2016-02

Developmental toxicity of metaldehyde in the embryos of *Lymnaea stagnalis* (Gastropoda: Pulmonata) co-exposed to the synergist piperonyl butoxide

Hallett, KC

<http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/4530>

10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.11.040

Science of The Total Environment

Elsevier BV

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

**Developmental toxicity of metaldehyde in the embryos of
Lymnaea stagnalis (Gastropoda: Pulmonata) co-exposed
to the synergist piperonyl butoxide.**

Katrina C. Hallett^a, Andrew Atfield^b, Sean Comber^a, Thomas H. Hutchinson^{b†}

^aSchool of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Plymouth,
Drake Circus, Plymouth PL4 8AA, UK

&

^bSchool of Biological Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake Circus, Plymouth PL4
8AA, UK.

†Corresponding author: T.H. Hutchinson

Telephone 0044 1752 584469; Email tom.hutchinson@plymouth.ac.uk.

Suggested journal : STOTEN

Abstract

Metaldehyde is a tetramer of acetaldehyde and was first introduced as a molluscicide in 1936, remaining in wide use today for the control of mollusc pests in agriculture and horticulture. Damage to crops from slugs and snails is a major problem in many countries associated with relatively warm and wet winters. For example in the UK it is estimated that over 8 % of the area covered by arable crops is treated with formulated granular bait pellets containing metaldehyde as the principle active ingredient. Metaldehyde is hydrophilic ($\log P = 0.12$), water soluble (200 mg.L^{-1} at 17°C) and has been detected in UK surface waters in the concentration range of typically $0.2\text{-}0.6 \text{ }\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$ (maximum $2.7 \text{ }\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$) during 2008-2011. In the absence of chronic data on potential hazards to non-target freshwater molluscs, a laboratory study was conducted to investigate the impact of metaldehyde on embryonic development in the gastropod *Lymnaea stagnalis* (RENILYS strain) and using zinc as a positive control. *L. stagnalis* embryos were exposed to metaldehyde under semi-static conditions at $20 \pm 1^\circ\text{C}$ and hatching success and growth (measured as spire height and intraocular distance) examined after 21d. Exposure concentrations were verified using HPLC and gave 21d^{hatching}NOEC and 21d^{hatching}LOEC mean measured values of 36 and $116 \text{ mg MET.L}^{-1}$, respectively (equal to the 21d^{spire height}NOEC and 21d^{spire height}LOEC values). For basic research purposes, a second group of *L. stagnalis* embryos were co-exposed to metaldehyde and the pesticide synergist piperonyl butoxide (PBO). Co-exposure to the PBO (measured concentrations between $0.47\text{-}0.56 \text{ mg.L}^{-1}$) reduced hatching success from 100% to 47% and a 30% reduction in embryo growth (spire height) in snail embryos co-exposed to metaldehyde at $34\text{-}36 \text{ mg.L}^{-1}$ over 21d. In conclusion, these data suggest mollusc embryos may have some metabolic detoxification capacity for metaldehyde and further work is warranted to explore this aspect in order to support the recent initiative to include molluscs in the OECD test guideline programme.

Keywords: freshwater, pesticide, mollusc, metabolism, OECD

48 Introduction

49 The control of molluscs and other pests remains a major challenge for food
50 production in many regions. Crop damage by slug and snail pests is a major
51 problem in European agriculture and it has been compounded in recent years by the
52 mild, wet climate and changes in farming practices. It is estimated that over 8% of
53 the area covered by arable crops in the United Kingdom is treated with the slug
54 pellets and their active ingredient metaldehyde (Environment Agency, 2009). First
55 used as a molluscicide in the 1930's (Gimingham and Newton 1937), metaldehyde
56 (CAS number 108-62-3, molecular weight 176) is a crystalline solid and cyclic
57 tetramer of acetaldehyde, with a melting point of between 110-120°C. Metaldehyde
58 is persistent in the aquatic environment and is moderately soluble in water up to 200
59 mg.L⁻¹ at 17°C (Bieri 2003; USEPA 2006a; EFSA 2010). Common formulations
60 include solutions, dusts, pastes, foams, particulates and suspensions or as
61 formulated granular bait pellets (eg Cekumeta[®], Deadline[®], Hardy[®], Metarex[®] and
62 Metason[®]) (Zhang et al., 2011). Metaldehyde is also used as a molluscicide in rice
63 paddies and aquaculture systems in south east Asia (Calumpang et al., 1995;
64 Coloso et al., 1998). Metaldehyde is also used for some solid fuel camping stoves
65 and as a fire starter to preheat petrol stoves (Gupta 2012; Zen Stoves 2015). In the
66 United Kingdom, regulators have raised recent concerns about the relatively high
67 levels of metaldehyde detected in surface waters. It was first detected in surface
68 water in autumn 2007 following the development of new mass spectrometric
69 analytical techniques (Environment Agency 2009). From then until autumn 2012
70 there was a demonstrable downward trend in the number of occasions where
71 metaldehyde has been detected in raw and treated water. In 2012, however, the
72 challenge of a wet and mild summer, which had been the wettest since 1912 (371
73 mm mean UK average for June to August compared to 320 mm in 2008), followed
74 by the wettest April in 100 years and above average rainfall in May 2012 (Marshall
75 2013; Kay and Grayson 2014). These conditions significantly increased slug activity
76 and production of juvenile populations to levels which jeopardised autumn sowings,
77 in turn leading to an increase in metaldehyde use during 2012. Metaldehyde is
78 spread during autumn, due to the wetter weather and crop vulnerability, it can be
79 found at higher levels in surrounding environments during this time period. The main
80 mechanism by which metaldehyde enters water is either directly, through point

source spillages, via runoff or by-pass flow. Kay and Grayson (2014) reported concentrations of metaldehyde in the range 0.4 to 0.6 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$ (but sometimes up to 2.7 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$) in north east England between 2008 and 2011. Taking the specific example of the Metarex[®] formulation, the Predicted Exposure Concentrations for metaldehyde in surface waters (PEC_{sw}) under FOCUS Step 2 exposure scenario for Northern Europe ranged from 26.871 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$ and 19.016 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$ after 7 and 42 days, respectively (EFSA 2010). There is evidence indicating that existing water treatment processes are inadequate for removing metaldehyde residues from sources of drinking water. Metaldehyde concentrations up to 8 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$ have been reported in some UK drinking waters, in contrast to the regulatory limit for pesticide active ingredients in drinking water of 0.1 $\mu\text{g.L}^{-1}$) (Environment Agency 2009). However, metaldehyde is not effectively removed through adsorption onto activated carbon and hence there is considerable work to find effective removal methods (Li et al., 2010; Autin et al., 2012). Unsurprisingly, metaldehyde residues have also been detected in crops and in soil sampled from various regions (Selim & Seiber 1973; Zhang & Dai 2006; Zhang et al., 2011).

In terms of the hazard profile of metaldehyde, the evidence indicates moderate mammalian toxicity. Metaldehyde poisoning is characterised by central nervous system depression and convulsions. Several cases of deliberate or accidental ingestion by man, pets or domestic animals have been reported (WHO 1996; Jones & Charlton 1999; Bleakley et al., 2008). Mice receiving an oral dose of 100 mg.kg^{-1} body weight died within two hours of exposure. Signs of poisoning included sedation, shivering, whole body tremors, convulsions and death. In cattle, horses and dogs mild poisoning was evidenced by salivation ataxia and hypernea. Symptoms observed in severe poisoning included convulsions, sweating, tachycardia and muscle spasms, with death usually attributed to respiratory failure (WHO 1996). Metaldehyde induced convulsions in mice were accompanied by a reduction in the levels of serotonin and noradrenaline in the brain and increased monoamine oxidase activity (Mills et al., 1992).

In molluscs, metaldehyde can act as either a contact or stomach poison. A number of authors have described metaldehyde's toxic mode of action in molluscs as causing irreversible damage in the mucous cells of the skin and gut lining. This leads to excessive mucus production, destruction of the mucus cells, damage to absorptive

cells of the heptatopancreas and death (Triebkorn 1989; Triebkorn & Ebert 1989; Coloso et al., 1998; Triebkorn et al., 1998). In addition to this the quality of mucus produced is diminished. Furthermore Mills et al. (1990 & 1992) described the electrophysiological perturbation and feeding disruption associated with the toxic mode of action of metaldehyde. Experimental analysis indicated that acetaldehyde was present in the haemolymph of slugs immediately after the end of a metaldehyde meal (Mills et al., 1990). Comparing the impacts of a pellet formulation on terrestrial molluscs (slugs) with the freshwater gastropod *Lymnaea stagnalis*, Mills et al. (1990) reported that a metaldehyde concentration of 5 g.kg⁻¹ in the pellet reduced the meal duration and number of bites in slugs by about 70% compared to control. In *L. stagnalis*, however, the same metaldehyde concentration reduced the meal duration by approximately 25%. Differences in the concentration required to produce a given effect may be due to differences in the rate of absorption or amount of body contact with the pellet, or differences in the aversive chemosensory response to metaldehyde. The study by Mills et al (1990) provides good evidence of metaldehyde's neurotoxic mode of action and that some of the toxic symptoms in slugs and other terrestrial molluscs are likely mediated by acetaldehyde. There is also a growing body of evidence describing the toxicity of metaldehyde to earthworms and other non-target terrestrial invertebrates (Iglesias et al., 2003; Langan & Shaw 2006; Edwards et al., 2009; Rae et al., 2009; Gavin et al., 2012; Cardoso et al., 2015). In terms of aquatic non-target species, the most sensitive species included in a recent review by EFSA (2010) is the freshwater amphipod *Gammarus pseudolimnaeus* with a 96h EC50 of 19.3 mg.L⁻¹. While Coloso et al. (1998) reported over 80% snail mortality after 7d in milkfish ponds treated with metaldehyde at 0.38-1.55 mg.L⁻¹, EFSA (2010) reported a 48h EC50 of >200 mg.L⁻¹ for the freshwater ramshorn snail *Planorbis corneus*. However, there is a lack of published experimental data (supported chemical analysis) on the potential longer terms impacts of metaldehyde on non-target freshwater molluscs. The current work aims to help address this gap using a recently adopted OECD test species *Lymnaea stagnalis* (Ducrot et al., 2014).

From a basic research perspective, relatively little is known about the ability of many molluscan species to metabolise pesticides. One approach to exploring this possibility in aquatic species is to use metabolic inhibitors of key detoxification

pathways (Ankley et al., 1991; El-Merhibi et al., 2004); Weinstein & Garner 2008). One such inhibitor is piperonyl butoxide (PBO) (CAS: 51-03-6) which is also a widely used insecticide synergist (US EPA 2006b). The effectiveness of piperonyl butoxide as an insecticide synergist lies in its ability to inhibit several isozymes of cytochrome P450 (CYP450) system (Ankley & Collyard 1995; Feyereisen 2015). Piperonyl butoxide has also been used as an inhibitor of xenobiotic metabolism in fish where it inhibits the metabolism of aldrin, methoxychlor and trifluralin (Reinbold & Metcalf 1976). Piperonyl butoxide also reduces the biotransformation 2,8-dichlorodibenzo-p-dioxin and pentachlorobenzene in goldfish (Sijm et al. 1993). In molluscs, Singh et al (2005) used piperonyl butoxide or the metabolic inhibitor MGK-264 (also termed ENT8184) to enhance the impacts of plant-derived molluscicides on reproduction of *Lymnaea acuminata*. Hence for basic research purposes, in addition to conducting exposures on metaldehyde *per se* this study also examined the potential for piperonyl butoxide to modify the developmental toxicity of metaldehyde in the embryos of *Lymnaea stagnalis*. All experiments included zinc as a positive control chemical as recommended by UK environmental regulators (Environment Agency 2007).

Materials and Methods

Organism culturing. A culture of the RENILYS strain of *Lymnaea stagnalis* (kindly donated by colleagues at INRA, Rennes, France) was established at Plymouth University in October 2013 and cultured in 30 L aquaria (20 ± 1°C in synthetic fresh water). The culture water was changed twice weekly and animals fed organic lettuce *ad libitum* as per the method of Ducrot et al (2014). The aquaria were kept at a 14:10 light dark cycle using full spectrum UV lights.

Embryos ('egg masses') were harvested from tanks of adults daily as needed for the experiments. Adapting the method of Liu et al (2013), individual embryos that had not developed past the two cell stage were collected by separating each embryo from the gelatinous mass under low power magnification (10x) and placing them into culture wells of a 24 well microplate (Thermoscientific, Nunclon Delta Surface).

Embryonic toxicity of zinc over 7d (defining the positive control). The first experiment (30 May – 6 June 2014) was conducted to define the optimal concentration of zinc for use as a positive control in future developmental toxicity

experiments using the embryos of the RENILYS strain of *L. stagnalis*. Adapting the method of Badow & Weltje (2012), a 7d semi-static toxicity test was conducted with 20 individual embryos each placed into a single well of a 24 well microplate. The test compound was zinc sulphate heptahydrate ($\text{ZnSO}_4 \cdot 7\text{H}_2\text{O}$; CAS number 7446-20-0) purchased from Sigma-Aldrich, Poole UK (purity $\geq 99\%$). Nominal zinc concentrations used for the 7d study were 0.1, 0.32, 1.0, 3.2, 10 and 32 mg Zn.L^{-1} in synthetic freshwater and all control and zinc test solutions were verified by Inductively Coupled Plasma - Optical Emission Spectrometry (ICP-OES). Briefly, for ICP-OES test solution samples were collected and acidified prior to being analysed using a Thermoscientific iCap 7000 400 with a Burgener PEEK miramist nebuliser and a cyclone spray chamber. The ICP-OES had an exposure time 2,2; RF product 1150; Viewing height 12; Coolant gas 12; Auxiliary gas flow, 0.5; and additional gas flow 0). Test solution renewals were conducted every other day and the physico-chemical parameters of the water checked in parallel microplates. Mean measured zinc concentrations were calculated based on 4 samples from each treatment over 7d. *L. stagnalis* embryo development was observed daily using an Olympus stereomicroscope. Nominal and mean measured (in parentheses) zinc concentrations were 0 (0.003), 0.10 (0.12), 0.32 (0.212), 1.0 (0.66), 3.2 (1.82), 10 (5.93) and 32 (17.34) mg Zn.L^{-1} , with an overall mean measured zinc concentration 60.8% of nominal values (based on ICP-OES with a limit of detection of 0.001 mg Zn.L^{-1}). Physico-chemical parameters for the study were: conductivity 866 - 987 $\mu\text{S.cm}^{-1}$; dissolved oxygen 60 - 95% saturation; pH 6.9 – 8.1; temperature 20.1 – 21.9°C. Based on this study (Table 1), the 7d EC50 for embryo development was 1.23 mg Zn.L^{-1} (based on mean measured Zn concentrations) hence a nominal concentration of 2.0 mg Zn.L^{-1} was used as a positive control for subsequent experiments. This compares well with the Environment Agency (2007) recommendation to use between 0.1 - 10 mg Zn.L^{-1} for quality assurance purposes within UK effluent Direct Toxicity Testing programmes using *Daphnia magna*.

Embryonic toxicity of piperonyl butoxide over 14d. The developmental toxicity of PBO to *L. stagnalis* embryos was examined over 14 d (from 1-15 July 2014) using the same static renewal test design as for the zinc exposure study and including a positive control treatment of 2.0 mg Zn.L^{-1} . Piperonyl butoxide (CAS number 51-03-6) was purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (technical grade purity 90%) and solutions

were made up in synthetic freshwater and using Analar[®] grade ethanol (0.64 mL.L⁻¹) as a carrier solvent. The experiment was conducted with 20 individual embryos each placed into a separate well on a 24 well microplate. Nominal PBO concentrations were chosen based on the papers by Ankley et al (1991) and Ankley & Collyard (1995) and parallel microplates were run in order to allow analysis of the PBO concentrations and standard physico-chemical water quality parameters. *L. stagnalis* embryo development was observed daily using an Olympus stereomicroscope. Also, after 13d embryos were photographed in order to measure shell spire height and inter-ocular distance as a sign of toxicity (adapting the zebrafish embryo method described by Loucks & Ahlgren (2012)). Test solutions were changed on alternate days and the physico-chemical parameters of the water checked in parallel plates. PBO analyses were conducted by using fluorescence spectrometry based on four sampling points over the 14 d exposure period. Briefly, the PBO analyses were conducted using a Hitachi F-4500 Fluorescence spectrophotometer. The system was run using EX start WL 200 nm; Ex end WL 300 nm, EX sampling interval 10.0; EM start WL 300; EM end WL 350; EM sampling interval 10.0; with a scan speed of 2400 nm.min⁻¹; Ex slit 5.0 nm, Em slit 5.0 nm, PMT voltage 950V, response 0.004s. Using this approach the overall mean measured PBO concentration was 224% of nominal values (with a limit of detection of 0.02 mg PBO.L⁻¹ using fluorescence spectrometry). Physico-chemical parameters for the study were: dissolved oxygen 69 - 95% saturation; pH 7.5 – 8.0; temperature 18.5 - 22.0°C. Based on the results of this study (Table 2), the embryo 14d^{spire height} NOEC and^{spire height} LOEC values were 0.43 and 1.03 mg PBO.L⁻¹, respectively and these values were used to aid the design of the following experiment with metaldehyde ± PBO.

Embryonic toxicity of metaldehyde – 7d range finder. The impact of metaldehyde per se on *L. stagnalis* embryonic development was examined using a 7 day static renewal toxicity test (with 20 individual embryos placed into separate wells of a 24 well microplate. The nominal exposure concentrations of metaldehyde in synthetic freshwater were 1.0, 3.2, 10, 32 and 100 mg.L⁻¹, plus the dilution water control and positive control (nominally 2.0 mg Zn.L⁻¹). Metaldehyde analysis was carried out with a Shimadzu LC20AD liquid chromatograph, Shimadzu SIL20A HT Autosampler, Shimadzu SPD20A UV-vis spectrophotometer (Column: Thermo Hypersil-Keystone,

ODS, 5 μm 150 x 4.6 mm length). Samples of water were added to DNHP (0.25g.100 mL⁻¹ of 50% sulphuric acid) reagent. 1 ml of sample and 0.3 ml of DNHP were added to 1.5 ml capacity vials for the auto sampler. Standards of 1, 2, 5 and 10 mg.L⁻¹ were used and concentrations higher than 10 mg.L⁻¹ were diluted 10x in order to fit within the calibration.

Embryonic toxicity of metaldehyde $\pm$ PBO over 21d. In the absence of notable embryonic mortalities in any metaldehyde exposure group during the 7d range-finding study, for the 21d experiment (29 July -19 August 2014) the nominal exposure concentrations of metaldehyde prepared in synthetic freshwater were 1.0, 3.2, 10, 32 and 100 mg.L⁻¹, plus the dilution water control and positive control (nominally 2.0 mg Zn.L⁻¹). All metaldehyde exposures were also conducted using a nominal synergist concentration of 0.5 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (in ethanol at 0.64 mL.L⁻¹). *L. stagnalis* embryo development was observed daily using an Olympus stereomicroscope. After the initial placement in the wells, each individual was also photographed using high powered microscopy (Tills et al. 2010), with an Optem Zoom 70, Allied Vision Technology, Pike f210c camera in order to measure shell spire height, inter-ocular distance and heart rate as indicators of sublethal toxicity. The hatching success of each treatment was monitored daily from 14 days post fertilisation (dpf). Test solutions were changed on alternate days and the physico-chemical parameters of the water checked in parallel plates. Mean measured zinc concentrations in the dilution water was 0.002 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (LOD of 0.001 mg Zn.L⁻¹). The overall mean measured PBO concentrations ranged from 0.47 – 0.56 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (with a limit of detection of 0.02 mg PBO.L⁻¹ using fluorescence spectrometry). Physico-chemical parameters for the study were: dissolved oxygen 80-99% saturation; pH 7.5 – 8.1; temperature 19.4 - 20.9°C.

Statistical Analyses. Embryo development data from the initial 7d experiment with zinc were analysed using SIGMAPLOT 13 from Systat Software Inc[®] to derive the EC10 and EC50 values and their 95% confidence intervals (based on mean measured Zn concentrations). The No Observed Effect Concentration (^{development}NOEC) and Lowest Observed Effect Concentration (^{development}LOEC) for the same zinc exposure were calculated by one-way ANOVA using Minitab[®]. For the 14d embryo toxicity test using only PBO, the embryo development, shell spire height

and inter-ocular distances were also calculated by one-way ANOVA using Minitab®. It was not possible to calculate the EC10 and EC50 values for this 14d experiment due to the absence of a full concentration-response curve. Finally, for the 21d metaldehyde experiment, embryo hatching success at 21d was evaluated using a series of Kruskal-Wallis rank-based nonparametric tests in Minitab® in order to derive the ^{hatching}NOEC and ^{hatching}LOEC for metaldehyde *per se*. The 21d results from the combined metaldehyde and PBO treatments were also analysed by one-way ANOVA in Minitab® in order to identify statistically significant differences in the present or absence of the PBO synergist.

Results

Embryonic toxicity of zinc over 7d. The specific purpose of this experiment was to define a concentration of zinc that would generate a dramatic toxic response in the embryos of *L. stagnalis* RENILYS (Table 1). After 7d, the ^{development}EC50 was 2.0267 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (nominal concentration) which equated to 1.23 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (based on mean measured Zn concentrations).

Embryonic toxicity of piperonyl butoxide over 14d. Exposure of embryos for 14d up to 2.34 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (based on mean measured PBO concentrations) generated no developmental inhibition. In contrast, snail embryos exposed to the positive control (2.0 mg Zn.L⁻¹) had a 90% reduction in normal development (Table 2). The embryonic shell spire height was inhibited by piperonyl butoxide exposure and gave 14d ^{spire height}NOEC and ^{spire height}LOEC values of 0.43 and 1.03 mg PBO.L⁻¹, respectively as mean measured concentrations (one-way ANOVA; P<0.001). In contrast, the embryonic inter-ocular distance was unaffected by piperonyl butoxide exposure and gave a 14d ^{interocular distance}NOEC value of ≥2.34 mg PBO.L⁻¹ based on mean measured concentrations. As a key goal of this experiment was to define a Maximum Tolerated Concentration (MTC) of piperonyl butoxide that did not cause developmental toxicity in the snail embryos, the MTC was considered to be approximately 0.5 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (Hutchinson et al., 2009).

Embryonic toxicity of metaldehyde ± PBO over 21d. Since there was no significant snail embryonic mortalities after 7d exposure to metaldehyde up 100

mg.L⁻¹, this was chosen as the highest exposure concentration for the subsequent 21d experiment in accordance with standard OECD recommendations not to exceed this value unless there is environmental exposure data to warrant higher test concentrations. Based on mean measured concentrations of metaldehyde only, this gave 21d ^{hatching success}NOEC and ^{hatching success}LOEC values of 36 and 116 mg.L⁻¹, respectively (one-way ANOVA; P<0.05) (Table 3). Similarly, using mean measured concentrations of metaldehyde only also gave 21d ^{spire height}NOEC and ^{spire height}LOEC values of 36 and 116 mg.L⁻¹, respectively (one-way ANOVA; P<0.05). There were also statistically significant differences in hatching success between all metaldehyde treatment in the presence or absence of PBO at a measured concentration of between 0.47-0.56 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (P≤0.045). The test concentration of 109 mg MET.L⁻¹ and 0.47 mg PBO.L⁻¹ is statistically significant from the ethanol and dilution water controls and all other test concentrations (P<0.05). The use of zinc as a positive control also achieved its aim and no embryos hatched after 21d when exposed to a nominal concentration of 2.0 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (Table 3). In terms of the intra-ocular observations, there were no statistically significant differences between embryos for any metaldehyde and PBO treatment group whereas there was a significant difference for the Zn positive control as these embryos failed to develop any eyespots (P=<0.001). Embryo heart rate data made using video microscopy showed considerable variability in the dilution water controls (mean values ranging from 59.1 to 75.5 beats.min⁻¹ measured between 7d to 20d) and the ethanol solvent control (mean values ranging from 49.5 to 79.8 beats.min⁻¹ measured between 7d to 20d). The measured heart rates of embryos exposed to metaldehyde only at 116 mg.L⁻¹ had mean values ranging from 31.6 to 65.5 beats.min⁻¹ between 7d to 20d and for the 36 mg.L⁻¹ metaldehyde exposure group had mean values ranging from 31.4 to 77.0 beats.min⁻¹ between 7d to 20d. For the metaldehyde (33.7 mg.L⁻¹) and piperonyl butoxide (0.47 mg.L⁻¹) embryo heart rates ranged from 44.0 to 62.1 beats.min⁻¹ between 7d to 20d and the range was similar for other metaldehyde and piperonyl butoxide treatments. Overall there was no clear evidence over time of metaldehyde or piperonyl butoxide having a consistent effect in heart rate in *L. stagnalis* embryos in this study.

Discussion

The goals of the project were (1) to generate information on the developmental toxicity of metaldehyde to non-target freshwater molluscs in order to strengthen the EFSA (2010) risk assessment for surface waters; and (2) investigate through the use of a P450 inhibitor whether the embryos of *L. stagnalis* can possibly detoxify metaldehyde under laboratory conditions. For the first objective, the results of the 21d experiment suggest an overall 21d NOEC value for metaldehyde of 36 mg.L⁻¹ based on hatching success and growth (measured as shell spire height) (Table 3). In comparison, the EFSA (2010) data review cites an acute lethality study using freshwater ramshorn snails (*Planorbis corneus*) with a 48h EC50 > 200 mg.L⁻¹ (Table 4). Given that measured concentrations of metaldehyde in UK freshwater sites is in the range 0.4 to 0.6 µg.L⁻¹ (with but sometimes up to 2.7 µg.L⁻¹ as reported by Kay and Grayson 2014) this suggests a large margin of safety for non-target freshwater gastropod populations. This conclusion is also broadly supported by the EFSA (2010) predictive exposure modelling for one slug bait formulation (Metarex[®]) which cites Predicted Exposure Concentrations for metaldehyde in surface waters (PEC_{sw}) under a FOCUS Step 2 exposure scenario for Northern Europe of 19.016 µg.L⁻¹ after 42 days.

With regard to the second objective, piperonyl butoxide was successfully used as a metabolic detoxification inhibitor to suggest that the embryos of *L. stagnalis* can detoxify metaldehyde under the conditions of the 21d laboratory experiment. The 14d MTC for piperonyl butoxide was successfully defined as nominally 0.5 mg PBO.L⁻¹ (14d NOEC of 0.43 mg PBO.L⁻¹ based on measured values) for *L. stagnalis* RENILYS embryos (Table 2). The inhibition of *L. stagnalis* embryo growth (as spire height) at 1.03 and 2.34 mg PBO.L⁻¹ may be linked to PBO impacts on metabolism since PBO has the ability to bind to cytochrome P450 (Weinstein & Garner, 2008). In theory, the resulting reduction in metabolic output could cause a reduction in organism growth rates such that the snail embryos may have had insufficient energy to grow and develop normally. The plant growth regulator flurprimidol has also been reported as reducing growth by blocking the cytochrome P450 system (Rademacher, 2000). More broadly, the piperonyl butoxide data suggest a sensitivity for gastropod embryos similar to that reported by Ankley et al (1991) for *Ceriodaphnia dubia* (48h LC50 of 1.0 mg PBO.L⁻¹), *Daphnia magna* (48h LC50 of 2.83 mg PBO.L⁻¹) and

Daphnia pulex (48h LC50 of 1.62 mg PBO.L⁻¹). As shown in Table 3, snail embryo hatching success was reduced by very high concentrations of metaldehyde (116 mg.L⁻¹). Currently, the embryos were maintained at 20 ± 1°C; however, there was variation in the hatching time of the different treatments. Embryos in the dilution water control started hatching at 13 days post-fertilisation (dpf) (10/38) and continued at a steady rate. However in the 1.0 mg MET.L⁻¹ exposures, embryo hatching started at 14 dpf (3/20) which at 3.53, 9.0 and 36 mg MET.L⁻¹ the start of embryo hatching was delayed until 15 dpf (18/79) and the 116 mg MET.L⁻¹ started at 16 dpf (2/40). In comparison, Smirthwaite et al. (2007) investigated the timing differences in developmental events of several gastropod species and reported that *L. stagnalis* (strain unspecified) cultured at 20 ± 1°C would typically hatch at 14 dpf. As shown in Table 3, only the 109 mg MET.L⁻¹ and 0.47 mg PBO.L⁻¹ exposure group totally failed to have any successful hatching after 21d. The metabolism and detoxification of metaldehyde could be using a substantial amount of energy that the embryo would usually use for growth and development (Strathmann 1985; Tills et al., 2010; Munley et al., 2013). However, during this study it was noted that even though there was a reduction in hatching success, the embryos appeared to develop normally throughout the 21 days. An explanation for the delay in effects could be the egg case acting as a barrier to toxicants. *L. stagnalis* embryo development takes place inside a large gelatinous capsule and therefore this protects against chemicals such as metaldehyde. Carls and Rice (1988) showed a similar pattern in fish embryos exposed to hydrocarbons, where there were sub-lethal effects on the embryos in the absence of mortalities.

In conclusion, chronic effects of metaldehyde on embryo development of *L. stagnalis* under laboratory conditions have been defined (high mg.L⁻¹ range) and suggest a low risk to the early life stages of gastropod molluscs relative to reported environmental exposures (low µg.L⁻¹ range). As noted by Bandow and Weltje (2012), the 21d test design could be a very useful supplement to the draft OECD test guideline to assess reproduction in *L. stagnalis* (Ducrot et al., 2014). Finally piperonyl butoxide was successfully used to generate evidence that gastropod embryos may have some P450-based metabolic capacity to detoxify metaldehyde. Further research is warranted to explore this theme further using a wider range of agrochemicals and different metabolic inhibitors (Feyereisen 2015).

References

- Ankley, G.T., Collyard, S.A. (1995). Influence of piperonyl butoxide on the toxicity of organophosphate insecticides to three species of freshwater benthic invertebrates. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol.* 110C: 149–155
- Ankley, G.T., Dierkes, J.R., Jensen, D.A., Peterson, G.S. (1991). Piperonyl butoxide as a tool in aquatic toxicology research with organophosphate insecticides. *Ectotoxicol. Environ Safety* 21: 266–274
- Autin, O., Hart J., Jarvis P., MacAdam J., Parsons SA., Jefferson B. (2012) Comparison of UV/H₂O₂ and UV/TiO₂ for the degradation of metaldehyde: kinetics and the impact of background organics. *Water Res* 46: 5655-5662
- Bandow, C., Weltje, L. (2012). Development of an embryo toxicity test with the pond snail *Lymnaea stagnalis* using the model substance tributyltin and common solvents. *Sci. Total Environ.* 435-436: 90–95
- Bieri, M., (2003). The environmental profile of metaldehyde. In: BCPC Symposium Proceedings, British Crop Protection Council, pp. 255–262
- Bleakley, C., Ferrie, E., Collum, N., Burke, L. (2008). Self-poisoning with metaldehyde. *Emergency medicine journal : EMJ*, 25(6), 381–382
- Calumpang, S.M.F., Median, M.J.B., Tejada, A.W., Medina, J.R. (1995). Environmental impact of two molluscicides: niclosamide and metaldehyde in a rice paddy ecosystem. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 55: 494 – 501
- Cardoso, D.N., Santos, M.J.G., Soares, A.M.V.M., Loureiro, S. (2015) Molluscicide baits impair the life traits of *Folsomia candida* (Collembola): possible hazard to the population level and soil function. *Chemosphere* 132: 1-7
- Carls, M.G., Rice, S.D. (1988). Sensitivity differences between eggs and larvae of walleye pollock to hydrocarbons. *Mar Environ Res* 26: 285–297

- Coloso, R.M., Borlongan, I.G., Blum, R. (1998) Use of metaldehyde as a molluscicide in semi-commercial and commercial milkfish ponds. *Crop Protection* 17: 669–674
- Ducrot V., Askem C., Azam D., Brettschneider D., Brown R., Charles S., Coke M., Collinet M., Delignette-Muller M., Forfait-Dubuc C., Holbech H., Hutchinson T.H., *et al.* 2014. Development and validation of an OECD reproductive toxicity test guideline with the pond snail *Lymnaea stagnalis* (Mollusca: Gastropoda). *Regulatory Toxicology & Pharmacology* 70: 605-614
- Edwards, C.A., Arancon, N.Q., Vasko-Bennett, M., Little, B., Askar, A. (2009) The relative toxicity of metaldehyde and iron phosphate-based molluscicides to earthworms. *Crop Protection* 28: 289–294
- El-Merhibi, A., Kumar, A., Smeaton, T. (2004). Role of piperonyl butoxide in the toxicity of chlorpyrifos to *Ceriodaphnia dubia* and *Xenopus laevis*. *Ecotoxicol Environ Safety* 57: 202–212
- Environment Agency (2007). The direct toxicity assessment of aqueous environmental samples using the juvenile *Daphnia magna* immobilisation test. Methods for the Examination of Waters and Associated Materials. Available from https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/316804/daphnia208_1669241.pdf (accessed 18 September 2015)
- Environment Agency (2009) The determination of metaldehyde in waters using chromatography with mass spectrometric detection. Available from https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/316782/Metaldehyde-226b.pdf (accessed 18 September 2015)
- European Food Safety Authority. 2010. Conclusion on the peer review of the pesticide risk assessment of the active substance metaldehyde. *EFSA Journal* 8(10): 1856

- Feyereisen R. (2015) Insect P450 inhibitors and insecticides: challenges and opportunities. *Pestic Manag Sci* 71: 793-800
- Gavin, W.E., Mueller-Warrant, G.W., Griffith, S.M., Banowetz, G.M., 2012. Removal of molluscicidal bait pellets by earthworms and its impact on control of the gray field slug (*Derocerus reticulatum* Mueller) in western Oregon grass seed fields. *Crop Protection* 42: 94–101
- Gimingham, C.T., Newton, H.C.F., 1937. A Poison Bait for Slugs, *The Journal of the Ministry of Agriculture* Vol. XLIV, 3: 242 – 246
- Gupta, R.C. (2012). *Veterinary Toxicology: Basic and Clinical Principles*. 2nd ed. London: Elsevier. 624-630
- Hutchinson T.H., Bögi C., Winter M.J., Owens J.W. 2009. Benefits of the Maximum Tolerated Dose (MTD) and Maximum Tolerated Concentration (MTC) concept in aquatic toxicology. *Aquatic Toxicology* 91: 197–202
- Iglesias, J., Castillejo, J., Castro, R., 2003. The effects of repeated applications of the molluscicide metaldehyde and the biocontrol nematode *Phasmarhabditis hermaphrodita* on molluscs, earthworms, nematodes, acarids and collembolans: a two-year study in north-west Spain. *Pest Manag Sci* 59: 1217–1224
- Jones, A., Charlton, A., 1999. Determination of metaldehyde in suspected cases of animal poisoning using gas chromatography–ion trap mass spectrometry. *J. Agric. Food Chem* 47: 4675–4677
- Kay, P., Grayson, R. (2014) Using water industry data to assess the metaldehyde pollution problem. *Water and Environment Journal* 28: 410-417
- Langan, A.M., Shaw, E.M. (2006) Responses of the earthworm *Lumbriculus terrestris* (L.) to iron phosphate and metaldehyde slug pellet formulations. *Appl. Soil Ecol.* 34: 184–189

501 Li, C., Wu, Y.-L., Yang, T., Zhang, Y. (2010) Determination of metaldehyde in water
 502 by SPE and UPLC-MS-MS. *Chromatographia* 72: 987–991
 503

504 Liu, T., Koene, J. M., Dong, X. (2013). Sensitivity of isolated eggs of pond snails : a
 505 new method for toxicity assays and risk assessment. *Environ. Monit Assess* 185:
 506 4183–4190

507 Loucks, E., Ahlgren, S. (2012) Assessing teratogenic changes in a zebrafish model
 508 of fetal alcohol exposure. *Journal of Visualized Experiments* 61: 1–6

509 Marshal, J. (2013). Briefing paper on , Water UK. Water UK (pp. 1–5)

510 Mills, J.D., McCrohan, R.C., Bailey, S.E.R. (1992). Electrophysiological responses to
 511 metaldehyde in neurones of the feeding circuitry of the snail *Lymnaea stagnalis*.
 512 *Pestic Biochem Physiol* 42: 35–42

513 Mills, J.D., McCrohan, C.R., Bailey, S.E.R. (1990) Effects of metaldehyde and
 514 acetaldehyde on feeding responses and neuronal activity in the snail *Lymnaea*
 515 *stagnalis*. *Pestic Sci* 28: 89–99

516 Munley, K.M., Brix, K.V, Panlilio, J., Deforest, D.K., Grosell, M. (2013). Growth
 517 inhibition in early life-stage tests predicts full life-cycle toxicity effects of lead in
 518 the freshwater pulmonate snail , *Lymnaea stagnalis*. *Aquatic Toxicology*, 128-
 519 129, 60–66

520 PAN. (2010) PAN pesticides database, metaldehyde [online].
 521 http://www.pesticideinfo.org/Detail_Chemical.jsp?Rec_Id=PC32878 [accessed
 522 12 September 2015].
 523

524 Paolo, M., Renzo, B., 1983. Determination of metaldehyde in workroom air. *Bull.*
 525 *Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 30: 479–484

526 Rademacher, W. (2000). Growth retardants: effects on gibberellin biosynthesis and
 527 other metabolic pathways. *Ann Rev Plant Biol* 51: 501–531

528 Rae, R.G., Robertson, J.F., Wilson, M.J. (2009) Optimization of biological
529 (Phasmarhabditis hermaphrodita) and chemical (iron phosphate and
530 metaldehyde) slug control. Crop Prot 28: 765–773

531 Reinbold, K.A., Metcalf, R.L. (1976) Effects of the synergist piperonyl butoxide on
532 metabolism of pesticides in green sunfish. Pestic Biochem Physiol 6: 401-412

533 Selim, S., Seiber, J.N., 1973. Gas chromatographic method for the analysis of
534 metaldehyde in crop tissues. J. Agric. Food Chem. 21: 430–433

535 Shelley, L.K., Balfry, S.K., Ross, P.S., Kennedy, C.J. (2009). Immunotoxicological
536 effects of a sub-chronic exposure to selected current use pesticides in rainbow
537 trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Aquatic Toxicol 92: 95–103

538 Sijm, D.T.H.M., Schaap, G., Opperhuizen, A. (1993) The effect of the
539 biotransformation inhibitor piperonyl butoxide on the bioconcentration of 2,8-
540 dichlorodibenzo-p-dioxin and pentachlorobenzene in goldfish. Aquatic Toxicol
541 27: 345–359

542 Singh, P., Singh, V.K., Singh, D.K. (2005) Effect of binary combinations of some
543 plant-derived molluscicides with MGK-264 or piperonyl butoxide on the
544 reproduction of the snail *Lymnaea acuminata*. Pestic Manag Sci 61: 204-208

545 Smirthwaite, J. J., Rundle, S. D., Bininda-Emonds, O. R. P., Spicer, J. I. (2007). An
546 integrative approach identifies developmental sequence heterochronies in
547 freshwater basommatophoran snails. Evolution Devel 9: 122–130

548 Strathmann, R.R. (1985) Feeding and non-feeding larval development and life
549 history evolution in marine invertebrates. Ann Rev Ecol Systematics 16: 339-361

550 Tills, O., Spicer, J., Rundle, S. (2010) Salinity-induced heterokairy in an upper
551 estuarine population of the snail *Radix balthica* (Mollusca: Pulmonata). Aquat
552 Biol 9: 95-105

553 Triebkorn, R. (1989). Ultrastructural changes in the digestive tract of *Deroceras*
554 *reticulatum* (Müller) induced by a carbamate molluscicide and metaldehyde.
555 Malacologia 31: 141-156
556

557 Triebskorn, R., Ebert, D. (1989). The importance of mucus production in slugs'
 558 reaction to molluscicides and the impact of molluscicides on the mucus
 559 producing system. In: Slugs and Snails in World Agriculture, ed. I F Henderson,
 560 pp. 373 - 378. BCPC Monograph No. 41.

561 Triebskorn, R., Christensen, K., Heim, I. (1998). Effects of orally and dermally
 562 applied metaldehyde on mucus cells of slugs (*Deroceras reticulatum*) depending
 563 on temperature and duration of exposure. Journal of Molluscan Studies 64: 467-
 564 487

565 US EPA (2006a). Reregistration Eligibility Decision for Metaldehyde. Prevention,
 566 Pesticides and Toxic Substances. Document reference OPP-2005- 0231 (54
 567 pages)

568 US EPA (2006b). Reregistration Eligibility Decision for Piperonyl Butoxide (PBO).
 569 Prevention, Pesticides and Toxic Substances. Document reference EPA 738-R-
 570 06-005 (112 pages)

571 Weinstein, J.E., Garner, T.R. (2008). Piperonyl butoxide enhances the
 572 bioconcentration and photoinduced toxicity of fluoranthene and benzo[a]pyrene
 573 to larvae of the grass shrimp (*Palaemonetes pugio*). Aquatic Toxicol 87: 28-36

574 WHO. (1996). WHO/FAO Data sheets on pesticides. No. 93.

575 Zen stoves (2015) Information on META solid fuel for camping stoves. Available
 576 from <http://zenstoves.net/> [accessed 17 September 2015]

577 Zhang, X.Y., Dai, X.F., (2006) Degradation and determination of residues of
 578 metaldehyde in tobacco and soil. Chinese J. Pestic. Sci. 8: 344–348

579 Zhang, H.-Y., Wang, C., Lu, H.-Z., Guan, W.-B., & Ma, Y.-Q. (2011). Residues and
 580 dissipation dynamics of molluscicide metaldehyde in cabbage and soil. Ecotoxic
 581 Environ Safety 74: 1653–1658

582

583

Table 1. Developmental toxicity of the reference chemical zinc sulfate heptahydrate (CAS number 7446-20-0) to *Lymnaea stagnalis* RENILYS® embryos under semi-static conditions over 7d at 20 ± 2°C.

Time	Response	Embryo development (expressed as mean measured mg Zn.L ⁻¹ ; n=20)			
		EC ₁₀ (± 95% CI)	EC ₅₀ (± 95% CI)	LOEC	NOEC
48 hr	Development (morphology)	6.08 (5.98 – 6.18)	>17.34	>17.34	17.34
96hr	Development (Spinning Behaviour)	1.98 (1.82 – 2.13)	3.78 (3.73 – 3.83)	5.93	1.82
7 day	Development (morphology)	0.53 (0.11 – 1.05)	1.23 (1.18 – 1.31)	1.82	0.66

Footnote - Nominal and mean measured (in parentheses) zinc concentrations were 0 (0.003), 0.10 (0.12), 0.32 (0.212), 1.0 (0.66), 3.2 (1.82), 10 (5.93) and 32 (17.34) mg Zn.L⁻¹, with an overall mean measured zinc concentration 60.8% of nominal values (based on Inductively Coupled Plasma - Optical Emission Spectrometry with a limit of detection of 0.001 mg Zn.L⁻¹. Physico-chemical parameters for the study (30 May-6 June 2014) were: conductivity 866 - 987 µS.cm⁻¹; dissolved oxygen 60 - 95% saturation; pH 6.9 – 8.1; temperature 20.1 – 21.9°C.

Table 2. Developmental toxicity of piperonyl butoxide (PBO) (CAS number 51-03-6) to *Lymnaea stagnalis* RENILYS® embryos under semi-static conditions over 14 days at 20 ± 2°C.

Mean measured exposure concentrations (mg PBO.L ⁻¹)	Biological responses after 14 days (n=20)		
	% normal development (morphology)	Spire height in µm (mean ± SD)	Interocular distance in µm (mean ± SD)
Dilution water control	95	873 ± 228	220 (n=1)
Ethanol control 0.64 ml.L ⁻¹	95	857 ± 231	295 (n=1)
Positive control 2.0 mg Zn.L ⁻¹	10 ^{aa}	448 ± 187 ^{aa}	176 ± 28.2
0.018	90	847 ± 312	243 ± 10.6
0.036	95	853 ± 222	183 ± 67.2
0.059	90	859 ± 244	223 ± 37.9
0.225	95	869 ± 225	185 (n=1)
0.43	100	870 ± 104	200 ± 28.3
1.03	100	702 ± 134 ^a	173 ± 24.8
2.34	100	553 ± 108 ^{aa}	180 ± 21.8
Summary of developmental effects after 14d (measured PBO concentrations):			
developmental NOEC	≥ 2.34	-	-
developmental LOEC	> 2.34	-	-
spire height NOEC	-	0.43	-
spire height LOEC	-	1.03	-
interocular distance NOEC	-	-	≥ 2.34
interocular distance LOEC	-	-	> 2.34

Footnote - Measured zinc concentrations in the ISO reconstituted dilution water was 0.002 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (LOD of 0.001 mg Zn.L⁻¹). The overall mean measured PBO concentration was 224% of nominal values (with a limit of detection of 0.02 mg PBO.L⁻¹ using fluorescence spectrometry. Physico-chemical parameters for the study (1-15 July 2014) were: dissolved oxygen 69 - 95% saturation; pH 7.5 – 8.0; temperature 18.5 - 22.0°C. ANOVA results showing PBO treatments significantly different from the ethanol control shown as ^a(P<0.05) and ^{aa}(P<0.01).

Table 3. Summary of ecotoxicology and analytical chemistry data for freshwater molluscs (*Lymnaea stagnalis* RENILYS® strain) exposed to Metaldehyde (ME) (CAS number 9002-91-9) and piperonyl butoxide (PBO) (CAS number 51-03-6) using semi-static renewal conditions for 21 days at 20 ± 1°C.

Mean measured exposure concentrations (mg ME.L ⁻¹)	Biological responses after 21 days (n=20)		
	% hatching success	Spire height (µm as mean ± SD)	Interocular distance (µm as mean ± SD)
Dilution Water Control	85	1090 ± 210	238 ± 32.5
Ethanol control 0.64 ml.L ⁻¹	84	1268 ± 211	262 ± 34.0
Positive control 2.0 mg Zn.L ⁻¹	0	-	-
<i>Metaldehyde (ME) only treatments:</i>			
1.00	100	1092 ± 135	236 ± 16.4
3.53	100	1091 ± 191	225 ± 19.4
9.00	95	1115 ± 136	232 ± 13.0
36.0	100	1082 ± 188	232 ± 20.9
116	60 ^{aa}	886 ± 108 ^a	212 ± 20.2
hatching success NOEC	36.0	-	-
hatching success LOEC	116	-	-
spire height NOEC	-	36.0	-
spire height LOEC	-	116	-
interocular distance NOEC	-	-	≥ 116
interocular distance LOEC	-	-	> 116
<i>Metaldehyde (ME) and piperonyl butoxide (PBO) treatments:</i>			
2.36 mg ME.L ⁻¹ + 0.56 mg PBO.L ⁻¹	40 ^b	924 ± 135	215 ± 24.1
4.46 mg ME.L ⁻¹ + 0.52 mg PBO.L ⁻¹	25 ^b	833 ± 124	221 ± 18.9
12.4 mg ME.L ⁻¹ + 0.56 mg PBO.L ⁻¹	47 ^b	894 ± 137	222 ± 27.8
33.7 mg ME.L ⁻¹ + 0.47 mg PBO.L ⁻¹	47 ^b	879 ± 108	212 ± 18.8
109 mg ME.L ⁻¹ + 0.47 mg PBO.L ⁻¹	0 ^b	-	-

Footnote - Measured zinc concentrations in the dilution water was 0.002 mg Zn.L⁻¹ (LOD of 0.001 mg Zn.L⁻¹). The overall mean measured PBO concentration was 224% of nominal values (with a limit of detection of 0.02 mg PBO.L⁻¹ using fluorescence spectrometry). Physico-chemical parameters for the study (29 July-19 August 2014) were: dissolved oxygen 80-99% saturation; pH 7.5 – 8.1; temperature 19.4 - 20.9°C. ANOVA results showing ME only treatments significantly different from the ethanol control shown as ^a (P<0.05) and ^{aa} (P<0.01). T-test results showing significant differences between the ME results for ± PBO shown as ^b (P<0.05).

624 Table 4. Summary of published data on impacts of metaldehyde (ME) on aquatic
625 invertebrates.

626

Test species	Life stage	Exposure concentrations verified	Toxic effect (mg ME.L ⁻¹)	Reference
FRESHWATER STUDIES:				
Algae (<i>Desmodesmus subspicatus</i>)	LC	Nominal	72h ^{growth} EC50 > 200	EFSA 2010
Crustacean (<i>Daphnia magna</i>)	AD	Mean measured	48h ^{survival} EC50 > 90	EFSA 2010
Crustacean (<i>Daphnia magna</i>)	LC	Nominal	21d ^{survival} NOEC = 90 21d ^{repro} NOEC = 90	EFSA 2010
Crustacean (<i>Gammarus pseudolimnaeus</i>)	AD	Nominal	96h ^{survival} EC50 = 19.3	EFSA 2010
Fish (<i>Oncorhynchus mykiss</i>)	JU	Nominal	96h ^{survival} LC50 = 75	EFSA 2010
Fish (<i>Oncorhynchus mykiss</i>)	JU	Nominal	21d ^{survival} NOEC = 37.5 21d ^{growth} NOEC = 37.5	EFSA 2010
Mollusc (<i>Lymnaea stagnalis</i>)	EM	Mean measured	21d ^{hatching} NOEC = 36 21d ^{hatching} LOEC = 116 21d ^{spire height} NOEC = 36 21d ^{spire height} LOEC = 116	This study
Mollusc (<i>Planorbarius corneus</i>)	AD	Nominal	48h ^{survival} EC50 > 200	EFSA 2010
SALTWATER STUDIES: No data available.				
Molluscs (<i>Cerithidea cingulata</i>) in brackish aquaculture ponds	Pond study	Nominal	After 7d snail mortality of 86-87% at 0.38-1.55 mg ME.L ⁻¹ compared to 6% in control ponds	Coloso et al., (1998)

627

628 Notes: AD = adult; EC = effective concentration; ECO = ecosystem study; EM = embryo; JU
629 = juvenile; LC = life cycle; LOEC = Lowest Observed Effect Concentration; NOEC = No
630 Observed Effect Concentration; repro = reproduction. Also, note a 1.0 M solution of
631 metaldehyde = 176.212 g.L⁻¹ and water solubility = 222 mg ME.L⁻¹ (EFSA 2010).

632