
<th>E&amp;W</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>13,860</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>51,980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>78,040</td>
<td>61.8</td>
<td>108,870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>126,370</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>191,940</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>23,560</td>
<td>16.2</td>
<td>66,350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>80,860</td>
<td>55.7</td>
<td>106,590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>145,170</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>216,140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>26,960</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>56,600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>99,830</td>
<td>64.1</td>
<td>140,160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>155,790</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>226,950</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1991</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>18,990</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>49,730</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>124,260</td>
<td>69.6</td>
<td>184,880</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>143,250</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>234,610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>23,790</td>
<td>11.0</td>
<td>48,186</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>160,564</td>
<td>74.5</td>
<td>232,968</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All employed</td>
<td>184,354</td>
<td>100.0</td>
<td>381,154</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first thing to say about table 4.23 is that employment growth and population growth seem to be more closely tied in Wiltshire than in Cornwall. Employment growth in Wiltshire in 1971-81 had dipped from the previous decade and population growth followed suit. In 1981-91 employment growth increased compared to the previous decade and again population growth also went up. Like Wiltshire, Cornwall’s employment growth dipped in 1971-81 compared to 1961-71 but in contrast, population growth increased from the previous decade. Indeed, this contains the period of high unemployment levels in Cornwall in the late 1970s and early 80s. In the following decade, 1981-91 the population increase was larger in Cornwall compared to Wiltshire despite the fact that employment growth was only half of what occurred in Wiltshire. It is this decade that seems most unusual.

The peculiarity of this trend is emphasised in table 4.24. This shows intercensal employment growth as a ratio of population growth. In three of the four decades the ratio of employment growth to population growth was similar in Cornwall and Wiltshire but in 1981-91 Cornwall provided one extra job for every two people while Wiltshire had an increase of one job per person. We may expect population growth to have been higher in Wiltshire at this time given the large increase in employment however it is likely that much of the growth in employment would have been filled by the longer-term unemployed. The oddity is that Cornwall had a high rate of population growth compared to employment growth and this seems to reflect Perry’s (1986) assertions about in-migrants indirectly.

---

52 The slight mismatch of employment growth and population growth in Cornwall through the 1970s is less peculiar than the following decade. Both population and employment grew rapidly in the early 1970s. Taking the measure of employment growth from start and finish of the decade masks substantial growth that took place around the early to mid-1970s.

53 See point 2.4
causing unemployment. The most recent decade shows that Cornwall has had strong employment growth and a smaller increase in population. The reason why this may have been the case is discussed below. However, we may argue that this has helped to bring unemployment down from the high levels in the early 1990s to the low point at the end of the decade.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Emp's</strong></td>
<td>18,800</td>
<td>10,620</td>
<td>22,770</td>
<td>35,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Pop'n</strong></td>
<td>39,000</td>
<td>44,500</td>
<td>45,100</td>
<td>30,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>24,200</td>
<td>10,810</td>
<td>44,470</td>
<td>39,812</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>56,000</td>
<td>37,700</td>
<td>43,400</td>
<td>43,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;W</td>
<td>377,050</td>
<td>-608,280</td>
<td>392,300</td>
<td>2,440,484</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2,956,000</td>
<td>482,300</td>
<td>1,113,700</td>
<td>1,612,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>0.24</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td>0.43</td>
<td>0.29</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E&amp;W</td>
<td>0.13</td>
<td>-1.26</td>
<td>0.35</td>
<td>1.51</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


4.7 Why has in-migration been consistently high in Cornwall despite economic poverty?

Taking the economic data and the LS data together, it is possible to suggest why Cornwall has been the recipient of high levels of in-migration despite its economic poverty. Both Cornwall and Wiltshire have shared a similar pattern of counterurbanisation. It also seems that both areas support Fielding's claim about population growth being linked to

54 See point 2.5.7.3

240
employment growth, particularly in terms of manufacturing decentralisation through the 1960s and early 70s, and the growth of service employment. However, the claim that it is predominantly employment-led seems to explain a far greater proportion of Wiltshire’s growth than it does Cornwall’s, particularly for the 1980s. The rate of population growth in this decade seems to be higher than what we may expect from the rate of employment growth. This is evident by the comparative rates in Wiltshire. While employment-led in-migration will comprise much of Cornwall’s in-migration we may argue that Cornwall’s population growth has been supplemented by an inflow of in-migrants that are less constrained or motivated by employment. This would represent families and individuals, towards the later working-ages, for whom environmental concerns may have become increasingly important. The LS evidence of in-migration during 1991-2001 and the PP findings certainly support this claim.

The fact that the ratios between employment growth and population in Cornwall and Wiltshire seems to stand out particularly in the 1980s would also support this claim. The housing market was entering into a period of extreme growth in the second half of this decade and we may argue that it is the housing market rather than the labour market that would be a particularly strong driver of this type of in-migration. Chapter two showed that in-migration was particularly high during 1987-88 indeed Mitchell (1993) suggested that more people decided to cash in on the value of their property and move to Cornwall at this time. The argument can be made that in-migration has been supplemented by environmental migrants for some time indeed the evidence of the LS and PP would suggest
4.8 Why it is that in-migration has failed to bring about economic prosperity in Cornwall?

These inferences also enable us to address the second part of the puzzle; why it is that in-migration has failed to bring economic prosperity. It is necessary to recap the three possible benefits of in-migration. First, in-migration may be a response to new employment and filling those jobs in-migrants directly add to the employment base which contributes to economic performance. Second, in-migrants may be bringing their jobs or businesses with them so they may directly add to the employment base either through self-employment or by creating direct jobs for others. Third, in-migration may indirectly create employment in the service sector by increasing demand for goods and services. Each point can be examined with by comparing in-migration in Cornwall to that of Wiltshire.

First, we can argue that in-migration in Wiltshire is far better explained as a job-led process. The LS showed that a higher proportion of Wiltshire’s in-migrants were in employment after moving than was the case for Cornwall. In this sense the economic contribution of in-migration would be greater in Wiltshire than Cornwall assuming both had comparable levels of incomers.

The second benefit is far more difficult to assess. The LS showed that Cornwall had a higher proportion of in-migrants in self-employment than in Wiltshire. As such Cornwall’s
in-migrants arguably have the greater potential to be directly creating employment, if not for others then for themselves. However, we may argue that the potential for direct employment creation may also be undermined if in-migration is motivated by lifestyle reasons and if entrepreneurial dynamism is less common than satisficing economic behaviour.

Finally we can argue that both areas would have benefited from the multiplier effects of in-migration. It is likely that population growth in the two areas would have generated substantial service sector employment. Indeed, table 4.21 shows that the increase in service employment in both areas has been far in excess of the national rate since the 1970s.

It is also important to recognise that while both Cornwall and Wiltshire have experienced considerable growth in the service sector this conceals important differences in the proportional share of employees across each sub-sector. Table 4.25 shows the proportion of full-time employees within each service sub-sector for Cornwall and Wiltshire. The service sub-sectors are ranked in order of the most to the least productive. Figure 4.6 displays this visually and clearly shows that compared to Wiltshire Cornwall has a far higher prevalence of the low productive sectors and a lower prevalence of high value sectors. Table 4.26 shows this trend against the service sub-sectors ranked this time by average pay. Again, with the exception of the education sector, figure 4.7 shows that Cornwall has a high

---

55 This has been a main point of Perry and others who suggest that in-migrants in Cornwall have often been found to be satisficing business owners rather than interested in growth (see point 2.5.6.4.2. It echoes the argument that not all self-employed persons are entrepreneurs.

56 See point 3.5.4
proportion of employees in the lower paid sectors and a low proportion in the highly paid sectors compared to Wiltshire.

This shows that while the economic structure of the two economies are similar at the broad level of analysis the actual numbers of people employed in different value individual sectors undoubtedly affects the overall strength of each economy. In terms of the development of each area's economy, industrial restructuring and the changing geography of employment has left Cornwall with a far weaker economy. It is problematic to attribute the differences in the service economies of Cornwall and Wiltshire to the type of in-migration they have received. However, with respect to the quality of employment in the two areas, Wiltshire would seem to be a better prospect for job-led in-migrants.

Table 4.25: Proportion of FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by value of sector (2004)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industrial Sector ranked by sector value</th>
<th>GVA (£) per FTE England &amp; Wales</th>
<th>% FT employees Cornwall</th>
<th>% FT employees Wiltshire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial intermediation</td>
<td>90791</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate, renting &amp; business</td>
<td>71142</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport, storage &amp; communication</td>
<td>54437</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community, social &amp; personal serv's</td>
<td>51374</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public admin, defence &amp; social sec.</td>
<td>39777</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale &amp; retail trade</td>
<td>34445</td>
<td>24.0</td>
<td>21.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>33404</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health &amp; social work</td>
<td>31652</td>
<td>11.2</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotels &amp; restaurants</td>
<td>25886</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 4.6: Proportion of FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by value of sector (2004)

Table 4.26: Proportion of FT employees by service industries Cornwall & Wiltshire by pay of sector (2004)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industrial Sector ranked by sector pay</th>
<th>Median weekly gross pay £ FT employees UK</th>
<th>% FT employees Cornwall</th>
<th>% FT employees Wiltshire</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Financial intermediation</td>
<td>494.2</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>6.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Real estate, renting &amp; business</td>
<td>464.8</td>
<td>14.6</td>
<td>23.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>463.1</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public admin, defence &amp; social sec.</td>
<td>462.1</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>9.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport, storage &amp; communication</td>
<td>427.2</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>12.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health &amp; social work</td>
<td>404.1</td>
<td>13.8</td>
<td>10.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community, social &amp; personal serv's</td>
<td>367.1</td>
<td>6.5</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wholesale &amp; retail trade</td>
<td>336.5</td>
<td>24.0</td>
<td>21.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotels &amp; restaurants</td>
<td>267.6</td>
<td>11.8</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
One final point is that this seems to suggest that counterurbanisation is most beneficial when it is predominantly job-led. However population growth in this sense is an indication of employment growth and economic success rather than a cause per se. Ultimately, this further emphasises how the complexity in understanding the correlation between population growth and employment growth identified by Champion and Vandermotten (1997). It does however suggest that rural areas need to be considered separately because the cause of the correlation is likely to vary from place to place. Cornwall essentially serves as a prime example of the need to separate the pattern of counterurbanisation from the process. It is erroneous to assume that Cornwall would exhibit the same economic benefits as Wiltshire simply because the patterns of counterurbanisation are similar. It is the underlying
processes that are crucial in determining the outcomes and these are affected by processes that may be significantly different.

It seems likely that in-migration has been economically beneficial for Cornwall, just not to the same extent as Wiltshire. Nevertheless it is possible that Cornwall would have been a much poorer place without in-migration. With this in mind the next section of the chapter compares Cornwall with WW&V in an attempt to address the extent to which rural in-migration has been beneficial for Cornwall in recent years.

4.9 Can in-migration be claimed to be economically beneficial for Cornwall?
The usefulness of using West Wales as a comparative example is that, like Cornwall, it is such a poor region that it has been the recipient of comparable levels of European structural funding, most notably from the Objective 5b and Objective 2 programmes since 1994 and more recently the Objective One programme from 2000 onwards. It was also shown to be fairly similar to Cornwall in terms of the type of migration that it received between 1991-01, although not as extreme as Cornwall, in-migration was shown to exhibit some of similar hallmarks of lifestyle orientated strategies. However, where Cornwall and West Wales and the Valleys differ is in the quantity of migration that they have received. The rate of population growth in Cornwall has far and away eclipsed that of West Wales and the Valleys. This is a crucial difference between the two regions.

As mentioned earlier, we may expect the strong rate of population growth in Cornwall to be associated with a stronger level of economic performance than WWV for three reasons.

57 See earlier point 4.2.2 about the heterogeneity of WW&V
First, we might assume that in-migrants are directly adding to employment levels, be it as a job-taker or as an employer. Secondly we would assume that they would have the multiplier effect of creating additional employment in the service sector. Thirdly, we may argue that they would add to economic output by increasing expenditure in the local service sector, not necessarily leading to new employment. This last point is considerably more difficult to assess.

4.9.1 Economic performance and population growth in Cornwall and WW&V

The first aim is to examine levels of population growth and see if these correspond with economic growth. Table 4.27 shows that Cornwall's total GVA output increased between 1995 and 2003 by 65%. This was far higher than the national increase of 54% and although West Wales and the Valleys also displayed an increase in total GVA, it was almost half that of Cornwall. Table 4.28 shows how Cornwall's dramatic increase in GVA coincided with an equally dramatic growth in population whereas the poor rate of GVA growth in West Wales runs concurrent with unusually low population growth.

Further support for the association between population growth and economic growth can be identified by comparing figures 4.8 and 4.9. Figure 4.8 shows the growth of GVA per annum, highlighting the strong performance of Cornwall from 1998 onwards. This corresponds with a particularly strong annual rate of population growth for the same period (figure 4.9). GVA growth per annum also improved in West Wales from 1998 onwards, again in line with a marked increase in the annual rate of population growth.
Table 4.27: Total Gross Value Added at current prices (1995-2003)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Total GVA £million</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall &amp; Isles of Scilly</td>
<td>3,227</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; Valleys</td>
<td>14,847</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eng &amp; Wales</td>
<td>639,115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Sub-regional Gross value added at current prices (2006)


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Population</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1995</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>478,500</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; Valleys</td>
<td>1,860,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eng &amp; Wales</td>
<td>51,272,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Figure 4.8: Total GVA % change per annum (1995-2003)

Source: ONS Sub-regional Gross value added at current prices (2006)

Figure 4.9: Population % change per annum 1995-2003

4.9.2 In-migration and the labour market

The next step is to analyse data from the ABI to investigate if economic growth is indeed from an increase in jobs. This looks at the 1998-2003 period as there are no earlier continuous data. As we may expect table 4.29 shows that Cornwall experienced a dramatic increase in FTE employees over the period. This was twice the rate experienced in WWV and almost four times the national rate. One particularly interesting finding is that that WWV experienced an increase in employment of almost twice the national rate and yet, as table 4.29 shows, the rate of GVA growth was lower here than in England and Wales. This may give some indication as to the importance of population growth for expenditure.

Although largely speculative, GVA growth in WW&V may have been low because it had fewer additional consumers, as a result of its low level of population growth. Population growth was higher in England and Wales so expenditure may have increased resulting in economic growth despite a comparatively low increase in employment. Essentially, we may argue that an area requires an increase in people, as well as jobs, to maximise economic performance. Indeed, this occurred in Cornwall and this corresponded with a strong increase in GVA output.
Table 4.29: Change in FTE’s by sector 1998-2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industrial Sector</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th></th>
<th>West Wales &amp; V</th>
<th></th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture/Energy/Construction</td>
<td>-1,366</td>
<td>-11.0</td>
<td>-6,020</td>
<td>-17.0</td>
<td>-9,352</td>
<td>-0.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>-372</td>
<td>-1.9</td>
<td>-10,152</td>
<td>-8.9</td>
<td>-705,523</td>
<td>-19.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Service sectors</td>
<td>22,028</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>54,821</td>
<td>16.6</td>
<td>1,523,709</td>
<td>10.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wholesale/retail trade; repairs etc</td>
<td>6,515</td>
<td>26.6</td>
<td>1,742</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>111,973</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hotels &amp; restaurants</td>
<td>3,653</td>
<td>31.3</td>
<td>1,615</td>
<td>5.9</td>
<td>132,725</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Transport &amp; communication</td>
<td>877</td>
<td>17.2</td>
<td>5,380</td>
<td>30.1</td>
<td>106,580</td>
<td>8.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Financial intermediation</td>
<td>-117</td>
<td>-4.8</td>
<td>-643</td>
<td>-6.6</td>
<td>-12,670</td>
<td>-1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Real estate, renting and business</td>
<td>6,893</td>
<td>80.1</td>
<td>11,042</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>397,194</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Public admin &amp; defence; social sec.</td>
<td>808</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>7,416</td>
<td>20.3</td>
<td>81,981</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Education</td>
<td>3,740</td>
<td>40.9</td>
<td>12,450</td>
<td>29.0</td>
<td>271,849</td>
<td>20.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Health and social work</td>
<td>-1,643</td>
<td>-9.0</td>
<td>15,067</td>
<td>23.8</td>
<td>301,148</td>
<td>17.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Community, social &amp; personal services</td>
<td>1,303</td>
<td>23.4</td>
<td>754</td>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>132,931</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total employees</td>
<td>20,291</td>
<td>16.4</td>
<td>38,649</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>808,834</td>
<td>4.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Annual Business Inquiry employee analysis (from Nomis accessed July 2007)

The particular problem in assessing the benefit of in-migration on employment growth is that we cannot know if in-migrants filled job vacancies, created employment directly through their own enterprises or created additional jobs through the multiplier effect of increasing demand for goods and services. This was essentially the same problem faced by Champion and Vandermotten (1997) who found that population growth and employment growth had a strong positive correlation but it cannot be known which causes which. The conundrum is not made any easier by the fact that service sector, people-led growth was the dominant cause of growth in WW&V, where in-migration was negligible, as it was in Cornwall where in-migration was substantial. One way to attempt to address this is by looking at the individual sectors predominantly responsible for the large gains in employees and to consider alternative, non-people-led explanations.
First, job growth in Cornwall has been dominated by four sectors; ‘wholesale/retail’, ‘hotels & restaurants’, ‘real estate/renting & business’ and ‘education’. Wholesale, retail, hotels and restaurants may all benefit from an upswing in tourist expenditure so employment growth would be created by ‘external’ demand as well as by the resident population. Tellingly, figures 4.10 and 4.11 both show that visitor numbers and expenditure in tourism had reached something of a high point at the end of the 1990s and into the millennium.

Second, it is reasonable to suggest that growth in the education sector would be largely attributable to an increase in young children. As children are shown to constitute a large proportion of the inflow in Cornwall we may suggest that in-migration has played a fairly significant role. Importantly, however, the period in question also coincides with Objective One European funding which focused on several higher education developments, not least the expansion of the Combined Universities of Cornwall (CUC) in Falmouth, so employment growth may again be the result of ‘external’ forces.

Finally, we may suggest that businesses in the real estate sector may have expanded due to increased activity within Cornwall’s housing market. This is likely to be partly explained by relocating in-migrants themselves as an increased inflow of property buyers would surely provide extra business in this sector. However it may also be the result of ‘external’ demand as individuals purchasing property in the county as second homes or investment opportunities would also increase business in this sector. Growth in this sector from second home buyers or investors would not be attributable to in-migration and both are argued to
have been significant aspects of Cornwall's housing market (Miller, 2006). Ultimately there are a number of valid reasons why employment growth may have resulted from circumstances unrelated to the resident population so while in-migration is likely to have contributed to employment growth it is nevertheless impossible to quantify exactly how this has been done.

Figure 4.10: Total visitor trips to Cornwall and the Isles of Scilly 1981-2005

Source: Cornwall Tourist Board (2007) 58

58 http://www.cornwalltouristboard.co.uk/documents/TourisminCornwallResearchUpdateSep06.pdf
One possible method which may enable us to speculate about the direct creation of jobs by in-migrants is to examine the rate of VAT registrations. This provides a proxy measure of entrepreneurship in an area by capturing the prevalence of business start-ups. It should be stated here that businesses only need to become VAT registered if they have an annual turnover of more than £58,000 so it may include existing businesses that have expanded as well as new start-ups. Furthermore, the data does not discriminate between in-migrant businesses and non-migrant businesses but if a large number of in-migrants are relocating their businesses or starting new ones then we may expect that to see a notable increase in VAT registrations alongside high levels of in-migration.

Table 4.30 shows that this does not seem to be the case in Cornwall. The annual rate of business registrations in Cornwall was no different to WW&V despite in-migration being substantially greater. In fact both areas are characterised by below average rates of VAT
registrations though Cornwall had a slightly lower rate of deregistrations resulting in a marginal annual net increase of businesses. Figure 4.12 does show that registrations in Cornwall was greater in 2002 and 2003 when the rate of population growth was greater however a similar pattern is identified for WW&V. This seems to indicate that in-migration in Cornwall may be less well explained as an inflow of new employers than it is by new employees. This would seem to suggest that employment growth is more a cause of the recent high levels of in-migration rather than the result. However, this appears to be somewhat surprising given that the LS findings show that self-employment and the ‘petite bourgeoisie’ class is prevalent among Cornwall’s in-migrants.

Table 4.30: Annual VAT Registrations/Deregistrations & Net Stock 1995-2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Annual rate as % of total annual stock 1995-2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Registrations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Wales &amp; the Valleys</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>England and Wales</td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS VAT registrations/deregistrations (from Nomis accessed July 2007)

Figure 4.12: Registrations annual as % of total VAT stock 1995-2003

Source: ONS VAT registrations/deregistrations (from Nomis accessed July 2007)
As said above, VAT registrations only capture businesses with a turnover of over £58,000 so it may fail to identify growth in micro businesses. Table 4.31 displays data from the ABI workplace dataset. It shows counts of workplaces with 1-4 employees, these being small businesses that may ‘fly under the radar’ of VAT registration data. This shows that Cornwall had a far better rate of business growth than WW&V when only ‘micro businesses’ are analysed, indeed growth also exceeded the national rate. Again we cannot know for sure, but the large increase in micro-businesses may be partly attributable to the high levels of in-migration, particularly as Findlay et al found that the vast majority of self-employed in-migrants in rural England and Scotland employed only 1-4 additional persons (Findlay et al, 1999; 2000). If this is the case then we could argue that in-migration has been beneficial in directly creating additional employment.

A final point to note from table 4.31 is that 73% of the increase in micro-businesses is due to construction and real estate, renting and business activities. We may suggest that the strength of Cornwall’s housing market may have played a part in the growth in these sectors which in itself could be another multiplier effect of in-migrants. The significance of the housing market is turned to next.
Table 4.31: Change in business units employing 1-4 employees 1998-2003

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Industry sector</th>
<th>Change in workplaces with 1-4 employees 1998-2003</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Cornwall</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture &amp; fishing / Energy &amp; water</td>
<td>-12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>370</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All Services</td>
<td>955</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Wholesale/retail trade; repairs etc</td>
<td>-339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Hotels &amp; restaurants</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Transport &amp; communication</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Financial intermediation</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Real estate, renting and business</td>
<td>928</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Public admin &amp; defence; social sec.</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Education</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Health and social work</td>
<td>-91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Community, social &amp; personal serv's</td>
<td>212</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total workplaces</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,344</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Annual Business Inquiry workplace analysis (from Nomis accessed July 2007)

4.9.3 In-migration and the housing market in Cornwall

The evidence seems to suggest that Cornwall may have benefited from a high rate of in-migration, certainly in comparison to WW&V. Moreover given that employment growth and in-migration have been particularly strong in Cornwall in recent years it may be tempting to suggest that a more job-led process of counterurbanisation has been taking place. However, it is also important to give some consideration to the housing market in the recent period because this too may have played an important role.

The LS was able to show that 72% of all in-migrants moving to Cornwall between 1991 and 2001 were owner-occupiers before moving. This means that almost three quarters of in-migrants would have had an economic incentive to move to Cornwall if prices in the county were considerably lower than their point of origin. The graph below uses Land Registry property price information to display the price differential of the average cost of semi-
detached properties in Cornwall with those in the South East for each year between 1995 and 2005. The reason for these measures is because the LS has shown that 33% of all Cornwall's in-migrants originate from London and the South East, more than any other region and over 30% were living in semi-detached dwellings more than any other dwelling type.

Figure 4.13 shows that the price differential between a semi-detached property in Cornwall and one in London and the South East widened considerably between 1995 and 2003. Theoretically someone moving from a semi-detached dwelling in London and the South East and moving to a comparable property in Cornwall during 1995 stood to accumulate around £30,000 from the transaction. However, by the peak of the differential in 2002 the profit from such a transaction could be as much as almost £80,000. The price differential can be seen to tally well with the rate of in-migration over the same period. Figure 4.14 shows with the exception of 1996 and 1997 the rate of net migration followed the same upward trajectory as the house price differential. Net migration can be seen to have peaked at over 7,000 a year between 2001 and 2003, generally the same period the price differential peaked. Clearly there was a strong economic incentive for anyone contemplating a move to Cornwall at this time. Therefore while employment growth in Cornwall at this time may have facilitated a number of moves, it is likely that the housing market did also. Interestingly, the last time that net migration was running at such a high level was during 1987-88 which Mitchell (1993) argued was due to the high price differential at that time. The more recent trends seem to lend weight to this claim.

---

[^9]: See appendices
While the housing market may have contributed to in-migration it also likely that in-migration may too have contributed to the housing market. Figure 4.15 compares the average annual rate of price increase for semi-detached houses in London and the South East with those in Cornwall. House prices in Cornwall were growing at a slower rate than London and the South East until 2000/1 when the rate of increase in Cornwall reached a marginally higher level. In 2001/2 and 2002/3 the rate of increase in Cornwall climbed substantially higher than that in London and the South East so the period of rapid house
price increases in Cornwall ran concurrent with the unusually high level of net migration. This seems to highlight what Hamnett (1992) suggested in terms of migration acting as an equilibrating mechanism on house price prices. Table 4.32 shows that the price of semi-detached houses in Cornwall did in fact move closer to that of London and the South East between 2000 and 2003. This would suggest that the multiplier effect of in-migration spreads far further than just goods and services.

Figure 4.15: Annual % increase in the price of semi-detached properties in Cornwall and London & the South East 1995-2003


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>London &amp; South East</th>
<th>Cornwall</th>
<th>Cornwall as a % of London &amp; South East</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1995</td>
<td>£81,955</td>
<td>£48,211</td>
<td>58.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1999</td>
<td>£123,986</td>
<td>£65,230</td>
<td>55.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2003</td>
<td>£217,092</td>
<td>£142,664</td>
<td>65.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If in-migration has contributed to the ‘ripple-out’ effect of house price increases then it can be claimed to have been economically beneficial, at least in macro terms for the Cornish
economy. In the most recent analysis of Cornwall’s economic performance Nankivell (2006, p. 59) claims that GVA growth in ‘real estate, renting and business services’ sector has been particularly strong between 2000 and 2005 and suggests that this was largely the result of growth in the housing market. Moreover, the large increase in house prices will also have generated wealth on an individual level for those people in Cornwall who own properties. However, for those people in the county who have not been property owners during this time the effect of in-migration on property prices is likely to have been unwelcome so the benefits are largely subjective at the individual level.

4.10 Summary

The LS findings seemed to indicate that in-migration in Cornwall involved a high proportion of individuals for whom environmental concerns may have become increasingly important. This can be inferred from the demographic and socio-economic profiles of Cornwall’s migrants and also from the PP survey findings. This would go some way to explaining why population growth in Cornwall seems to have been higher than one may expect than if it was predominantly resulting from growth in employment. As such, we may argue that population growth in Cornwall has consisted of two types of inflows, economic and environmental, and the inducements for each have been temporally variable. The 1980s may serve as a good example of when environmental migration may have appeared to be more ‘visible’ given that the inducements, in terms of conditions in the housing market, would have added an extra incentive to move. Essentially we could argue that Cornwall has had high rates of in-migration for two reasons, first because it reflects the strong rate of
employment growth in the county and second, because a more environmental orientated migration has supplemented this inflow.

The key reason why Cornwall has experienced economic poverty for so long despite in-migration seems likely to be in part due to over-optimistic expectations. We may argue that part of the reason why economic growth is related to in-migration is because it is often the former that leads to the latter rather than the other way round. We may argue that this explains in-migration in Wiltshire to a greater extent than it does for Cornwall. In this sense it is an erroneous to assume that population growth should be associated with economic growth when the underlying processes may be temporally and spatially specific. This assertion would suggest that counterurbanisation ‘appears’ to be most beneficial when it is predominantly job-led.

By drawing comparisons with WW&V it seems that Cornwall may indeed have benefited from in-migration in recent years. Employment growth and population growth seemed to be linked and furthermore, both seem to have increased substantially from 1998 onwards. It is difficult to assess the degree to which in-migration has contributed to employment growth other than multiplier effects in the service economy. However, if in-migrants have led to an increase in business formation in Cornwall it seems likely that this has been in micro-businesses. Finally, although impossible to prove, it seems likely that in-migrants would have helped to fuel the housing market in Cornwall. The strengths and limitations of these arguments are examined further in the discussion chapter.
It has been necessary to examine in-migrants as single collectives within the analyses here. Such an approach undoubtedly conceals a level of heterogeneity amongst in-migrants. The following chapter seeks to examine the heterogeneity of in-migration and the heterogeneity of the relationships between in-migration and socio-economic factors within Cornwall.
5 In-migration in Cornwall: micro level analysis

5.1 Introduction

This chapter addresses the third and final research question: To what extent is Cornwall spatially diverse in regard to population growth, in-migration and socio-economic performance?

The chapter has two sections, the second more in-depth than the first. First the aim is to examine the relationship between population growth and economic performance at the district level of analysis. This will consider the heterogeneity of economic performance, population growth, employment growth and in-migration across the six district of Cornwall. Particular attention is focused on the districts of Carrick and Restormel as they provide two very contrasting processes occurring within Cornwall. The findings suggest economic performance is linked with employment growth which in itself is linked more to the economic quality of in-migration rather than to population growth.

The second section explores the association between economically dynamic in-migration and socio-economic performance at the smallest possible spatial scale. This compares the socio-economic profiles and performance of destinations with contrasting types of in-migration. This draws principally upon data from the 1991 and 2001 Censuses as well as additional contextual data. The findings suggest that there is an association between different types of in-migration and the socio-economic profiles and performance of recipient areas. Moreover, it is suggested that the destinations of two of the in-migrant
streams seem to be logical outcomes of goal directed behaviour while one for other immigrants destinations may be determined in part by constraining factors.

5.2 District analyses

Figure 5.1: Cornwall by local authority districts


5.2.1 Population growth and economic performance 1993-2003

Table 5.1 shows that there was a fairly heterogeneous pattern to the level of population growth across the districts in Cornwall. The highest growth has been in the districts of North Cornwall and Restormel which is largely the result of the higher rate of house building in these areas, while growth has been lowest in Caradon. What is immediately clear is that economic growth does not appear to be associated with population growth.
Restormel had the highest population growth over the period but the second lowest rate of growth in GVA. Moreover, the second largest growth in GVA was in Caradon, the district with the lowest rate of population growth. This may be fairly surprising for two reasons. First we may expect high levels of population growth to have been associated with employment growth either as a cause, an effect or both. Second, we may expect that population growth would have generated extra expenditure and throughput in the local economy, particularly in regard to increased demand on local services. To gain a better understanding it is necessary to consider population growth in relation to employment growth as well as economic performance. The following analysis focuses just on the 1998 to 2003 due to the availability of temporally comparable employment data.

Table 5.1: Change in population and GVA 1993-2003 by district

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Population in 1993</th>
<th>Population in 2003</th>
<th>Population change % 93-03</th>
<th>Total GVA in 1993 £m</th>
<th>Total GVA in 2003 £m</th>
<th>GVA growth per annum 93-03</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Caradon</td>
<td>76,700</td>
<td>80,800</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>392</td>
<td>802</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrick</td>
<td>84,100</td>
<td>89,200</td>
<td>6.1</td>
<td>631</td>
<td>1,335</td>
<td>7.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerrier</td>
<td>88,700</td>
<td>94,900</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>495</td>
<td>1,004</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Cornwall</td>
<td>74,900</td>
<td>83,000</td>
<td>10.8</td>
<td>522</td>
<td>1,052</td>
<td>7.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penwith</td>
<td>60,000</td>
<td>63,700</td>
<td>6.2</td>
<td>368</td>
<td>687</td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restormel</td>
<td>88,300</td>
<td>99,100</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>614</td>
<td>1,169</td>
<td>6.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td>472,700</td>
<td>510,600</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>504</td>
<td>1,008</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 1 ONS mid-year population estimates (accessed from Nomis Oct 2007)  
2 GVA from Nankivell & Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (2005)

5.2.2 Population growth, employment growth and economic performance 1998-2003

Unsurprisingly, table 5.2 shows that economic performance is fairly well matched to levels of employment growth across each district. Carrick had by far the largest percentage per annum increase in GVA and this corresponds with the highest rate of employment growth.
The same trend is identified for Kerrier and Penwith, both had above average levels of GVA growth and employment growth. This relationship is unsurprising given that GVA is partly a measure of the volume of employment activity. However, what is important is that the corresponding rate of job growth to population growth in each district differs so much.

Possibly the most interesting two districts in the table are Carrick and Restormel. Carrick had the second smallest rate of population growth, by far the largest growth of employment, in absolute and percentage terms, and the strongest rate of growth in GVA. This is in complete contrast to Restormel which experienced by far the biggest rate of population growth between 1998 and 2003, in absolute and percentage terms, and yet employment growth was slightly below average. Indeed only Caradon had a less favourable ratio of employment growth to population growth. Moreover, the rate of GVA growth was lower in Restormel than in any other district.

Restormel therefore seems to throw doubt on the assumption that population growth is economically beneficial. It seems counterintuitive that Restormel experienced the lowest growth in GVA despite having an average growth in employment. Unfortunately the explanation for this is beyond the scope of this thesis. However it is possible to speculate on why Carrick and Restormel display contrasting levels of population growth and employment growth. The first possible explanation is that it may be the result of the geographical level of analysis. At the district level of analysis there is likely to be a greater level of independence between an individual’s area of residence and where they work or shop than there would be at the county level. For example, because of the shorter distances,
inter-district commuting is far more prevalent than inter-county commuting in Cornwall, with the possible exception of the Plymouth Travel-To-Work-Area (TTWA). Indeed the fact that Restormel and Carrick are neighbouring districts means that it is likely that population growth in Restormel has consisted of a great many Carrick commuters, who may have taken advantage of the increasing number of employment opportunities in Carrick. This seems likely to explain a part of the puzzle. An alternative explanation may relate to the cause of population growth in each district, specifically the type of in-migration that each has received.

Table 5.2: Change in population, employment and GVA 1998-2003 by district

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Population change</th>
<th>Employment change</th>
<th>Ratio of employment change to population change</th>
<th>GVA% growth per annum 93-03</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>n</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caradon</td>
<td>1,800</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>779</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrick</td>
<td>4,000</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>6,739</td>
<td>23.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerrier</td>
<td>4,600</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>3,333</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Cornwall</td>
<td>4,100</td>
<td>5.2</td>
<td>2,164</td>
<td>9.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penwith</td>
<td>2,900</td>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>2,496</td>
<td>18.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restormel</td>
<td>7,200</td>
<td>7.8</td>
<td>3,569</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean average</td>
<td>4,100</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3,180</td>
<td>14.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources:  
1 GNS mid-year population estimates (accessed from Nomis Oct 2007)  
2 Annual Business Inquiry (accessed from Nomis July 2007)  
3 GVA from Nankivell & Local Intelligence Network Cornwall (2005)

5.2.3 Economic dynamism of in-migrants

The previous chapter put forward the assertion that Cornwall receives higher levels of population growth than that which can be accounted for by employment growth. Essentially the thought is that population growth in Cornwall has been particularly high because it is a recipient of a high level of environmental orientated in-migration. The district analyses may indicate a level of spatial heterogeneity with regard to environmental in-migration.
Essentially we may argue that Restormel’s growth has been ‘supplemented’ by this to some degree while Carrick may exhibit a far more economic process of in-migration. This possibility is explored below by looking at the economic dynamism of in-migrant flows to each district.

Table 5.3: Economic dynamism of in-migrant LS members by district in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>All aged 26-59 n</th>
<th>All 26-59s Econ Active n</th>
<th>EA 26-59s in FT work n</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caradon</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>60.9</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carrick</td>
<td>145</td>
<td>67.1</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kerrier</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>64.3</td>
<td>98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Cornwall</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>55.4</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penwith</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>62.1</td>
<td>56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restormel</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>59.7</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean average</td>
<td>112</td>
<td>61.6</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 5.3 shows three exclusive measures for the economic dynamism of in-migrants in each district. First it shows the percentage of in-migrants that were working-age, both before and after moving. The second variable shows the percentage of working-age in-migrants that were still economically active after moving. Finally, the third variable shows the percentage of economically active working-age in-migrants that were working full-time after moving.

Firstly, the data suggests that the in-migrant flow in Restormel does indeed contain a larger proportion of non-economic in-migrants than on average. The evidence for this can be seen in the fact that there was not only a low proportion of working age in-migrants but also, of those that were working-age, a smaller than average proportion was active after moving. Moreover, for those in-migrants that were working, there was actually a lower than average
proportion in full-time work. Essentially, Restormel was the only district where in-migrants were less economically dynamic than average on all three measures.

In complete contrast to Restormel, Carrick is the only district to have an in-migrant flow that scored better than average on all three economic dynamism variables. Given that the growth rate of Carrick’s economy between 1998 and 2003 far outperformed that of any other district, particularly in terms of the number of new jobs created, it seems intuitive that it would be the favoured destination of the most economically dynamic in-migrants. Furthermore the comparatively low rate of population growth in Carrick and the strong economic profile of its in-migrants suggests there to be a very low proportion of non-economic in-migrants. This is quite unlike the migratory profile of the county as a whole.

5.2.4 District level summary

The process of in-migration identified for Cornwall is not homogenous throughout. The difference between the districts in terms of in-migration and economic performance, specifically Restormel and Carrick, may be used to draw parallels with the differences identified for Cornwall and Wiltshire. In the case of Restormel and Cornwall it seems that a less economic inflow may have served to boost in-migration numbers. For Carrick and Wiltshire it seems that in-migration is much more closely tied to employment growth and the characteristics of in-migrants would seem to point towards a more economically motivated strategy. Beyond all substantive findings, the districts analyses have justified the need to examine in-migration at a number of spatial levels. For this reason it is useful to
examine the association between in-migration and socio-economic profiles at an even smaller scale of analysis.

5.3 Sub-district analyses

The county analyses showed that it was not so much the quantity of in-migration that was associated with economic success but rather the quality of in-migration. Wiltshire’s economic conditions made it an appealing destination for economically dynamic in-migrants whereas Cornwall offers comparatively less in terms of economic opportunity but more in socio-environmental amenities and this is reflected by the in-migration it receives. The district analyses also support the association between the economic dynamism of in-migration and the economic profile and performance of areas while at the same time displaying a spatial heterogeneity within the county. The aim here is to examine the spatial heterogeneity at the sub-district level of analysis to see if these claims can be substantiated at a smaller spatial scale. This will therefore identify those small areas which receive the most and least economically dynamic in-migrants to see if this corresponds with differential socio-economic profiles and differential levels of socio-economic performance.

5.3.1 Defining in-migrant groups by economic dynamism

The first flow focuses upon the most economically dynamic in-migrants; those in-migrants which are strong in terms of quantity and quality of labour market participation. The criteria for this flow is that it consists of a higher than average percentage of economically active in-migrants and a higher than average percentage of active in-migrants working full-time. The final criteria is that there is a higher than average proportion of in-migrants in the
top social classes which includes large employers, managers and professionals. The second flow is the least economically dynamic in-migrants; those in-migrants which are poor in regard to both quantity and quality of labour market participation. This is where there is a lower than average proportion of active in-migrants and a below average rate of active in-migrants working full-time. Finally it consists of a greater than average proportion of in-migrants in the lowest social classes including those in semi-routine and routine occupations. Table 5.4 provides the key criteria of each in-migrant group.

Table 5.4: In-migrant groups – most and least economically dynamic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No. Areas</th>
<th>% economically active in-migrant HRP's 16-74</th>
<th>% economically active in-migrant HRP's 16-74 working FT</th>
<th>% Large Employers/Managerial/Professional in-migrants 16-74</th>
<th>% Semi-routine / Routine in-migrants 16-74</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>79.6</td>
<td>82.0</td>
<td>51.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>67.8</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>71.5</td>
<td>76.5</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Special Migration Statistics (United Kingdom)

5.3.2 Spatial and demographic characteristics of dynamic in-migrant destinations

Figure 5.2 shows the geographical distribution of destinations for the most dynamic in-migrants in Cornwall. Interestingly out of the 12 destinations none are within either Kerrier or Penwith, the two districts in the West of the county. The furthest West that dynamic in-migrants feature is in a cluster of three areas in the Carrick district centred around Truro, incorporating the city itself as well as the surrounding areas of Feock, Kea & Chacewater and Mylor & Perranwell. This is somewhat unsurprising given that the district analyses showed Carrick to have the most dynamic in-migrants. However, this provides a more spatially specific measure which seems to indicate the importance of Truro. Only two other
large towns in Cornwall attract the most dynamic in-migrants; Newquay and Saltash.

Saltash and the other cluster of areas in the East of the county, St Cleer & St Neot, Lynher & Golberdon and Stokeclimsland & Treburley are all very accessible to labour markets outside the county. Saltash is known to contain a large proportion of Plymouth commuters while the other three areas are not only close to Plymouth they are within close proximity of the A30 trunk road so while they are rural they are nevertheless accessible rather than remote. More will be said on the importance of the spatial distribution later.

**Figure 5.2: Destinations of the most dynamic in-migrants**

1. Lynher & Golberdon
2. Feock, Kea & Chacewater
3. Saltash
4. Truro
5. Newquay
6. St Cleer & St Neot
7. St Enoder & Fraddon
8. Stokeclimsland & Treburley
9. Padstow
10. Mylor & Perranwell
11. Fowey & Tywardreath
12. St Ewe

Figure 5.3 show the areas with the least dynamic in-migrants to be fairly dispersed throughout the county although none are within Carrick which seems to support the findings from the district analyses. Arguably the most notable feature is that almost half of the areas are some of the largest towns in the county including Penzance, Camborne & Pool, Redruth, St Austell and Bodmin. Again, the possible significance of this will be discussed later.

Figure 5.3: Destinations of the least dynamic in-migrants

1. St Austell
2. Redruth
3. Bodmin
4. Penzance & Newlyn
5. Porthleven
6. Callington
7. Peterwill
8. Camborne & Pool
9. Camelot & Tintagel
10. Looe, St Martin & Sheviock
11. Constantine, Gweek & Mawnan

Source: 2001 Census, Output Area Boundaries.
Crown copyright 2003
Table 5.5: Demographic characteristics of in-migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>8145.8</td>
<td>3.0</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>11409.3</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td>4.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>6837.4</td>
<td>3.8</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
Source: 1991 Census: Small Area Statistics (England and Wales)

Table 5.5 backs up the observations in the maps in that the areas favoured by the least dynamic in-migrants are, on aggregate, larger and more densely populated than average. Areas with the most dynamic in-migrants while large in size are generally less densely populated than average. In terms of population change the destinations of the least dynamic in-migrants grew by a lower than average rate compared to an average rate of growth in the areas with dynamic in-migrants.

5.3.3 Socio-economic profile of destinations

Table 5.6: Socio-economic profile of migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean IMD score 2004</th>
<th>Weekly income 2001</th>
<th>Mean price terraced house 2001</th>
<th>% Households that are home owners 2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>466.3</td>
<td>84,819</td>
<td>76.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>402.8</td>
<td>73,864</td>
<td>72.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>430.9</td>
<td>78,100</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: ¹2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
²ODPM (2004)
³ONS Neighbourhood Statistics
⁴HM Land Registry
Table 5.6 shows there are clear socio-economic differences between the areas favoured by the most and least economically dynamic in-migrants. Areas with a dynamic inflow are likely to have low levels of deprivation and higher than average levels of household income, house prices and home ownership. In complete contrast, the areas with the least dynamic in-migrants have high levels of deprivation, low incomes, low house prices and low levels of home ownership. As with the district analyses, economically dynamic in-migrants are moving to areas with the strongest socio-economic profile, while the least dynamic in-migrants are moving to the socio-economically weaker areas.

Table 5.7: Labour market participation by migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% population aged 16-64 in 2001</th>
<th>% 16-64 population economically active in 2001</th>
<th>% economically active 16-64 in FT employment 2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>62.4</td>
<td>71.3</td>
<td>54.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>60.5</td>
<td>69.0</td>
<td>52.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>61.7</td>
<td>70.1</td>
<td>51.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)

Table 5.7 shows that the most dynamic in-migrants are moving to areas in which there is a high level of labour market participation evidenced by the higher than average proportion of working age people, the high rate of economic activity and the high percentage of active individuals in full-time employment. Again, there is a contrast in the areas where the least dynamic people are moving where, although there is a fairly high proportion of full-time employment, there is a low proportion of working-age people and economic activity.

Not only do the destinations of the migrant types differ in terms of labour market participation but also in regard to the quality of the labour force in each area. Table 5.8
shows that the dynamic in-migrants are moving to areas with a higher than average proportion of the labour force in the managerial and professional occupations and a low proportion in manual and routine classes. The converse is the case for destinations with the least dynamic in-migrants. Moreover the labour markets of the destinations differ in terms of qualifications with dynamic in-migrants moving to areas of highly qualified individuals and the least dynamic in-migrants moving to areas with a below average proportion of degree level qualified individuals. The two tables therefore suggest again that the nature of in-migration is associated by the profile of the area with highly qualified, skilled and economically dynamic people moving to areas of similar profile and vice versa with regard to the least dynamic in-migrant flows and destinations.

Table 5.8: Quality of labour market participation by migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Managerial / Professional 2001</th>
<th>% Manual &amp; Routine 2001</th>
<th>% 18-pensionable age with degree level qualifications 2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>30.9</td>
<td>21.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>38.2</td>
<td>16.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td>34.9</td>
<td>18.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)

The evidence of the sub-district analyses certainly suggests an association between economic quality of migration and socio-economic profile. This appeared to be the case at both county and district level and it also seems to exist at the sub-county level of analysis. The possible reasons for this will be discussed later, first it is necessary to examine if there is an association between the economic quality of in-migration and socio-economic performance.
5.3.4 Socio-economic performance of destinations

Table 5.9 looks at socio-economic performance across deprivation between 2000 and 2004, household income between 1998/99 and 2000/01 and home ownership over the inter-censal decade. Areas with economically dynamic in-migrants were not only less deprived than average at both points in time, deprivation levels also decreased compared to all areas. In contrast, in areas with the least dynamic in-migrants deprivation levels were higher than average at both points in time and actually became comparatively worse over the period. A similar set of fortunes can be seen with regard to household income. Areas with dynamic in-migrants improved on already high levels of income while low income levels were further consolidated in areas with the least dynamics in-migrants. The third indicator shows that high levels of home ownership in areas of dynamic in-migration were further strengthened by an increase over the decade despite an average decline across all areas.

Again, the adverse was the case in areas with the least dynamic in-migrants where the proportion of home-owning households decreased by almost 3 percentage points. In terms of deprivation, income and home-ownership, it appears that socio-economic performance is also related to the quality of in-migration.

Table 5.9: Socio-economic performance by migrant destination

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Most Dynamic</strong></td>
<td>26.2</td>
<td>20.9</td>
<td>-5.3</td>
<td>51.8</td>
<td>53.3</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>76.0</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>47.0</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>28.5</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>-5.7</td>
<td>75.3</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>-2.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mean</strong></td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>74.9</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources:  
1 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)  
1 1991 Census: Small Area Statistics (England and Wales)  
2 ONS Neighbourhood Statistics  
3 ODPM (2004)
There also appears to be key differences in the migrant destinations in terms of labour market performance over the intercensal decade. Table 5.10 shows that areas with dynamic in-migration did better than average in regard to changes to the proportion of working-age people, economic activity and full-time employment. This served to strengthen the strong levels of labour market participation that already characterised these areas. In contrast, areas with the least dynamic in-migrants performed worse than average across each indicator and, in the case of the level of working-age people and economic activity levels, resulted in the concentration of an already weak level of labour market participation in these areas.

The differences in performance are not just restricted to the quantity of labour market participation but to the quality of the labour force also. Table 5.11 shows that the labour force in areas recipient of dynamic in-migrants up-skilled over the intercensal decade increasing upon the already high levels of people in managerial/professional and technical occupations and the proportion with degree equivalent qualifications while further decreasing the low proportion in manual and routine occupations. Again, the opposite trends are confirmed within areas recipient of the least dynamic in-migrants. Here the low proportion of people in managerial/professional and technical occupations was consolidated by an increase well below the average rate. The comparatively high proportion of individuals in manual and routine occupations was strengthened by a small increase despite an average decrease for all areas. Finally, the low percentage of degree-level qualified individuals was compounded by a below average rate of increase. The two tables both show
that economic quality of in-migration is associated with socio-economic performance in regard to the quantity of labour market participation and the quality of the labour force.

Table 5.10: Performance of labour market participation by migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% population aged 16-64</th>
<th>% 16-64 population economically active</th>
<th>% economically active 16-64 in FT employment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>62.0</td>
<td>62.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>60.9</td>
<td>60.5</td>
<td>-0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>61.3</td>
<td>61.7</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
         1991 Census: Small Area Statistics (England and Wales)

Table 5.11: Performance of labour market quality by migrant destinations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>% Managerial/ professional &amp; technical</th>
<th>% Manual &amp; routine</th>
<th>% 18-pensionable age with degree equivalent qualification</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Most Dynamic</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>4.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Least Dynamic</td>
<td>23.9</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>23.2</td>
<td>26.8</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
         1991 Census: Small Area Statistics (England and Wales)

The evidence is fairly compelling in indicating an association between the economically quality of in-migration and both the socio-economic profile and performance of an area.

The reasons for this are likely to be complex and possibly indiscernible. However, an attempt will be made to explain the associations focusing first on the most dynamic in-migrants and second on the least dynamic in-migrants.

5.3.5 Economically strong in-migration – strong socio-economic profile

The first possible explanation relates to issues of unequal access to the most desirable residential areas. Firstly areas recipient of economically dynamic in-migration are shown to
be amongst the least deprived with the highest cost of housing. This alone suggests that they are likely to be the types of areas where most people would like to live given the chance. This is not to say that individuals' residential preferences are swayed by knowledge of statistical measures, rather that deprivation is derived as a measure of performance across more tangible and visible elements which are likely to be important in choosing a residential location. These may include living environment, access to services and amenities, and crime. The fact that house prices are high may also indicate a high demand for properties in this location. However given that house prices are high, coupled with the fact that these areas also have lower than average levels of rentable accommodation stock, we may argue that access would be restricted only to those people who could afford it. As economically dynamic in-migrants are not only more likely to be working full-time, but to be doing so in the better remunerated occupations, it is likely that they would be better placed than most financially to access the most sought after areas.

The second possible explanation proposes that the choice of destinations of economically dynamic in-migrants is the outcome of logical, goal-directed behaviour. This assumes that economically dynamic in-migrants, by definition, are likely to represent a more job-led model of migration. Essentially, they are likely to be either motivated or constrained in their choice of destination by the quantity and quality of employment prospects. Due to an absence on data for pre-move characteristics we cannot know whether migration for these individuals has coincided with a change in employment. However, given the fact that over 40% migrated over a long distance (originating outside of Cornwall or Devon) it is reasonable to assume that this would have been the case for many. For some the move may

60 See ODPM (2004)
have been instigated by a new job while for others the prospects of gaining employment after moving may have been speculative. Either way it is logical that such a move would have been directed towards areas where the prospects of good quality employment are maximised.

This argument certainly seems to have support when we examine the spatial distribution of economically dynamic in-migrant destinations. The two dominant employment centres for Cornwall's residents are Truro and Plymouth. The cluster of destinations close to these areas therefore seems logical as they would appeal most to employment driven in-migrants. Table 5.12 examines in-migrant characteristics and socio-economic indicators in the Truro and Plymouth-accessible areas compared to all economically dynamic in-migrants destinations. It shows first the distinct appeal that the Truro and Plymouth areas would have to economically driven migrants as they are characterised by high incomes, high levels of full-time employment and a high proportion of people in the highest socio-economic occupations. Table 5.12 also shows that in-migrants in the Truro areas and the 'Plymouth-accessible' areas are likely to be the most economically dynamic in-migrants of all. In-migrants in these areas are more likely to be aged 16-44 than all dynamic in-migrants and it may be claimed that employment and upward social mobility is likely to be particularly important for this cohort. Moreover the Truro and 'Plymouth-accessible' areas also have a far higher proportion of skilled in-migrants working in the highest socio-economic occupations.
Table 5.12: Key characteristics of dynamic in-migrant areas by area type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Truro/Plymouth-accessible areas</th>
<th>All dynamic in-migrant areas</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weekly Household Income (£)</td>
<td>493.7</td>
<td>466.3</td>
<td>430.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001/02^</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Economically active 16-64 in full-time employment^1</td>
<td>55.0</td>
<td>54.1</td>
<td>51.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Managerial/professional &amp; technical^1</td>
<td>34.6</td>
<td>31.1</td>
<td>26.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 16-44^2</td>
<td>54.2</td>
<td>51.8</td>
<td>48.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants HRP managerial/professional &amp; technical^2</td>
<td>55.5</td>
<td>51.3</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 12001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)  
^2001 Census: Special Migration Statistics (England and Wales)  
^ONS Neighbourhood Statistics

These findings may indicate an inflow which is far more concerned by employment considerations and seem to reflect the findings of Hardill and Munn (1996) whereby rural in-migration was generally more economic in motivation when rural areas were accessible rather than remote. The destinations of the most dynamic in-migrants seem to reflect this trend. Firstly, none are located in the more remote Western districts of Kerrier and Penwith and secondly if the Truro areas do not represent more rural accessible areas then the Plymouth accessible areas serve as a fairly compelling example.

5.3.6 Economically strong in-migration – strong socio-economic performance

Although we cannot know for sure, it may be possible to speculate about why dynamic in-migration is associated with levels of socio-economic performance. Due to the scarcity of data on small areas all the area-level socio-economic indicators used in this thesis are derived from measures of an area’s resident population. Area-level socio-economic change therefore results from changes to the circumstances of existing residents and/or changes to
the composition of the population itself, with migration being the dominant cause of the latter. Socio-economic improvement within the longer-term population such as increases in full-time employment, income and occupational class may be the result of the growth of new and better employment in the immediate and surrounding areas. However, socio-economic improvement of an area may also result from compositional changes, for example, if individuals with strong socio-economic profiles are moving in and less socio-economically dynamic individuals are moving out. Essentially it is impossible to distinguish between the two possible causes of socio-economic improvement. However, as we can identify the characteristics of in-migration we may draw some inferences about the conceivable contribution of compositional change on socio-economic performance.

By definition economically dynamic in-migrants are strong in terms of the quantity and quality of their labour market participation. As such it seems fair to suggest that they are also likely to be financially resilient, well qualified and are unlikely to be suffering socio-economic deprivation. An inflow of individuals of this type would therefore contribute favourably to area-level socio-economic measures such as deprivation, household income, labour market activity and qualifications. Moreover, given that all indications suggest these areas to be relatively desirable residential locations, it seems likely that many out-migrants would be moving through necessity rather than choice, particularly as we have shown that rentable accommodation stock is comparatively low and house prices high. Although no analyses of out-migrants were carried out here, it is not unreasonable to suggest that it would be characterised by less financially resilient individuals unable to compete for housing with the more affluent incomers. Again, it
cannot be known for sure but we may guess that out-migrants would have weaker socio-economic profiles compared to in-migrants and it is this net-migration effect on the composition of the population which contributes in part to the strong socio-economic performance of these areas.

Obviously this assertion relies on an assumption that the dynamism of in-migrants identified for 2000/01 is both typical and consistent of what has gone before and this cannot be known for sure. However, dynamic in-migration is shown to be prevalent within the areas around Truro, and the Plymouth-accessible areas. Given the longevity of these areas as employment centres, there is little reason to suggest that the economically dynamic in-migration identified in these areas in 2000/01 is either inconsistent or atypical.

5.3.7 A further distinction for the least economically dynamic in-migrants

To explain the association between economically weak in-migration and corresponding weak socio-economic profiles it necessary to examine the information in greater depth. The reason for doing so is that there appears to be two geographically distinct types of economically weak in-migration, one that is directed towards the towns and the other which is concentrated in a far more spatially heterogeneous pattern. Moreover, the two in-migratory flows also appear to be characteristically different both in terms of the socio-economic conditions of the destinations and by the characteristics of the in-migrants involved. The following analyses therefore re-examine the economically weak in-migrant flows disaggregating the destination areas into two groups; first, the 5 large towns, St Austell, Penzance & Newlyn, Redruth, Camborne & Pool and Bodmin, and second the
remaining 6 areas, Callington, Porthleven, Petherwin, Camelot and Tintagel, Looe St Martin & Sheviock and Constantine, Gweek & Mawnan.

On an aggregate level, areas recipient of economically dynamic in-migration are shown also to exhibit weak socio-economic profiles. However by disaggregating these areas (Table 5.13) it is clear that this is due almost solely to the particularly bad profile of the largest towns where levels of deprivation, income, house prices and home-ownership are drastically worse than average. In contrast, the remaining areas actually have a better socio-economic profile than average on all indicators except for income, and even this is only marginally below average.

Table 5.13: Socio-economic profile of economically weak in-migrant destinations by destination type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Large towns</th>
<th>Remaining areas</th>
<th>All weak in-migrant areas</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IMD score 2004</td>
<td>29.4</td>
<td>20.7</td>
<td>24.7</td>
<td>21.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekly Income Estimates (£) 2001/2002</td>
<td>375.8</td>
<td>425.3</td>
<td>402.8</td>
<td>430.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean average price terraced house (£) 2001</td>
<td>66,388</td>
<td>80,094</td>
<td>73,864</td>
<td>78,100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Households that are owned 2001</td>
<td>68.5</td>
<td>75.9</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>74.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Households owned outright 2001</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>44.3</td>
<td>39.8</td>
<td>40.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Households owned with a mortgage 2001</td>
<td>40.0</td>
<td>31.6</td>
<td>32.7</td>
<td>33.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Households that are rented 2001</td>
<td>31.5</td>
<td>24.2</td>
<td>27.4</td>
<td>26.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Households that social rented 2001</td>
<td>15.9</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>10.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Households that are privately rented 2001</td>
<td>15.6</td>
<td>15.2</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>15.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
1ODPM (2004)
2ONS Neighbourhood Statistics
3HM Land Registry

Table 5.14 shows there are also clear differences in the characteristics of in-migrants moving to these two area types. In terms of age, an unusually high percentage of young adults are moving to the large towns. This in itself is fairly unsurprising given the general
urbanising trends that characterise this age group however, coupled with the high proportion of in-migrants aged 0-15 it seems that the towns attract a large number of young families. The remaining areas are fairly striking in regard to the high proportion of pre-retirement and retirement age in-migrants.

In terms of economic activity and full-time work the two migratory flows are similar and both fare worse than average. This is expected given that these were selecting criteria for identifying the in-migrants. However, the large towns attract a notably high proportion of unemployed in-migrants which is not the case in the remaining areas. In the remaining areas it is the high proportion of in-migrants in part-time work which stands out. Both areas are shown to be characterised by a high proportion of in-migrants in manual and routine occupations and a low percentage in managerial/professional and technical occupations although it is again the large towns rather than the remaining areas which fare worse in this respect.

One of the most striking differences between the two in-migrant flows relates to tenure. Large towns attract a low proportion of owner occupier in-migrants which is explained partly by the high rate in private rents but mostly by the unusually large proportion in social rented housing. This is not the case in the remaining areas where owner occupancy levels are actually substantially higher than average. These differences no doubt relate in a large part to the differences in the age profiles of the two flows. Finally, we can see that in-migrants are far less likely than average to be moving a long-distance in the large towns.
Again, in contrast, the remaining areas are shown to attract a high than average level of long-distance migrants.

Table 5.14: In-migrant characteristics of economically weak in-migrant destinations by destination type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Large towns</th>
<th>Remaining areas</th>
<th>All areas</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 0-15</td>
<td>20.7</td>
<td>16.3</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 16-24</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>13.5</td>
<td>15.1</td>
<td>15.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 25-34</td>
<td>22.0</td>
<td>19.2</td>
<td>20.5</td>
<td>19.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 35-44</td>
<td>12.6</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>12.0</td>
<td>13.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 45-59</td>
<td>14.8</td>
<td>22.8</td>
<td>18.7</td>
<td>18.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 60-74</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>12.2</td>
<td>10.0</td>
<td>9.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants aged 75+</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% HRP in-migrants economically active</td>
<td>67.4</td>
<td>68.1</td>
<td>67.8</td>
<td>71.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% economically active HRP in-migrants in FT work</td>
<td>69.6</td>
<td>70.4</td>
<td>70.0</td>
<td>76.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% economically active HRP in-migrants in PT work</td>
<td>19.8</td>
<td>21.6</td>
<td>20.8</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% economically active HRP in-migrants unemployed</td>
<td>10.6</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>7.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants HRP managerial/prof &amp; technical</td>
<td>32.1</td>
<td>35.7</td>
<td>34.1</td>
<td>39.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants HRP semi-routine &amp; routine</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>32.5</td>
<td>32.9</td>
<td>24.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants owner occupiers</td>
<td>51.5</td>
<td>59.8</td>
<td>56.0</td>
<td>55.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants in social rented properties</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>5.7</td>
<td>8.3</td>
<td>8.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants in private rented properties</td>
<td>37.0</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>35.6</td>
<td>36.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% In-migrants originating outside Cornwall/Devon</td>
<td>36.5</td>
<td>43.2</td>
<td>40.1</td>
<td>41.2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: 2001 Census: Special Migration Statistics (United Kingdom)

The analyses of all areas with economically weak in-migrants can now be seen to have concealed a picture of two very different migrant flows moving to contrasting types of areas. Though both area types are characterised by the least economically dynamic in-migrants, the large towns represent some of the most deprived areas in Cornwall where in-migration is generally characterised by unusually high numbers of young people moving within Cornwall, comparatively high levels of unemployment and a large percentage in social and private rented accommodation. The remaining areas, while also characterised by the least economically dynamic in-migrants, are actually less deprived than average and are
generally characterised by a higher than average share long-distance migrants, people of pre-retirement and retirement age, individuals working part-time and owner occupiers.

5.3.7.1 Economically weak in-migration – weak socio-economic profile

Focusing just on the aggregate analyses of all economically weak in-migrants it is tempting to suggest that individuals are moving to some of the poorest areas in Cornwall out of necessity. Given the fact that these in-migrants are characterised by low levels of labour market participation and a large percentage working in the lower remunerated occupations it is likely that many are going to be more constrained than most in terms of financial resources. It is likely therefore that the destination choice for many of these individuals is going to be largely determined by constraining factors of housing availability and affordability with trade-offs having to be made in terms of residential desirability. This certainly seems to be a plausible explanation for the large towns. While they are shown to be amongst the most deprived areas they nevertheless have comparatively high levels of rentable stock and low house prices. This corresponds with an in-migrant flow with high levels of renters and the fact that there is a high proportion of younger individuals suggests that even home owners are more likely to be in the early stages of their housing career and would probably have accumulated less equity.

This explanation fits less well with the least dynamic flows elsewhere. Here we can see a migratory flow that may best reflect what Carole Williams (2002) suggested as being ‘work-poor’ and ‘equity-rich’. In this sense in-migrants are less constrained in the housing market by being work-poor because they have the financial resources to access the more
desirable locations from being equity rich. Although it cannot be known for sure, this inflow may reflect the process of lifestyle migration described in the previous chapter. Indeed, the low levels of economy activity, high rate of part-time employment and high degree of home ownership post-migration may be indicative of this. It cannot be known why these individuals would not favour the least deprived areas but one may argue that it could be to maximise returns on their equity. If we assume that these individuals are less constrained by employment concerns then they would be less concerned to move near to employment centres. A move to the least deprived areas of Truro or the Plymouth-accessible areas for example, would not yield as big a return on their equity due to house prices being comparatively high. Alternately it may actually reflect the processes of counterurbanisation identified elsewhere in that the more remote rural areas are actually favoured by individuals less concerned by employment and motivated more by lifestyle considerations. Indeed, the relationship with deprivation may be largely arbitrary as equity-rich in-migrants are less likely to experience deprivation to the extent of the longer-term population in these areas.

5.3.7.2 Economically weak in-migration – weak socio-economic performance

Once again it is useful to disaggregate the areas into large towns and remaining areas because in-migrant flows that are different in cause and characteristics may also be argued to be different in effect. Table 5.15 shows that the overall poor performance of areas with the least economically dynamic areas is largely attributable to the large towns. Firstly, the aggregate poor performance in terms of deprivation and household income are shown to be almost solely attributable to the large towns. Moreover, despite the fairly comparable poor

---

61 See Hardill and Munn (1996) for example
performance of both area types in overall home ownership, the remaining areas (non-large
town areas) actually had an above average increase in outright ownership. There was very
little difference between the two area types in terms of inter-censal performance in labour
market participation as both performed badly in regard to rates of economic activity and
full-time employment. There were however differences in the changes to the quality of
labour market participation as the non-town areas had a larger increase in individuals in the
highest socio-economic occupations, albeit still below the average rate of increase. Perhaps
a key difference is in the increase in the proportion of individuals with degree-equivalent
qualifications. Although the increase in degree-level qualified individuals in non-town
areas was around the average rate of increase it was nevertheless almost double that which
occurred in the large towns.

Table 5.15: Socio-economic performance of economically weak in-migrant
destinations by destination type

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Large towns</th>
<th>Remaining areas</th>
<th>All areas</th>
<th>Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>IMD rank position change 2000-2004(^1)</td>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>-0.8</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weekly household income rank position change 98/99-01/02(^2)</td>
<td>-10.8</td>
<td>-1.5</td>
<td>-5.7</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change in home ownership 91-01</td>
<td>-3.0</td>
<td>-2.6</td>
<td>-2.8</td>
<td>-0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Point change in outright home ownership 91-01</td>
<td>1.9</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>3.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- % Point change in homes owned with a mortgage 91-01</td>
<td>-4.9</td>
<td>-6.1</td>
<td>-5.6</td>
<td>-4.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change 16-64 population economically active 91-01</td>
<td>-2.2</td>
<td>-2.0</td>
<td>-2.1</td>
<td>-1.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change econ active 16-64 employed FT 91-01</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.4</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change managerial/prof &amp; technical 91-01</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change manual/routine 91-01</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Point change degree equiv qualifications 18-pen age 91-01</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>3.9</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Sources: 2001 Census: Standard Area Statistics (England and Wales)
1991 Census: Small Area Statistics (England and Wales)
\(^1\)ONS Neighbourhood Statistics
\(^2\)ODPM (2004)
Again, we may suggest that in-migration has played a role in socio-economic performance by impacting upon compositional changes. Given that the large towns are recipients of individuals who are seemingly both work-poor and equity-poor, and are therefore likely to be amongst the most financially constrained, we may suggest that an intensification of deprivation levels, low incomes and low home ownership levels, would be unsurprising. In contrast, we may also argue that the inflow of less financially constrained, equity-rich migrants in the remaining areas would have done little to intensify deprivation or worsen income levels here. Moreover, in further support of the compositional effects of migration, the strong increase in outright ownership in the remaining areas may be resulting from an equity-rich migrant inflow. We may also suggest that the comparatively large increase in qualified residents may also be partly explained by the equity rich inflow as individuals are likely to have previously been economically dynamic to be in this position. Indeed, unlike occupational status, the qualification status of an individual would remain unchanged in spite of alterations to economic status. Again, it is important to reiterate that these claims are largely based upon the assumption that the 2000/01 in-migration trends identified in these areas are both typical and consistent.

5.3.8 Sub-district summary

As with the county and district analyses, it appears that the economically dynamic in-migration is associated not just with a strong socio-economic profile but with a favourable level of socio-economic performance also. On the part of economically dynamic in-migrants we may argue that their destinations are logical outcomes of a more economically motivated migration strategy. The value of the spatial analysis has brought to light what
appear to be two distinct flows for the least economically dynamic in-migrants. Those in-migrants moving to the largest towns, representing some of the most deprived and socio-economically poor areas in Cornwall, may be argued to represent a constrained migration flow, one that is particularly affected by the availability of rented stock and the price of private housing. Alternately we can see that another flow that is comparatively poor in terms of work status are actually fairly rich in terms of equity. These in-migrants may be less constrained by housing or labour market factors and seem to favour the more remote areas, possibly to maximise their equity.

The explanation for the association between in-migrant status and socio-economic performance is far more problematic and hence more speculative. It may be that the examples given here go some way to show how migration not only reflects patterns of socio-economic development but how it may also serve to impact upon these changes through its effects on the composition of populations. The argument put forward here is that the socio-economic performance of the destinations recipient of the three types of in-migration, economically dynamic in-migrants and the two types of economically weak in-migrants, partly reflect the characteristics of the inflows. Therefore it is possible to infer that in-migration may be having an 'area-level' effect by altering the composition of the population on which those 'area-level' variables are based. If this is the case then there is an indication of Cornwall possibly becoming more homogenised in the long-term and further spatially polarised, at least in terms of socio-economic deprivation, in the short-term.
The inferences drawn from all three research questions will be discussed in the following chapter. This will consider how successful the analyses were in addressing the research questions, the possible implications of the research method and findings along with a consideration of some possible implications of the findings.
6 Discussion

6.1 Introduction

This chapter considers each research question in turn and the key findings of the analyses are briefly revisited. For each question there is a consideration of some of the methodological limitations of the research approach with some thought given to the strength and weaknesses of inferences. The chapter will also consider the possible implications of the findings.

6.2 Research question 1

Why it is that in-migration has been consistently high in the face of economic poverty and why has it failed to bring about economic prosperity?

The comparison with Wiltshire was particularly useful in addressing this question specifically with regard to how it strengthened Champion’s (1989) call to separate the pattern of counterurbanisation from the process. Both Cornwall and Wiltshire experienced a similar pattern of counterurbanisation in terms of net migration population growth but the corresponding economic outcomes were different. The analyses suggested that the different economic outcomes reflect important differences in the structural economic processes underpinning net in-migration in each area. Furthermore, the two areas contrast in the type of in-migration that each receives. Essentially, the argument is made to suggest that while both areas have had similar patterns of counterurbanisation, the processes, in regard to the
cause and composition of in-migration, are sufficiently different to explain the different effects.

It is useful to highlight Fielding's (1998 p. 44-7) assertions once again which helps to provide an analytical framework by which to answer the first research question. Three key components of this account of the process of counterurbanisation can be summarised as:

- A process of industrial restructuring led to the transformation of rural economies away from declining sectors to high growth sectors
- Net migration growth was explained by employment driven in-migrants attracted by employment growth first in manufacturing and later in the service sectors
- The endogenous growth of industry and services in rural areas in the 1980s and 90s was largely dependent upon the skills and mentalities of residents.

6.2.1 Industrial restructuring transformed rural economies towards high growth sector

Table 4.21 showed that industrial restructuring certainly occurred within Cornwall from the 1960s onwards and this led to a growth in manufacturing and service employment. However while Cornwall certainly benefited from growth in manufacturing, it can be argued that this was vulnerable to wider economic change from outset. Not only was it largely underpinned by regional aid and subsidies but the very nature of the branch-plants made it a particularly vulnerable form of manufacturing. Table 4.21 again shows that the 1980s saw a huge retraction of manufacturing employment in Cornwall, similar to that in the country as a whole. In this sense manufacturing was a short term fix for many of the employers who chose to relocate in Cornwall, and it was a short term fix for Cornwall also. Rather than transforming the economic structure towards high growth sectors Cornwall was suddenly reliant on another declining industry.
Admittedly service sector growth has indeed been substantial since the 1970s. Table 4.21 showed that the rate of service sector employment in Cornwall outstripped the national rate in each intercensal decade between 1971 and 2001. What is possibly significant is that Wiltshire had already begun to lose manufacturing employment by 1971-81 and between 1971 and 1991 it created 78,000 service sector jobs compared to only 45,000 in Cornwall. In this sense, industrial restructuring seemed to have begun a lot earlier in Wiltshire and to greater effect. The other point about the process of industrial restructuring relates to the value of the new jobs created in the service sector. Figures 4.6 and 4.7 showed that while industrial restructuring and service sector growth had indeed occurred in Cornwall, it nevertheless resulted in the creation of a low value service economy with low paid jobs, quite in contrast to Wiltshire. It therefore appears that economic restructuring not only transformed Wiltshire’s economy earlier and to a greater extent than Cornwall, it also culminated in a qualitatively stronger economy. Thus the economic process underpinning counterurbanisation in the two areas can therefore be seen to be subtly but importantly different.

6.2.2 Job-led in-migration

It is the degree to which in-migration has been a job-led phenomenon that we can see the most marked differences between Cornwall and Wiltshire. The LS analyses presented a picture suggesting that in-migration is far more economically driven in Wiltshire compared to Cornwall. Firstly, table 4.6 showed that Cornwall’s in-flow contained far fewer young working-age people and a higher proportion of pre-retirement and retirement aged
individuals compared to Wiltshire. Secondly, analyses of in-migrants in the middle working-ages also provided compelling evidence as to the difference of migratory strategies in the two areas. The economic analyses (tables 4.7-4.13) showed that while Cornwall and Wiltshire both attracted a high proportion of economically active individuals Cornwall’s in-migrants were far less likely to be in full-time employment and more likely to be working part-time or unemployed before moving. Moreover in-migration to Cornwall was shown to involve a notable decrease in terms of the quantity and quality of in-migrants’ labour market participation. Not only was this not the case in Wiltshire, once having moved to Wiltshire in-migrants were actually more likely to have been economically active, in full-time employment and in managerial, professional and technical occupations than in England and Wales generally. For many individuals, in-migration to Cornwall seems to be associated with ‘trading-down’ in the quantity and quality of their labour market participation. Essentially, economically-driven migration seems to explain the vast majority of Wiltshire’s in-migration but in Cornwall there appears to be far more non-economically motivated in-migrants.

This is not the only evidence for this phenomenon however. Firstly, the findings of the People’s Panel (PP) survey (figure 4.5) suggested that Cornwall’s in-migrants were overwhelmingly more likely to be moving for socio-environmental rather than economic reasons. Secondly, analysis of the intercensal population and employment growth (tables 4.23 and 4.24) seemed to imply that Cornwall’s population growth had been far higher than that which could be explained by employment growth. This was particularly the case in the 1980s when the ratio of employment growth to population growth was substantially lower.
in Cornwall than in Wiltshire. The later stages of this decade saw house prices increase substantially and this is likely to have increased the inducement for in-migration, not necessarily for economic migrants but certainly for environmental migrants, those who may be equity rich and less constrained by employment opportunities. We may argue that the comparative stability in the housing market through much the 1990s has resulted in fewer environmental in-migrants in Cornwall. The findings of the LS and the PP suggest that they still comprise a large proportion of all in-migrants but the size of the inflow has been less resulting in a more similar employment to population ratio with that of Wiltshire (table 4.24).

Essentially it seems to be an erroneous argument to expect economic growth to have been as strong in Cornwall just because it shared a similar pattern of counterurbanisation population growth with Wiltshire, when in fact the structural economic conditions and in-migration processes have been very different. The anomaly is therefore not the differential economic performance of each area but the comparable levels of in-migration and this is best explained by the fact that Cornwall has a large ‘surplus’ non-economic, in-migrant stream that Wiltshire does not.

6.2.3 Prospects for endogenous growth

Fielding implies that the prospects for endogenous growth in rural areas seem to be largely due to the skills and mentalities of residents. The first thing to say is that we can confidently assume that Cornwall's population has been largely shaped by its migratory profile. Indeed table 4.5 showed that 20% of the 2001 resident population were made up of
individuals who had moved to the county in since 1991. The second point is that in-migrants have been highly skilled, at least until they move to Cornwall. With this in mind we can echo the point made by Stockdale (2006) and Findlay et al (2000) that in-migrants represent a potentially valuable source of skilled human capital. What is less clear is the mentalities of in-migrants and how this may affect the potential for endogenous growth.

Firstly, the findings from the 1991-2001 analyses (tables 4.13 and 4.14) showed that Cornwall appears to be appealing to self-employed persons and those moving into the petite bourgeoisie class. This is not a new phenomenon as self-employment was shown to have been common amongst in-migrants in the 1980s (Perry et al, 1986). This would suggest that in-migrants are likely to be creating additional employment upon moving to Cornwall. However, Cornwall also lends itself as an attractive destination to individuals coming toward the end of their working lives and up until recently, conditions in the housing market would have benefited those individuals who were looking to ‘cash-in’ and ‘step-off’ the social mobility escalator (Fielding, 1991). Indeed the LS evidence here suggests that many in-migrants trade-down economically but ‘trade-up’ in housing terms (table 4.17). The question is the effect that such a migratory strategy has upon the potential for generating endogenous growth.

Findlay et al (2000) suggest that environmentally orientated migration need not operate at the expense of entrepreneurialism. The degree to which self-employed in-migrants are entrepreneurial is beyond the evidence in this thesis, nevertheless there have been a number of studies which suggest that entrepreneurs in Cornwall have not been the ‘modernising
elite' that most would have hoped. Shaw and Williams (1987) suggested that in-migrant businesses were often short-term family enterprises creating little additional employment. Phillips and Williams (1987) and Perry et al (1986) both claim that in-migrant entrepreneurs were marked by low levels of economic dynamism while Spooner (1972) suggested that even in the 1960s incoming business owners were 'satisficing' rather than ambitious towards expansion. Ultimately these are dated studies and the findings may no longer reflect the current picture. Indeed, there may be much value in conducting an up to date analysis of in-migrant entrepreneurialism with a similar study to that of Findlay et al (2000).

One aspect that can be commented on is the fact that the LS has shown in-migration in Cornwall to involve individuals who are 'trading-down' in their occupational class while in Wiltshire the opposite was shown to be the case (tables 4.14 and 4.15). In terms of prospects for endogenous growth we may argue that in-migrants willing to 'down-shift' in occupational class may contribute to a low-skill equilibrium (Green and Hardill, 2003). Essentially this relates to a low skilled labour market being perpetuated by a labour force willing to take up low-skilled positions. Moreover, Cornwall has long experienced an outflow of young people, often the better qualified individuals (Aldous, 2002) and Stockdale (2006) argues that rural out-migration by the young is often a response to the limited opportunities in rural labour markets. Obviously this relies on a number of assumptions but if Cornwall's in-migrants are not a 'modernising elite' then the failure to bring about more highly skilled opportunities may also lead to the loss of those individuals who may go on to develop the skills and mentalities necessary for endogenous growth.

See point 1.4.2.4

62 See point 1.4.2.4
6.2.4 Limitations and considerations

6.2.4.1 Are Cornwall's in-migrants less economically dynamic through choice?

A large part of the explanation for the research question assumes that Cornwall's in-migrants are often less dynamic through choice. While the LS suggested a low level of economic dynamism amongst Cornwall's working-age in-migrants there is slightly more doubt about the extent to which either the movement out of the labour market or the trade-down in economic status is voluntary. Firstly, the most frequent explanation for in-migrants becoming economically inactive is because they are 'looking after the home'. While this is deemed to be a voluntary economic status in previous research, here it may nevertheless be involuntary if, for example, an individual was an unpaid carer looking after a family member. This cannot be ruled out, especially given that a high proportion of in-migrants were also permanently sick or disabled after moving (table 4.9).

Secondly, in-migration is shown to be associated with low levels of full-time employment but individuals may have moved with the intention of finding full-time employment but subsequently found themselves unable to achieve this. Indeed, Buck et al (1993) found that in-migrants were often unaware about the parlous nature of Cornwall's economy. However the current research cannot show this and the design is restricted to comparing the characteristics of Cornwall's in-migrants with those in other areas to see if changes are associated with migration. The other explanation for changes to characteristics relates to conditions and opportunities in the destination area and thus compares characteristics of in-migrants with the long-term populations. This is the best available proxy measure with the
LS by which to hypothesise about migrants' motivations but it is nevertheless weakened by 
the chance that changes may be unintended consequences.

6.2.4.2 Why hasn't Wiltshire had environmental migration?
It is necessary to note one of the methodological weaknesses in using Wiltshire as a 
comparator example. Though Wiltshire, like Cornwall, can be considered be rural in terms 
of its settlement patterns and population density, unlike Cornwall it may be described as 
being an accessible rural area in that it offers good transportation links with the surrounding 
metropolitan areas of Bristol and London. Cornwall on the other hand is both rural and 
remote with comparatively poor access to metropolitan regions. Fielding (1998 p.44) 
claims the dispersal of production activities, particularly through the 1960s and 70s, was 
not equal among all rural areas. The most remote and peripheral rural areas, such as 
Cornwall, commonly attracted the more routine and branch-plant production activities. 
Activities involving high technology industries, research and development and other white 
collar service activities were commonly dispersed to the more accessible rural regions, such 
as Wiltshire. The differences in terms of locations are also likely to have accounted for how 
each faired through times of economic downturn. For Cornwall, its remoteness has often 
meant that industry has been attracted by subsidy, making it more vulnerable than Wiltshire 
which could at least rely on good transport links. As pointed out above, this does not really 
affect the overall assertions because it is claimed that the differences in economies are a 
more a cause of the different types of in-migration rather than an effect.
Another key difference between the two areas is that of tourism. Tourism has been a consistent feature of Cornwall for some considerable time. As such it has arguably served to place Cornwall in the shop window for potential 'consumption-orientated' in-migrants in a way that Wiltshire would have failed to do. Indeed, the survey of Perry et al. (1986) and the PP survey (figure 4.5) both showed that previous holidays were cited as an important reason for moving to Cornwall for around a quarter of respondents. Other research (Elzey, 1998; Shaw and Williams, 1987) has shown the tourist industry has also served as a mechanism by which in-migrants, primarily driven by lifestyle consideration, have accessed Cornwall by establishing their own tourism enterprises.

Finally, it necessary to recognise that Wiltshire’s in-migrants may actually have been equally motivated by environmental gains, as those moving to Cornwall. It is possible that a repeat of the PP survey in Wiltshire would yield a similar set of responses to those in Cornwall. The key difference between the two areas is that in-migrants in Wiltshire may have been able to achieve an environmentally pleasant residence without having to trade-down economically because employment opportunities were so good. This does, however, seem considerably unlikely given the differences of in-migration in each area, but it remains a possibility.
6.3 Research question 2

Can in-migration be claimed to be economically beneficial for Cornwall?

This is a problematic question to answer, if for no other reason that it is difficult to separate those economic circumstances which may be a cause of population growth from those which could be an effect. As such many of the assertions were based on proxy, best-available evidence and are largely speculative.

6.3.1 Identifying an association between economic performance and population growth

Firstly, the analyses were able to identify a very strong level of economic growth in Cornwall between 1995 and 2003 and this was shown to correspond with a high rate of population growth (figures 4.8 and 4.9). Moreover, WW&V, an area with comparable levels of European Structural Funding had a below average rate of economic growth which corresponded with no sizable increase in its population. The link between population growth and economic growth was further substantiated by looking at annual rates of growth for each. This showed that annual economic growth in both Cornwall and WW&V increased generally in line with annual population growth. Though the association is clear and Cornwall certainly has experienced considerable economic growth, particularly between 1998 and 2003, attributing the growth to in-migration is extremely problematic.
6.3.2 Direct employment growth

As noted above, a key problem with evaluating the benefit of in-migration on Cornwall’s economy is the degree to which in-migrants may be generating employment directly either by self-employment or through their own businesses. The method used to explore this possibility made the assumption that if a large number of in-migrants were relocating their businesses or starting new ones then we would expect that to see a notable increase in business start-ups. By looking at VAT registrations (table 4.30) it was possible to show that this was not the case, indeed the rate of new businesses was the same as WW&V where in-migration had been minimal. However, by looking at the growth in micro-businesses, those employing 1-4 people and less likely to be VAT registered, it was possible to show a sizable growth within Cornwall (table 4.31). Again, this is highly speculative given the data that is available but it is possible that may reflect some direct employment growth from in-migration. This would surely merit further investigation if found to be true.

6.3.3 Indirect employment growth

The first thing to say about indirect employment growth from in-migration is that the service sectors would be expected to grow substantially with an increased population. This indeed did happen in Cornwall to an impressive degree (table 4.29). However WW&V also experienced an increase in service sector employment, moreover the rate of growth in this sector outstripped the national rate of growth. This seems to be counterintuitive given that population grew at a slower rate than in England and Wales. Further analysis of employment growth by specific service sub-sectors suggested that Cornwall’s growth could be equally attributable to ‘external’ factors as well as being ‘people-led’. Essentially, the
research question was only able to succeed in giving a glimpse of the complexity in attributing service sector employment growth to in-migration.

Finally, the housing market was examined and this too emphasised the complexity in evaluating the benefits of in-migration. Firstly, increases in net migration were shown to have corresponded with a widening differential between the price of housing in London and the South East and Cornwall (tables 4.13-4). Moreover, when net migration was at the highest level since the late 1980s, the annual increase in house prices in Cornwall climbed above that of London and the South East (figure 4.15). Clearly, it is problematic to accredit the increase in house prices in Cornwall to an increased demand by in-migrants but it may indicate Hamnett’s (1992) assertion that migration may act as an equilibrating mechanism on prices. If this was indeed the case then in-migration would have been beneficial not on a macro level for Cornwall’s economy but also for owners of property in the county.

6.3.4 A turning point or a temporary phenomenon?

On the evidence of the most recent period, from 1998, it seems reasonable to say that population growth, and therefore in-migration, has been beneficial for Cornwall’s economy. Indeed at a time when employment growth has been strong in-migration has no doubt helped to fill new jobs, has probably created others and would have provided additional revenues and expenditure for the local economy. However there is more evidence to suggest that this is a temporary phenomenon than an indication of the future.
It is likely that the very high levels of population growth have been more an effect of economic growth than a cause. The fact that Cornwall has had consistently high levels of population growth for around 40 years, and yet has failed to become prosperous suggests that this may be a temporal anomaly. The 1960s and early 1970s may also be held up as a time when the economy fared particularly well alongside rapid rates of population growth, however much of the employment growth occurring at that time was, as it may be now, largely due to structural funding and subsidy. Cornwall has not had a problem attracting people at time of economic growth, indeed the socio-environmental amenities have been shown to give an advantage over other areas (Perry, 1978). The main problem for Cornwall has come during times of wider economic downturn. It is during times of economic retraction that Cornwall’s economy has been particularly fragile and the evidence suggests that the failure to distract in-migration may make matters worse. Essentially, the socio-environmental appeal of Cornwall may be beneficial in attracting employers and employees during times of economic boom and yet it may be a hindrance when the economy takes a downturn.

The conditions of recent years are further complicated by the fact that economic growth has coincided with growth in the housing market. Although we cannot know for sure, it is possible that Cornwall’s population growth has once again been substantially supplemented by a more lifestyle orientated process of in-migration. Indeed the evidence shows that net migration has increased in line with the house price differential with London and the South East. This is fine while employment growth is strong, however, the long-term prospects
may be that Cornwall once again experience unusually high unemployment in the next economic downturn.

6.4 Research question 3

To what extent is Cornwall spatially diverse in regard to population growth, in-migration and socio-economic performance?

6.4.1 District analyses

The district analyses served to emphasise the importance of spatial variability in the relationship between population growth, economic performance and in-migration. Generally the districts display the historical trend synonymous of Cornwall as a whole in that population growth does not tally neatly with economic performance. However, the most interesting and contrasting examples of the heterogeneity existing within Cornwall relates to comparisons of the two central districts of Carrick and Restormel.

One of the central arguments of the thesis is that Cornwall has a high proportion of lifestyle in-migration which is independent or undeterred by conditions within the local labour market. Indeed the evidence of past research and the LS findings discussed in this thesis suggest as much. It is argued that this has supplemented population growth keeping it a higher level than that which can be explained by employment opportunities. Restormel seems to a compelling and acute example of this process as it has had the lowest rate of employment growth in recent years and the highest rate of population growth.
Admittedly, Restormel neighbours Carrick district where employment growth has been far higher than population growth. The possibility exists that many of Restormel’s in-migrants residents have actually taken up employment in Carrick given that the distance for commuting would never be greater than 20 miles. However, using the LS it is again possible to examine the economic dynamism of in-migrants in Restormel and this provides compelling evidence to suggest that population growth may indeed have been supplemented to a large degree by a large number of lifestyle migrants. Not only was there a lower than average proportion of working-age in-migrants in Restormel but it had the lowest proportion of economically active working-age in-migrants of any district. Furthermore there was a lower than average proportion of economically active, working-age in-migrants in full-time employment. Indeed, Restormel was the only district whereby in-migrants were below average on all three measures of economic dynamism.

The picture in Carrick is a complete contrast to Restormel and serves as a clear example of the heterogeneity of population growth, economic performance and in-migration in the county. As noted above, although population growth was slightly below average in Carrick, employment growth was more than double the rate of population growth and was highest in absolute and percentage terms of any district. Significantly, Carrick was marked by an economically dynamic in-migrant flow with a higher than average percentage of in-migrants working-age, a higher than average percentage of economically active working-age in-migrants and a higher than average percentage of economically active, working-age in-migrants in full-time employment. Indeed, Carrick was the only district whereby in-migrants were above average on all three measures of economic dynamism.
Carrick seems to offer an exception to the general trend of in-migration in Cornwall as a whole. It may be argued that it represents a process more akin to Wiltshire in that a high rate of job growth is associated with economically dynamic in-migrants who, in comparative terms, seem more likely to be moving from employment reasons. The nature of Carrick is that it contains the Cornish capital Truro. It is the only city in the county, although this is by virtue of the cathedral rather than size as there are other larger towns. Nevertheless it contains the majority of the public sector employment including the County Council and the Royal Cornwall Hospital. However it has also developed over the last 30 years into the central retail centre for the county so it may therefore serve to provide a good example of Keynesian economic development.

6.4.2 Small area analyses

The district analyses not only indicated differences in the economic profiles and performance within Cornwall but also that differential profiles and performance seemed to be associated with the economic quality of in-migrant flows. The small area analyses confirmed that this was also the case at the sub-district level. This section will summarise the key findings and arguments discussed in the last chapter and provide a brief discussion on the implications for these trends.

6.4.2.1 Migrant dynamism and socio-economic profile

The evidence for this association is compelling. Areas which were recipients of the most economically dynamic in-migrants were more likely to be less deprived than average and
had higher than average levels of household income, house prices, home ownership, working-age populations and economic activity rates. The opposite was shown to be the case with areas attracting the least economically dynamic in-migrants. These areas were more deprived than average and had lower than average levels of household income, house prices, home ownership, working-age populations and economic activity rates.

Possible reasons which explain this association centre on the assumption that migration is ultimately goal-directed behaviour instigated by push and pull factors and mediated by financial resources. Economically dynamic in-migration is suggested to be employment-driven and as such the spatial clustering of destinations around the largest employment centres of Plymouth and Truro would seem to be logical. For many of the dynamic migrants, taking up new employment may actually have been the cause of a move while for others, for whom employment is a central concern, a move to these areas locates them within close proximity to where employment prospects are likely to be the greatest. Alternately it was also suggested that dynamic in-migrants may have been exercising preferences for specific residential locations based on socio-environmental amenities. The fact these areas represent some of the strongest socio-economic areas in Cornwall means that they would no doubt be some of the most sought after locations, indeed the high cost of housing may suggest as much. Economically dynamic in-migrants are not only participating substantially in the labour market but are doing so within the better remunerated occupations so it is reasonable to suggest that they are financially better placed than most to rent or buy in these locations.
The spatial distribution of the least dynamic in-migrants gave the first sign of two rather
different types of migrant flows. Economically weak in-migration in the largest towns was
argued to represent a more constrained migratory flow where individuals were both work-
poor and equity poor and were likely to be those with the lowest financial resources. The
move to some of the weakest socio-economic areas for these individuals may be viewed as
a trade-off of residential desirability for the increased availability of rentable housing stock
and lower priced housing. Other economically weak in-migrants were shown to be
accessing areas with marginally better than average socio-economic profiles. It was
suggested that these in-migrants were able to access fairly desirable locations in spite of
their poor labour market activity because they were equity rich. Indeed, the slightly older
profile of these in-migrants coupled with the high rate of part-time employment and home
ownership and the fact that a high proportion had migrated from beyond Cornwall and
Devon suggests they may be indicative of lifestyle migrants. If this is the case then a move
to the more remote rural areas, rather than the high-priced areas around Truro and
Plymouth, would make economic sense as they would achieve a greater return on their
housing equity.

6.4.2.2 Migrant dynamism and socio-economic performance

Areas recipient of economically dynamic in-migration were shown to have had better than
average performance across almost every socio-economic indicator. In contrast, areas with
the least dynamic in-migrants were shown, on aggregate, to have performed worse than
average in each socio-economic indicator. The argument put forward suggests that in-
migration is likely to have been a contributory factor in socio-economic performance given
that it is a measure of changes in the resident population and the composition of the resident population is likely to be shaped by migration. It is therefore argued that economically dynamic in-migration would have contributed to an area-level increase in economically strong, and less deprived, individuals. Without out-migrant analyses it cannot be known for sure but it is possible that more economically weak, deprived and financially constrained individuals are compelled to move out of these areas given that house prices are particularly high. The net compositional effect would be an overall area-level socio-economic improvement.

The opposite process is argued to be occurring in the large town areas with the least dynamic in-migrants. It is argued that high levels of deprivation, low income and low home ownership are strengthened by an in-migratory flow identified as consisting of some of the least financially resilient individuals. The less urban areas with economically weak immigration performed much better than the towns and the increase in outright home ownership in these areas was of particular interest given the high rate of equity rich in-migrants. Admittedly it is impossible to quantify the effect that in-migration has on socio-economic performance compared to other unknown factors. However the similarity between in-migrants’ characteristics and the nature of socio-economic change in their destination areas seems to suggest that it plays some part.

6.4.2.3 Implications of the association

Though mostly conjecture, the findings of the small area analyses throw-up some interesting possible implications. Firstly, the destination profiles of work-poor equity-poor
migrants may indicate the effect of counterurbanisation exacerbating issues of housing availability and affordability in rural areas. This may also be a process which is particularly extreme in Cornwall given that earnings are low and the LS has shown in-migrants to be comparatively privileged in the housing market. The most economically disadvantaged residents in Cornwall, those identified as being work-poor and equity-poor, are likely to be most adversely affected by this. Although a crude distinction, they are not only likely to be competing with well-remunerated, job-led in-migrants, for properties in the more accessible rural areas near employment centres, but also with equity-rich, lifestyle migrants for accommodation in the more remote rural areas. The spatial distribution of the work-poor equity-poor migrants shows them to be concentrated in those areas which are least favoured by either type of in-migrant which, coincidentally or not, are also the areas where pressures on housing availability and affordability are likely to be less severe. The small area analyses may therefore serve to highlight the existence of an urbanising counter-flow to counterurbanisation, whereby a fairly selective group are displaced to the more remote and deprived towns.

For those individuals that may be displaced to the poorer Cornish towns, many may still be working elsewhere in the county. Indeed, it is known that the poor town areas of Camborne/Redruth/Pool house many of Truro’s employees. Further dislocation between residence and workplace would surely be of interest to Transport Planners looking to reduce the frequency of people making longer journeys to work. Moreover, the increased separation of employment opportunities and the residential locations of those most in need of employment may undermine employability efforts particularly for the least mobile.
The association between migrant dynamism and socio-economic performance may also have important implications. If migration determines or contributes to socio-economic performance through compositional changes then it is possible that certain areas may be becoming increasingly gentrified. However we may argue that this comes about partly as a result of access being limited to the least deprived people and partly by the displacement of the poorer individuals. Given that in-migration to Cornwall is shown to involve comparatively privileged individuals, we may argue that it serves to spatially concentrate socio-economic disadvantage. In this respect counterurbanisation may not only serve to homogenise rural regions, it may also strengthen social polarisation across spatial areas within rural areas.

Another important consideration relates to the assumption that areas with dynamic in-migrants appear to have been socio-economically successful. By necessity, the analyses focus on area-level measures such as deprivation, income, home ownership etc however if improvements across these indicators are the result of compositional changes in the population then socio-economic improvement is unlikely to have occurred for all individuals within the longer-term population. A rudimentary example can be seen with members of the long-term population that are propertied compared to the property-less. The former may benefit from being able to capitalise on increased interest from well resourced in-migrants but the increase in interest, and possibly prices, may diminish the chances of buying a property for the latter. This point can be emphasised further in regard to area-based measures of deprivation. It is argued that the spatial distribution of economically
weak in-migration may serve to intensify deprivation in the towns however it may also act to conceal deprivation in areas with dynamic in-migration. The inflow of least deprived individuals may reduce deprivation for the area as a whole but this may also serve to statistically hide pockets of long-standing socio-economic disadvantage within the longer-term population.

6.4.2.4 Limitations

As with all the analyses of migrants in the thesis, be it at the county, district or sub-district level, migrant flows are aggregates of individuals moving. It is important to recognise that while flows may be distinguished by economic dynamism, as is the case in the small area analyses, this is nevertheless a relative distinction not an absolute one. There will almost certainly be economically weak individuals contained in the dynamic migrant flows just as there will be dynamic migrants in the flows containing the least dynamic in-migrants. Indeed, if we consider the least dynamic in-migrants, those moving to the large towns and labelled here as work-poor and equity-poor, the majority are actually economically active, almost half are working full-time and over half are living in owner occupied properties, it’s just that this is a low proportion compared with other flows. Essentially the migrant flows defined here are discernable by differences and this is due to a minority of migrants rather than a majority. With this in mind the inferences may also only be suitable for explaining differences between flows and areas and may actually only tell us about the circumstances of the critical or unusual minority.
Another weakness with the analyses, referred to in the methods chapter, relates to the use of the income and deprivation variables. There are three issues with the use of these variables in the small area analyses. Firstly, there is a possibility that change is related in part to geographical inconsistencies as the earlier outputs for IMD and household income was based on 1991 ward boundaries. This has the potential to affect 7 of the 23 areas under scrutiny but even for these areas the effect may be minimal. Second, there may be a level of co-linearity between the socio-economic indicators. For example, increases in economic activity may affect the levels of household income and changes in household income are likely to affect the overall deprivation indices. Rather than seeing this as a problem it may be looked upon as gathering a more rounded picture of the circumstances because if an improvement or deterioration in one of these variables is reflected in change in others, as has shown to be the case, then they serve to confirm the overall picture. Indeed, there may be more cause for concern when they contradict each other markedly which was not shown to be the case. Thirdly, and arguably of least concern, they capture a shorter period of change than the Census data measures of inter-censal change. However, this may be a good thing as they capture a point in time close to the migration data.

As mentioned before, one of the inherent weaknesses of the migration data is that it is merely a snapshot of migration for the 2000/01 period so it is possible that is atypical and inconsistent with preceding and subsequent trends. This is less of a problem for analyses of in-migrant characteristics and area socio-economic profiles because the majority of the area-level data applies to the same point in time. It is more of a problem with the inferences about associations between migration and the socio-economic performance of areas. The
claim that performance is related in part to compositional changes from migration may wrongly assume a longer-term typicality and consistency in the characteristics of in-migration identified for 2000/01.

Another weakness of the migration data is that captures characteristics post-move and not pre-migration. The inferences here suggest that the economic dynamism of migrants is due to more to their own agency rather than to the effect of limited or plentiful opportunities at their destination. As with the LS data, we cannot be certain that in-migrants are not less dynamic because of a shortfall in the quantity or quality of employment at their destination. However, given the spatial scale of the small area analyses it seems unlikely that individuals would be constrained by job opportunities in their immediate location when other opportunities may exist within a short distance away. It also seems to place too much emphasis on structural impacts as individuals working in managerial/professional and technical occupations would arguably need to possess the skills or experience to do these jobs rather than it resulting from their residential location.

A final limitation once again relates to the assumption that compositional changes may play a role in the socio-economic performance. The inferences put forward here suggest that consistent types of in-migration may exert an effect on the socio-economic performance of an area. It is important to reiterate here that compositional change is the net effect of in-migration minus out-migration. Only in-migration was focused upon in these analyses, the characteristics of out-migration were not analysed and this would surely be a fruitful
avenue for further research, particularly in regard to whether out-migration from improving
areas consists of the more financially constrained groups.

Attention now turns to the final chapter. The aim here will be to consider the findings for
Cornwall and to apply them to the broader theoretical context of counterurbanisation.
7 Conclusions – Issues for counterurbanisation

7.1 Introduction

In a geographic and demographic sense, Cornwall provides a classic case of counterurbanisation. However, Cornwall also serves to emphasise the complexities of the phenomenon. The conclusions draw upon a number of the issues discussed in the thesis through doubt over the possibility of there being one ‘classic case’ of counterurbanisation.

7.2 Counterurbanisation is temporally complex

Counterurbanisation in Cornwall has looked very different at different times. Cornwall’s population growth during the 1960s and early 70s was arguably far more synonymous with the structural explanations put forward by Fielding (1982). It seems likely that in-migration at this time would have been predominantly economic, largely explained by changes in the labour market and consisting largely of employers and employees and their families. This is not to say that economic inducements precluded environmental inducements, rather that they may have been more ‘visible’ at this point in time. Moving the chronological focus forward to in-migration through to the late 70s and 1980s and it would seem far less well explained by economic incentives at a time when economic retraction and high unemployment characterised Cornwall. Indeed the full complexity is brought to light in the most recent period from 1998 onwards when employment growth has coincided with a period of rapid growth in the housing market. The high rate of net migration over this period may be a response to employment opportunities reflecting a more economic inflow.
but it may also have been the result of individuals cashing-in on equity which may be tied
to a far more environmental-orientated strategy.

Cornwall provides a good example of how in-migration is unlikely to be entirely dictated
by economic reasons at the exclusion of environmental concerns or vice versa. Even during
the ‘structural’ period of counterurbanisation in Cornwall in the 60s and 70s Perry (1978)
showed that the majority of relocating business owners chose Cornwall for the sake of
having holidayed there. Moreover, the majority of in-migrants who were employees of
relocating businesses in the early 1970s actually chose to stay on, unemployed, when their
firms relocated out of the Cornwall (Perry et al, 1986). Consequentially, we may
confidently term these individuals as economic in-migrants but even this is questionable
because their reasons for staying may in fact have been environmental. The same confusion
applies for what we may argue to be environmental migration. The analyses here, and those
of Williams et al (1995), have shown that in-migration over the last two intercensal decades
has not only been dominated by working-age individuals, but by individuals most likely to
be economically active. While the PP survey confirmed earlier surveys (Perry et al, 1986;
CCC, 1975), showing that in-migrants frequently cited environmental motivations in
deciding to move over economic reasons, these are not going to be taken freely of
employment concerns for the majority of the individuals involved. Just as it may be a
fallacy to draw a distinction between economic or environmental migration so too is it
problematic to define counterurbanisation as being either structural or individual in cause
alone.
7.3 Counterurbanisation is spatially complex

In reality, both economic and environmental in-migration processes have occurred in Cornwall since the onset of counterurbanisation but the inducements for each type exert unequal force, not just across time but also space. Cornwall may be argued to be fairly unique, specifically in regard to the extent that environmental and economic inducements are comparatively asymmetric. Cornwall’s environmental inducements are considerable and comparatively consistent. In contrast, the economy has been dogged by periods of high unemployment, earnings have been consistently amongst the lowest in the country and the employment structure has long been skewed towards the lower skilled, lower value jobs. In short, the economic inducements of Cornwall have generally been poor. It is these inducements which are spatially diverse across different rural areas and as such it is little surprise that in-migrant processes differ. The differences between Cornwall and Wiltshire serve to highlight this well.

Importantly, the analyses also showed that migration processes are spatially heterogeneous within Cornwall. Analyses of district and sub-district areas showed that economic migration may be prevalent in the more accessible rural areas near to employment centres while environmental migration was more extensive in the more remote rural areas. Essentially the heterogeneity of in-migration at county, district and sub-district level emphasises Cloke’s (1985) warning that counterurbanisation will alter depending upon the conditions of the rural area in focus. Such a premise states the importance of conducting local-specific studies of counterurbanisation processes which are sensitive to spatial variations.
7.4 Counterurbanisation is different for different people

Given that environmental and economic inducements are comparatively asymmetric in Cornwall we may suggest that Cornwall is a particularly attractive destination for those individuals willing and indeed able to trade-off pecuniary losses in favour environmental gains. Therefore while areas differ in terms of economic and environmental provision differential inducements also impact unevenly upon specific groups. This is reflected by the selective characteristics of Cornwall’s in-migrants.

Firstly, the benefits of environmental gain are likely to become more important than economic considerations for individuals at a particular life stage. Cornwall’s in-migrant profile shows that it attracts large numbers in the 35-44 and 10-14 cohorts (aged 25-34 and 0-4 before moving). These findings confirm rural in-migration patterns elsewhere (CRC, 2007) and support the idea that families with young children are well represented among counterurbanisers in England and Wales (Champion & Atkins, 2000). We might suggest that this is the period in the life cycle when environmental amenities start to take on increased importance. We can be even more confident with this assertion in explaining the high proportion of later working-age in-migrants in Cornwall as “responsiveness to spatial labour market disparities declines through the lifecycle whilst the converse is true of amenity effects” (Millington 2000, p. 521). In this sense, the imbalance between economic and environmental inducements in Cornwall is likely to be heavily influencing the demographic profile of its in-migrants.
Although Cornwall will appeal to individuals differently depending on their life stage, the ability to make pecuniary trade-offs in favour of residential preference will not be equal to all individuals in society. Cornwall substantiates previous evidence (Fielding, 1998; Champion & Atkins, 2000; Cross, 1990) of how rural in-migration and counterurbanisers are socially selective as disproportionately high numbers of in-migrants were drawn from the highest socio-economic occupations. We cannot say with any certainty whether middle-class individuals value the rural idyll more strongly than the working-classes as Thrift (1989) might suggest. However, we can be fairly confident in assuming that they will have greater financial resources to be able to access the more sought-after locations and, being comparative solvent, the prospects of pecuniary trade-offs may be less inhibiting than they would be to someone less well-off.

Financial resources are not the only determining factor. The prospects of poor economic inducements, at least in terms of employment opportunities, are likely to be very different depending on individuals’ economic status. Counterurbanisation and rural in-migration has often been associated with self-employment, both in terms of attracting individuals within this status but also with such moves being associated with a transition to this status (Fielding, 1998; 1990). Cornwall provides a conspicuous example of both these trends. It not only attracts a high proportion of in-migrants already in self-employment, but in-migration itself is strongly linked with a transition to this status. It can be argued that self-employed in-migrants are amongst the least likely to be affected by poor labour market opportunities as their employment moves with them. In this sense, self-employment muddies the water considerably in terms of the complexity of migration as either economic
or environmental. We may regard self-employed in-migrants as economic migrants because they are moving with employment and yet their destination choice may ultimately be driven by environmental concerns. Aside from the self-employed, the unemployed or long-term sick may also have less to lose by moving to Cornwall and both are shown to be pronounced in Cornwall's in-migrant flow. As suggested by Champion et al (1998), benefit payments are geographically standardised so individuals may be able to achieve environmental gains whilst sustaining minimum pecuniary losses.

Counterurbanisation processes are also largely dependent upon the different strategies of migrants. Perceptions on the drawbacks of poor economic inducements are likely to be substantially diminished for those individuals already planning to trade-down economically. This is perhaps the most compelling feature of Cornwall’s in-migration where in-migrants became notably less likely to be participating in the labour market after moving and also displayed decreases in terms of socio-economic occupation. While there were indications of this in the 1981-91 intercensal decade in the analyses of Williams et al (1995), it is the migratory trends for the 91-01 period analysed in this thesis which emphasises its prevalence. Again, these findings are largely supportive of other counterurbanisation findings with regard to decreases in economic activity (Champion & Atkins, 2000) and a downshift in occupational class (Hoggart, 2000). Although it may be tempting to suggest that these types of in-migrants epitomise environmental in-migration there could yet have been important economic reasons which facilitated such a move. The private housing market may further obsfuscate the complexity between economic and environmental migration processes.
The comparatively low price of housing in Cornwall means that it would have offered an additional economic inducement to migrate. Indeed the increase in outright ownership associated with a move to Cornwall suggests that in-migrants do remarkably well in this sense. However, once again, this inducement would not have been equal to all people. For one, the inducement would have been greatest for propertied rather than property-less individuals. Second, it is spatially determined as house price differentials would be greatest for individuals originating in high price areas such as London and the South East but would be considerably less, or even act as a disincentive, for those moving from lower priced regions. Third, potential housing gains will once again be mediated by the cost of economic trade-offs associated with moving to Cornwall. Finally, regional price differences are ephemeral and conditions therein can be a facilitating factor at one point in time and a constraining factor at another. This may be evidenced by the fact net migration trends were extremely high for the 1987/88 and 2001/03, periods when the house price differential was large, and dropped to a low point in 1991/92 at the time of dramatic house price decreases. Ultimately, even when the house price differentials favour in-migrants it is likely to facilitate rather than cause in-migration and will be possibly more important for those individuals who are already inclined towards environmental migration and are less constrained by labour market considerations.

Finally, it is necessary to state that for some of Cornwall’s in-migrants there would not have been an economic trade-off. The fact that in-migrants are drawn from the highest socio-economic groups means that they are likely to be well positioned in terms of labour
market skills to compete for the better jobs in Cornwall. Despite aggregate analyses showing a large net decrease in the number of in-migrants in the top socio-economic occupations, over a third of in-migrants actually remain in this category after moving, which is a far higher proportion than for the long-term population. For some in-migrants the move will not have been associated with a decrease in the quality of occupation while others may have achieved upward social mobility. Essentially it is an ecological fallacy to assume uniformity in downward social mobility with Cornwall’s in-migrants merely because it occurs at an aggregate level. Just as it is an ecological fallacy to dismiss the presence of economic migration in what may appear to be a generally environmental process.

7.5 Concluding remarks

The processes of in-migration identified in Cornwall suggest that we should think more carefully about counterurbanisation. This is certainly in regard to the economic benefits, which like the causal processes, may be unequally distributed across space, time and for different sub-groups of the population. Arguably it is the spatial and temporal focus of analysis which determines, to a large part, the processes that will be identified and as such we may choose to heed Cloke’s (1985) request to consider explanations of processes which account for distinct, specific and localised conditions. Moreover, counterurbanisation is not only shown to be substantially different between rural areas but within them also. The heterogeneity within Cornwall seems to suggest that not only will there be several different sub-forms of counterurbanisation at any one time (Mitchell, 2004) but also within one place.
Essentially Cornwall brings to light the complexity and multi-dimensionality of the process. Perhaps the most significant point to take from the thesis is the need to repeat Champion's (1998) call to separate the pattern of counterurbanisation from the process. Identifying the pattern of population deconcentration is arguably a straightforward task and amenable to wider application compared to unpacking the complexity and multi-dimensionality of the processes which underpin it. In this sense, generalising about counterurbanisation processes may not be possible or indeed desirable.
Bibliography


Bell, D and Kirwan, F. (1979) Return Migration in a Scottish Context, Regional Studies, 13, pp.100-111

Berry, B. (1976) Urbanisation and counterurbanisation, Beverly Hills, Sage


331


332


Elzey, R. (1998) 'In-migration to Newquay: Migrants' Lifestyles and Perspectives on Environments' *Cornish Studies*, 2nd series 6,


333


336


Spooner, D J. (1972) Industrial movement and the rural periphery: The case of Devon and Cornwall, Regional Studies, 6, 2, pp.197-215


Williams, M. (2003) Why is Comwall Poor? Poverty and In-migration since the 1960s, *Contemporary British History*, 17, pp.55-70


Appendices 1

Full ONS Longitudinal Study tables from Chapter 4
Table 4.7: % LSMs economically active aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economically active</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall EcoA</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall EcoA %</td>
<td>90.2</td>
<td>72.5</td>
<td>-17.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall EcoA</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall EcoA %</td>
<td>89.1</td>
<td>83.1</td>
<td>-6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall % EcoA</td>
<td>123,313</td>
<td>123,313</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.8: % LSMs economically inactive (retired/full-time students/looking after the home) aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chosen inactivity</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Inact</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Inact %</td>
<td>8.2</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Inact</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Inact %</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>10.9</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall % Inact</td>
<td>11,979</td>
<td>11,598</td>
<td>-381</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.9: % LSMs economically inactive (permanently sick or disabled) aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sick/disabled LSMs aged 36-55</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Sick</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Sick %</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>11.4</td>
<td>9.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall All 36-55</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>320</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Sick</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall Sick %</td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>11.5</td>
<td>9.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall WW&amp;V Sick</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>-1.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
Table 4.10: % economically active LSMs in full-time work aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FT employed LSMs aged 36-55</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT</td>
<td>151</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>-34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% FT</td>
<td>65.7</td>
<td>63.2</td>
<td>-2.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>-18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% FT</td>
<td>78.2</td>
<td>77.1</td>
<td>-1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;BV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>-56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FT</td>
<td>242</td>
<td>196</td>
<td>-46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% FT</td>
<td>75.4</td>
<td>74.0</td>
<td>-1.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.11: % economically active LSMs in part-time work aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PT employed LSMs aged 36-55</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% PT</td>
<td>24.8</td>
<td>27.0</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>48</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% PT</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>21.8</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;BV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>-56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PT</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% PT</td>
<td>19.6</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.12: % economically active LSMs in unemployment aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unemployed LSMs aged 36-55</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unem</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Unem</td>
<td>9.6</td>
<td>9.7</td>
<td>0.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unem</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>-1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Unem</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>-3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;BV</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>265</td>
<td>-56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unem</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>-3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Unem</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>-0.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
Table 4.13: % economically active LSMs in self-employment aged 36-55 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self-employed LSMs aged 36-55</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>-45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-emp</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% S-E</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>28.1</td>
<td>11.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EA 36-55</td>
<td>285</td>
<td>266</td>
<td>-19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-emp</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% S-E</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>7.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% S-E</td>
<td>16.5</td>
<td>21.5</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study

Table 4.17: % LSM outright home owners aged 46-65 in 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outright owner LSMs aged 46-65</th>
<th>In-migrants</th>
<th>LT pop</th>
<th>England &amp; Wales</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cornwall</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All 46-65</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owns</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>124</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Owns</td>
<td>13.2</td>
<td>52.8</td>
<td>39.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wiltshire</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All 46-65</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>188</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owns</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Owns</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>28.7</td>
<td>19.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WW&amp;V</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All 46-65</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>316</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Owns</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% Owns</td>
<td>13.6</td>
<td>47.2</td>
<td>33.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: ONS Longitudinal Study
Appendices 2

Peoples Panel Survey Questionnaire
Having Your Say On Issues In Cornwall!

PART TWO: INFORMATION ABOUT YOURSELF

1. Are you......

Male □ Female □

2. Your age group......

16 - 24 □ 25 - 34 □ 35 - 44 □ 45 - 54 □ 55 - 64 □ 65+ □

3. Which district do you live in?

Caradon □ Carrick □ Kerrier □
North Cornwall □ Penwith □ Restormel □

4. What is your ethnic group?
Choose ONE section from A to E, then tick the appropriate box to indicate your cultural background.

A) White
□ British
□ Cornish
□ English
□ Scottish
□ Welsh
□ Irish
□ Any other White background, please write in

B) Mixed
□ White and Black Caribbean
□ White and Black African
□ White and Asian
□ Any other Mixed background, please write in
5. With regard to your home, which of the following best describes your situation?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Own your own home outright</th>
<th>Rent from a housing association</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Own your own home with a mortgage</td>
<td>Rent from a private landlord</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rent from the Council</td>
<td>Other (please state below)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Live with family</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6. What type of property do you live in?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Detached house</th>
<th>Detached bungalow</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semi-detached house</td>
<td>Semi-detached bungalow</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Terraced house/bungalow</td>
<td>Flat/maisonette</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caravan/mobile temporary home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

7. How many bedrooms does your property have?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More than 4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. How many people including yourself live in your household? □

9. Is the property .......

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your main or only home</th>
<th>Your second home</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

10. Which of these activities best describes what you are doing at present? Please tick all that apply.

- Employed full-time (31 hours a week or more).............. □
- Employed part-time (16-30 hours a week)................... □
- Self-employed, full-time................................. □
- Self-employed part time................................. □
- Looking after the home................................. □
- Retired.................................................. □
- Unemployed and available for work........................ □
- Permanently sick or disabled............................. □
- Caring for someone........................................ □
- In full-time education..................................... □
- Training (government scheme, apprenticeship etc)....... □
- Other..................................................... □

11. Could you briefly describe your current or most recent job?


12. Do you consider yourself to be disabled?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. Do you suffer from a limiting long-term illness?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Yes</th>
<th>No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>□</td>
<td>□</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cornwall is one of the fastest growing counties in the country which is almost solely the result of migration. Over the ten years between 1991 and 2001 the population increased by almost 33,000 to over 500,000. Over the next 10 years it is estimated to grow by a further 45,000 people. While many people are moving to Cornwall many more are moving house within the Duchy. It is crucial to gain a greater understanding of the social and economic factors associated with the movement of people, both to and within the county, to be able to better predict the current and future needs of the people of Cornwall.
1. Have you lived in Cornwall all of your life?
   Yes ☐  No ☐  (if yes, please go to question 5)

2. If No, in which year did you move to Cornwall?
   Year

3. When you moved to Cornwall......
   Which town or village did you move from?
   Which city or county did you come from?

4. What factors were important in your decision to move to Cornwall? (please tick all that apply)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Factor</th>
<th>☐</th>
<th>☐</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Posted/transferred with job</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred climate</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for retirement</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move near relatives/friends</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preferred environment</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Escape urban rat race</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enjoyed previous holidays</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move out of family home</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move closer to amenities</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for health</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better wages</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better for children</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cheaper housing</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better housing</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Return to homeland</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move closer to work</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move to smaller property</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Move to bigger property</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (please specify)</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. In which year did you move to your present address?
   Year
   Lived here all my life ☐
6. Have you moved house within Cornwall?
   Yes ☐  No ☐ (if no, please go to question 9)

7. When you moved within Cornwall what town or village did you move from?
   Town/village

8. What reasons were important in your decision to move within Cornwall? (please tick all that apply)

   - Posted/transferred with job
   - Better for health
   - Move out of family home
   - Better wages
   - Better for retirement
   - Better for children
   - Move near relatives/friends
   - Cheaper housing
   - Preferred environment
   - Better housing
   - Move closer to amenities
   - Move closer to work
   - Move to bigger property
   - Move to smaller property
   - More modern property
   - Other (please specify)

9. Have you moved house within the last ten years?
   Yes ☐  No ☐ (if yes, please answer question 10)

The remaining questions ask about your situation 10 years ago

10. What type of property did you live in 10 years ago?

   - Detached house
   - Detached bungalow
   - Semi-detached house
   - Semi-detached bungalow
   - Terraced house/bungalow
   - Flat/maisonette
   - Caravan/mobile temporary home
11. How many bedrooms did your property have?

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 or more</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

12. What situation best describes the home you lived in 10 years ago?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Owned outright</th>
<th>Owned with a mortgage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rented privately</td>
<td>Rented from the council</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rented from a housing association</td>
<td>Lived with family</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

13. How many people lived in your household 10 years ago?

Number of people

14. Was the property you lived in 10 years ago......

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Your main or only home</th>
<th>Your second home</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

15. What best describes your economic situation 10 years ago?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Employed full-time (31 hours a week or more)</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employed part-time (16-30 hours a week)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed, full-time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Self-employed part time</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Looking after the home</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Retired</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unemployed and available for work</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Permanently sick or disabled</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Caring for someone</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In full-time education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training (government scheme, apprenticeship etc)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Thank you for taking the time to complete this survey.

Data protection statement – Cornwall County Council is collecting this information for the purposes of undertaking statistical analysis to gain an understanding of specific issues relating to Rights of Way in Cornwall, Waste Management and Migration within Cornwall. This will help to inform future development in these areas of work. Only specified members of the relevant departments will have access to your personal data should you choose to provide it. In accordance with the Data Protection Act, this data will not be disclosed to a third party.

Only non-personalised data will be published in the written report.