

2019-01

Patchiness in habitat distribution can enhance biological diversity of coastal engineering structures

Cacabelos, E

<http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/13098>

10.1002/aqc.2972

Aquatic Conservation: Marine and Freshwater Ecosystems

Wiley

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

1 Disclaimer

2 'This is a copy of the accepted paper as submitted for publication. Readers are
3 advised to refer to the final version of the paper which can be found at
4 <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/abs/10.1002/aqc.2972?af=R>

5

6

7

8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33

**Patchiness in habitat distribution can enhance biological diversity of
coastal engineering structures**

Eva Cacabelos^{1,2*}, Richard C. Thompson³, Afonso C. L. Prestes², José Manuel N.
Azevedo², Ana I. Neto², Gustavo M. Martins²

¹MARE – Marine and Environmental Sciences Centre, Caniçal, Madeira, Portugal

²cE3c - Centre for Ecology, Evolution and Environmental Changes/Azorean
Biodiversity Group; Faculdade de Ciências e Tecnologia, Departamento de
Biologia, Universidade dos Açores, Portugal

³Marine Biology and Ecology Research Centre, Plymouth University, UK

Correspondence:

E Cacabelos, MARE – Marine and Environmental Sciences Centre, Caniçal,
Madeira, Portugal

Email: ecacabelos@mare-centre.pt

34

35 **Abstract**

36 1. Urbanization of coastal habitats is increasing worldwide. However, most man-
37 made structures are poor surrogates for the habitats they replace and can
38 strongly impact the diversity and functioning of coastal habitats.

39 2. The value of coastal engineering can be enhanced by the provision of
40 microhabitats that facilitate colonization by marine life. One step forward is
41 moved in this research by combining species coexistence theory, resource
42 patchiness, and applied ecology in order to find ways that maximize the
43 biological diversity of coastal defence structures.

44 3. Featureless areas of a seawall were modified by the addition of microhabitats
45 (resource) that were distributed in different configurations of patchiness.

46 4. Gastropod diversity peaked at intermediate levels of microhabitat patchiness.
47 This appeared to be driven by different patterns of resource use among species.
48 Gastropods dispersed longer distances on unmodified seawalls than on natural
49 rocky shores but when microhabitats were added dispersal decreased. The
50 ability to find microhabitats differed among species.

51 5. Our results confirm that patchiness in microhabitat distribution affects
52 biodiversity. The extent of microhabitat patchiness could potentially be tailored
53 by coastal engineers to meet specific conservation priorities: increasing diversity
54 vs. increasing number of individuals.

55

56 **Keywords:** benthos, coastal, ecosystem services, biodiversity, intertidal,

57 invertebrates, urban development

58

59

60 **1 INTRODUCTION**

61 Coastal urbanization, the process whereby stretches of natural shoreline are
62 modified or replaced by the addition of man-made coastal structures, is
63 increasing worldwide (Firth, Knights, et al., 2016). Coastal urbanization is
64 associated with a variety of negative impacts on the ecology of coastal habitats
65 via changes in important physical, chemical and biological processes, which can
66 strongly impact the structure and functioning of coastal habitats (Bishop et al.,
67 2017; Heery et al., 2017; Nordstrom, 2014).

68

69 Generally, coastal defence structures are considered as poor surrogates for the
70 natural shores they replace (Bulleri & Chapman, 2010; Chapman, 2003;
71 Chapman & Bulleri, 2003; Coombes, La Marca, Naylor, & Thompson, 2015; Evans
72 et al., 2015; Firth, Knights, et al., 2016; Moschella et al., 2005); when compared to
73 natural habitats, coastal defence structures often support assemblages that are
74 less diverse (Cacabelos et al., 2016a,b; Chapman, 2003, 2006; Chapman & Bulleri,
75 2003; Connell & Glasby, 1999; Evans et al., 2015; Firth et al., 2015; Firth,
76 Mieszkowska, Thompson, & Hawkins, 2013; Moschella et al., 2005; Pister, 2009;
77 Vaselli, Bulleri, & Benedetti-Cecchi, 2008). This effect has been attributed to the
78 lack of topographic complexity that characterizes many of such structures (e.g.
79 seawalls, pontoons, groynes) and which is important for many marine organisms
80 (Aguilera, Broitman, & Thiel, 2014; Chapman, 2003; Metaxas & Scheibling, 1993;
81 Moschella et al., 2005).

82

83 Recently, efforts to enhance the diversity on coastal defence structures showed
84 that structures such as seawalls and breakwaters could be modified in an
85 attempt to increase the biodiversity they support. This has included the addition
86 of simple topographic features such as pits, grooves, cracks or water-retaining
87 structures (Browne & Chapman, 2014; Chapman & Blockley, 2009; Coombes et
88 al, 2015; Dafforn, Glasby, et al., 2015; Dafforn, Mayer-Pinto, Morris, & Waltham,
89 2015; Evans et al., 2015; Firth, Browne, Knights, Hawkins, & Nash, 2016; Firth,
90 Mieszkowska, et al., 2013; Firth, Schofield, White, Skov, & Hawkins, 2014; Firth,
91 Thompson, et al., 2013, 2014; Martins, Thompson, Neto, Hawkins, & Jenkins,
92 2010; Morris, Chapman, Firth, & Coleman, 2017; Morris et al., 2018; Strain et al.,
93 2018 for a review). In order to further increase their ecological value, we need to
94 understand how modifications made to coastal defence structures might affect
95 species coexistence with potential long-lasting effects (Martins, Jenkins, Neto,
96 Hawkins, & Thompson, 2016).

97

98 Much research, both theoretical and empirical, has focused on the mechanisms
99 that determine diversity and local species coexistence such as resource
100 partitioning (e.g. Schoener, 1974), predator-mediated effects (e.g. Leibold, 1996)
101 and interference competition (e.g. Richards, Nisbet, Wilson, & Possingham, 2000;
102 Vance, 1985). An important consideration is that spatial variability in the
103 distribution of resources can promote coexistence by exploiting differences in
104 foraging traits of competing species. This has been elegantly demonstrated by
105 Chase, Wilson, and Richards (2001) who showed that coexistence (and hence
106 species richness) in freshwater snails was driven by the interplay between
107 differences in foraging trade-offs (ability to find a resource vs. ability to exploit

108 it) and patchiness in resource (patches of food) distribution. They found that
109 diversity was greatest at intermediate levels of resource patchiness. These
110 authors discussed findings in light of a digger-grazer model developed for
111 marine snails (Schmitt, 1996; Wilson, Osenberg, Schmitt, & Nisbet, 1999) under
112 which two competing species can coexist due to complementary foraging
113 strategies: one species (coined as digger) excels at harvesting food in each patch,
114 whereas the other species (coined as grazer) maximizes the area over which
115 food is consumed. It was not possible for a species to simultaneously do both.
116 Wilson et al (1999) also provided compelling evidence that the digger-grazer
117 model may be much more widely applicable, including ecosystems such as the
118 rocky intertidal.

119

120 In the north-eastern Atlantic, rocky shore snails (e.g. *Phorcus* spp., *Littorina* spp.,
121 *Patella* spp.) overlap considerably in spatial distribution and can all be found
122 together on open rock. These grazer gastropods differ markedly in their feeding
123 mode according to the morphology of their radula and feeding mechanism. For
124 instance, docoglossan patellid limpets can penetrate hard substrates,
125 taenioglossan littorinids can only penetrate softer substrates and rhipidoglossan
126 trochids can only superficially brush the substrate surface (Hawkins et al., 1989).
127 The way they use their radula to feed on algae has been likened to 'shovels',
128 'rakes' and 'brooms', respectively (Steneck & Watling, 1982). Moreover, these
129 species differ remarkably in the way they move. Patellid limpets are known for
130 their homing behaviour, the consistent return of individuals to a specific location
131 on the substratum when not feeding or searching for food (Lord, 2008; Santana,
132 1993; Shanks, 2002; Steneck, 1982). In contrast, trochids and littorinids show

133 little site fidelity and gradually disperse away to locate new patches with
134 resources (Chapman, 1995; Norton, Hawkins, Manley, Williams, & Watson,
135 1990). They must either move faster between patches or convert more
136 efficiently the resources to population growth (Richards et al., 2000) than
137 species exhibiting homing behaviour.

138

139 For many intertidal snails, however, food is not the only important resource
140 (Rochette & Dill, 2000). Intertidal microhabitats such as rockpools, pits and
141 grooves also play an important role, at least during some stage of their life-cycle
142 (Firth & Crowe, 2010), by dampening environmental extremes during low water
143 (Fairweather, 1988; Gray & Hodgson, 1998) and/or providing protection from
144 predation (Bertness, Garrity, & Levings, 1981; Garrity, 1984). In fact, most
145 enhancements done to coastal defence structures (see above) are effective
146 because they provide a refuge for environmental stressors or the risk of
147 predation (Browne & Chapman, 2011, 2014; Chapman & Blockley, 2009;
148 Coombes et al., 2015; Evans et al., 2015, 2017; Firth, Browne, et al., 2016; Firth,
149 Knights, et al., 2016; Firth, Mieszkowska, et al., 2013; Firth, Schofield, et al., 2014;
150 Firth, Thompson, et al., 2013, 2014; Loke, Ladle, Bouma, & Todd, 2015; Martins
151 et al., 2010, 2016; reviews in Dafforn, Glasby, et al., 2015; Dafforn, Mayer-Pinto,
152 et al., 2015; Firth, Knights, et al., 2016; Strain et al., 2018). However, the
153 magnitude of the effects varied among considered functional groups and habitat
154 settings (Strain et al., 2018). For instance, Martins et al. (2016) showed that the
155 response of three intertidal snails to the addition of pits to a topographically
156 simple seawall varied according to pit size and number: littorinids (*Tectarius*
157 *striatus* and *Melarhaphe neritoides*) tended to aggregate on small microhabitats,

158 limpets (*Patella candei*) tended to aggregate in areas with large microhabitats,
159 whilst all species tended to be more abundant with increasing microhabitat
160 density. Moreover, the contrasting response of limpets and littorinids to
161 microhabitat size had community-wide cascading effects, leading, in the longer-
162 term, to the establishment of very distinct assemblages. Martins et al. (2016) also
163 noted that whilst many individual littorinids were often found aggregating in a
164 single pit, limpets were generally found alone (one individual limpet per pit).
165 This pattern suggests that inter- and intra-specific competition (for pits) is
166 higher for limpets than among littorinids.

167

168 In the present study we build on previous findings (Martins et al., 2010, 2016) to
169 test if spatial variability (patchiness) in the distribution of microhabitats (pits)
170 can affect snail behaviour and be used as a means to enhance diversity in coastal
171 defence structures.

172 We hypothesize that (1) intertidal gastropods have distinct displacement
173 behaviours on seawalls and natural rocky shores, (2) patterns of gastropod
174 dispersal and microhabitat use differs among species; specifically, littorinids (*M.*
175 *neritoides* and *T. striatus*) disperse further and utilise experimental pits more
176 quickly than limpets, and finally (3) richness in gastropod snails will be
177 enhanced at intermediate levels of microhabitat patchiness, reflecting the
178 divergent patterns of motility, intra- and inter-specific competition among these
179 species.

180

181 **2 METHODS**

182 **2.1 Study sites and gastropod assemblages**

183 The Azores archipelago is volcanic by origin and the coast is mainly composed of
184 boulder shores interspersed between rocky platforms. The tides are semidiurnal
185 and the tidal range small (< 2 m). The experimental study was done on a natural
186 rocky shore platform and the adjacent steep seawall consisting of large regular-
187 sized basalt blocks, comprising a stretch of the coast of 200 m with south-
188 southwest orientation at São Roque (São Miguel Island). The basalt blocks had a
189 smooth surface and lacked the microtopographic complexity of the surrounding
190 natural rocky shore (see Martins et al., 2010). The assemblage of grazer
191 gastropods from mid to upper shore levels comprised the limpet *Patella candei*
192 and the littorinids *Tectarius striatus* and *Melarhappe neritoides* (Martins,
193 Thompson, Hawkins, Neto, & Jenkins, 2008), both in natural shores and seawall.
194 These are, for the most part, the only macroinvertebrate grazing gastropods
195 present in the intertidal throughout the archipelago. Other species (e.g. *Littorina*
196 *saxatilis*) are rare on Azorean coasts.

197

198 **2.2 Dispersion behaviour on seawalls vs. natural rocky shores**

199 Since patterns of dispersion on seawalls have been shown to differ from those
200 observed on natural rocky shores (Bulleri, Chapman, & Underwood, 2004), it
201 was important to test, prior to the main experiment, if the same occurred in the
202 study system and focal species. To compare the movement of gastropods in each
203 habitat (seawall and natural rocky shore), the distance travelled per unit time on
204 both habitats was investigated during the summer of 2014. On the seawall and
205 on an adjacent natural rocky shore (a platform shore with the same orientation
206 100 m apart), random sites metres apart were selected at similar intertidal level
207 and animals were individually labelled. We calculated the distance travelled over

208 different periods of time (1 and 14 days) by measuring the distance between the
209 animals and two fixed marks. The distance travelled over the different periods of
210 time was calculated by co-ordinate geometry, using paired measures at the
211 beginning and at the end of the period of time (Underwood 1977). As many
212 individuals were lost, we repeated the procedure described several times to
213 obtain enough replicates. For the purpose of analyses (see below), data from
214 each time period were pooled together.

215

216 The distances travelled by gastropods on the seawalls and the natural rocky
217 shore were compared using a two-way permutational ANOVA (PERMANOVA,
218 Anderson, 2005) with the factors 'Habitat' and 'Species' fixed and orthogonal to
219 each other. The analyses were done separately for 1 and 14 days after the start
220 of the experiment. Permutational ANOVA was used instead of traditional ANOVA
221 because analyses were unbalanced (e.g. different numbers of animals per
222 species). Prior to analyses, heterogeneity of variances was checked using
223 PERMDISP and transformations were applied where necessary. Pair-wise
224 comparisons were made when differences were found. All analyses were run on
225 Euclidean distances with 999 permutations using the software PRIMER 6+
226 (Clarke & Gorley, 2006).

227

228 **2.3 Microhabitat patchiness**

229 In December 2013, two sites 50 m long, belonging to the same continuous
230 seawall, located 100 m apart and similarly exposed to oceanic swell, were
231 selected for experimental manipulation. To test the effect of patchiness on
232 gastropod diversity, 20 plots (25 x 25cm) were haphazard marked at mid-shore

233 level (approximately 1.50-1.90 m above lowest astronomical tide) of each site,
234 where barnacles, limpets and littorinids are present, and randomly assigned to
235 four treatments (n = 5): control (no pits added), low, intermediate and high
236 levels of microhabitat patchiness (Figure 1). Comparison of controls and
237 treatments were used to confirm that all the three species, *M. neritoides*, *T.*
238 *striatus* and *P. candei*, responded positively to the experimental addition of pits,
239 (see Martins et al., 2016). To ensure that the sizes of experimental pits were
240 suitable for the majority of the individuals, the total number and size of pits was
241 established *a priori* according to previous observational and experimental
242 studies in the area (Martins et al., 2010, 2016). As pits can be key features for the
243 recruitment and survival of many species, especially for the case of juvenile
244 stages (e.g. recent recruited and immature limpets < 1cm), and the effect of pit
245 density and size for small limpets was limited by the density of pits, whatever
246 their size (Martins et al., 2010), here we opted for drilling pits 12 mm diameter,
247 10 mm depth. Levels of patchiness were achieved by drilling 16 pits within the
248 plot areas at varying arrangements following the design of Chase et al. (2001): a
249 unique group of 16 adjacent pits (low patchiness), two groups of 8 adjacent pits
250 in opposite corners of the plot (intermediate patchiness) and four groups of 4
251 adjacent pits, each on a different corner of the plot (high patchiness) (Figure 1).

252

253 Martins et al. (2016) found that patterns of pit use on rocky shores differed
254 slightly between the short (3 months to 1 year) and the long-term (7 years),
255 probably reflecting the adjustment of animal densities to intra- and inter-specific
256 competition. To allow plenty of time for individuals to relocate, experimental

257 plots were only sampled in June 2016, 30 months after experimental setup, when
258 all gastropods within experimental plots were identified and counted.

259

260 The effects of microhabitat patchiness on the diversity (species richness and
261 Shannon index of diversity) and abundance of gastropods was investigated using
262 a two-way mixed model ANOVA with the following factors: 'Site' (random with
263 two levels) and 'Treatment' (fixed with 3 levels: low, intermediate and high),
264 orthogonal between them. Prior to analyses, data were inspected for
265 heterogeneity of variances using Cochran's test, and transformations were
266 applied where necessary. *Post-hoc* pooling was done at $p > 0.25$, by pooling MS
267 terms and using the resultant term as the denominator for the *F. A posteriori*
268 comparisons were made using the SNK test when differences were found.

269 Pearson correlation coefficient was calculated among all gastropod species
270 across treatments to evaluate potential biotic interactions among these species.

271

272 **2.4 Dispersion behaviour across microhabitat patchiness**

273 We compared the dispersal of gastropods across levels of patchiness in the winter
274 of 2016-2017 at one of the experimental sites. Prior to the start of the experiment,
275 plots were defaunated. Afterwards, *M. neritoides*, *T. striatus* and *P. candei* were
276 collected from the surrounding area within the seawall, marked with coloured nail
277 varnish and translocated to the centre of each experimental plot (5 individuals per
278 species per plot). In the case of *P. candei*, more sensitive to manipulation, the use
279 of smaller animals allowed us to easily dislodge them off the rock. Moreover,
280 animals were carefully removed and immediately translocated to the
281 experimental plots. Adherence of animals was checked about 30 minutes

282 afterwards. In most cases limpets reattached alone, but if not these were replaced.
283 The number of animals transplanted into each plot was within the range of
284 densities observed on several natural shores of the island (mean values of
285 12.8 ± 5.0 , 11.7 ± 3.4 and 4.1 ± 0.6 individuals per 625 cm^2 were observed for *M.*
286 *neritoides*, *T. striatus* and *P. candei* respectively, during summer 2013 (n=25,
287 Cacabelos et al., 2016a). In January 2014 we observed even higher densities on
288 local natural shores (103.6 ± 13.0 *M. neritoides* individuals per 625 cm^2 , 24.8 ± 5.4
289 *T. striatus* and 5.3 ± 0.9 *P. candei* (n=30) and therefore intra-species competition
290 was not expected to occur. After 24h, we measured the distance travelled by each
291 marked individual from the centre of each plot and recorded whether it was inside
292 or outside a pit. To account for the number of animals which were lost, we
293 repeated the procedure described two more times (total of 3 runs for *P. candei* and
294 2 for littorinids).

295

296 To test the hypothesis that dispersal of gastropod species differed among levels
297 of patchiness, for each individual we calculated its dispersal from the centre of
298 the patch against the mean dispersal observed on controls (no pits) using the Ln
299 ($d_{\text{treatment}}/d_{\text{control}}$), d = distance travelled from the centre of the plot. This was
300 done to standardize the distances travelled among species and against a
301 situation where no microhabitats were available (controls). Negative values
302 indicate that animals dispersed less than in controls, while positive values
303 indicate that animals dispersed more than in controls. Data were analysed using
304 a 2-way factorial permutational ANOVA with the following factors: 'Species' (3
305 levels) and 'Treatment' (3 levels: low, intermediate and high), both fixed. Pair-
306 wise comparisons were made when differences were found. Again,

307 permutational ANOVA was chosen due to the unbalanced dataset (for further
308 details see above). For analysis, data from the different runs were pooled
309 together.

310

311 **3 RESULTS**

312 **3.1 Dispersion behaviour on seawall vs. natural rocky shore**

313 In the shorter-term (1 day), distances travelled by *Tectarius striatus* were always
314 significantly greater than those travelled by *Melarhappe neritoides* and *Patella*
315 *candei* (mean \pm SE, *T. striatus*: 12.0 ± 2.2 cm, *M. neritoides*: 3.9 ± 0.9 and *P. candei*:
316 1.8 ± 0.5 cm), but there were no differences in dispersal between habitats
317 (natural rocky shore or seawall (Figure 2, Table S1). However, in the longer-term
318 (14 days) there was a significant interaction between habitat and species (Table
319 S1). Pair-wise comparisons showed that, on average, limpets dispersed very little
320 regardless of habitat but that littorinids dispersed significantly greater distances
321 on the seawall than on the natural rocky shore (Figure 2, Table S1). Pair-wise
322 comparisons also showed that while on natural shores *M. neritoides* dispersed
323 little (similar to *P. candei*), on the seawall *M. neritoides* dispersed much more
324 (similar to *T. striatus*) (Table S1).

325

326 **3.2 Suitability of experimental microhabitat addition**

327 The addition of experimental pits to the seawall proved a successful means to
328 enhance the diversity and abundance of gastropods per unit area (Table 1):
329 compared to controls, experimentally enhanced plots supported, on average, an
330 abundance of individuals and a species richness that was 1 order of magnitude
331 greater.

332

333 **3.3 Microhabitat patchiness**

334 When considering the effects of the different spatial arrangements of
335 experimental pits, both the species richness and the Shannon diversity generally
336 peaked at intermediate levels of patchiness (Figure 3). In fact, mean species
337 richness at intermediate patchiness was significantly greater than found on high
338 patchiness (Figure 3; see also Table S2 in supporting information for ANOVA
339 tables). Shannon diversity was also significantly greater at intermediate
340 patchiness compared to low and high patchiness (Figure 3, Table S2). For both
341 richness and Shannon diversity, results were spatially consistent in both sites
342 examined (Table S2).

343

344 Statistical analyses failed to detect any significant variation in mean abundance
345 of the different species among levels of patchiness, probably because there was
346 much (and significant) spatial variability between sites for both *P. candei* and *M.*
347 *neritoides* (see Table S3). However, when the numbers of all individuals per
348 treatment were pooled together, the pattern varied substantially and we
349 observed differences among species (Figure 4): the numbers of *T. striatus*
350 increased with patchiness, whereas the numbers of both *P. candei* and *M.*
351 *neritoides* peaked at intermediate levels of patchiness.

352

353 A negative correlation was found between the numbers of limpets and both
354 species of littorinids (*P. candei* * *T. striatus*, $r = -0.34$; *P. candei* * *M. neritoides*, $r =$
355 -0.18), whereas a positive correlation was found between the numbers of
356 littorinids (*T. striatus* * *M. neritoides*, $r = +0.44$).

357

358 **3.4 Dispersion behaviour across microhabitat patchiness**

359 All species tended to disperse less in areas enhanced with experimental pits
360 (Figure 5a). There were also significant differences in dispersal both among
361 species and among treatments. Inspection of a posteriori comparisons showed
362 that *P. candei* and *M. neritoides* dispersed significantly less than *T. striatus* (Table
363 S4). Patterns of dispersion also varied across levels of patchiness, with all
364 animals dispersing significantly less in areas with low patchiness (Figure 5a).
365 Inspection of the experimental plots after 24h showed that the proportion of
366 individuals (data pooled over replicates) found inside pits decreased with
367 increasing patchiness (Figure 5b).

368

369 **DISCUSSION**

370 The main outcome of this study was that diversity, both in terms of richness and
371 Shannon diversity, was greater at intermediate levels of microhabitat patchiness.
372 This is in accordance with Chase et al. (2001) who found that the diversity of
373 freshwater snails was also greatest at intermediate levels of resource patchiness.
374 In their study, this pattern was driven by the interplay between differences in
375 foraging trade-offs, coexisting due to complementary foraging strategies
376 (Schmitt, 1996; Wilson et al., 1999), and patchiness in resource distribution, and
377 thus highlight the importance of variability in species traits. Previous studies in
378 natural systems demonstrated how the responses of species assemblages to
379 microhabitats can vary among taxa (Bateman and Bishop, 2017). Here, too, we
380 showed that not only the dispersal of intertidal gastropods varied among
381 species, especially between littorinids and limpets which have contrasting

382 foraging behaviours (different abilities to find and exploit resources), but also
383 between habitats (natural rocky platform and seawall) and between levels of
384 habitat patchiness on a seawall.

385

386 A mechanism to explain the biotic response to microhabitat manipulation can be
387 deduced from the observation that littorinids (but not limpets) dispersed over
388 larger distances in seawalls compared with natural rocky habitats, a result also
389 shown for the limpet *Cellana tramoserica* on seawalls in New South Wales
390 (Bulleri et al., 2004). This greater mobility on artificial substrates suggests that
391 gastropods move more because they may lack appropriate microhabitats (e.g.
392 pits) in which to shelter. This hypothesis is further supported in our study by the
393 result that all species also dispersed less in areas of the seawall enhanced with
394 pits. In addition, complementary information, e.g. related to the age of the
395 animals, could be incorporated when predicting patterns of movement of
396 gastropods (Crowe, 1996). The three species also exhibited distinct short-term
397 patterns of dispersal in relation microhabitat patchiness. Although not
398 experimentally tested, we found evidence that at least limpets and littorinids
399 may be competing for these microhabitats on the seawall. As such, the
400 differential ability to disperse may be important in alleviating competition
401 among these species, which could, in the longer term, result in the distinct
402 patterns of abundance observed among treatments and hence, diversity. Our
403 results thus suggest that the manipulation of microhabitat patchiness may be an
404 effective way to exploit differences in species dispersal, and presumably foraging
405 behaviour, and which may in fact have wider implications for the structure of
406 remainder of the community (Martins et al., 2014; O'Connor & Crowe, 2005).

407

408 Understanding the mechanisms that drive species coexistence has been a central
409 question in theoretical ecology, but it may have wider applied interest. The
410 addition of microhabitats to an existing seawall without previously water
411 retaining features was shown to be an effective way to enhance the local
412 numbers and diversity of gastropods, confirming previous studies (Martins et al.,
413 2010, 2016) and suggesting the potential use of such modifications as a means to
414 enhance the diversity of intertidal biota on coastal defence structures (see Firth,
415 Knights, et al., 2016 and references therein). Here we show that controlling the
416 spatial patchiness of microhabitats is an effective way to enhance the local
417 abundance or diversity of target species in artificial substrates. However, a
418 frequent limitation of eco-engineering research is the investigation of large-scale
419 effects or habitat modifications (but see Morris et al., 2017). Although our
420 experiments have been replicated at sites within a single artificial structure, a
421 next step would be to evaluate the effect size of such treatments at the scale of
422 the entire structure, on different geographical areas and with different
423 assemblages of organisms. Provided that results hold, this study suggests that
424 managements strategies could potentially be tailored to meet specific
425 conservation priorities and inform eco-engineering approaches to enhance
426 biodiversity, namely increasing diversity vs. increasing number of individuals.

427

428 This work emphasizes the importance of field experiments as a powerful tool to
429 establish causal relationships and adds to the toolkit of coastal engineers in the
430 design of more ecologically friendly coastal structures, providing direct evidence
431 of the suitability of low-cost engineering modifications to enhance artificial

432 ecosystems. Our study adds to the wider literature showing that coastal
433 structures can be enhanced in different ways: (i) via the provision of different
434 microhabitat types (e.g. pits, grooves, rockpools) (e.g. Browne & Chapman, 2014;
435 Coombes et al., 2015; Firth, Schofield, et al., 2014; Firth, Thompson, et al., 2014),
436 (ii) via the provision of microhabitat of different sizes (Martins et al., 2010,
437 2016), or (iii) by controlling the level of patchiness in the provision of
438 microhabitats (this study). Ultimately, the choice among these options should be
439 dictated by the desired outcome (e.g. ecological, conservation of exploited
440 species) and by the available intervention possibilities.

441

442 **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

443 This study was supported by the European Regional Development Fund (ERDF)
444 through the Operational Competitiveness Programme (COMPETE) and National
445 funds through FCT – Fundação para a Ciência e Tecnologia via the project ‘BUS’
446 PTDC/MAR-EST/2160/2012. Funding was also partially provided from National
447 Funds through FCT under project UID/BIA/00329/2013 and through DRCT,
448 within the project M1.1.a/009/Funcionamento-C-/2016 (GBA). E.C. benefitted
449 from a post-doctoral fellowship awarded by ARDITI Grant Programme Madeira
450 14-20 (M1420-09-5369-FSE-000001). G.M.M. was supported by a post-doctoral
451 grant awarded by FCT (SFRH/BDP/108114/2015). Authors are grateful to Ana
452 Lloveras, Carles Mir, Laura Busquier, Rubén Mosquera, Virginie Leyendecker,
453 João Faria and Lidia Muñoz for helping with the fieldwork. This manuscript was
454 substantially improved by the suggestions made by the editor and 2 anonymous
455 reviewers.

456

457

458 **REFERENCES**

459 Aguilera, M. A., Broitman, B. R., & Thiel, M. (2014). Spatial variability in
460 community composition on a granite breakwater versus natural rocky shores:
461 lack of microhabitats suppresses intertidal biodiversity. *Marine Pollution*
462 *Bulletin*, 87, 257–268.

463 Anderson, M. J. (2005). PERMANOVA: a FORTRAN computer program for
464 permutational multivariate analysis of variance. Department of Statistics,
465 University of Auckland, New Zealand.

466 Bateman, D., & Bishop, M. J. (2017). The environmental context and traits of
467 habitat-forming bivalves influence the magnitude of their ecosystem
468 engineering. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 563, 95–110.

469 Bertness, M. D., Garrity, S. D., & Levings, S. C. (1981). Predation pressure and
470 gastropod foraging: a tropical–temperate comparison. *Evolution*, 35, 995–1007.

471 Bishop, M. J., Mayer-Pinto, M., Airoidi, L., Firth, L. B., Morris, R. L., Loke, L. H. L.,
472 Hawkins, S. J., Naylor, L. A., Coleman, R. A., Chee, S. Y., Dafforn, K. A. (2017).
473 Effects of ocean sprawl on ecological connectivity: impacts and solutions. *Journal*
474 *of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 492, 7–30.

475 Browne, M. A., & Chapman, M. G. (2011). Ecologically informed engineering
476 reduces loss of intertidal biodiversity on artificial shorelines. *Environmental*
477 *Science & Technology*, 45, 8204–8207.

478 Browne, M. A., & Chapman, M. G. (2014). Mitigating against the loss of species by
479 adding artificial intertidal pools to existing seawalls. *Marine Ecology Progress*
480 *Series, 497*, 119–29.

481 Bulleri, F., & Chapman, M. G. (2010). The introduction of coastal infrastructure as
482 a driver of change in marine environments. *Journal of Applied Ecology, 47*, 26–35.

483 Bulleri, F., Chapman, M. G., & Underwood, A. J. (2004). Patterns of movement of
484 the limpet *Cellana tramoserica* on rocky shores and retaining seawalls. *Marine*
485 *Ecology Progress Series, 281*, 121-129.

486 Cacabelos, E., Martins, G. M., Thompson, R., Prestes, A. C. L., Azevedo, J. M. N., &
487 Neto, A. I. (2016a). Material type and roughness influence structure of intertidal
488 communities on coastal defences. *Marine Ecology, 37*, 801-812.

489 Cacabelos, E., Martins, G. M., Thompson, R., Prestes, A. C. L., Azevedo, J. M. N., &
490 Neto, A. I. (2016b). Factors limiting the establishment of canopy-forming algae
491 on artificial structures. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science, 181*, 277-283.

492 Chapman, M. G. (1995). Aggregation of the littorinid snail *Littorina unifasciata* in
493 New South Wales, Australia. *Marine Ecology Progress Series, 126*, 191-202.

494 Chapman, M. G. (2003). Paucity of mobile species on constructed seawalls:
495 effects of urbanization on biodiversity. *Marine Ecology Progress Series, 264*, 21-
496 29.

497 Chapman, M. G. (2006). Intertidal seawalls as habitats for molluscs. *Journal of*
498 *Molluscan Studies, 72*, 247-257.

499 Chapman, M. G., & Blockley, D. J. (2009). Engineering novel habitats on urban
500 infrastructure to increase intertidal biodiversity. *Oecologia*, *161*, 625–35

501 Chapman, M. G., & Bulleri, F. (2003). Intertidal seawalls – new features of
502 landscape in intertidal environments. *Landscape and Urban Planning*, *62*, 159-
503 172.

504 Chase, J. M., Wilson, W. G., & Richards, S. A. (2001). Foraging trade-offs and
505 resource patchiness: theory and experiments in a freshwater snail community.
506 *Ecology Letters*, *4*, 304-312.

507 Clarke, K. R., & Gorley R. N. (2006). Primer. User manual/tutorial. Plymouth, UK:
508 PRIMER-E Ltd.

509 Connell, S. D., & Glasby, T. M. (1999). Do urban structures influence local
510 abundance and diversity of subtidal epibiota? A case study from Sydney Harbour,
511 Australia. *Marine Environmental Research*, *47*, 373-387.

512 Coombes, M. A., La Marca, E. C., Naylor, L. A., & Thompson, R. C. (2015). Getting
513 into the groove: opportunities to enhance the ecological value of hard coastal
514 infrastructure using fine-scale surface textures. *Ecological Engineering*, *77*, 314-
515 23.

516 Crowe, T. (1996). Different effects of microhabitat fragmentation on patterns of
517 dispersal of an intertidal gastropod in two habitats. *Journal of the Experimental*
518 *Marine Biology and Ecology*, *206*, 83-107.

519 Dafforn, K. A., Glasby, T. M., Airoidi, L., Rivero, N. K., Mayer-Pinto, M., & Johnston,
520 E. L. (2015). Marine urbanization: an ecological framework for designing

521 multifunctional artificial structures. *Frontiers in Ecology and*
522 *Environment*, 13, 82–90.

523 Dafforn, K. A., Mayer-Pinto, M., Morris, R. L., & Waltham, N. J. (2015). Application
524 of management tools to integrate ecological principles with the design of marine
525 infrastructure. *Journal of Environmental Management*, 158, 61–73.

526 Evans, A. J., Firth, L. B., Hawkins, S. J., Morris, E. S., Goudge, H., & Moore, P. J.
527 (2015). Drill-cored rock pools: an effective method of ecological enhancement on
528 artificial structures. *Marine and Freshwater Research*, 67, 123–30.

529 Evans, A. J., Garrodd, B., Firth, L. B., Hawkins, S. J., Morris-Webb, E. S., Goudge, H.,
530 & Moore, P. J. (2017). Stakeholder priorities for multi-functional coastal defence
531 developments and steps to effective implementation. *Marine Policy*, 75, 143-155.

532 Fairweather, P. G. (1988). Movements of intertidal whelks (*Morula marginalba*
533 and *Thais orbita*) in relation to availability of prey and shelter. *Marine Biology*,
534 100, 63–68.

535 Firth, L. B., Browne, K. A., Knights, A. M, Hawkins SK, & Nash R. (2016). Eco-
536 engineered rock pools: a concrete solution to biodiversity loss and urban sprawl
537 in the marine environment. *Environmental Research Letters*, 11, 094015.

538 Firth, L. B., & Crowe, T. P. (2010). Competition and habitat suitability: small-scale
539 segregation underpins large-scale coexistence of key species on temperate rocky
540 shores. *Oecologia*, 162, 163–174.

541 Firth, L. B., Knights, A. M., Bridger, D., Evans, A. J., Mieszkowska, N., Moore, P., ...
542 Hawkins, S. J. (2016). Ocean sprawl: challenges and opportunities for

543 biodiversity management in a changing world. in R. N. Hughes, D. J. Hughes, I. P.
544 Smith, & A. C. Dale (eds), *Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual*
545 *Review*. vol. 54, *Oceanography and Marine Biology - An Annual Review*, vol. 54,
546 CRC Press.

547 Firth, L. B., Mieszkowska, N., Thompson, R. C., & Hawkins, S. T. (2013). Climate
548 change and adaptational impacts in coastal systems: the case of sea defences.
549 *Environmental Science: Processes, & Impacts*, 15, 1665-1670.

550 Firth, L. B., Schofield, M., White, F. J., Skov, M. W., & Hawkins, S. J. (2014).
551 Biodiversity in intertidal rock pools: Informing engineering criteria for artificial
552 habitat enhancement in the built environment. *Marine Environmental*
553 *Research*, 102, 122-130.

554 Firth, L. B., Thompson, R.C., Bohn, K., Abbiati, M., Airoidi, L., Bouma, T. J., ...
555 Hawkins, S.J. (2014). Between a rock and a hard place: environmental and
556 engineering considerations when designing coastal defence structures. *Coastal*
557 *Engineering*, 87, 122–135.

558 Firth, L. B., Thompson, R. C., White, F. J., Schofield, M., Skov, M. W., Hoggart, S. P. G.,
559 ..., Hawkins, S. J. (2013) The importance of water-retaining features for
560 biodiversity on artificial intertidal coastal defence structures. *Diversity and*
561 *Distributions*, 19, 1275–1283.

562 Firth, L. B., White, F. J., Schofield, M., Hanley, M. E., Burrows, M. T., Thompson, R.
563 C., ... Hawkins, S. J. (2015). Facing the future: the importance of substratum
564 features for ecological engineering of artificial habitats in the rocky
565 intertidal. *Marine and Freshwater Research*, 67(1), 131-143.

566 Garrity, S. D. (1984). Some adaptations of gastropods to physical stress on a
567 tropical rocky shore. *Ecology*, 65, 559–574.

568 Gray, D. R., & Hodgson, A. N. (1998). Foraging and homing behaviour in the high-
569 shore, crevice-dwelling limpet *Helcion pectunculus* (Prosobranchia: Patellidae).
570 *Marine Biology*, 132, 283–294.

571 Hawkins, S. J., Watson, D. C., Hill, A. S., Harding, S. P., Kyriakides, M. A.,
572 Hutchinson, S., Norton, T.A. (1989). A comparison of feeding mechanisms in
573 microphagous, herbivorous, intertidal, prosobranchs in relation to resource
574 partitioning. *Journal of Molluscan Studies*, 55, 151-165.

575 Heery E. C., Bishop, M. J., Critchley, L. P., Bugnot, A. B., Airoidi, L., Mayer-Pinto, M.,
576 Sheehan, E. V., Coleman, R. A., Loke, L. H. L., Johnston, E. L., Komyakova, V.,
577 Morris, R. L., Strain, E. M. A., Naylor, L. A., Dafforn, K. A. (2017). *Journal of*
578 *Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 492, 31-48.

579 Leibold, M. A. (1996). A graphical model of keystone predators in food webs:
580 trophic regulation of abundance, incidence, and diversity patterns in
581 communities. *The American Naturalist*, 147, 784-812.

582 Loke, L. H. L., Ladle, R. J., Bouma, T. J., & Todd, P. A. (2015). Creating complex
583 habitats for restoration and reconciliation. *Ecological Engineering*, 77, 307-313.

584 Lord, J. (2008). Movement patterns and feeding behavior of the limpet *Tectura*
585 *testudinalis* (Müller) along the mid Maine Coast. Honors Theses. Paper 243.

586 Martins, G. M., Jenkins, S. R., Neto, A. I., Hawkins, S. J., & Thompson, R. C. (2016).
587 Long-term modifications of coastal defences enhance marine biodiversity.
588 *Environmental Conservation*, 43, 109-116.

589 Martins, G. M., Jenkins, S. R., Ramírez, R., Tuya, F., Neto, A. I., & Thompson, R. C.
590 (2014). Early patterns of recovery from disturbance in intertidal algal
591 assemblages: consistency across regions within a marine province. *Marine*
592 *Ecology Progress Series*, 517, 131-142.

593 Martins, G. M., Thompson, R. C., Hawkins, S. J., Neto, A. I., & Jenkins, S. R. (2008).
594 Rocky intertidal community structure in oceanic islands: scales of spatial
595 variability. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 356, 15-24.

596 Martins, G. M., Thompson, R. C., Neto, A. I., Hawkins, S. J., Jenkins, S. R. (2010).
597 Enhancing stocks of the exploited limpet *Patella candei* d'Orbigny via
598 modifications in coastal engineering. *Biological Conservation*, 143, 203-211.

599 Metaxas, A., & Scheibling, R. E. (1993). Community structure and organization of
600 tidepools. *Marine Ecology Progress Series*, 98(1-2), 187-198.

601 Morris, R. L., Chapman, M. G., Firth, L. B., & Coleman, R. A. (2017). Increasing
602 habitat complexity on seawalls: Investigating large- and small-scale effects on
603 fish assemblages. *Ecology and Evolution*, 7, 9567-9579.

604 Morris, R. L., Porter, A. G., Figueira, W. F., Coleman, R. A., Fobert, E. K., Ferrari R.
605 (2018). Fish-smart seawalls: a decision tool for adaptive management of marine
606 infrastructure. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment*

607 Moschella, P. S., Abbiati, M., Åberg, P., Airoidi, L., Anderson, J. M., Bacchiocchi, F., ...
608 Hawkins, S. J. (2005). Low-crested coastal defence structures as artificial habitats
609 for marine life: Using ecological criteria in design. *Coastal Engineering*, *52*, 1053–
610 1071.

611 Nordstrom, K. F. (2014). Living with shore protection structures: a review.
612 *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science*, *150*, 11–23.

613 Norton, T. A., Hawkins, S. J., Manley, N. L., Williams, G. A., & Watson, D. C. (1990).
614 Scraping a living: a review of littorinid grazing. *Hydrobiologia*, *193*, 117–138.

615 O'Connor, N. E. & Crowe, T. P. (2005). Biodiversity loss and ecosystem
616 functioning: distinguishing between number and identity of species. *Ecology*, *86*,
617 1783-1796.

618 Pister, B. (2009). Urban marine ecology in southern California: the ability of
619 riprap structures to serve as rocky intertidal habitat. *Marine Biology*, *156*, 861–
620 873.

621 Richards, S. A., Nisbet, R. M., Wilson, W. G., & Possingham, H.P. (2000). Grazers
622 and Diggers: Exploitation competition and coexistence among foragers with
623 different feeding strategies on a single resource. *The American Naturalist*, *155*(2),
624 266-279.

625 Rochette, R., & Dill, L. M. (2000). Mortality, behavior and the effects of predators
626 on the intertidal distribution of littorinid gastropods. *Journal of Experimental*
627 *Marine Biology and Ecology*, *253*, 165-191.

628 Santina, P. D. (1993). Homing pattern, activity area and trail following of the high
629 shore Mediterranean limpet *Patella rustica* L. (Mollusca Gastropoda). *Ethology,*
630 *Ecology, & Evolution*, 6, 65-73.

631 Schmitt, R. J. (1996). Exploitation competition in mobile grazers: trade-offs in use
632 of a limited resource. *Ecology*, 77, 408-425.

633 Schoener, T. W. (1974). Resource partitioning in ecological communities. *Science*,
634 185, 27-39.

635 Shanks, A. L. (2002). Previous agonistic experience determines both foraging
636 behavior and territoriality in the limpet *Lottia gigantea*. *Behavioral Ecology*
637 13(4), 467-471.

638 Steneck, R. S. (1982). A limpet-coralline alga association: adaptations and
639 defenses between a selective herbivore and its prey. *Ecology*, 63(2), 507-522

640 Steneck, R. S., Watling L. (1982). Feeding capabilities and limitations of
641 herbivorous molluscs: a functional group approach. *Marine Biology*, 68, 299-319.

642 Strain, E. M. A., Olabarria, C., Mayer-Pinto, M., Cumbo, V., Morris, R. L., Bugnot, A.
643 B., Dafforn, K. A., Heery, E., Firth, L. B., Brooks, P., Bishop, M. J. (2018). Eco-
644 engineering urban infrastructure for marine and coastal biodiversity: which
645 interventions have the greatest ecological benefit? *Journal of Applied Ecology*, 55:
646 426-441.

647 Underwood, A. J. (1977). Movement of intertidal gastropods. *Journal of*
648 *Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology*, 26, 191-201.

649 Vance, R. R. (1985). The stable coexistence of two competitors for one resource.
650 *The American Naturalist*, 126, 72-86.

651 Vaselli, S., Bulleri, F., & Benedetti-Cecchi, L. (2008). Hard coastal-defence
652 structures as habitats for native and exotic rocky-bottom species. *Marine*
653 *Environmental Research*, 66, 395-403.

654 Wilson, W. G., Osenberg, C. W., Schmitt, R. J., & Nisbet, R. M. (1999).
655 Complementary foraging behaviors allow coexistence of two consumers. *Ecology*,
656 80, 2358-2372.

657

658

659

660

661

662

663

664

665

666

667

668 **TABLES**

669 **Table 1.** Mean (\pm SE) numbers and richness of gastropods found on plots with
670 experimental pits added (n = 30) and unmanipulated controls (n = 10).

	<i>P. candei</i>	<i>T. striatus</i>	<i>M. neritoides</i>	Richness
Treatment	2.27 \pm 0.89	22.37 \pm 4.44	2.43 \pm 0.93	1.73 \pm 0.17
Control	0.10 \pm 0.10	0.40 \pm 0.22	0.20 \pm 0.13	0.60 \pm 0.27

671

672

673

674

675

676

677

678

679

680

681

682

683

684

685

686

687

688

689

690 **FIGURE CAPTIONS**

691 **Figure 1.** Different levels of patchiness obtained by drilling 16 pits (12 mm
692 diameter, 10 mm depth) within the plot areas, achieving (a) low, (b)
693 intermediate and (c) high patchiness. In Control plots (d), no pits are added.

694 **Figure 2.** Mean (+SE) dispersal of tagged individuals of *P. candei*, *T. striatus* and
695 *M. neritoides* on seawalls and natural rocky shores after (a) 1 and (b) 14 days.
696 Letters highlight significant differences among means as detected by *a posteriori*
697 comparisons (see Table S1 for further details).

698 **Figure 3.** Mean (+SE) grazing gastropod (a) richness and (b) Shannon diversity
699 in experimental enhanced areas of the seawall after 30 months at increasing
700 levels of the patchiness in the spatial distribution of pits. Letters highlight
701 significant differences among means as detected by *a posteriori* SNK tests (for
702 further details see Table S2)

703 **Figure 4.** Total number of individuals of (a) *P. candei*, (b) *T. striatus* and (c) *M.*
704 *neritoides* found after 30 months in experimentally enhanced areas of the
705 seawall at increasing levels of microhabitat patchiness.

706 **Figure 5.** (a) Mean (\pm SE) dispersal relative to controls among gastropod species
707 across all levels of microhabitat patchiness after 24h. Letters highlight significant
708 differences among means as detected by pair wise comparisons (for further
709 details see Table S4); (b) Proportion of relocated gastropods found inside pits
710 after 24h.