

2021-04-15

Spatial distribution of sediment phosphorus in a Ramsar wetland

Crocker, R

<http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/17435>

10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.142749

Science of The Total Environment

Elsevier BV

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

1 ACCEPTED COPY OF MANUSCRIPT

2 AVAILABLE AT:

3 Science of The Total Environment 765:142749-142749 Article number 142749 Apr 2021

4 Spatial distribution of sediment
5 phosphorus in a Ramsar wetland

6 Ry Crocker ^a, William H. Blake ^a, Thomas H. Hutchinson ^a, Sean Comber ^{a*}

7 ^a School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Plymouth, Plymouth, Devon
8 PL4 8AA, UK.

9 * Corresponding author: sean.comber@plymouth.ac.uk

10
11 Abstract

12 Eutrophication is a significant threat to surface water biodiversity worldwide, with excessive
13 phosphorus concentrations being among the most common causes. Wetland ditches under these
14 conditions shift from primarily submerged aquatic vegetation to algae or duckweed dominance,
15 leading to excessive shading and anoxic conditions. Phosphorus, from both point (e.g. wastewater
16 treatment works) and diffuse (largely agricultural runoff) sources, is currently the central reason for
17 failure in the majority of surface water bodies in England to meet required water quality guidelines.
18 This study assesses phosphorus storage in the ditch systems at West Sedgemoor, a designated site of
19 special scientific interest. Elevated phosphorus concentrations in sediment was observed across the
20 Moor up to 4,220 mg Kg⁻¹, almost 10 times that which may be expected from background levels. The
21 highest concentrations were generally observed at the more intensively farmed sites in the north of
22 the moor, near key inlets and the outlet. Based upon their chemical and physical properties, clear
23 distinction was observed between sites outside and within the Royal Society of the Protection of Birds
24 nature reserve, using principal component analysis.

26 Keywords

27 Eutrophication; Managed floodplain; Drainage ditch; Surface sediment geochemistry; Non-point
28 source pollution; Somerset Levels

29 1 Introduction

30 Wetland ecosystems are important worldwide, providing numerous valuable ecological services for
31 people and wildlife. They are biologically diverse habitats serving hydrological functions, including
32 water storage; storm protection and flood mitigation; and water purification. Economically, wetlands
33 benefit water supply; agriculture; fisheries and recreational fishing; tourism; and wetland products
34 such as herbal medicines (Hughes and Heathwaite, 1995; Ramsar Convention Secretariat, 2016).
35 However, wetlands are one of the most threatened ecosystems due to loss and degradation, with 87%
36 lost globally in the last 300 years, and 54% since 1900 (IPBES, 2018). Human activities are the main
37 driver of wetland degradation. Intensified agriculture has seen considerably increased crop and
38 livestock yields across the world, but when managed inappropriately, can cause soil erosion, and
39 eutrophication of aquatic systems via diffuse pollution (IPBES, 2018; Ockenden et al., 2014). Objectives
40 of the European Habitats Directive (Council of the European Communities, 1992) and the Water
41 Framework Directive (WFD) (Council of the European Communities, 2000) demand action to restore
42 waterbodies that are either not meeting good status, WFD, or need to meet favourable conservation
43 status, Habitats Directive. Wetland areas are also protected under the Ramsar Convention (Ramsar
44 Convention, 1994).

45 Eutrophication of surface water is a significant threat to biodiversity worldwide, with excessive
46 phosphorus (P) concentrations being among the most common causes (Comber et al., 2015; Zhang et
47 al., 2017). Surface water systems under these conditions deviate from primarily submerged aquatic
48 vegetation to algae or duckweed dominance, leading to shading and potentially anoxic conditions and
49 therefore deterioration of aquatic ecosystems (Zhang et al., 2017). Heavy shading via surface
50 coverage, and bacterial degradation of excessive amounts of organic matter, produced by algal and
51 duckweed blooms, causes depletion of oxygen in the water column, bringing about fish kills and
52 development of bad odours (Padedda et al., 2017; Riley et al., 2018; Zhang et al., 2017).

53 Significant improvements have been made to reduce the amount of P input from point source
54 discharges to water courses, such as wastewater treatment Works (WwTW), and land management
55 policy is encouraging farming best management practices to reduce biogeochemical flows (Ockenden
56 et al., 2014). Specifically, the linear biogeochemical flow of P from mineral reserves to agriculture and
57 then into catchments and oceans is considered to be exceeding the planetary boundary, thence

58 leading to eutrophication (Carpenter and Bennett, 2011; Ockenden et al., 2014). In arable catchment,
59 surface runoff is an important driver of erosion damage and of fertilizer P export to waterbodies. P
60 contributions from pasture catchment include dissolution of cow manure from overland flow or from
61 subsurface flow (Verheyen et al., 2015). However, wetland managed as waterfowl nature reserve can
62 potentially cause P loading through bird droppings (guanotrophication). Sadly, the degradation and
63 loss of wetlands and other freshwater bodies that were once breeding grounds and migratory
64 stopovers have forced intensified use of the surviving habitat. These large bird populations, relative
65 to the size and/or volume of the waterbody, can have a significant fraction of the internal P load cycling
66 through their diet. Waterfowl have the potential to affect wetland P cycling by altering the form of P
67 and by inputting and/or exporting P to and/or from external areas to the wetland (Adhurya et al.,
68 2020; Scherer et al., 1995).

69 However, measures put in place to reduce P loads discharged to a catchment could be negated as
70 legacy P bound in sediment has the potential to act as a secondary source of P to the water column,
71 following disturbance (Collins and McGonigle, 2008; Van der Perk et al., 2007) or in response to
72 changes in condition of overlying waters (Jarvie et al., 2005; Reynolds, 1992). This ability of sediment
73 to release stored P to the water column could significantly delay the recovery and compliance with
74 water column-based standards, and give rise to algal and duckweed bloom production in excess of
75 what may be expected from external loading alone (Heaney et al., 1992). Therefore, it is crucial to
76 generate data on particulate P storage in sediments in systems that are failing to meet WFD
77 requirements.

78 In this study, the spatial distribution of surface sediment P is examined across West Sedgemoor, a Site
79 of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI) and part of the Somerset Levels and Moors, Ramsar site no. 914.
80 Water quality across a number of sites on the moor has already been shown to exceed the Common
81 Standards Monitoring Guidance for phosphorus ($>0.1 \text{ mg-P l}^{-1}$ as total P) set as part of the Natura 2000
82 series of which include Special Protection Areas (SPAs), designated under the European Birds
83 Directive, and Special Areas of Conservation (SACs), designated under the European Habitats Directive
84 (Council of the European Communities, 1992; European parliament and the council of the European
85 Union, 2009; Taylor et al., 2016). This eutrophication necessitates the requirement to identify the
86 sources of contamination and to put in measures to remediate the situation. Understanding the
87 potential sediment contribution to this overlying water exceedance is crucial and so for the first time
88 a systematic sediment sampling exercise was planned and undertaken.

89 Ditch sediment samples were collected from a range of locations, corresponding with different land
90 uses, from agricultural to Royal Society for the Protection of Birds (RSPB) nature reserve areas. In order

91 to assess potential factors of P loading in sediments, sediments were also analysed for a range of major
92 and minor element constituents and particle size. Multivariate principle component analysis was used
93 to determine whether land use impacts ditch surface sediment geochemistry.

94 2 Material and methods

95 2.1 Study area

96 West Sedgemoor SSSI (51°01'40.8"N 2°54'45.2"W) is an area of the Somerset Levels and Moors
97 Ramsar site and a Special Protection Area (SPA) site in Somerset, England; Fig. 1. This inland wetland
98 has a total area of 10.16 km² and consists of many small, low lying fields and meadows separated by
99 narrow water-filled ditches, locally called rhyes. Water levels and the circulation of water flow on the
100 moor is managed by the Parrett Internal Drainage Board (IDB), although the only water outlet is via
101 West Sedgemoor Pumping Station, discharging to the River Parrett (tidal), which is operated by the
102 Environmental Agency (EA). The site is of a maritime temperate climate, typically 5 m above sea level
103 with the average monthly temperature ranging from 8.3 °C (January) to 21.8 °C (July) with an annual
104 mean temperature of approximately 14.6 °C. The area receives a mean annual precipitation of 708.5
105 mm (Met Office, 2019).

106 Lowland wet grassland in the UK usually consists of reclaimed floodplain land managed as grazing
107 marshes with some being cut for hay or silage (Jefferson and Grice, 1998; Williams, 1970). West
108 Sedgemoor was drained in 1816, making it one of the last moorland reclamations of the Somerset
109 Levels. The surrounding higher ground gave limitations to how the area could be dealt with, this gave
110 a certain unity to the drainage scheme, which other areas in the Levels lacked. Also, the relatively late
111 reclamation meant experience from previous drainage schemes across the Levels could be applied.
112 Dividing the moor nearly in half, the aptly named Middle Rhyne was the first to be implemented on
113 the moor, swiftly followed by the addition of the North Drove Rhyne which was dug parallel to the
114 Middle Rhyne (Williams, 1970). This arterial ditch system is still in operation today; however the
115 pumping station was not constructed until 1944, allowing for stricter control over water levels (Parkin
116 et al., 2004; Williams, 1970).

117 Runoff provides one of the main sources of water to West Sedgemoor, from a relatively small
118 catchment (roughly 41 km²). Widness Rhyne in the west contributes most of the runoff water entering
119 the moor. Other runoff water sources include the North Curry and Stoke St Gregory ridge, draining
120 directly to both Sedgemoor Old Rhyne and West Sedgemoor Main Drain, and Wick Moor (fed also by
121 the River Parrett; nontidal) and Curry Rivel ridge, draining to Wickmoor Rhyne. During the summer, a
122 culvert allows the moor to be supplied with water direct from the River Parrett (nontidal) via the Oath

123 Farm Inlet. Although the area is still often flooded, water levels are lowered in the winter to reduce
124 flood risk by allowing better drainage. However, most watercourses retain low pen level in the interest
125 of conservation efforts and in order to reduce frost damage and bank erosion. Winter target water
126 levels in Raised Water Level Area (RWLA) blocks range from 4.65 m to 5.15 m ODN (Ordnance Datum
127 Newlyn). Outside of RWLAs, winter target water levels range from 4.20 m to ~4.70 m ODN, barring
128 flood events. Circulation of water flow changes drastically in the summer months, the emphasis
129 changing from drainage to irrigation, barring high flood risk conditions (e.g. heavy rainfall). During the
130 period of early April to late November, water levels are allowed to rise in rhynes and ditches. Summer
131 target water levels range from 4.65 m to 5.30 m ODN. These higher levels provide 'wet fences' around
132 fields to contain livestock, maintain the groundwater table for the growing period and continue the
133 watercourse conservation interest (Parrett IDB, 2009).

134 West Sedgemoor is internationally important for supporting wintering waterfowl populations such as
135 Wigeon (*Anas penelope*), Teal (*Anas crecca*) and Lapwing (*Vanellus vanellus*). The moor also supports
136 England's largest breeding population of waders such as Lapwing (*Vanellus vanellus*), Snipe (*Gallinago*
137 *gallinago*) and Curlew (*Numenius arquata*) (Natural England, 2019). Additionally, Fivehead Woods and
138 Meadow on the southern edge of the moor has one of the largest heronries in the UK with more than
139 100 breeding pairs of Grey Heron (*Ardea cinerea*) (Drewitt et al., 2008). West Sedgemoor is also the
140 location for the Great Crane Project aimed to secure the future for the Crane (*Grus grus*) in the UK,
141 after a five year reintroduction was completed in 2015 (The Great Crane Project, 2014). West
142 Sedgemoor Drain, Stathe, to the north of the moor is a recreational fishing site managed by the Taunton
143 Angling Association (TAA). Fish species present include Common Bream (*Abramis brama*), Tench
144 (*Tinca tinca*), European Perch (*Perca fluviatilis*), Common Roach (*Rutilus rutilus*), Northern Pike (*Esox*
145 *Lucius*), Common Carp (*Cyprinus carpio*), Gudgeon (*Gobio gobio*), Rudd (*Scardinius erythrophthalmus*),
146 Sunbleak (*Leucaspius delineatus*), Stone Loach (*Barbatula barbatula*), 3-Spined Stickleback
147 (*Gasterosteus aculeatus*), 10-Spined Stickleback (*Pungitius pungitius*) and Eels (*Anguilla anguilla*)
148 (Environment Agency, 2020). Finally, the site is also rich in rare and scarce invertebrate fauna,
149 particularly water beetles (Drake et al., 2010).

150 2.2 Sampling and chemical analyses

151 Surface sediment samples were collected in March 2018. 59 sampling sites (Fig 2.) were chosen based
152 upon (1) coverage of IDB viewed rhynes and potential inputs (2) site accessibility/access permission
153 (3) minimal disturbance to nature conservation efforts of the RSPB. Samples were collected using a
154 Van Veen Grab sampler and transferred into hydrochloric acid (10% - Fisher Scientific Primar Plus) and

155 Ultra high purity water (>18 Mohm.cm) soaked HDPE 500 ml Nalgene bottles, and stored frozen at -
156 18°C in the dark until further analysis.

157 Once thawed, samples were centrifuged at 4000 rpm for 10 minutes, and the majority of the pore
158 water was poured off. At this stage samples were individually mixed and had subsamples taken for
159 particle size analysis. Roots and other large plant material were either not present or removed from
160 samples manually. These subsamples of sediment were pushed through a stainless steel mesh sieve
161 with a 1.00 mm aperture, and then pretreated with H₂O₂ to remove organic constituents. Particle size
162 analysis was measured using a Malvern Mastersizer 2000. Particle size analysis data was analysed
163 using GRADISTAT (Blott S.J. and Pye K., 2001).

164 The remaining sediment was frozen, freeze-dried, disaggregated and sieved to the <63 µm fraction.
165 Subsamples were then taken, milled and pressed into pellets for analysis using a PANalytical
166 Wavelength Dispersive X-Ray Fluorescence Spectrometer (WD-XRF) (Axios Max); the concentrations
167 of a range of major and minor element constituents (F, Na, Mg, Al, Si, P, S, Cl, K, Ca, Ti, Cr, Mn, Fe, Co,
168 Ni, Cu, Zn, Ga, Br, Rb, Sr, Y, Zr, Nb, Ba, Ce, Pb, As, Au, Bi, Ge, Ir, Mo, Nd, Pr, Se, Tl and V) were measured
169 (Blake et al., 2013). Sites 12, 46 & 50 were unable to be analysed by WD-XRF due to an insufficient
170 amount of <63 µm fraction available.

171 2.3 Principle Component analysis

172 Principal component analysis (PCA) of the WD-XRF and particle size analysis data was conducted using
173 Minitab 17. No outliers were observed from examining the Mahalanobis distances plotted in Fig. A1
174 of the Electronic Supplementary information (ESI) (Brereton, 2015). The grouping of the sites was
175 visualized with a scatterplot of the scores of the second principal component versus the scores of the
176 first principal component. The variables responsible for the grouping of sites were identified by
177 plotting the coefficients of each variable for the first component versus the coefficients for the second
178 component.

179 3 Results and discussion

180 3.1 Spatial phosphorus distribution in sediment

181 The spatial distribution of total phosphorus (TP) in sediments is shown in Fig. 3. The highest TP content
182 of 4220 mg kg⁻¹, around 10 times that which may be expected from background levels (Owens and
183 Walling, 2002), was recorded at site 53 located on the section of Wickmoor Rhyne that intersects
184 Eastern Rhyne, south of the Oath Supply Ditch. Site 30, on the southern end of the Middle Rhyne, had
185 the lowest observed TP concentration of 957 mg kg⁻¹, while the mean concentration for the whole site
186 was 1870 mg kg⁻¹. Higher TP concentrations were generally observed in the north of the moor, near

187 key inlets (sites 33, 35, 51, 53, 54, 56) and the outlet (sites 1 and 2). The mean TP concentration in the
188 north of the site (sites 1-22, 48-57) was 2140 mg kg⁻¹, in the south (sites 23-47, 58 & 59) It was 1560
189 mg kg⁻¹. Lower TP concentrations were generally observed around winter roost sites with a mean
190 concentration of 1460 mg kg⁻¹, compared to 1960 mg kg⁻¹ for the rest of the site. However, most of
191 these winter roost samples are taken from the ditches that outline the boarder of the winter roost
192 sites (Fig A2 of the ESI); this was done to cause minimal disturbance to the roosting birds and the
193 nature conservation efforts of the RSPB. Table 1 compares the TP concentration range, in ditch
194 sediment, of this study to other literature data for similar rural ditch environments. West Sedgemoor
195 had the highest single observed TP sediment concentration, of all the compared sites TP ranges, and
196 the second highest low-end concentration. Even compared to other man-made managed aquatic
197 ecosystems, West Sedgemoor can be considered to have exceedingly high TP concentrations; a study
198 of fishponds in the Czech Republic observed an average sediment TP concentration of 1113.2 mg kg⁻¹
199 ¹, across 28 sites, with a highest concentration of 3020 mg kg⁻¹ (Baxa et al., 2019). Although the
200 analytical method of this study differs from that of the other literature data, previous studies have
201 shown that the methods are equivalent (Blake et al., 2013; Matsunami et al., 2010).

202 3.2 Main factors affecting phosphorus storage in sediment

203 3.2.1 Correlation coefficient analysis

204 The correlation coefficients between P, Fe, S, Al, Ca and % mud (<63 µm) particle size, for West
205 Sedgemoor SSSI, are shown in Table 2. Sediment P was not correlated with Fe (r = 0.169), Al (r = 0.261),
206 Ca (r = -0.051) or % mud (r = -0.066). This varies from data reported for other rivers in England for
207 example where a stronger correlation was observed (Burns et al., 2015) between P and Ca. The
208 reasons for a lack of correlation potentially reflects the varying sources and magnitudes of the
209 elements across the wetland site including agricultural runoff, inflows from the main river, including
210 wastewater treatment works effluents and avian deposition via faeces.

211 Seasonal increases in temperature and biological activity influences internal loading, retention
212 capacity and release mechanisms. Increasing temperatures stimulate mineralisation of organic matter
213 and the release of soluble inorganic phosphate. Increased sediment respiration during mineralization
214 processes causes decline in oxygen and nitrate sediment penetration depth. As oxygen and nitrate
215 have the capability to keep iron in its oxidised form, their decline can cause redox-sensitive release of
216 P. Under oxic conditions, P is bound to Fe(III) compounds; under anoxic conditions, both P and Fe are
217 released to the water column as insoluble Fe(III) compounds are reduced to soluble Fe(II)
218 (Søndergaard et al., 2003). Additionally, low nitrate and high sulphate concentrations, combined with
219 a large supply of biodegradable organic matter, enables dissimilatory sulphate reduction

220 (desulphurication) and sulphide-mediated chemical iron reduction. This sulphide precipitation
221 depletes the amount of Fe available for P binding, influencing both short- and long-term P retention
222 in sediments (Søndergaard et al., 2003; Wu et al., 2019; Zhao et al., 2019). A weak negative correlation
223 was observed between P and S ($r = -0.400$), suggesting a possible S interference in iron-phosphorus
224 cycling by sulphide-mediated chemical iron reduction. However, there is a general lack of significant
225 correlations observed, for the site as a whole, from which to draw conclusions.

226 The study site was therefore split into three designations in order to observe the influence of land
227 management on P storage in sediment. Sites surrounded by RSPB nature reserve land, sites
228 surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve, and sites adjacent to both land that is RSPB nature
229 reserve and land that is not RSPB nature reserve were analysed for correlations as separate groups
230 (Table 3).

231 In surface sediments of sites surrounded by RSPB nature reserve land, P showed significant positive
232 correlations with Fe ($r = 0.682$) and Al ($r = 0.764$) and significant negative correlations with S ($r = -0.905$)
233 and Ca ($r = -0.758$). This suggests P at these sites is primarily stored in the sediment bound to Fe and
234 Al, not Ca. The moderate P-Fe positive correlation along with significant negative correlations between
235 S-P ($r = -0.905$) and S-Fe ($r = -0.894$) suggest that sulphide interference of iron-phosphorus cycling is
236 happening, but Fe concentration is high enough that, in RSPB surrounded sites, Fe storage of P is still
237 a primary pathway (Fig. A3-A7 of the ESI). P retention from coprecipitation with Fe oxides may be
238 more prevalent in RSPB surrounded sites due to a larger influence of rooted macrophyte radial oxygen
239 loss (ROL) induced oxidised chemical conditions in the sediment rhizosphere. Most macrophytes
240 shield against harmful Fe sulphide precipitates via the ROL process, in which the roots release oxygen
241 into the rhizosphere forming protective plaques of Fe oxides (LaFond-Hudson et al., 2018; Smith and
242 Luna, 2013). These Fe oxides would then be available for coprecipitation with P (Petkuvienė et al.,
243 2019). This larger influence of ROL in RSPB surrounded sites may be due to higher S concentrations at
244 these sites and/or the RSPB land management as marsh and wet hay meadow, as this could be
245 supporting a larger amount of macrophytes and/or macrophytes species with higher radial oxygen
246 rates (Smith and Luna, 2013). Many of the plant species at West Sedgemoor are described in Table A1
247 of the ESI.

248 Surface sediments of sites surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve showed less significant
249 correlations than in RSPB surrounded sites. P concentrations were not correlated to Fe ($r = -0.120$), Al
250 ($r = -0.012$), Ca ($r = 0.174$) or % mud ($r = -0.263$). A weak negative correlation was observed between
251 P and S ($r = -0.400$) and a moderate positive correlation between Fe and S ($r = 0.659$) suggest that
252 sulphide interference of iron-phosphorus cycling is occurring (Fig. A8 and A9 of the ESI). A potentially

253 high input of organic matter, such as cow manure from pasture or leaf-fall from arable land withy
254 (willow) beds, could be increasing mineralisation, decreasing oxygen and nitrate sediment penetration
255 depth and subsequently enabling sulphide-mediated chemical iron reduction, at these sites. Sulphide
256 interference of P retention from coprecipitation with Fe oxides may be more prevalent in sites
257 surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve due to less rooted macrophyte ROL. As this land
258 is typically managed as agricultural pasture, it could be supporting a smaller amount of macrophytes
259 and/or species with lower radical oxygen rates than the marsh and wet hay meadow managed RSPB
260 land. However, it is unclear what mechanisms affect P storage for sites that don't boarder RSPB land.

261 Surface sediments of sites adjacent to both land that is RSPB nature reserve and land that is not RSPB
262 nature reserve showed less significant correlations than in RSPB surrounded sites and sites that don't
263 boarder RSPB land. Therefore, the sites bordering both types of land are relatively more different from
264 each other geochemically, which suggests that the dominate land management influence varies for
265 these sites. P showed a significant moderate positive correlation with Fe ($r = 0.635$) (Fig. A10 of the
266 ESI). P concentrations were not correlated to S ($r = -0.009$), Al ($r = 0.124$), Ca ($r = -0.007$) or % mud ($r =$
267 0.213). This suggests P at these sites is primarily stored in the sediment bound to Fe, not Al or Ca.

268 As sites surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve had no significant positive correlations
269 between P and the selected parameters, it indicates that these sites have a lower chemical ability to
270 bound P in the sediment when compared to sites surrounded by or partially adjacent to RSPB nature
271 reserve land. Correlations between P and Fe, indicating P bound to Fe(III) compounds and a greater
272 chemical ability to bound P, was observed in sites surrounded by or partially adjacent to RSPB nature
273 reserve land.

274 The lack of significant correlations observed for % mud ($< 63 \mu\text{m}$) in the correlation coefficient analysis,
275 is most likely due to the lack of variance in particle size of the sediments. Fig. 4 is a sand, silt and clay
276 trigon (SSC trigon) showing sediment classification schemes based on the relative percentages of sand,
277 silt and clay (Blott S.J. and Pye K., 2001). Most sediment samples were classified as sandy silt with only
278 four sites being classified as silty sand. Of the silty sand sites, 46 and 50 were unable to be analysed
279 by WD-XRF due to an insufficient amount of $<63 \mu\text{m}$ fraction available; sites 31 and 57 are located at
280 opposite ends of the West Sedgemoor, so it's unlikely their increased particle size is linked. Localised
281 bank collapses could be a possible explanation for these sites having coarser sediment. A relatively
282 consistent particle size distribution suggests that variance in the P concentrations across the site
283 cannot be attributed to a bias towards higher concentrations being associated with finer sediment
284 (Capasso et al., 2020; Xiao et al., 2013).

285 3.2.2 Principal components analysis

286 A principal component analysis was conducted to determine whether the three designations of
287 sample sites (sites surrounded by RSPB nature reserve land, A; sites surrounded by land that is not
288 RSPB nature reserve, B; and sites adjacent to both land that is RSPB nature reserve and land that is
289 not RSPB nature reserve, C) could be distinguished from each other using their chemical and physical
290 properties. The first principal component explains 28.3% of the variation (Eigenvalue = 11.309) and is
291 mainly based on Al, Si, S, Cl, K, Ti, Br, Sr, Y and Zr (factor loadings = -0.273, -0.289, 0.274, 0.259, -0.213,
292 -0.284, 0.262, 0.246, -0.248 and -0.226, respectively). The second principal component explains 8.5%
293 of the variation and is mainly based on Na, Mg, K, Ca, Fe, Co, Cu, Ga, Rb, Ge and Ir (factor loadings =
294 -0.239, 0.200, 0.246, -0.227, 0.234, 0.220, 0.211, 0.208, 0.410, 0.205 and -0.208, respectively). Eigen
295 values, explained variance and cumulative variance of subsequent principal components is provided
296 in Table A2 of the ESI.

297 The principal component analysis score plot of West Sedgemoor SSSI surface sediment sample sites
298 (Fig. 5a) is shown based on chemical and physical differences illustrated in the accompanying loading
299 plot (Fig. 5b). A clear distinction can be seen between sites surrounded by RSPB nature reserve land
300 and sites surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve, based on separation along the first
301 principal component axis. Sites of group A are generally positively correlated with the first principal
302 component, although site 37 appears to be an outlier in this case. Sites of group B are generally
303 negatively correlated with the first principal component. This suggests that land management
304 influences ditch surface sediment geochemistry, which could have the potential to affect P storage in
305 sediments. However, sites of group C are spread relatively evenly across the first principle component
306 axis, most likely owing to the groups varying land management influences. This shows that some group
307 C sites are more similar to group A sites than others, suggesting that certain sites are less influenced
308 by land that is not RSPB nature reserve than others, and vice versa. Group A sites were characterised
309 by relatively higher concentrations of S, Br, Cl and Sr, whereas the group B sites had higher Si, Ti, Al
310 and Y (Fig. 5b). Of these, S and Cl are likely associated with avian guano input on RSPB nature reserve
311 land (Chen et al., 2020; Schnug et al., 2018), while Sr has been reported to accumulate in egg shells
312 which suggests an input from migratory breeding (Kitowski et al., 2014; Mora et al., 2007). Si, Ti and
313 Al are related to terrigenous watershed input (Sabatier et al., 2014), whereas Y is present in
314 agricultural fertilisers which can cause diffuse pollution of rare earth elements in runoff and surface
315 water in rural areas (Möller et al., 2014; Otero et al., 2005). This suggests that Si, Ti, Al and Y are
316 enriched in the group B sites due to soil runoff. Although correlation coefficient analysis indicated that
317 group B sites have a lower chemical ability to bound P in the sediment, compared to groups A and C,
318 P has a weak negative loading on the first component which suggests that P concentrations tend to

319 be slightly higher outside of the RSPB nature reserve (Fig. 5b). This suggests that higher P
320 concentrations at group B sites is due to higher P input from the surrounding agricultural land.
321 However, the P concentrations did not significantly differ between the site groups (Table A4, ESI).

322 4 Conclusions

323 The main findings of the research are as follows:

- 324 • The analysis of total phosphorus (TP) in sediments show that all the sites have elevated
325 concentrations, with sites in the north of the moor, near key inlets and the outlet generally
326 showing the highest concentrations. Mean TP concentration in the north of the site (sites 1-
327 22, 48-57) was 2140 mg kg⁻¹, in the south (sites 23-47, 58 & 59) it was 1560 mg kg⁻¹.
- 328 • Based on correlation coefficient analysis, sediments phosphorus storage mechanisms vary
329 across the site depending on the influence of differing land management between Royal
330 Society of the Protection of Birds (RSPB) nature reserve and privately owned land. Correlations
331 between P and Fe, indicating P bound to Fe(III) compounds and a greater chemical ability to
332 bound P, was observed in sites surrounded by or partially adjacent to RSPB nature reserve
333 land. As opposed to sites surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve that had no
334 significant positive correlations between P and the selected parameters. Also, the lack of
335 significant correlations observed for % mud (< 63 µm) in the correlation coefficient analysis,
336 is most likely due to the lack of variance in particle size of the sediments.
- 337 • Principal component analysis showed clear distinction between sites surrounded by RSPB
338 nature reserve land and sites surrounded by land that is not RSPB nature reserve, based upon
339 their chemical and physical properties. RSPB nature reserve land surrounded sites were
340 characterised by relatively higher concentrations of S, Br, Cl and Sr, whereas sites surrounded
341 by land that is not RSPB nature reserve had higher Si, Ti, Al and Y concentrations. This suggests
342 that differing land management between Royal Society of the Protection of Birds (RSPB)
343 nature reserve and privately owned (e.g. agricultural) land influences ditch surface sediment
344 geochemistry, which could have the potential to affect P storage in sediments. P has a weak
345 negative loading on the first component suggesting that P concentrations tend to be slightly
346 higher outside of the RSPB nature reserve.

347 Acknowledgements

348 This study was financially supported by a PhD studentship funded by the University of Plymouth, UK;
349 Natural England, UK; and Wessex Water, UK. The authors gratefully acknowledge; co-sponsor contacts
350 Mark Taylor (Natural England), Chris Tattersall and John Bagnall (Wessex Water); Harry Paget-Wilkes

351 at the Royal Society for the Protection of Birds for allowing access to the nature reserve at West
352 Sedgemoor SSSI and sharing expert knowledge of the site; Phil Brewin at the Somerset Drainage
353 Boards Consortium for sharing expert knowledge of the site; Alex Taylor at the University of Plymouth
354 Consolidated Radio-isotope Facility (CORIF) for analytical expertise. The authors declare that there is
355 no conflict of interest.

356 References

- 357 Adhurya, S., Das, S., Ray, S., 2020. Guantrophication by Waterbirds in Freshwater Lakes: A Review
358 on Ecosystem Perspective, in: Springer Proceedings in Mathematics and Statistics. Springer, pp.
359 253–269. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-0422-8_22
- 360 Baxa, M., Šulcová, J., Kröpfelová, L., Pokorný, J., Potužák, J., 2019. The quality of sediment in shallow
361 water bodies – Long-term screening of sediment in Czech Republic. A new perspective of
362 nutrients and organic matter recycling in agricultural landscapes. *Ecol. Eng.* 127, 151–159.
363 <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2018.11.009>
- 364 Blake, W., Comber, S., Burns, E.E., Goddard, R., Dougal, M., Taylor, A., Couldrick, L., 2013. Spatial and
365 geochemical distribution of particulate P in river sediments impacted by DWPA and urban and
366 industrial effluent., University of Plymouth Catchment and River Science (CARiS) research group
367 report for Westcountry Rivers Trust.
- 368 Blott S.J., Pye K., 2001. GRADISTAT: a grain size distribution and statistics package for the analysis of
369 unconsolidated sediments. *Earth Surf. Process. Landforms* 26, 1237–1248.
- 370 Brereton, R.G., 2015. The Mahalanobis distance and its relationship to principal component scores. *J.*
371 *Chemom.* 29, 143–145. <https://doi.org/10.1002/cem.2692>
- 372 Burns, E.E., Comber, S., Blake, W., Goddard, R., Couldrick, L., 2015. Determining riverine sediment
373 storage mechanisms of biologically reactive phosphorus in situ using DGT. *Environ. Sci. Pollut.*
374 *Res.* 22, 9816–9828. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-015-4109-3>
- 375 Capasso, J., Bhadha, J.H., Bacon, A., Vardanyan, L., Khatiwada, R., Pachon, J., Clark, M., Lang, T.,
376 2020. Influence of flow on phosphorus-dynamics and particle size in agricultural drainage ditch
377 sediments. *PLoS One* 15, e0227489. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0227489>
- 378 Carpenter, S.R., Bennett, E.M., 2011. Reconsideration of the planetary boundary for phosphorus.
379 *Environ. Res. Lett.* 6, 014009.
- 380 Chen, Y., Shen, L., Huang, T., Chu, Z., Xie, Z., 2020. Transformation of sulfur species in lake sediments

381 at Ardley Island and Fildes Peninsula, King George Island, Antarctic Peninsula. *Sci. Total Environ.*
382 703. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.135591>

383 Collins, A.L., McGonigle, D.F., 2008. Monitoring and modelling diffuse pollution from agriculture for
384 policy support : UK and European experience. *Environ. Sci. Policy* 11, 97–101.

385 Comber, S., Gardner, M., Darmovzalova, J., Ellor, B., 2015. Determination of the forms and stability
386 of phosphorus in wastewater effluent from a variety of treatment processes. *J. Environ. Chem.*
387 *Eng.* 3, 2924–2930.

388 Council of the European Communities, 2000. Directive 2000/60/EC of the European Parliament and
389 of the Council of 23 October 2000 establishing a framework for Community action in the field
390 of water policy. *Off. J. Eur. Communities* 43, 1–73.

391 Council of the European Communities, 1992. Council Directive 92/43/EEC of 21 May 1992 on the
392 conservation of natural habitats and of wild fauna and flora. *Off. J. Eur. Communities* 35, 7–50.

393 Drake, C.M., Stewart, N.F., Palmer, M.A., Kindemba, V.L., 2010. The ecological status of ditch
394 systems: an investigation into the current status of the aquatic invertebrate and plant
395 communities of grazing marsh ditch systems in England and Wales Technical Report.
396 Peterborough.

397 Drewitt, A., Evans, T., Grice, P., 2008. Natural England Research Report NERR015 A review of the
398 ornithological interest of SSSIs in England. Sheffield, UK.

399 Environment Agency, 2020. Ecology & Fish Data Explorer [WWW Document]. NFPD (National Fish
400 Popul. Database). URL <https://environment.data.gov.uk/ecology-fish/> (accessed 8.5.20).

401 European parliament and the council of the European Union, 2009. Directive 2009/147/EC of the
402 European Parliament and of the Council of 30 November 2009 on the conservation of wild
403 birds 7–25.

404 Heaney, S.I., Corry, J.E., Lishman, J.P., 1992. Changes of water quality and sediment phosphorus of a
405 small productive lake following decreased phosphorus loading, in: Sutcliffe, D.W., Jones, J.G.
406 (Eds.), *Eutrophication: Research and Application to Water Supply*. Freshwater Biological
407 Association, pp. 119–131.

408 Hughes, J.M.R., Heathwaite, A.L., 1995. Introduction, in: Hughes, J.M.R., Heathwaite, A.L. (Eds.),
409 *Hydrology and Hydrochemistry of British Wetlands*. John Wiley & Sons, Inc., Chinchester, UK,
410 pp. 1–8.

411 IPBES, 2018. Summary for policymakers of the thematic assessment report on land degradation and
412 restoration of the Intergovernmental Science-Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem
413 Services. IPBES secretariat, Bonn, Germany.

414 Jarvie, H.P., Jürgens, M.D., Williams, R.J., Neal, C., Davies, J.J.L., Barrett, C., White, J., 2005. Role of
415 river bed sediments as sources and sinks of phosphorus across two major eutrophic UK river
416 basins: The Hampshire Avon and Herefordshire Wye. *J. Hydrol.* 304, 51–74.

417 Jefferson, R.G., Grice, P. V., 1998. The conservation of lowland wet grassland in England, in: Joyce,
418 C.B., Wade, P.M. (Eds.), *European Wet Grasslands: Biodiversity, Management and Restoration*.
419 John Wiley & Sons, Chichester, pp. 31–48.

420 Kitowski, I., Sujak, A., Wiącek, D., Strobel, W., Rymarz, M., 2014. Trace element residues in eggshells
421 of Grey Heron (*Ardea cinerea*) from colonies of East Poland. *J. Zool.* 10, 346–354.

422 LaFond-Hudson, S., Johnson, N.W., Pastor, J., Dewey, B., 2018. Iron sulfide formation on root
423 surfaces controlled by the life cycle of wild rice (*Zizania palustris*). *Biogeochemistry* 141, 95–
424 106. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-018-0491-5>

425 Matsunami, H., Matsuda, K., Yamasaki, S., Kimura, K., Ogawa, Y., Miura, Y., Yamaji, I., Tsuchiya, N.,
426 2010. Rapid simultaneous multi-element determination of soils and environmental samples
427 with polarizing energy dispersive X-ray fluorescence (EDXRF) spectrometry using pressed
428 powder pellets. *Soil Sci. Plant Nutr.* 56, 530–540. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-0765.2010.00489.x)
429 [0765.2010.00489.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1747-0765.2010.00489.x)

430 Met Office, 2019. Yeovilton climate information - Met Office [WWW Document]. URL
431 <https://www.metoffice.gov.uk/public/weather/climate/gcn45vme7> (accessed 3.5.19).

432 Möller, P., Knappe, A., Dulski, P., 2014. Seasonal variations of rare earths and yttrium distribution in
433 the lowland Havel River, Germany, by agricultural fertilization and effluents of sewage
434 treatment plants. *Appl. Geochemistry* 41, 62–72.

435 Mora, M.A., Taylor, R.J., Brattin, B.L., 2007. Potential ecotoxicological significance of elevated
436 concentrations of strontium in eggshells of passerine birds. *Condor* 109, 199–205.

437 Natural England, 2019. European Site Conservation Objectives: Supplementary advice on conserving
438 and restoring site features Somerset Levels and Moors Special Protection Area (SPA) Site Code:
439 UK9010031.

440 Ockenden, M.C., Deasy, C., Quinton, J.N., SurrIDGE, B., Stoate, C., 2014. Keeping agricultural soil out
441 of rivers: Evidence of sediment and nutrient accumulation within field wetlands in the UK. *J.*

442 Environ. Manage. 135, 54–62.

443 Otero, N., Vitòria, L., Soler, A., Canals, A., 2005. Fertiliser characterisation: Major, trace and rare
444 earth elements. *Appl. Geochemistry* 20, 1473–1488.

445 Owens, P.N., Walling, D.E., 2002. The phosphorus content of fluvial sediment in rural and
446 industrialized river basins. *Water Res.* 36, 685–701.

447 Padedda, B.M., Sechi, N., Lai, G.G., Mariani, M.A., Pulina, S., Sarria, M., Satta, C.T., Viridis, T.,
448 Buscarinu, P., Lugliè, A., 2017. Consequences of eutrophication in the management of water
449 resources in Mediterranean reservoirs: A case study of Lake Cedrino (Sardinia, Italy). *Glob. Ecol.*
450 *Conserv.* 12, 21–35.

451 Parkin, G., Birkinshaw, S., Benyon, P., Humphries, N., Bentley, M., Gilman, K., 2004. Water availability
452 and budgets for wetland restoration and recreation sites - BD1316. DEFRA.

453 Parrett IDB, 2009. West Sedgemoor and Wick Moor Water Level Management Plan. Parrett Internal
454 Drainage Board.

455 Petkuvienė, J., Vaiciute, D., Katarzyte, M., Gecaite, I., Rossato, G., Vybernaite-Lubiene, I., Bartoli, M.,
456 2019. Feces from Piscivorous and Herbivorous Birds Stimulate Differentially Phytoplankton
457 Growth. *Water* 11, 2567. <https://doi.org/10.3390/w11122567>

458 Ramsar Convention, 1994. Present text of the Convention on Wetlands.

459 Ramsar Convention Secretariat, 2016. An Introduction to the Convention on Wetlands, 7th ed.
460 Ramsar Convention Secretariat, Gland, Switzerland.

461 Reynolds, C.S., 1992. Eutrophication and the management of planktonic algae: what Vollenweider
462 couldn't tell us, in: Sutcliffe, D.W., Jones, J.G. (Eds.), *Eutrophication: Research and Application*
463 *to Water Supply*. Freshwater Biological Association, pp. 4–29.

464 Riley, W.D., Potter, E.C.E., Biggs, J., Collins, A.L., Jarvie, H.P., Jones, J.I., Kelly-Quinn, M., Ormerod,
465 S.J., Sear, D.A., Wilby, R.L., Broadmeadow, S., Brown, C.D., Chanin, P., Copp, G.H., Cowx, I.G.,
466 Grogan, A., Hornby, D.D., Huggett, D., Kelly, M.G., Naura, M., Newman, J.R., Siriwardena, G.M.,
467 2018. Small Water Bodies in Great Britain and Ireland: Ecosystem function, human-generated
468 degradation, and options for restorative action. *Sci. Total Environ.* 645, 1598–1616.

469 Sabatier, P., Poulenard, J., Fangeta, B., Reyss, J.L., Develle, A.L., Wilhelm, B., Ployon, E., Pignol, C.,
470 Naffrechoux, E., Dorioz, J.M., Montuelle, B., Arnaud, F., 2014. Long-term relationships among
471 pesticide applications, mobility, and soil erosion in a vineyard watershed. *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci.*

472 U. S. A. 111, 15647–15652.

473 Scherer, N.M., Gibbons, H.L., Stoops, K.B., Muller, M., 1995. Phosphorus loading of an urban lake by
474 bird droppings. *Lake Reserv. Manag.* 11, 317–327.
475 <https://doi.org/10.1080/07438149509354213>

476 Schnug, E., Jacobs, F., Stöven, K., 2018. Guano: The White Gold of the Seabirds, in: Mikkola, H. (Ed.),
477 Seabirds. InTechOpen, pp. 79–100.

478 Smith, K.E., Luna, T.O., 2013. Radial oxygen loss in wetland plants: Potential impacts on remediation
479 of contaminated sediments. *J. Environ. Eng. (United States)* 139, 496–501.
480 [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)EE.1943-7870.0000631](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)EE.1943-7870.0000631)

481 Søndergaard, M., Jensen, J.P., Jeppesen, E., 2003. Role of sediment and internal loading of
482 phosphorus in shallow lakes. *Hydrobiologia* 506–509, 135–145.

483 Taylor, A., Comber, S., Blake, W., 2016. An investigation into the temporal and spatial patterns of
484 phosphorus concentrations across the ditch system of West Sedgemoor SSSI, University of
485 Plymouth Catchment and River Science (CARIS) research group report for Natural England.

486 The Great Crane Project, 2014. Annual Report 2014 Release Year (Year 5 of 5).

487 Van der Perk, M., Owens, P.N., Deeks, L.K., Rawlins, B.G., Haygarth, P.M., Beven, K.J., 2007. Controls
488 on catchment-scale patterns of phosphorus in soil, streambed sediment, and stream water. *J.*
489 *Environ. Qual.* 36, 694–708.

490 Verheyen, D., Van Gaelen, N., Ronchi, B., Batelaan, O., Struyf, E., Govers, G., Merckx, R., Diels, J.,
491 2015. Dissolved phosphorus transport from soil to surface water in catchments with different
492 land use. *Ambio* 44, 228–240. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13280-014-0617-5>

493 Williams, M., 1970. *The Draining of the Somerset Levels*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.

494 Wu, S., Zhao, Y., Chen, Y., Dong, X., Wang, M., Wang, G., 2019. Sulfur cycling in freshwater
495 sediments: A cryptic driving force of iron deposition and phosphorus mobilization. *Sci. Total*
496 *Environ.* 657, 1294–1303.

497 Xiao, Y., Zhu, X.L., Cheng, H.K., Li, K.J., Lu, Q., Liang, D.F., 2013. Characteristics of phosphorus
498 adsorption by sediment mineral matrices with different particle sizes. *Water Sci. Eng.* 6, 262–
499 271. <https://doi.org/10.3882/j.issn.1674-2370.2013.03.003>

500 Zhang, W., Zhu, X., Jin, X., Meng, X., Tang, W., Shan, B., 2017. Evidence for organic phosphorus
501 activation and transformation at the sediment–water interface during plant debris

502 decomposition. *Sci. Total Environ.* 583, 458–465.

503 Zhao, Y., Zhang, Z., Wang, G., Li, X., Ma, J., Chen, S., Deng, H., Annalisa, O.-H., 2019. High sulfide
504 production induced by algae decomposition and its potential stimulation to phosphorus
505 mobility in sediment. *Sci. Total Environ.* 650, 163–172.

506