Faculty of Science and Engineering

School of Biological and Marine Sciences

2020-12

Survived but not safe: Marine heatwave hinders metabolism in two gastropod survivors

Hemraj, DA

http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/16257

10.1016/j.marenvres.2020.105117 Marine Environmental Research Elsevier BV

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

2	Survived but not safe: marine heatwave hinders metabolism in two gastropod survivors	
3		
4	Deevesh A. Hemraj ¹ , Natasha C. Posnett ² , Jay J. Minuti ¹ , Louise B. Firth ³ , Bayden D. Russell ^{1*}	
5		
6	¹ The Swire Institute of Marine Science and School of Biological Sciences, The University of	
7	Hong Kong, Pokfulam Road, Hong Kong SAR, China	
8	² School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake	
9	Circus, Plymouth, PL4 8AA, UK	
10	³ School of Biological and Marine Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake Circus, Plymouth,	
11	PL4 8AA, UK	
12		
13	*corresponding author: brussell@hku.hk	
14		
15	Keywords: Marine heatwave; magnitude; mortality rate; metabolic regulation; thermal history	
16	Highlights:	
17 18	• Two marine gastropods (<i>T. sacellum</i> and <i>A. haematragum</i>) survived moderate marine	
19	heatwave but perished under extreme heatwave conditions.	
20	Surviving heatwaves instigated ongoing physiological costs and non-adaptive metabolic depression	
21	 Post-heatwave recovery will be key for species persistence under increasing heatwave 	
23	frequency.	
24		
25		

26 Graphical abstract



40

41 Abstract

Marine heatwaves (MHWs) are an emerging threat to marine organisms that have increased in 42 frequency and magnitude in the past decade. These extreme heating events can have differential 43 impacts for organisms with some experiencing mortality while others survive. Here, we 44 45 experimentally exposed two species of subtidal gastropod (Trochus sacellum and Astralium haematragum) to two realistic intensities of MHW to test the ability of different species to 46 physiologically cope with extreme heating events. Extreme MHW conditions caused 100% 47 48 mortality in both species within five days. In contrast, both species showed evidence of nonadaptive metabolic depression under moderate MHW conditions. Both species 49 demonstrated an inability to upregulate their metabolic rates at the higher temperatures 50 following exposure to a MHW (i.e. reduced temperature of maximum metabolic rate; T_{MMR}), 51 suggesting a lack of molecular protective responses and ongoing physiological damage. 52 Therefore, the physiological damage endured by heatwave survivors may lessen their ability to 53 54 cope with subsequent stress until fully recovered. Repairing this damage may have serious repercussions for the rate of recovery of these normally resilient species and their ability to 55 maintain their ecological functions post MHW, especially under the predicted increasing 56 frequency, duration and magnitude of MHWs. 57 58

- 59
- 60
- 61
- 62
- 63

64

65 66

67 **1. Introduction**

Marine heatwaves (MHWs) are recognised as major threats to biodiversity because they drive 68 69 mass mortality of organisms (Garrabou et al., 2009; Le Nohaïc et al., 2017), changes in species geographical distribution (Wernberg et al., 2016; Lonhart et al., 2019; Sanford et al., 2019), 70 71 and re-organisation of community composition (Arafeh-Dalmau et al., 2019; Brodeur et al., 72 2019). The overarching effect of MHWs on biodiversity is dependent not only on the duration and magnitude of thermal stress but also on the sensitivity of the organisms themselves 73 (Frölicher and Laufkötter, 2018; Leung et al., 2019). Since tolerance to thermal stress is 74 75 associated with the ability to regulate aerobic capacity and maintain physiological homeostasis (Madeira, 2018 a), interspecific discrepancies in the effects of MHWs exist whereby some 76 species are resistant or resilient, while others are sensitive (Leung et al, 2019). Thus, some 77 78 species can be categorised as 'winners' for exhibiting adaptive phenotypic plasticity in response to MHWs (Cavole et al., 2016; Watson, 2018) while others will be 'losers' when they 79 are unable to tolerate acute warming and die. 80

81

While different magnitudes of heat stress from MHWs can be lethal for some species, the activation of physiological pathways associated with aerobic metabolism and cellular stress response allow others to be resistant or resilient to thermal stress (Leung et al., 2019). Speciesspecific regulation of physiological mechanisms to cope with stress under heatwaves are present even among species from the same habitat (Bernal et al., 2020). Additionally, the metabolic pathways that are activated to tolerate or survive thermal stress, such as cellular

metabolism, cholesterol metabolism, or activation of the complement system (a component of
immune response), will differ among surviving species (Bernal et al., 2020). However, the
regulation of molecular mechanisms is energetically costly and, consequently, increases in
thermal tolerance come with the requirement of balancing responses with energy reserves and
enhancement in energy intake and assimilation following the heat stress (Giomi et al., 2016;
Leung et al., 2019).

94

95 "The capacity of an organism to physiologically adjust in response to fluctuating environmental 96 temperatures depends largely on their natural realised thermal windows, and whether they are able to both display thermally compensated respiratory functions, as well as extend their lethal 97 temperature thresholds (Sandblom et al., 2016). Depending on the duration and magnitude of 98 a heatwave, the thermotolerance strategy employed by a species, the associated energetic costs, 99 and the ability of different species to regulate metabolism and energy assimilation after a MHW 100 will lead to different physiological consequences during and post-MHW. It is generally 101 102 accepted that sensitivity of an organism to environmental change and capacity for thermal acclimation is determined by environmental selection pressure, which is often correlated with 103 104 latitude although a wider suite of selective pressures may concurrently be involved (Jupe et al., 105 2020). Generally, species living in more stable tropical environments have greater capacity for chronic thermal acclimation when the rate of onset is slower, whereas those which live in more 106 107 thermally variable environments are more equipped to deal with acute temperature change through physiological plasticity given the range experienced in their natural environment 108 109 (Seebacher et al., 2015). Indeed, predicting the different responses of more tropical and temperate-affiliated species in areas in which their ranges overlap is complex, due to variety in 110 111 thermotolerance mechanisms utilised by functionally similar species (Goldenberg et al., 2018).

Deleted: Given adequate time to acclimate, organisms subjected to high temperatures can be expected to achieve higher lethal temperature limits, but physiological trade-offs or adaptive metabolic depression may also impact other associated physiological processes (Harianto et al., 2018).

An understanding of these responses is of increasing importance for predicting how warming
seas will drive species range shifts and novel biological communities (Donelson et al., 2019;
Sanford et al., 2019; Wernberg et al., 2016).

120

Here, we investigated the effect of different magnitudes of realistic MHW scenarios (moderate 121 122 and extreme; Hobday et al., 2018) on the metabolism and survival of two subtidal gastropods, Trochus sacellum and Astralium haematragum, which co-occur in a tropical-temperate 123 124 transition zone. T. sacellum is widely distributed in tropical and temperate waters between 125 Korea and the Philippines (Batomalaque et al., 2010; Noseworthy and Kwang-Sik, 2010) while A. haematragum is distributed mainly around the cooler waters of Japan (Meyer et al., 2005) 126 and Korea (Noseworthy and Kwang-Sik, 2010), reaching its southern trailing edge near Hong 127 128 Kong. Both T. sacellum and A. haematragum are common subtidal grazers in Hong Kong, where they are exposed to substantial seasonal fluctuations in water temperature. Here, we 129 investigate the capacity of these species with different geographic distributions, and therefore 130 131 evolutionary thermal histories, to regulate their metabolism during heatwave scenarios. We then examine possible interspecific differences in the capacity to regulate metabolism post 132 MHW. We hypothesised that the magnitude of MHW will drive the metabolic rate and survival 133 of gastropods whereby the more tropical species (T. sacellum) will demonstrate greater survival 134 and ability to regulate metabolism under moderate heatwave conditions because of its 135 136 evolutionary history under warmer temperatures, but both species will have elevated mortality under extreme heatwave conditions (i.e. inability to acclimate). Secondly, we hypothesised that 137 the capacity of gastropods to regulate their aerobic metabolism immediately following 138 heatwaves will be impaired because of the heatwave induced physiological damage. We predict 139 140 this reduced function will be more prominent in the more tropical species (T. sacellum) because

while tropical species are thought to live closer to their upper thermal limits, the stable conditions mean they have a smaller thermal safety margin and are more likely to endure high physiological damage under subsequent stress, possibly leading to death. The physiological state of these organisms post-MHW will have large repercussions for their ability to maintain grazing, their key functional role in the ecosystem. Therefore, unravelling the consequences of MHWs on their physiological state is key to understanding their ability for enduring environmental stress, to recover, and to maintain their ecological function post MHW.

148

149 **2.** Methods

150 2.1 Organism collection

Individuals of *Trochus sacellum* and *Astralium haematragum* were collected from the subtidal waters of Bluff island, Hong Kong (22°19'18.0" N 114°21'18.2" E), by SCUBA diving, in summer so that they were seasonally acclimated to warm summer conditions. Organisms were brought to the laboratory and allowed to acclimate to laboratory conditions for a period of 24 hours at 28°C (ambient water temperature during collection) in aquaria fitted with an open flow-through system providing clean filtered seawater to acclimate to laboratory conditions.

157

158 2.2 Experiment 1: MHW simulation

To start the heatwave treatment, replicate aquaria (12 L) were maintained at 28°C (ambient control), or gradually increased to 31°C (moderate heatwave) or 34°C (extreme heatwave) (n = 3 aquaria per treatment, n = 6 individuals per aquarium) over 24 hours using flow-through systems to pump pre-heated water into experimental aquaria. These temperatures were chosen to elucidate current summer conditions (control: Fig. 1) and predicted future heatwave conditions under climate change. Temperatures were then maintained for seven days using

flow-through heater/chiller units (Hailea, Model HC.2200BH) and water temperature was 165 monitored twice daily. Daily checks were made to record any mortality and dead individuals 166 were removed and not replaced. After the 7-day heatwave treatments, metabolic rates of 167 organisms were measured at treatment conditions (see "Metabolic rate" below) before 168 temperatures were gradually reduced back to 28°C over 24 hours. Following the 24-hour 169 170 recovery, all individuals were used in thermal ramps (see below). Gastropods were fed ad libitum with filamentous turf-algae naturally growing on rocks collected from field for the 171 172 duration of the experiment.

173

174 2.3 Metabolic rate

Metabolic rates of individuals were measured both prior to exposure to (i.e. all at 28 °C) and 175 176 after the seven days of heatwave exposure (i.e., at 28°C, 31°C, or 34°C). Metabolism was measured as change in oxygen concentration in sealed air-tight glass respirometry chambers 177 containing an oxygen sensor spot (PreSens SP-PSt3-YAU). Chambers were placed into a large 178 179 water bath at experimental temperature to maintain temperature constant throughout measurements, with a magnetic stirrer in each chamber used to ensure water was thoroughly 180 mixed throughout measurements. One individual organism was placed into each chamber 181 which was sealed under water ensuring that no air bubbles were present. Organisms were 182 allowed to rest for five minutes, after which oxygen concentrations were measured every five 183 184 minutes for 30 minutes using a fibre optic meter (Firebox 4 Trace). For each temperature treatment, one blank chamber with no gastropod was used to measure change in oxygen 185 concentration and to take into account any biological activity in the water. Ten individuals per 186 temperature treatment were selected randomly for the respiration measurements (n = 10). Final 187

188 metabolic rate was calculated as the rate of oxygen concentration depletion in seawater as a

189 function of body weight and time $(mgO_2 L^{-1} gfw^{-1} h^{-1})$.

190

191 2.4 Experiment 2: Analysis of post MWH physiology through thermal ramps

Following the 24-hour recovery after heatwave exposure, metabolic rates of six individuals 192 193 from each exposure type (control or heatwave) were measured (n = 6) on a thermal ramp following the same procedure as for metabolic rate measurements. Prior to commencement of 194 195 the thermal ramp, individuals were housed in aquaria in which the temperature had been 196 reduced to 16°C over 24 hours. Thermal ramps had an initial temperature of 16°C (with a ramping rate of 2°C every two hours until mortality, with metabolic rate measured at every 2°C 197 interval. Thermal ramps started at 16 °C because it represents the winter temperature 198 experienced by the organisms and was used to cover their full natural temperature range (Fig. 199 1). Mortality was used as the end point to assess whether acclimation to experimental 200 treatments allowed individuals to increase the temperature of mortality (upper lethal limit: 201 202 ULL). Prior to measuring oxygen consumption, the organisms were allowed to acclimate at each temperature for one hour, after which the respirometry chambers were sealed and oxygen 203 concentration in the chambers were measured every five minutes for 20 minutes. Water 204 205 temperature was regulated using heater/chillers (Hailea, Model HC.2200BH).

206

207 2.5 Data analysis

To test for the effect of heatwaves (control vs. moderate heatwave) on respiration a one-way
permutational analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) was done using Euclidean distance
(n = 10) using Primer 7 + PERMANOVA. Exponentially Modified Gaussian Function (EMG)
models were fitted for temperature ramp data as per Angilletta (2006) to extract the temperature

- at maximum metabolic rate (T_{MMR}), upper lethal limit (ULL), and to model the change in
- 213 metabolic rate over the temperature ramp for both species pre- and post-heatwave exposure.
- 214 An EMG was performed for the thermal ramp dataset from each group independently, based
- the mean and variances within each dataset. EMGs were modelled using RStudio Version1.1.463.
- 217

218 **3. Results**

219 3.1 Mortality

- 220 Mortality of organisms exposed to the extreme heatwave (34°C) was higher than those from
- 221 the moderate heatwave (31°C; Fig. 2). Exposure to extreme heatwave conditions caused 100
- 222 % mortality after three days for *T. sacellum* and five days for *A. haematragum*. Moderate
- 223 heatwave conditions (31°C), caused the same level of mortality for both species, but mortality
- 224 was delayed for A. haematragum; 17% of T. sacellum individuals died after four days followed
- by no further deaths while 17 % of A. haematragum died after six of exposure. There was no
- 226 mortality at current summer temperatures (control; 28°C).
- 227

228 3.2 Metabolic rates

As extreme heatwave conditions caused 100 % mortality, metabolic rates were only obtained for organisms exposed to moderate heatwave and control summer conditions. Contrary to predictions, elevated temperature (31°C) did not cause a rise in metabolic rate of the individuals which survived the moderate heatwave for both *T. sacellum* and *A. haematragum* (Fig. 3, all p > 0.1).

234

235 **3.3 Thermal ramps**

236 Exposure to moderate heatwave conditions caused a change in metabolic rates across thermal ramps for both T. sacellum and A. haematragum compared to individuals kept at control 237 summer temperatures. Metabolism of T. sacellum exposed to control conditions (28°C) 238 remained low between 16°C to 28°C ($Q_{10} = 1.73$), then increased four-fold between 28°C and 239 34°C (Q10 = 14.39; Fig. 4a) before rapidly declining. In contrast, individuals previously 240 241 exposed to moderate heatwave conditions (31°C) displayed nonadaptive metabolic depression (sensu Verberk et al., 2016) across the temperature ramp and did not have an increase in 242 243 metabolic rates at higher temperatures; metabolism remained low between 16°C to 28°C $(Q_{10} = 1.77)$, then decreased between 28°C and 34°C $(Q_{10} = 0.02)$ (Fig. 4a). Metabolic rates of 244 A. haematragum followed a similar trend (16°C to 28°C: Q₁₀ = 1.3 and 0.94 for control and 245 moderate heatwave, respectively; 28°C to 34°C: Q10 = 21.06 and 0.08 for control and moderate 246 247 heatwave, respectively). The T_{MMR} for gastropods exposed to control conditions were 32.6°C and 35.5°C for T. sacellum and A. haematragum, respectively. Exposure to moderate heatwave 248 conditions changed the overall metabolic response to temperature across the thermal ramp, 249 250 reducing the metabolic rates of both species at temperatures above 30°C suggesting nonadaptive metabolic depression (Fig. 4, Table 1). The T_{MMR} of both the temperate (A. 251 haematragum, -9.8°C) and the more tropical species (T. sacellum, -4.0°C) (Table 2) were also 252 reduced following exposure to the moderate heatwave, further suggesting nonadaptive 253 metabolic depression and stress. There was no change in the ULL of either species under the 254 255 different treatments.

256

257 4. Discussion

The impact of heatwaves on the physiology and survival of organisms is generally thought to be dependent on their duration and magnitude, and, just as importantly, on the ability of the

species to cope with thermal stress (Frölicher and Laufkötter 2018). Physiologically coping 260 with thermal stress is, in turn, dependent on factors including the ability to maintain 261 homeostasis of metabolic systems (Sokolova et al., 2012; Giomi et al., 2016; Leung et al., 262 2019). Yet, the efficacy of coping mechanisms vary among even functionally similar species 263 within the same habitat (Bernal et al., 2020). Here, we show that the magnitude of MHW indeed 264 265 influenced the survival of two subtidal marine species with different distributions and evolutionary histories, whereby neither species were able to survive under extreme heatwave 266 267 conditions (+ 6°C above summer temperatures) but only experienced 17 % mortality under the 268 moderate heatwave scenario (+3°C above summer temperatures). There was, however, a difference in the onset of mortality between species with the more tropical T. sacellum 269 270 succumbing to thermal stress more rapidly in both extreme and moderate heatwave scenarios 271 than the more temperate A. haematragum. Theory suggests that thermal tolerance is linked to species geographical distribution (Bozinovic et al., 2011; Seebacher et al., 2014), where more 272 tropical-affinity species experience more stable environments and have narrow thermal 273 274 windows, while temperate species posess the ability to maintain broader thermal windows because they are adapted to greater environmental variation (Stillman and Somero, 2000). We 275 276 found that our tropical species experienced maximum metabolic rate at a lower temperature (T_{MMR}) than the temperate species, which when surpassed, drove the more rapid onset of 277 mortality. Indeed, tropical species are generally thought to live close to their upper thermal 278 279 limits and have a reduced thermal safety margin (Bozinovic et al., 2011). Correspondingly, the consistently higher mortality rate of T. sacellum observed across both heatwave magnitudes 280 281 suggests that it possesses lower capability to withstand high temperatures compared to A. 282 haematragum.

284 Contrary to what is expected under metabolic theory, the metabolic rates of T. sacellum and A. haematragum exposed to moderate MHW were not different to metabolic rates under 285 normal summer temperatures. While this could be interpreted as both species acclimating to 286 moderate MHW conditions (sensu Seebacher et al. 2015), metabolic acclimation is unlikely 287 over the 7-day heatwave. In contrast, the post-MHW thermal ramps revealed that exposure to 288 289 MHWs impeded the capacity of both species to maintain aerobic metabolism at higher temperatures (i.e. nonadaptive metabolic depression), likely driven by thermal stress (Verberk 290 291 et al., 2016). The inability of both species to increase aerobic metabolism at temperatures above 292 30°C in line with individuals from the natural summer conditions (28°C), suggests that both species were undergoing nonadaptive metabolic depression to reduce energetic costs (Jacobson 293 294 et al., 2016). Comparable effects have also been observed in the gastropod Thalotia conica 295 (Leung et al., 2017) and crustaceans Rhynchocinetes durbanensis and Calcinus laevimanus (Madeira et al, 2018b) where although organisms survived thermal stress, they were unable to 296 297 maintain higher respiration at elevated temperatures and their physiological state was severely impacted. Therefore, although T. sacellum and A. haematragum were able to survive the 298 moderate MHW over the shorter term, the physiological costs likely rendered them unable to 299 sustain additional thermal stress because of the increased energetic requirements. 300

301

The observed nonadaptive metabolic depression post-MHW likely results from one of two possible mechanisms. Firstly, the immediate response of thermal stress involves the disruption of systemic oxygen balance (Pörtner, 2001; Pörtner and Knust, 2007; Kassahn et al., 2009), neccesiting increased mitochondrial capacity, or activation of a complementary system to restore normal function (Bernal et al., 2020; Kassahn et al., 2009; Sokolova et al, 2012). These compensatory mechanisms increase energy demands which may lead to severe depletion in

Commented [BR1]: Need entering in the references.

energy reserves (Ganser et al, 2015; Leung et al., 2017; Madeira et al, 2018a). Consequently, 308 following a MHW, surviving individuals may be physiologically impaired, including depleted 309 energy reserves and reduced cellular function (e.g. Madeira et al., 2018b). Such organisms 310 would have a drasticaly reduced capacity to regulate metabolic rates under further stress. 311 Secondly, at the edge of thermal tolerance, compensatory mechanisms may be insuficient to 312 313 maintain aerobic function and a switch to anaerobic function, reducing availability and supply of cellular energy (Kassahn et al., 2009). Such metabolic switches cause cellular damage, 314 315 impaired mitochondrial function, and reduced oxygen delivery capacity (Dimitriadis et al., 316 2012; Leung et al., 2017). While this strategy can limit metabolic costs and enhance short-term survival, it is a maladaptive strategy and reduces the ability of organisms to maintain adequate 317 318 metabolic function under further stress, until partially or fully recovered.

319

We hypothesised that the capacity of the more tropical species (T. sacellum) to tolerate 320 321 heatwaves would be less than the temperate species given the history of stable conditions rather than acute temperature change. A recent meta-analysis of the upper temperature limits of 34 322 323 tropical ectotherms found that under rapid warming the upper lethal temperature range for subtidal organisms (more thermally stable, similar to T. sacellum) was between 37-41°C but 324 325 between 41-52°C for intertidal organisms (more thermally variable, similar to A. haematragum) (Nguyen et al, 2011). As T. sacellum has a more tropical affinity, and therefore 326 evolved under more stable environmental conditions in its realised niche, it may have 327 physiological processes acclimated to tolerate the more stable tropical subtidal conditions and 328 329 hence experienced high mortality in response to rapid thermal stress. While less than 20% of individuals died under the moderate heatwave scenario, longer, or repeated heatwaves could 330 reduce subsequent generations to the point where shifts in invertebrate assemblages occur 331

(Smale et al, 2017), weakening or eliminating their ability to perform their ecological functions
and cascading to more drastic community- or ecosystem-wide changes (Brodeur et al., 2019;
Smale et al, 2017; Wernberg et al, 2013).

Even subtle environmental changes can cause vast shifts within communities, due to 335 intraspecific variation within different populations of a given species (Harley et al., 2017; 336 Wang et al., 2018). In our study, those individuals which did survive the moderate MWH (of 337 both species) were rendered incapable of regulating their metabolic rates at high temperatures. 338 339 Whilst their resting metabolic rate did not change, the maximum temperature theshold limits 340 showed little flexibility to increase (indeed, declined markedly), which ultimately reduced 341 survivability and resulted in a less succesful thermal response strategy (Armstrong et al., 2019). These species, therefore, demonstrate resilience rather than resistance to moderate MHWs 342 (Leung et al., 2019), meaning that they rely on recovering from thermal stress rather than 343 344 coping with it and maintaining function. Under such circumstances, the required recovery period post MHW can play a crucial role in the future survival of both species, which would 345 also be dependent on the type of physiological damage incurred during the MHW. The inability 346 347 to physiologically resist acute heating events has caused extensive range contractions of temperate species, even through singular acute thermal events. For example, the 2015/2016 348 heatwave in southeast Australia saw sea surface temperatures +3-4°C above climatological 349 averages, and observations of numerous fish and invertebrate species were found out of range 350 in Tasman waters (Oliver et al., 2017; Caputi., 2014). This heatwave caused a rapid climate 351 352 driven regime shift, losing the temperate defining kelp forests which were replaced by tropical and subtropical associated species, a community wide tropicalisation event (Wernberg et al., 353 2016). Therefore, the period of exposure to thermal stress, sustained physiological damage and 354 recovery period, and periodicity of recurring MHWs can determine the overlying impact on 355

populations and the wider community (Arias-Ortiz et al., 2018; Madeira et al., 2018b). With 356

the number of MHW days expected to continue increasing over the coming decades (Oliver et 357

al., 2018), and with differences in the adaptive phenotypic plasticity of species with 358

overlapping distributions (Cavole et al., 2016; Watson, 2018), the success in fully recovering 359

from MHW exposure lies at the core of the ability of species to survive, recover, and resume 360

- 361 their ecological functions post-MHW.
- 362

363 Acknowledgements

364 We thank the staff of the Swire Institute of Marine Science for helping to maintain the

experimental systems. This project was funded by a Hong Kong Research Grants Council 365

- General Research Fund grant (GRF17122916) to and a Universitas 21 Fellowship BDR. 366
- 367
- 368
- 369
- 370
- 371 37

372 373 274	Refere	ences
374 375	1.	Angilletta Jr, M. J. 2006. Estimating and comparing thermal performance curves.
376	-	Journal of Thermal Biology 31(7):541-545.
377	2.	Arafeh-Dalmau, N., G. Montaño-Moctezuma, J. A. Martinez, R. Beas-Luna, D. S.
378		Schoeman, and G. Torres-Moye. 2019. Extreme Marine Heatwaves alter kelp forest

379 community near its equatorward distribution limit. Frontiers in Marine Science 6:499. 3. Arias-Ortiz, A., O. Serrano, P. Masqué, P. S. Lavery, U. Mueller, G. A. Kendrick, M. 380 Rozaimi, A. Esteban, J. W. Fourqurean, and N. Marbà. 2018. A marine heatwave 381 382 drives massive losses from the world's largest seagrass carbon stocks. Nature Climate Change 8(4):338. 383

4. Armstrong, E. J., R. L. Tanner, and J. H. Stillman. 2019. High Heat Tolerance Is 384 Negatively Correlated with Heat Tolerance Plasticity in Nudibranch Mollusks. 385 386 Physiological and Biochemical Zoology 92(4):430-444.

 Batomalaque, G. A., B. G. P. Arce, M. B. M. Hernandez, and I. K. C. Fontanilla. 2010. Survey and spatial distribution of shoreline malacofauna in Grande Island, Subic Bay. Philippine Journal of Science 139(2):149-159.

387

388 389

390

391

392 393

394

395

396 397

398

399 400

401

402 403

404

405 406

407 408

409

410

411 412

413

414 415

416

417

418

419

420 421

422

423

424 425

426

427

- Bernal, M. A., C. Schunter, R. Lehmann, D. J. Lightfoot, B. J. Allan, H. D. Veilleux, J. L. Rummer, P. L. Munday, and T. Ravasi. 2020. Species-specific molecular responses of wild coral reef fishes during a marine heatwave. Science advances 6(12):eaay3423.
 - 7. Bozinovic, F., P. Calosi, and J. I. Spicer. 2011. Physiological correlates of geographic range in animals. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 42:155-179.
 - Brodeur, R. D., T. D. Auth, and A. J. Phillips. 2019. Major shifts in pelagic micronekton and macrozooplankton community structure in an upwelling ecosystem related to an unprecedented marine heatwave. Frontiers in Marine Science
 - Caputi, N., G. Jackson, and A. Pearce. 2014. The marine heat wave off western Australia during the summer of 2010/11: 2 years on. Fisheries Research Division, Western Australian Fisheries and Marine
- Cavole, L. M., A. M. Demko, R. E. Diner, A. Giddings, I. Koester, C. M. Pagniello, M.-L. Paulsen, A. Ramirez-Valdez, S. M. Schwenck, and N. K. Yen. 2016. Biological impacts of the 2013–2015 warm-water anomaly in the Northeast Pacific: Winners, losers, and the future. Oceanography 29(2):273-285.
- Dimitriadis, V. K., C. Gougoula, A. Anestis, H. O. Pörtner, and B. Michaelidis. 2012. Monitoring the biochemical and cellular responses of marine bivalves during thermal stress by using biomarkers. Marine environmental research 73:70-77.
- Donelson, J. M., J. M. Sunday, W. F. Figueira, J. D. Gaitán-Espitia, A. J. Hobday, C. R. Johnson, J. M. Leis, S. D. Ling, D. Marshall, and J. M. Pandolfi. 2019. Understanding interactions between plasticity, adaptation and range shifts in response to marine environmental change. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 374(1768):20180186.
- Frölicher, T. L., and C. Laufkötter. 2018. Emerging risks from marine heat waves. Nature communications 9(1):650.
- Ganser, A. M., T. J. Newton, and R. J. Haro. 2015. Effects of elevated water temperature on physiological responses in adult freshwater mussels. Freshwater Biology 60(8):1705-1716.
- Garrabou, J., R. Coma, N. Bensoussan, M. Bally, P. Chevaldonné, M. Cigliano, D. Díaz, J.-G. Harmelin, M. C. Gambi, and D. Kersting. 2009. Mass mortality in Northwestern Mediterranean rocky benthic communities: effects of the 2003 heat wave. Global change biology 15(5):1090-1103.
- 16. Giomi, F., C. Mandaglio, M. Ganmanee, G.-D. Han, Y.-W. Dong, G. A. Williams, and G. Sarà. 2016. The importance of thermal history: costs and benefits of heat exposure in a tropical, rocky shore oyster. Journal of Experimental Biology 219(5):686-694.
 - Goldenberg, S. U., I. Nagelkerken, E. Marangon, A. Bonnet, C. M. Ferreira, and S. D. Connell. 2018. Ecological complexity buffers the impacts of future climate on marine consumers. Nature Climate Change 8(3):229-233.
- 18. Harianto, J., H. D. Nguyen, S. P. Holmes, and M. Byrne. 2018. The effect of warming
 on mortality, metabolic rate, heat-shock protein response and gonad growth in
 thermally acclimated sea urchins (Heliocidaris erythrogramma). Marine Biology
 165(6):96.

19. Harley, C. D., S. D. Connell, Z. A. Doubleday, B. Kelaher, B. D. Russell, G. Sarà,

435		and B. Helmuth. 2017. Conceptualizing ecosystem tipping points within a
436		physiological framework. Ecology and evolution 7(15):6035-6045.
437	20.	Jacobson, L. M., P. J. Edmunds, E. B. Muller, and R. M. Nisbet. 2016. The
438		implications of reduced metabolic rate in resource-limited corals. Journal of
439		Experimental Biology 219(6):870-877.
440	21.	Kassahn, K. S., R. H. Crozier, H. O. Pörtner, and M. J. Caley. 2009. Animal
441		performance and stress: responses and tolerance limits at different levels of biological
442		organisation. Biological Reviews 84(2):277-292.
443	22.	Le Nohaïc, M., C. L. Ross, C. E. Cornwall, S. Comeau, R. Lowe, M. T. McCulloch,
444		and V. Schoepf. 2017. Marine heatwave causes unprecedented regional mass
445		bleaching of thermally resistant corals in northwestern Australia. Scientific reports
446		7(1):14999.
447	23.	Leung, J. Y., S. D. Connell, and B. D. Russell. 2017. Heatwaves diminish the survival
448		of a subtidal gastropod through reduction in energy budget and depletion of energy
449		reserves. Scientific reports 7(1):17688.
450	24.	Leung, J. Y., B. D. Russell, and S. D. Connell. 2019. Adaptive Responses of Marine
451		Gastropods to Heatwaves. One Earth 1(3):374-381.
452	25.	Lonhart, S. I., R. Jeppesen, R. Beas-Luna, J. A. Crooks, and J. Lorda. 2019. Shifts in
453		the distribution and abundance of coastal marine species along the eastern Pacific
454		Ocean during marine heatwaves from 2013 to 2018. Marine Biodiversity Records
455		12(1):13.
456	26.	Madeira, C., V. Mendonça, A. A. Flores, M. S. Diniz, and C. Vinagre. 2018a. High
457		thermal tolerance does not protect from chronic warming-A multiple end-point
458		approach using a tropical gastropod, Stramonita haemastoma. Ecological indicators
459		91:626-635.
460	27.	Madeira, C., M. C. Leal, M. S. Diniz, H. N. Cabral, and C. Vinagre. 2018b. Thermal
461		stress and energy metabolism in two circumtropical decapod crustaceans: Responses
462		to acute temperature events. Marine environmental research 141:148-158.
463	28.	Meyer, C. P., J. B. Geller, and G. Paulay. 2005. Fine scale endemism on coral reefs:
464		archipelagic differentiation in turbinid gastropods. Evolution 59(1):113-125.
465	29.	Nguyen, K. D. T., S. A. Morley, CH. Lai, M. S. Clark, K. S. Tan, A. E. Bates, and L.
466		S. Peck. 2011. Upper temperature limits of tropical marine ectotherms: global
467		warming implications. PLoS One 6(12)
468	30.	Noseworthy, R. G., and KS. Choi. 2010. The diversity and ecology of mollusks in
469		Seogundo off the southern Jeju Island, Republic of Korea. The Korean Journal of
470		Malacology 26(1):19-31.
471	31.	Oliver, E., M. Donat, M. Burrows, P. Moore, D. Smale, L. Alexander, J. Benthuysen,
472		M. Feng, A. Gupta, and A. Hobday. 2018. Longer and more frequent marine
473		heatwaves over the past century Nat. Commun. 9:1324.
474	32.	Oliver, E. C., J. A. Benthuysen, N. L. Bindoff, A. J. Hobday, N. J. Holbrook, C. N.
475		Mundy, and S. E. Perkins-Kirkpatrick. 2017. The unprecedented 2015/16 Tasman Sea
476		marine heatwave. Nature communications 8(1):1-12.
477	33.	Sanford, E., J. L. Sones, M. García-Reyes, J. H. Goddard, and J. L. Largier. 2019.
478		Widespread shifts in the coastal biota of northern California during the 2014–2016
479		marine heatwaves. Scientific reports 9(1):4216.

- 34. Sanford, E., J. L. Sones, M. García-Reyes, J. H. Goddard, and J. L. Largier. 2019.
 Widespread shifts in the coastal biota of northern California during the 2014–2016
 marine heatwaves. Scientific reports 9(1):1-14.
 - Seebacher, F., C. R. White, and C. E. Franklin. 2015. Physiological plasticity increases resilience of ectothermic animals to climate change. Nature Climate Change 5(1):61-66.
 - Smale, D. A., T. Wernberg, and M. A. Vanderklift. 2017. Regional-scale variability in the response of benthic macroinvertebrate assemblages to a marine heatwave. Marine Ecology Progress Series 568:17-30.
 - 37. Sokolova, I. M., M. Frederich, R. Bagwe, G. Lannig, and A. A. Sukhotin. 2012. Energy homeostasis as an integrative tool for assessing limits of environmental stress tolerance in aquatic invertebrates. Marine environmental research 79:1-15.
 - Somero, G. 2010. The physiology of climate change: how potentials for acclimatization and genetic adaptation will determine 'winners' and 'losers'. Journal of Experimental Biology 213(6):912-920.
 - 39. Stillman, J. H., and G. N. Somero. 2000. A comparative analysis of the upper thermal tolerance limits of eastern Pacific porcelain crabs, genus Petrolisthes: influences of latitude, vertical zonation, acclimation, and phylogeny. Physiological and Biochemical Zoology 73(2):200-208.
 - 40. Watson, G. J. 2018. "Winners" and "losers" in the Anthropocene: Understanding adaptation through phenotypic plasticity. Functional Ecology 32(8):1906-1907.
 - Wernberg, T., S. Bennett, R. C. Babcock, T. De Bettignies, K. Cure, M. Depczynski, F. Dufois, J. Fromont, C. J. Fulton, and R. K. Hovey. 2016. Climate-driven regime shift of a temperate marine ecosystem. Science 353(6295):169-172.
 - Wernberg, T., D. A. Smale, F. Tuya, M. S. Thomsen, T. J. Langlois, T. De Bettignies, S. Bennett, and C. S. Rousseaux. 2013. An extreme climatic event alters marine ecosystem structure in a global biodiversity hotspot. Nature Climate Change 3(1):78-82.

509

483

484

485 486

487

488 489

490

491

492 493

494

495 496

497

498

499

500 501

502

503

504 505

506 507

508

- 511 Table 1. The results of repeated measures PERMANOVAs testing for the effect of exposure
- 512 to the moderate heatwave (Exposure) on metabolic rates at different temperatures
- 513 (Temperature) across thermal ramps for both *Trochus sacellum* and *Astralium haematragum*.
- 514 Significant p-values are in **bold**.
- 515

	Factor	Df	F	p-value
Trochus sacellum	Exposure	1	3.2839	0.085
Respiration rate	Temperature	11	12.948	0.001
	Individual (Exposure)	10	3.8986	0.001
	Exposure x Temperature	11	14.046	0.001
Astralium haematragum Respiration rate	Exposure Temperature Individual (Exposure) Exposure x Temperature	1 11 9 11	5.8452 4.5485 2.2956 6.0839	0.03 0.003 0.021 0.001

- 517 Table 2. Temperature at maximum metabolic rate (T_{MMR}) as described by an Exponentially
- 518 Modified Gaussian Function (EMG) model for the more tropical *Trochus sacellum* and more
- 519 temperate Astralium haematragum after exposure to either summer water (28°C) or moderate
- 520 heatwave conditions (31°C). The difference in T_{MMR} in the heatwave compared to the control
- 521 treatment predicted by the EMG model are also shown.

		T _{MMR} (°C)	Change
Trochus sacellum	28 °C	32.6	/
	31 °C	28.6	-4.0
Astralium haematragum	28 °C	35.5	/
_	31 °C	25.7	-9.8

- 523 Figure 1: Mean monthly sea water temperature at Bluff Island (Mooring PM11) in Port
- 524 Shelter bay, Hong Kong from January 2015 to November 2018. Data downloaded from the
- 525 Environmental Protection Department, Hong Kong
- 526 (https://www.epd.gov.hk/epd/english/environmentinhk/water/hkwqrc/waterquality/marine.ht
- 527 ml.).
- 528 Figure 2: Cumulative mortality (%) of *Trochus sacellum* and *Astralium haematragum*
- 529 exposed to heatwave of 31°C and 34°C. No mortality was recorded in the control treatment
- 530 (28°C).
- 531 Figure 3: Metabolic rate of *Trochus sacellum* and *Astralium haematragum* at summer water
- temperatures (control; 28°C) and following 7 days exposure to either control (28 °C) or
- 533 moderate heatwave conditions (31°C). Error bars: \pm SE (n = 10).
- 534 Figure 4: Respiration rates of (a) Trochus sacellum and (b) Astralium haematragum
- 535 previously exposed to either control summer (28 °C) or moderate heatwave (31°C) across a

22

536 thermal ramp. Error bars \pm SE (n = 6).

537

540

541

542 543

544



27-12-14 15-07-15 31-01-16 18-08-16 06-03-17 22-09-17 10-04-18 27-10-18 15-05-19 Date

555 556









