2019-06-15

Stratigraphic and environmental control on marine benthic community change through the early Toarcian extinction event (Iberian Range, Spain)

Danise, Silvia

<http://hdl.handle.net/10026.1/13668>

10.1016/j.palaeo.2019.03.039

Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology

Elsevier

All content in PEARL is protected by copyright law. Author manuscripts are made available in accordance with publisher policies. Please cite only the published version using the details provided on the item record or document. In the absence of an open licence (e.g. Creative Commons), permissions for further reuse of content should be sought from the publisher or author.

Stratigraphic and environmental control on marine benthic community change through the early Toarcian extinction event (Iberian Range, Spain)

Silvia Danise^{1*}, Marie-Emilie Clémence², Gregory D. Price², Daniel P. Murphy³, Juan J. Gómez⁴, and Richard J. Twitchett⁵

¹Università degli Studi di Firenze, Dipartimento di Scienze della Terra, via La Pira 4, 50121, Firenze, Italy

²School of Geography, Earth and Environmental Sciences, University of Plymouth, Drake Circus, Plymouth, Devon PL4 8AA UK.

³Eastfield College, Dallas County Community College District, 3737 Motley Drive, Mesquite, TX 75150, USA.

⁴Departamento de Geodinámica, Estratigrafía y Paleontología, Facultad de Ciencias Geológicas (UCM) and Instituto de Geociencias (CSIC-UCM), c/ Jose Antonio Novais, 12. 28040 Madrid, Spain.

⁵Department of Earth Sciences, Natural History Museum, Cromwell Road, London, SW7 5BD, UK

* Corresponding author: silvia.danise@unifi.it

18 **ABSTRACT**

19

20 In the Early Jurassic (~183 Ma ago) global warming and associated environmental changes coincided
21 with an extinction event in the marine realm (early Toarcian extinction event). Anoxia was previously
22 considered to have been the main cause of extinction, but extinctions also occur at localities that
23 remained oxygenated throughout the event, suggesting that other factors, such as temperature, may have
24 played a major role. To test this hypothesis, we integrated quantitative analyses of benthic macro-
25 invertebrates with high-resolution geochemical proxies on the bulk rock (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and on
26 brachiopod and belemnite shells ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) from two sections from the Iberian Range, Spain, with no
27 black shale deposition. The sections are orientated SE-NW along an onshore-offshore gradient
28 deepening to the north. The dominant benthic groups, bivalves and brachiopods, show a different
29 response to the extinction: brachiopods go through a complete species-level turnover, while many
30 bivalve species range through the event. In the shallower section, changes in richness and evenness
31 correlate with TOC (Total Organic Carbon), suggesting that variations in nutrient input from runoff, and
32 the possible local onset of low-redox conditions ($\text{TOC} > 4 \text{ wt\%}$), controlled faunal diversity. In contrast,
33 at the deeper section, community change correlates with changes in $\delta^{18}\text{O}$, indicating that temperature
34 variations might have influenced faunal change. Different stratigraphic patterns of extinction occur
35 between the two localities, with last-occurrences clustering at the maximum flooding surface in the
36 shallower section, and at the transgressive surface in the deeper one. The observed differences between
37 the two localities highlight the important role of local sedimentary and stratigraphic processes in
38 controlling the shape of the geochemical and fossil record, and the need for studying multiple sections
39 along onshore-offshore gradients in order to extrapolate regional and global patterns.

40

Keywords: Jurassic, warming, anoxia, bivalves, brachiopods, stable isotopes

1. Introduction

Lower Jurassic (Pliensbachian-Toarcian, ~183 Ma) deposits record some of the most severe environmental perturbations of the Mesozoic. Pronounced (~2–5‰) negative carbon isotope excursions (CIEs) are recorded in marine carbonates and organic carbon from several sites around the world at the Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary and at the *Tenuicostatum-Falciferum* Zone transition of the early Toarcian, suggesting a substantial input of isotopically light carbon into the atmosphere–ocean system (Hesselbo et al. 2000; 2007; Jenkyns et al. 2001; Kemp et al. 2005; Littler et al. 2010; Izumi et al. 2012), probably from volcanic activity (Burgess et al. 2015). In the early Toarcian, an increase in seawater temperature of ~4–7 °C has been inferred from belemnite Mg/Ca and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ratios from various European sections (McArthur et al. 2000; Bailey et al. 2003; Gómez and Goy 2011), and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ of brachiopods shells from Peniche section, Portugal (Suan et al. 2008). Higher global temperatures may have accelerated the hydrological cycle and increased continental chemical weathering, elevating nutrient input to the shelf seas and oceans (Cohen et al. 2004; Jenkyns 2010). These conditions likely favoured higher primary organic productivity and organic matter fluxes, ultimately triggering anoxic to euxinic conditions in many epicontinental seas (Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic Event: T-OAE; Jenkyns 1988; 2010). Furthermore, massive pulses of CO_2 input are thought to have triggered a carbonate system crisis through associated ocean acidification (Suan et al. 2008; Trecalli et al. 2012; Brazier et al. 2015).

This time interval is also characterised by a second-order extinction event affecting both pelagic and benthic organisms (Little and Benton 1995; Cecca and Macchioni 2004; Caswell et al. 2009; García Joral et al. 2011; Caruthers et al. 2013; Danise et al. 2013; 2015; Martindale and Aberhan 2017; Dunhill

et al. 2018a). Anoxia has been considered the main cause of the marine extinction, as the event was firstly recognised in settings characterised by the deposition of widespread organic rich black shales (e.g., Little and Benton 1995). However, this hypothesis has been questioned following discovery that the extinction event is also recorded in localities that remained fully oxygenated throughout the lower Toarcian (Gómez and Goy 2011; García Joral et al. 2011; Arias 2013). In particular, the absence of black shale deposition in most of northern and central Spain has been used to support the hypothesis that temperature rise, and not anoxia, was the main trigger of extinction on a global scale (Gómez et al. 2008; Gómez and Goy 2011).

In order to better understand which factors controlled changes in marine benthic communities in the absence of widespread black shale deposition, we collected quantitative macro-invertebrate data from two sections of the Iberian Range, central Spain (Castrovido and Sierra Palomera). The study sites were selected because they record deposition at different water depths along an onshore-offshore gradient of the western Tethyan shelf, which enables us to better understand the role of sedimentary and stratigraphic processes on the distribution of fossils through the extinction event (i.e., Holland 2000; 2015, Nawrot et al. 2017). Furthermore, the presence of both bivalves and brachiopods at both study sites (Comas-Rengifo et al. 1988; 1996), enables us to test whether these different taxonomic groups responded differently to the same event and/or to the same environmental drivers or not, providing a test of the generality of faunal responses (e.g., Belanger 2012; Danise et al. 2015). For this purpose, faunal data were integrated with high-resolution geochemical proxies on the bulk rock (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and on calcitic brachiopod and belemnite shells ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$), to test for possible correlations between biotic and environmental change.

The main objectives of this study are: (1) to identify, through high-resolution chemostratigraphy, the Pliensbachian/Toarcian and early Toarcian events at the localities of Castrovido and Sierra

87 Palomera; (2) to analyse and compare the responses to the early Toarcian extinction event of two
88 different taxonomic groups, bivalves and brachiopods; (3) to test how richness, evenness, and
89 community composition of benthic macro-invertebrates correlate with variations in TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$
90 from calcitic shells; (4) to evaluate the role of stratigraphic processes in shaping the distribution of
91 species through the extinction event.

92

93 **2. Geological and stratigraphic setting**

94 The studied sections of Castrovido and Sierra Palomera are located in the Iberian Range, a NW
95 trending fold- and thrust-belt in eastern Spain which formed during the Paleogene by inversion of
96 Mesozoic rifted basins (Fig. 1A; Salas et al. 2001; Gómez and Fernández-López 2006). In the Late
97 Triassic to Middle Jurassic the area comprised a system of shallow marine platforms of the western
98 Tethys shelf that developed on the progressively submerging Iberian block, under a post-rift extensional
99 tectonic regime (Fig. 1B; Gómez and Goy 2005). This platform system was connected eastward with the
100 Tethyan Ocean, to the north with the Arctic, through the so-called Viking Corridor (Callomon 1979) or
101 “Laurasian Seaway” (Bjerrum et al. 2001), and to the west with South America through the Hispanic
102 Corridor, which had probably been intermittently open since the Sinemurian/Pliensbachian boundary
103 (Aberhan 2001; Damborenea 2002; Martindale and Aberhan 2017).

104 At both study sites, the upper Pliensbachian is represented by the Barahona Limestone
105 Formation, which consists mainly of lime wackestones to packstones, with occasional mudstone,
106 skeletal grainstones and minor interbedded marls. The Barahona Limestone Formation formed in a high
107 energy, shallow ramp, frequently influenced by storms (Gómez and Goy 2005). This formation spans
108 the Pliensbachian *Margaritatus* and *Spinatum* ammonite zones (Comas-Rengifo 1985). However, due to
109 synsedimentary tectonics, the top of the unit is diachronous, and in the central portion of the

110 southwestern branch of the Iberian Range its upper boundary is correlated with the lower Toarcian
111 *Tenuicostatum* Zone (e.g., in the Sierra Palomera section; Comas-Rengifo et al. 1996). Deposition of the
112 overlying Turmiel Formation began with the progressive deepening of the platform in the early
113 Toarcian. This formation is characterized by an alternation of lime mudstones and marls deposited in a
114 gently sloping, open-marine, homoclinal ramp (Gómez et al. 2003).

115 At both sections deposition took place below storm wave base (Comas-Rengifo et al. 1996). The
116 progressive flooding of the platform culminated in a peak transgression in the mid-Toarcian *Bifrons*
117 Zone (Quesada et al. 2005). Palaeogeographic reconstructions of the Western Tethys Iberian platform
118 system, now cropping out along the Asturias, Basque–Cantabrian, Iberian and Catalanian basins,
119 indicate that this ramp deepened and opened towards the north, changing from from inner to outer ramp
120 settings (Aurell et al. 2003, Gómez and Goy 2005; Quesada et al. 2005). The Sierra Palomera section
121 was thus deposited in shallower waters than Castrovido. Previous palaeocological studies on the benthic
122 fauna estimated water depth to be about 40-70 m on average for a locality very close to the Sierra
123 Palomera section (Gahr 2002; 2005).

124 From a sequence stratigraphic point of view, the early Jurassic Iberian Platform System has been
125 subdivided into second and third order transgressive-regressive cycles (Fig. 2; Gómez and Goy 2005).
126 The studied interval is part of the second order LJ3 cycle, and comprises the lower part of the LJ3-1
127 cycle, the entire LJ3-2 cycle (subdivided into two sub-cycles) and the lower part of the LJ3-3 cycle
128 (Comas-Renfigo et al. 1988; 1996; Gómez and Goy 2005). Ammonite biostratigraphy is used for
129 correlation, and follows Comas-Rengifo et al. (1996) and Osete et al. (2007) for the Sierra Palomera
130 section, and Comas-Renfigo et al. (1988) and García Joral et al. (2011) for the Castrovido section.

131

132 **3. Methods**

133

134 *3.1. Sample collection*

135 At both sections, samples were collected for geochemical analysis and for palaeoecological
136 analysis of the fossil macro-invertebrates. At Castrovido, bulk rock samples were collected for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$,
137 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and TOC analyses with an average spacing of 10 cm (n=169; Table S1). At Sierra Palomera, bulk
138 rock samples for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ analyses were collected at an average resolution of 11 cm (n=211; Table
139 S2), and TOC analyses at an average resolution of 26 cm (n=84; Table S2). From each fossiliferous bed,
140 belemnites and brachiopods were collected for stable isotope and trace element analysis. When
141 available, up to four specimens from the same bedding plane were analysed to assess the intra-horizon
142 variability of the geochemical data. A total of 50 belemnites and 33 brachiopods were analysed from the
143 Castrovido section (Table S1), 22 belemnites and 23 brachiopods from the Sierra Palomera section
144 (Table S2). The degree of diagenetic alteration of belemnite and brachiopod shells was assessed through
145 visual screening, cathodoluminescence analysis of thin sections, and trace elements analysis (see below).
146 At each site, from each fossiliferous bed, a standard mass of 2.5 kg of bulk rock was collected for the
147 quantitative analysis of benthic macro-invertebrates. A total of 76 bulk samples were collected (25 at
148 Castrovido; 51 at Sierra Palomera; Table S3).

149

150 *3.2. Cathodoluminescence analysis*

151 Cathodoluminescence (CL) analyses were performed with a CITL MK5 cathodoluminescence
152 instrument equipped with a Nikon microscope and digital camera at the University of Plymouth. CL is
153 widely employed as a screening technique that allows the identification of diagenetically altered shell
154 material (see however Barbin 2013 for a critical review of the method). The CL behaviour of marine
155 carbonates is a good indicator of burial diagenesis because many secondary calcites exhibit

156 luminescence that is activated by Mn^{2+} . As a result, non-luminescent biogenic carbonates are generally
157 considered to be unaltered (e.g., Kearsey et al. 2009; Rosales et al. 2001). After screening, belemnites
158 were classified into three classes: (1) well preserved and non-luminescent, with well-preserved
159 microstructure (Fig. 3A); (2) moderately preserved, with rare microborings or microfractures and
160 stylolites (Fig. 3B); and (3) poorly preserved, with extensive microborings, microfractures and stylolites
161 (Fig. 3C). Class 3 belemnites and the diagenetically altered portions of Class 2 belemnites were
162 excluded from the study. Only Class 1 belemnites and unaltered portions of Class 2 belemnites were
163 sampled and analysed. The same classes were applied to brachiopod shells. Rhynchonellid brachiopod
164 shells had the best-preserved microstructure, with most specimens exhibiting very low luminescence and
165 only rare microfractures (Figs. 3D, E), whereas terebratulid shells have a porous shell structure
166 characterized by endopunctae (Fig. 3F). Areas of brachiopod shells with cement- or matrix-filled
167 endopunctae were excluded from the analysis.

168

169 *3.3. Isotopes and trace element analysis*

170 Using a microdrill, 0.3-0.5 mg of bulk rock from the fine fraction carbonate areas, avoiding any
171 fossil material, was collected from each sample for trace element and isotope analysis. These carbonate
172 powders were reacted with 100% phosphoric acid at 90°C, and the evolved CO_2 was analysed on a GV
173 Instruments Isoprime mass spectrometer with a Gilson Multiflow carbonate autosampler at the
174 University of Plymouth. The results were calibrated against the Vienna Peedee Belemnite (VPDB) using
175 the international standard NBS-19 (National Bureau of Standards 19; $\delta^{13}C=1.95\text{‰}$ $\delta^{18}O=-2.20\text{‰}$).
176 Reproducibility of replicate analyses for both $\delta^{18}O$ and $\delta^{13}C$ was better than 0.1‰.

177 Brachiopod shells were cleaned and sectioned longitudinally, while belemnites were cut
178 perpendicular to the rostrum length. The outer (primary) layer of brachiopod shells is known to be in

179 isotopic disequilibrium (e.g., Parkinson et al. 2005), and so only secondary layers were sampled. Areas
180 of the belemnite rostrum that are typically most prone to diagenesis (the rostrum exterior and the porous
181 apical region) were avoided. A microdrill and an optical microscope were used to sample the best-
182 preserved parts of the shells and rostra, as identified by CL and microscopy. Between 0.2 and 0.3 mg of
183 carbonate powders were analysed for $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ using the same method as that used for the bulk
184 rock analysis. Brachiopod and belemnite specimens were also sampled for trace elements (Mn and Fe).
185 Sample powders were reacted with 0.2 M HNO_3 and measured at the University of Copenhagen using an
186 Optima 7000 DV ICP-OES. Accuracy and analytical precision of the analyses were measured through
187 interspersed aliquots of JLs-1 (Japanese limestone standard-1), which gave averages ($\pm$ sd) of $\text{Fe/Ca} =$
188 0.062 ± 0.01 mmol/mol and $\text{Mn/Ca} = 0.029 \pm 0.006$ mmol/mol. These results are in good agreement
189 with published values giving averages ($\pm$ 2 err) of $\text{Fe/Ca} = 0.20 \pm 0.1$ mmol/mol, and $\text{Mn/Ca} = 0.030 \pm$
190 0.004 mmol/mol (Imai et al. 1996). Inferred palaeotemperatures from $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{bel}}$ (Table S1 and
191 S2) were calculated from the equation of Anderson and Arthur (1983), assuming an ice-free Jurassic
192 world and a $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ of -1‰ V-SMOW (Shackleton and Kennett 1975).

193

194 3.4. Total organic carbon (TOC, wt%)

195 TOC analyses of the Sierra Palomera section were carried out on a SKALAR Primacs SLC. The
196 instrument was calibrated and standards (Oxalic Acid) were run throughout to maintain precision of
197 results. TOC analysis for the Castrovido samples were carried out at the National Oceanographic Centre,
198 University of Southampton using a CHNOS analyser, with the BCSS-1 CRM standard, following the
199 procedure of Nieuwenhuize et al. (1994). For both sets of analyses reproducibility, based on repeat
200 analyses of the same sample for organic carbon, is $\pm 2.5\%$ of the measured TOC wt.% values. Details
201 on the methods can be found in the supplementary material, File S1.

202

203 *3.5. Palaeoecological analysis*

204 Bulk samples were mechanically disaggregated in the laboratory to sub-centimetre size, with the
205 use of sharp chisels, and all recognisable macrofossils were counted and identified. The total dataset
206 comprises 1900 individuals of 141 species of bivalves, brachiopods and gastropods, which were
207 identified to the finest taxonomic level possible (Table S3). Shells that were originally calcitic are
208 preserved, whereas originally aragonitic shells occur as internal moulds. For bivalves and brachiopods,
209 the number of individuals was obtained by adding together the number of articulated specimens and the
210 highest number of right/left or dorsal/ventral valves. The number of gastropod individuals was equated
211 to the number of individual apices. Other taxonomic groups of benthic macro-invertebrates recorded in
212 the samples, including echinoderms and serpulids, were very rare and were not included in the dataset.

213 The number of species in each sample was used as a measure of richness (S). Evenness was
214 measured using the Simpson index of diversity (Simpson 1949), which is calculated as $1/\sum p_i^2$, where p is
215 the proportional abundance of species i. This index is an unbiased measure of evenness which ranges
216 from zero (one taxon dominates the assemblage completely) to one (all taxa have equal abundance;
217 Lande 1996).

218 Before multivariate elaboration, species occurring in only one sample were removed and samples
219 containing less than 12 individuals were excluded (mean sample size=35, min=12, max=86,
220 std.dev=18.2). Although 12 is a small sample size, the presence of multiple samples from each
221 sedimentary facies means that we are confident that the compositions of our fossil assemblages are
222 reliable (e.g., Bennington 2003). The resulting culled dataset comprises 52 samples with 78 species and
223 1663 individuals (87.5% of the original number of specimens). A two-way cluster analysis was
224 performed to describe groups of samples with similar faunal compositions (Q-mode). The clustering

algorithm used Bray–Curtis dissimilarity (Bray and Curtis 1957) and agglomerate nesting, coupled with Ward’s method (Ward 1963), which adds samples to existing clusters that minimize the total sum of squares. Ward’s method tends to produce dendrograms with well-defined clusters (Legendre and Legendre 1998). Biofacies were defined using Q-mode cluster analysis (cf., Ludvigsen et al. 1986). The cluster analysis was performed using the `hclust()` function in R’s `vegan` package (R Core Team 2017). Data were ordinated using nonmetric multidimensional scaling (nMDS), a useful ordination method for detecting patterns of co-occurrence among taxa as well as ecological gradients (Legendre and Legendre 1998). Ordinations used Bray–Curtis dissimilarity, three axes, 100 restarts to prevent reaching a local optimum, and weighted averaging to calculate taxon scores. NMDS ordination was performed with the `metaMDS()` function in the `vegan` package of R (R Core Team 2017). This function rotates the nMDS solution via principal components analysis such that nMDS axis 1 (nMDS1) explains the principal source of variation of the data, and the other axes (nMDS2, nMDS3 and so on) explain decreasing percentages of the variation, as is characteristic of eigenvalue methods. NMDS ordination was performed (i) on the total dataset (ii) on samples from each separate locality; and (iii) on samples from each locality, analysing bivalves and brachiopods separately. Gastropods were too rare to analyse independently.

For each locality, correlations between the palaeoecological data (S, Evenness, nMDS1) and geochemical data from brachiopod shells ($\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and the bulk rock (TOC wt%) were made using the Spearman’s rank correlation coefficient. Isotope data from brachiopod calcite were chosen instead of those of belemnites because their record is more complete throughout the two sections (e.g., no belemnites were found in the middle and upper part of the Sierra Palomera section), and because they are more likely to represent benthic environmental conditions. Possible temporal autocorrelations were tested for by applying the Durbin-Watson test (Durbin and Watson 1950), using the R package `lmtest` (R

Core Team 2017), and because some series returned positive results (Table S4), all data were differentiated prior to estimating the Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (Kendall 1948).

4. Results

4.1. Brachiopod and belemnite preservation

Trace element analysis was undertaken on those samples of belemnites and brachiopods that passed the initial CL-screening (Fig. 3), in order to provide additional screening of samples for possible diagenetic alteration (Veizer 1983). Most of the investigated belemnites, with the exception of 5 samples, had Fe concentrations below 200 ppm and Mn concentrations below 100 ppm (Table S1, S2), which are comparable with values recorded from other belemnites that are considered to be well-preserved (e.g., Rosales et al. 2004; Alberti et al. 2012; Wierzbowski 2015). Recent brachiopod shells (e.g., Morrison and Brand 1986; Brand et al. 2003) typically show low concentrations of Mn (4–450 ppm) and Fe (20–770 ppm). All the investigated brachiopods have elemental concentrations within these limits (Table S1, S2), and their recorded values are comparable with other published Jurassic brachiopod data (e.g., Price et al. 2013; Wierzbowski 2015). Thus, we consider that the brachiopods and belemnite specimens analysed in this study were not significantly affected by diagenesis.

4.2. Carbon and oxygen isotopes

The cross-plot of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ against $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ data shows very little correlation between micrite samples from Sierra Palomera (Fig. 4). Most of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ samples from Castrovido also have a scattered pattern, except for a few points showing a linear trend towards negative values (up to -3‰ $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and -7.8‰ $\delta^{18}\text{O}$), which are located at the base of the *Elegantulum* Subzone (Fig. 5). Although a

271 correlation between $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values can occasionally be of primary origin (e.g., due to increased
272 productivity linked to warmer temperatures), the covariance of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ data from the
273 *Elegantulum* Subzone Castrovido suggests that they might have been affected by diagenesis. Diagenetic
274 recrystallization of carbonate takes place in the presence of water, and any carbonate precipitated is
275 likely to have a $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ isotope value determined by pore-fluid composition and temperature (Immenhauser
276 et al. 2002). Hence, a diagenetic overprint may have affected the *Elegantulum* Subzone $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ data
277 from Castrovido. As pore-fluids have relatively low carbon content and the carbon reservoir in the rock
278 is thought to be greater than that in the diagenetic fluid, bulk rock carbon isotope values are probably not
279 significantly altered by diagenesis (Scholle and Arthur, 1980). The cross-plots of $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ values
280 from the belemnites and brachiopods show no correlation between the data (Fig. 4), which demonstrates
281 that the calcitic fossils have been affected by negligible diagenetic overprint (Marshall 1992).

282 The carbon and oxygen isotope data span from the Pliensbachian *Maragaritatus* Zone to the
283 Toarcian *Bifrons* Zone (Figs. 5, 6; Table S1, S2). $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values range between -2.8 and 2.9‰ at
284 Castrovido and -0.3 and 2.7‰ at Sierra Palomera. At Sierra Palomera, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values record two
285 marked negative excursions: one at the Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary, and the other at the base of the
286 *Elegantulum* Subzone (Fig. 6). At Castrovido, however, the Pliensbachian/Toarcian $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ negative
287 excursion is less pronounced (Fig. 5). $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{bel}}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{brach}}$ values broadly replicate the micrite record,
288 although gaps are present in the data. For example, belemnites were not found in the upper half of the
289 Sierra Palomera section, where analysed brachiopods are also rare (Fig. 6). At both sections a gap is also
290 present at the *Semicelatum-Elegantulum* transition, before and during the negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ excursion
291 (Fig. 5, 6).

292 The $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ values range between -7.8‰ and -1.1‰ at Castrovido, and between -5.2‰ and -
293 2.0‰ at Sierra Palomera. A well-defined vertical trend towards more negative values is recorded at

Sierra Palomera (Fig. 6). At Castrovido, this trend is less obvious and data are more scattered (Fig. 5). As discussed above, the very negative $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ values at the base of the *Elegantulum* Subzone, might be caused by diagenesis. Overall, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of brachiopods are more positive than co-eval $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$ values, but are less positive than the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of co-eval belemnite samples (Figs. 5, 6). Both $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{bel}}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ values become more negative towards the upper part of the section, mirroring the pattern of $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{micrite}}$.

4.3. Total organic carbon

At Castrovido TOC values are very low (below 0.5 wt%) for most of the section, except from the lower part of the *Elegantulum* Subzone, where they peak at 2.6 wt% (Fig. 5). At Sierra Palomera, the TOC record shows high variability throughout the entire section, with peaks over 4 wt%, and one up to 5.92 wt% in the *Falciferum* Subzone (Fig. 6). Overall, the range of TOC values at Castrovido is consistent with values measured at other early Toarcian Southern European sites of the Tethys (0.5–3 wt.%: Jenkyns 1988; Jenkyns et al. 2002; Hesselbo et al. 2007; Bodin et al. 2010), while at Sierra Palomera they are exceeded in a few instances.

4.4. Changes in the marine benthic communities

4.4.1. Richness and diversity

The total dataset, which pools all samples from Castrovido and Sierra Palomera together, is dominated by bivalves (69.5% of the species and 58.8% of the individuals), followed by brachiopods (20.5% of species; 39.1% of individuals) and by the rarer gastropods (10% of species; 2.1% of individuals). At Castrovido, evenness is mostly high overall (0.6-0.9), but drops to low values (0.2-0.5) in the *Elegantulum* Subzone, where richness also has its lowest values ($S=4$; Fig. 5). The lowest values

317 of richness and evenness coincide with the highest values of TOC (up to 2.6 wt%) and more negative
318 $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values. In the Sierra Palomera section, evenness is generally high apart from during the
319 *Elegantulum* and *Falciferum* subzones, where it drops to 0.1-0.3, with richness reaching peak values in
320 the *Semicelatum* and *Falciferum* subzones (Fig. 6). At Sierra Palomera, changes in richness and
321 evenness mirror lithological changes and TOC variations: lime mudstones, which overall have lower
322 TOC values, are more diverse than marly intervals.

323

324 4.4.2. Biofacies change and faunal turnover

325 NMDS ordination shows that the two sections record similar patterns of faunal change (Fig. 7A-
326 B). At both Castrovido and Sierra Palomera, samples from the lower part of the sections (*Spinatum* and
327 *Tenuicostatum* zones) form distinct clusters, which do not overlap with samples from the upper part
328 (*Bifrons* and *Serpentinum* subzones). This indicates that samples from the *Spinatum* and *Tenuicostatum*
329 zones have a very different faunal composition compared to samples from the *Bifrons* and *Serpentinum*
330 subzones. The same pattern is recorded when samples from the two sections are analysed together (total
331 dataset, Fig. 7C), and when bivalves and brachiopods from each locality are analysed separately (Fig.
332 S1).

333 Cluster analysis on the total dataset allowed the identification of groups of samples that contain a
334 similar suite of taxa in similar proportions (i.e., “biofacies” *sensu* Ludvigsen 1986), and to identify
335 their characteristic species (Figs. 7D, 8, Table 1). Biofacies B1, B2, and B3 are mainly represented by
336 samples from the *Spinatum* and *Tenuicostatum* zones, with the exception of one sample from the
337 *Serpentinum* Zone. Biofacies B1 is only recorded in samples from Sierra Palomera, and is dominated by
338 epifaunally non-motile bivalves like *Gryphaea sublobata* (37%) and *Plicatula spinosa* (15%), while the
339 rhynchonellid *Quadratirhynchia attenuata* (8%) is the most common brachiopod (Table 1). Biofacies

340 B2 is dominated by brachiopods, including the terebratulid *Lobothyris subpuncata* (34%), and the deep-
 341 infaunal species *Pleuromya alduini* (24%), while biofacies B3 is dominated by the pectinid
 342 *Pseudopecten aequivalvis* (24%, Table 1). Biofacies B4 includes samples from the *Elegantulum*
 343 Subzone only, and is dominated by the rhynchonellid *Soaresirhynchia bouchardi* (68%), followed by
 344 the pectinid *Parvamussium pumilum* (15%), the epifaunally attached *Plicatula auricula* (9%) and
 345 *Gryphaea crickleyensis* (4%). New brachiopod species appear after the *Elegantulum* Subzone, and are
 346 shared between Biofacies B5, B6 and B7. These biofacies contain a higher abundance and diversity of
 347 infaunal suspension feeding bivalves, compared to Biofacies B1 to B3. The pectinids *P. pumilum* (20%),
 348 *Entolium corneolum* (8%) and *Chlamys textoria* (7%) are the most abundant bivalves in B5, while
 349 amongst the brachiopods *Homoeorhynchia batalleri* (11%) and *Telothyris pirenaica* (10%) dominate
 350 (Table 1). Biofacies B6 is only recorded from Sierra Palomera and is dominated by the terebratulids
 351 *Telothyris jauberti* (17%) and *T. pirenaica* (12%). Biofacies B7 is also dominated by brachiopods, the
 352 most abundant being the terebratulid *Telothyris pirenaica* (24%) and the rhynchonellid *Homoeorhynchia*
 353 *meridionalis* (17%); among the bivalves, *P. pumilum* is still very common (10%). The carnivore *P.*
 354 *pumilum* is very common in post-extinction samples, together with rarer deposit-feeding bivalves of the
 355 families Nuculidae and Nuculanidae (Table 1), and grazing and omnivore gastropods (e.g.,
 356 *Ampullospira?* and *Pleurotomaria* sp.; Table S3).
 357

358 4.4.3. Correlation between ecological and environmental variables

359 Spearman's Rank correlations were performed between geochemical (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{brach}}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$)
 360 and ecological (S, Evenness, nMDS1) data, for each locality. Ecological parameters were measured for
 361 the total dataset (S, Evenness, nMDS1), and for the bivalve (S_{biv} , $\text{Evenness}_{\text{biv}}$, $\text{nMDS1}_{\text{biv}}$) and
 362 brachiopod (S_{brach} , $\text{Evenness}_{\text{Sbrach}}$, $\text{nMDS1}_{\text{brach}}$) datasets separately (Table 2). Correlations give

363 statistically significant results ($p < 0.05$) in only a few instances out of the fifty-four possible
364 combinations (Table 2; Fig. S2). For the Castrovido samples, the only significant correlation we found is
365 that the bivalve community composition (nMDS1_{biv}) is negatively correlated with $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ values. In
366 contrast, for the Sierra Palomera section, the richness and evenness of the entire fossil community (S,
367 Evenness) and of just the bivalves (S_{biv}, and Evenness_{biv}) are all negatively correlated with TOC. The
368 fact that the total dataset shows the same correlations as the bivalve-only dataset suggests that the
369 dominance of bivalves over brachiopods, in term of both richness and abundance, probably drives the
370 patterns of diversity and composition recorded in the entire community.

371

372 4.4.4. Extinction interval and sequence stratigraphic surfaces

373 In both sections, brachiopods go through a complete turnover in taxonomic composition at the
374 *Semicelatum/Elegantulum* boundary, while many bivalve species cross this interval (Figs. 9, 10). At
375 Castrovido, last occurrences of late Pliensbachian-early Toarcian brachiopods occur in the *Semicelatum*
376 Subzone, at the transgressive surface that separates cycles LJ3-2a and LJ3-2b. This surface is
377 characterised by an abrupt facies change from an interval dominated by lime mudstones to a thick
378 interval of marls, which suggest a change to a deeper depositional setting (Fig. 9). This surface is
379 followed by a ~ 2-m thick interval that is barren of macro-invertebrates, which corresponds to the
380 transgressive part of cycle LJ3-2b. *Soaresirhynchia bouchardi* is the only brachiopod, except one
381 occurrence of the inarticulate *Lingula* sp., to be present in the lower part of the *Elegantulum* Subzone,
382 together with the abundant pectinid *Parvamussium pumilum* and one specimen of the posidoniid *Bositra*
383 *?buchii*. They all occur in the regressive part of cycle LJ3-2b, and, specifically, the most abundant
384 species, *S. bouchardi*, first occurs at the maximum flooding surface. A suite of completely new

385 brachiopod species first occur at the top of the *Elegantulum* Subzone, in the lower, transgressive, part of
386 cycle LJ3-3.

387 Unlike at Castrovido, last occurrences at Sierra Palomera cluster at the maximum flooding
388 surface of cycle LJ3-2b, which occurs at the *Semicelatum-Elegantulum* transition (Fig. 10). The barren
389 interval is thinner than at Castrovido (around 50 cm thick), and the following, regressive, part of cycle
390 LJ3-2b, where new colonising species first occur, contains a more diverse benthic fauna than at
391 Castrovido. The rhynchonellid brachiopod *S. bouchardi* dominates, and co-occurs with a diverse
392 assemblage of bivalves: *P. pumilum*, *Pseudopecten aequivalvis*, *Pinna* sp., *Gryphaea* cf. *sublobata*, and
393 *Nicaniella* sp.1. New early Toarcian brachiopod species appear at the top of the *Elegantulum* Subzone at
394 Sierra Palomera, as at Castrovido, at the base of transgressive cycle LJ3-3.

395

396 **5. Discussion**

397

398 *5.1. Correlation and interpretation of carbon-isotope excursions*

399 Globally, the Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary is characterized by a negative carbon-isotope
400 excursion, which is recorded in marine bulk-rock carbonates, brachiopods, wood and organic matter
401 (e.g., Hesselbo et al. 2007; Littler et al. 2010; Suan et al. 2010; Bodin et al. 2016; Ait-Itto et al. 2017).
402 This negative excursion is most clearly recorded in our data at Sierra Palomera, where $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ data
403 record a $\sim 1.7\text{‰}$ negative shift. The magnitude of this CIE is similar to the magnitudes of
404 Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary CIEs from other European sections; e.g., at Hawsker Bottoms,
405 Yorkshire, England (Littler et al. 2010); in the Mochras Farm Borehole (Jenkyns and Clayton 1997); and
406 at Peniche, Portugal (Hesselbo et al. 2007). At Peniche, for example, the negative CIE is $\sim 2\text{‰}$, which is
407 comparable to the results of our study, whereas at other sections, such as in Morocco, an excursion of 3

408 to 4‰, spanning several 10s of metres, has been recorded (Bodin et al. 2016; Ait-Itto et al. 2017). A
409 negative isotope excursion is not shown by belemnite and brachiopod samples, probably because of the
410 patchiness of the data through the interval.

411 The second negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ excursion starts at the top of the *Semicelatum* Subzone, with the
412 lowest values at the base of the *Elegantulum* Subzone, and equates to the negative CIE of the T-OAE
413 (e.g., Hesselbo et al. 2007). At Sierra Palomera, TOC is already high prior to the proposed Toarcian
414 CIE, and remains high after the event into the *Falciferum* Subzone. This differs from Castrovido and
415 from other sites elsewhere in Europe, which record a TOC rise during the most negative part of the T-
416 OAE (e.g., Hesselbo et al. 2000). These differences in the relative timing of organic matter enrichment
417 and carbon isotope excursions illustrate the importance of local sedimentary processes and preservation,
418 which appear largely independent from global forcing mechanisms (c.f., Trabucho-Alexandre et al.
419 2011). Acknowledging the global character of the CIE, and the non-synchronous distribution of organic
420 rich-sediments in these sections and elsewhere (McArthur et al. 2008; Rodríguez-Tovar and Reolid
421 2013), as other authors have done previously (e.g. Bodin et al. 2016), we use the negative CIE to define
422 the T-OAE. At both Castrovido and Sierra Palomera, the most negative part of the T-OAE $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$
423 record corresponds to the interval of maximum flooding.

424 At Sierra Palomera, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values from the *Serpentinum* Zone (*Falciferum* Subzone) and
425 *Bifrons* Zone are on average ~1‰ more positive than data derived from the same interval at Castrovido.
426 This difference is most likely due to differences in the composition of the carbonate component of the
427 rock samples at each site. For example, in modern settings, the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of neritic platform carbonates tends
428 to be up to 4‰ more positive than pelagic carbonates produced by planktonic organisms such as
429 coccoliths and foraminifera (Swart and Eberli 2005), and so it is expected that bulk rock carbonates
430 from shallower settings would record more positive $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values. The slightly more positive

431 $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ values recorded at Sierra Palomera, which was deposited in shallower water than Castrovido,
432 are therefore consistent with such expectations. Carbon-isotopic enrichment of shallower water
433 carbonates is thought to relate to a combination of factors including high levels of photosynthesis, which
434 causes shallow waters to become enriched in the heavier isotope, and to the observation that aragonite
435 tends to be enriched by approximately 1‰ compared to low Mg-calcite (Swart and Eberli 2005).

436

437 *5.2. Estimated palaeotemperatures and early Toarcian warming*

438 The oxygen-isotopic compositions of the belemnites and brachiopods, from both sites, record
439 similar trends and become progressively more negative up section (Figs. 5, 6). Assuming a $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$
440 value of -1, as typically inferred for a Jurassic world free of ice caps (Shackleton and Kennett 1975), and
441 assuming that there were no major changes in the isotopic composition of seawater through the studied
442 interval, our $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ data indicate a rise in bottom water temperature from a mean of 20°C in the late
443 *Margaritatus* to *Tenuicostatum* zones, to a peak of 25°C soon after the T-OAE extinction interval (Table
444 3, Table S1, S2). These estimated palaeotemperatures are consistent with data from other localities in the
445 Iberian Peninsula where brachiopod calcite has been analysed, and the same assumptions applied, such
446 as at Peniche in Portugal (Suan et al. 2008). In addition, warming across this interval is also indicated by
447 $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and Mg/Ca ratios of belemnite rostra from Portugal, England, Spain and Germany (Bailey et al.
448 2003; Rosales et al. 2004; van de Schootbrugge et al. 2005).

449 However, if the Jurassic $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$ value at our study sites was closer to 0, then estimated
450 palaeotemperatures would be ~5°C higher (Table 3), although the magnitude of the rise would be the
451 same (cf., Kearsley et al., 2009). It has been suggested that there may have been transient development of
452 icehouse conditions during the late Pliensbachian before the T-OAE (Price 1999, van de Schootbrugge
453 et al. 2005; Suan et al 2010; Korte and Hesselbo 2011). If so, then the isotopic composition of Jurassic

454 seawater may have shifted from near 0 to -1 across the T-OAE, and the absolute temperature change
455 would have been less than 5°C (Table 3).

456 Apart from the potential for global changes in $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{seawater}}$, shallow marine environments may be
457 affected by local or regional variations in evaporation, precipitation and runoff, and therefore the $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$
458 record could plausibly also reflect variations in both seawater temperature and salinity. Warming events
459 are likely to cause a reduction in surface seawater salinity due to changes to the hydrological cycle such
460 as higher continental runoff (e.g., Cohen et al. 2004). Given kinetic effects during evaporation and
461 precipitation, freshwater $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ is generally lower than that of marine water (Craig 1961). If post-
462 extinction brachiopods biomineralised in waters with elevated freshwater input, the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of their
463 shells would therefore become more negative, leading to an overestimate of seawater temperature.
464 However, brachiopods are benthic animals, have preference for normal salinity seawaters (Brand et al.
465 2003), and both sites are below storm wave base in the Turmiel Formation (Comas-Rengifo et al. 1996).
466 Furthermore bottom seawaters are generally less affected by salinity changes than surface seawaters in
467 today's oceans (e.g., Lear et al. 2000). Therefore we consider that the recorded $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ values were only
468 influenced to a minor extent, at most, by possible salinity changes.

469 Comparison between belemnite and brachiopod oxygen isotope compositions from the two
470 sections reveals that the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values of the belemnites are more positive (i.e., they biomineralised in
471 'cooler' waters) than the coeval brachiopods (Figs. 5, 6). This difference has been noted before on a
472 global-scale (Price et al. 2013), and in a range of local studies (e.g., Alberti et al. 2012; Mettam et al.
473 2014; Wierzbowski 2015). Although non-equilibrium processes may explain the oxygen isotopic
474 signatures of belemnite fossils (Immenhauser et al. 2016), the consistent difference between brachiopods
475 and belemnites is most simply explained by their different ecologies: belemnites were motile animals,
476 able to swim throughout the water column but which evidently biomineralised in deeper (cooler) waters

477 as modern coleoids do (Price et al. 2009). Brachiopods, being sessile, record the chemistry of the
478 seawater at the site where they lived and are found, or from shallower (i.e., nearer sea-surface) settings if
479 they have been transported downslope post-mortem. Thus, they are the preferred proxy group for
480 Jurassic palaeotemperature studies (Price et al. 2013).

481

482 5.3. Faunal turnover and potential environmental drivers

483 At both localities, the pre-extinction faunal association of the *Tenuicostatum* Zone comprises
484 Biofacies B3, in which the abundance of non-attached epifaunal suspension feeders (e.g., *Gryphaea* cf.
485 *sublobata*; *Pseudopecten aequivalvis*) is indicative of relatively soft substrates and low energy
486 conditions (Fürsich et. al 2001), while the presence of deep-infaunal bivalves like *Pleuromya* suggests
487 well oxygenated bottom waters. This is consistent with what is observed in other localities of the Iberian
488 Range, where the dominance of epifaunal suspension feeders and the scarcity of detritus and deposit
489 feeders has been interpreted as indicative of a regime of low productivity, low turbidity, and low rate of
490 sedimentation in moderately soft to firm substrates (e.g., Fürsich et. al 2001; Gahr 2005).

491 The first assemblage to colonize the soft bottom after the extinction event is dominated by small,
492 opportunistic species, like the brachiopod *Soaresirynchia bouchardi*, and the epifaunal bivalves
493 *Parvamussium pumilum* and *Plicatula auricula* (Biofacies B4, Figs. 9, 10). *S. bouchardi* has the
494 distinctive features of an opportunistic organism (*sensu* Levinton 1970) as it shows basic external
495 features (e.g., nearly smooth shells, sub-rounded outlines), morphological plasticity and simple internal
496 architecture, and has a wide geographical distribution in the western Tethys (Gahr 2005; García Joral et
497 al. 2011; Baeza-Carratalá et al. 2011). Smooth brachiopods were typical inhabitants of deep-sea
498 environments in the Western Tethys (cf., Ager 1967; Vörös 1993, 2005). According to Vörös (2005),
499 after the end-Permian extinction, deeper-water marine habitats operated as long-term reservoirs where

500 the evolutionary lineages of smooth morphotypes survived marine crises and from which, under
501 appropriate conditions, expanded to re-occupy shallow habitats. *S. bouchardi* was probably one of these
502 species adapted to deep-sea environments, which took advantage of the ecological void caused by the
503 early Toarcian extinction by colonizing shallower habitats (Baeza-Carratalá et al. 2017). The deepening
504 that occurred during the LJ3-2b cycle, might also have favoured this colonization.

505 Similarly, *P. pumilum* is considered a eurytopic opportunist able to adapt to a wide range of
506 environmental conditions, given its elevated abundance at certain levels in the Toarcian of the Tethys,
507 included laminated black shales (Johnson 1984). Furthermore, modern propeamussiids occupy an
508 entirely exceptional position with regard to feeding type among bivalves, as they have adapted to a
509 carnivorous life style, preying on copepods (Hicks and Marshall 1985), foraminifera, and different kinds
510 of eggs and larvae (Morton and Thurston 1989). Most extant species in the Propeamussiidae inhabit
511 bathyal or abyssal zones, and their carnivorous life style clearly represents an adaptation to such
512 environments in which suspended nutrients are usually scarce (Schneider et al. 2013).

513 The other post-extinction communities (i.e., Biofacies B5-B7) are somewhat similar in their
514 ecological characteristics to the pre-extinction ones but show a higher abundance and diversity of
515 infaunal suspension-feeding bivalves as well as common occurrences of the carnivorous epifaunal
516 bivalve *Parvamussium*. The most striking difference between pre- and post-extinction communities is in
517 taxonomic composition. At both sections, brachiopods go through a complete turnover through the
518 studied interval, whereas many bivalve species range through it, indicating that the Toarcian extinction
519 event had relatively little impact on this group, at least locally in the Iberian Ranges. García Joral et al.
520 (2011) interpreted this brachiopod turnover as being due to widespread extinctions brought about by the
521 rapid and pronounced increase in temperature at the *Tenuicostatum/Serpentinum* boundary. They
522 hypothesise that as temperatures rose, brachiopods were prevented from dispersing toward the northern,

523 cooler Arctic waters by the predominant southward currents along the Laurasian Seaway, and so were
524 unable to escape the increasing seawater temperature (García Joral et al. 2011).

525 We found no significant correlation between $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ and nMDS1_{brac} in this study (Table 2),
526 which suggests that temperature may not have been a major driver of brachiopod community
527 composition, at least at these study sites, although this is not a direct test of the García Joral et al. (2011)
528 hypothesis. In their multivariate analysis of Pliensbachian-Toarcian communities from the Cleveland
529 Basin, UK, Danise et al. (2015) also found no evidence of correlation between $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and benthic marine
530 diversity, although in that case the oxygen-isotope data derived from belemnites not brachiopods.
531 Intriguingly, although the significant negative correlation between $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$ and nMDS1_{biv} suggests that
532 seawater temperature possibly influenced the composition of bivalve communities, bivalves did not
533 suffer intense extinction.

534 In contrast to the situation at Castrovido, the negative correlation between TOC and richness (S_{biv} ,
535 S_{biv}) and evenness (Evenness, Evenness_{S_{biv}}) at Sierra Palomera (Table 2) suggests that changes in the
536 total organic carbon content might have played a role in controlling benthic community diversity at the
537 shallower site. The weight percent of organic carbon within sediments depends on different factors, such
538 as palaeoproductivity, redox conditions and influx of terrigenous detrital material (Seiter et al. 2004), all
539 of which could have affected faunal diversity. A palynological study conducted on the same section
540 shows the disappearance of planktonic primary producers (e.g., acritarchs, dinoflagellates and
541 *Tasmanites* prasinophyte algae) at the *Paltum-Semicelatum* Zone transition, and the dominance
542 thereafter of terrestrially-derived palynomorphs throughout the rest of the section (Barrón et al. 1999).
543 This suggests that low values of richness and evenness, especially in the upper part of the section, could
544 have been caused by factors related to the loss of marine plankton and a high input of terrestrial organic
545 matter. Terrestrial TOC input may have been episodic or highly seasonal and associated with episodes of

546 elevated freshwater influx to coastal environments, which would have resulted in temporary
547 stratification and local seafloor dysoxia. TOC values of up to 4 wt%, recorded in some horizons, are
548 close to McArthur et al.'s (2008) threshold of 5% TOC that typically characterises anoxic black shales.
549 The shallower setting of Sierra Palomera, and hence its relative proximity to the palaeocoastline
550 compared to Castrovido, might explain the higher input of terrigenous material, and the very different
551 trends in TOC between the two sites.

552

553 5.4. Stratigraphic control on the timing of extinction

554 The extinction horizon is expressed differently in the rock record at the two study sites, which
555 highlights the important role that stratigraphic processes play in determining the clustering of first and
556 last occurrences in sedimentary successions (Holland 1995, 2000). Stratigraphic condensation (e.g., at
557 flooding surfaces) can alter the apparent relative timing of first and last occurrences, making events
558 appear more closely spaced – less protracted in time – than they actually are (Holland 2000; 2015;
559 Nawrot et al. 2017). In this study, last occurrences occur at two flooding surfaces: a transgressive
560 surface at Castrovido, and a maximum flooding surface at Sierra Palomera (Figs. 9, 10). At Castrovido,
561 the more pronounced transgression at the *Semicelatum-Elegantulum* transition results in clustering of
562 last occurrence at the base of the LJ3-2b cycle and produces a thicker stratigraphic interval barren of
563 macrofauna (~2 metres thick). At Sierra Palomera, on the other hand, which records a more proximal
564 (onshore) depositional position than Castrovido, last occurrences peak at the stratigraphically higher
565 maximum flooding surface of cycle LJ3-2b, resulting in a much thinner interval barren of macrofauna
566 (~50 cm thick). The strong stratigraphic control on the distribution of species is readily demonstrated by
567 looking at the last occurrences of a few species in the two sections. *Lobothyris subpunctata*, *L. arcta*,
568 and *Liospiriferina falloti* disappear at the transgressive surface at Castrovido, but have their last

569 occurrences at the maximum flooding surface in Sierra Palomera (Figs. 9, 10). The same species (i.e.,
570 with the same environmental tolerance), persisted longer at Sierra Palomera because of the shallower
571 water depth compared to Castrovido. This further confirms the need to study multiple sections in the
572 same sedimentary basin, along an onshore-offshore transect in order to better understand the timing and
573 magnitude of an extinction event (Smith et al. 2001; Holland 2015; Danise and Holland 2017).

574

575 *5.5. Timing of recovery, comparison with other localities and extinction events*

576 Richness returns to pre-extinction values at the top of the *Elegantulum* Subzone at Sierra Palomera (Fig.
577 6), and at the base of the *Falciferum* Subzone at Castrovido (Fig. 5), indicating full recovery of benthic
578 communities. Recovery is faster than at other Tethyan localities that are characterised by the
579 development of anoxic/dysoxic conditions with the deposition of thick black shales. For instance,
580 brachiopods did not recover in Northern Spain (Asturias and Basque–Cantabrian Basin) until the Middle
581 Toarcian *Variabilis* Zone (García Joral and Goy 2009; García Joral et al. 2011). Similarly, in the
582 Cleveland Basin, UK, black shale deposition was protracted until the lower part of the *Bifrons* Zone, and
583 this noticeably delayed faunal recovery (Danise et al. 2013; 2015). In contrast, on the East Midland
584 Shelf, UK, situated in a shallower, more hospitable setting compared to the Cleveland Basin, an increase
585 in faunal diversity began earlier, within the upper *Exaratum* Subzone (Caswell and Coe 2012), which
586 correlates with the *Elegantulum* Subzone of western Tethys. As noticed by García Joral et al. (2011), the
587 recovery pattern recorded in early Toarcian sections resembles the pattern that occurred in the aftermath
588 of the Late Permian mass extinction event, where recovery was more rapid in well oxygenated areas, but
589 delayed in areas affected by anoxia (e.g., Twitchett et al. 2004; Foster et al. 2015). Hence, even if the
590 development of anoxia was not the main, global cause of faunal loss across the early Toarcian, it plays
591 an important role for faunal recovery in the immediate aftermath.

Results from our local study mirror those from a global analysis of early Jurassic marine organisms, which found that the early Toarcian event selected against sessile suspension feeders (Dunhill et al. 2018a). Similar results have been found for other Mesozoic warming-related extinction events, such as the Late Permian (e.g., Rhodes and Thayer 1991, Erwin et al. 2002) and the Late Triassic mass extinctions (Dunhill et al. 2018a, 2018b). In particular, the global scale impact of the early Toarcian event was extraordinarily important for the articulate brachiopods: two major orders, Spiriferinida and Athyridida, and about 67% of the genera belonging to the order Rhynchonellida disappeared (Vörös 2002; Vörös et al. 2016; Manceñido 2000). The decline of brachiopods, which had already started with the Late Permian and Late Triassic mass extinctions, represent a fundamental change in the taxonomic structure and ecological architecture of marine ecosystems, and contributed to the shift to the molluscan Modern Fauna (Sepkoski 1981;1996; Bambach et al. 2002).

603

604 **6. Conclusions**

Our geochemical, palaeontological and stratigraphic study of two study sites in the Iberian Range, Spain, that originally lay along an onshore-offshore transect, has increased our understanding of the early Toarcian extinction event in the western Tethys. High-resolution analyses of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and TOC from bulk rock samples, coupled with $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ analyses of belemnites and brachiopods, has enabled us to characterise the geochemical signatures of the Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary and the early Toarcian (T-OAE) events in the Iberian Range. A negative CIE at the Pliensbachian/Toarcian boundary is recorded at both sections, but is more pronounced at Sierra Palomera than at Castrovido. A negative CIE in the lower part of the *Elegantulum* subzone is recorded at both sections, and coincides with organic enrichment at Castrovido but not at Sierra Palomera. The apparent timing of the early Toarcian extinction of the benthic fauna also differs between study sites, indicating the importance of

615 understanding local stratigraphy when interpreting the fossil record. Last-occurrences cluster at a
616 transgressive surface at the deeper water site of Castrovido but at the maximum flooding surface at the
617 shallower site of Sierra Palomera.

618 The early Toarcian extinction event caused a complete turnover in the brachiopod community
619 locally, but most bivalve species survived. Spearman's rank correlations between geochemical and
620 ecological variables demonstrate a strong correlation between changes in TOC, bivalve richness and
621 evenness at Sierra Palomera. We hypothesis that high organic content from episodic continental runoff
622 locally inhibited species diversity at the shallower study site, possibly due to associated changes such as
623 local dysoxia and salinity stratification. At Castrovido, a significant correlation between the $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ record
624 of brachiopod calcite and the ecological metric nMDS1 suggests that rising seawater temperature may
625 have affected the composition of bivalve communities at the deeper water site.

626 Our study has uncovered a number of key differences in the stratigraphic, geochemical and
627 palaeoecological records of the two study sites, and in the responses of the different taxonomic groups to
628 the early Toarcian extinction event. This shows the value of analysing multiple sections along a depth
629 transect rather than extrapolating from a single study site, and of integrating fossil and geochemical data
630 from the same samples. Analysing different taxonomic groups from multiple sites through the same
631 event is likely to provide greater insights into understanding the responses of marine communities to
632 past climate change and environmental perturbation.

633

634 **Acknowledgements**

635 This project was supported by Natural Environment Research Council (NERC) grant to R.J.
636 Twitchett (NE/I005641/1), and by project CGL201566604-R of the Spanish Ministerio de Economía y
637 Competitividad to J.J. Gómez. We thank F. García Joral for showing his collection of Early Jurassic

638 brachiopods for comparison; Silvia Menéndez and Graciela Delvene for access to the bivalve collection
639 of the Museo Geominero, Madrid; Jodie Fisher and Chiara Consolaro for TOC analyses; University of
640 Copenhagen for trace element analysis.

641

642 **References**

- 643 Aberhan, M., 2001. Bivalve palaeobiogeography and the Hispanic Corridor: time of opening and
644 effectiveness of a proto-Atlantic seaway. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 165, 375–394.
- 645 Ager, D.V., 1967. Some Mesozoic brachiopods in the Tethys region. In: Adams, C.G., Ager, D.V.
646 (Eds.), *Aspects of Tethyan Biogeography*. 7. Systematics Association Publication, pp. 135–151.
- 647 Ait-Itto, F-Z., Price, G.D., Addi, A.A., Chafiki, D., Mannani, I., 2017. Bulk-carbonate and belemnite
648 carbon-isotope records across the Pliensbachian-Toarcian boundary on the northern margin of
649 Gondwana (Issouka, Middle Atlas, Morocco). *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 466, 128–
650 136.
- 651 Alberti, M., Fürsich, F.T., Pandey, D.K., Ramkumar, M., 2012. Stable isotope analyses of belemnites
652 from the Kachchh Basin, western India: paleoclimatic implications for the Middle to Late Jurassic
653 transition. *Facies* 58, 261–278.
- 654 Anderson, T.F., Arthur, M.A., 1983. Stable isotopes of oxygen and carbon and their application to
655 sedimentological and paleoenvironmental problems. In: Arthur, M.A., Anderson, T.F., Kaplan,
656 I.R., Veizer, J., Land, L. (Eds.), *Stable isotopes in sedimentary geology: SEPM Short Course*, 10,
657 pp. 1–151.
- 658 Arias, C., 2013. The early Toarcian (early Jurassic) ostracod extinction events in the Iberian Range: The
659 effect of temperature changes and prolonged exposure to low dissolved oxygen concentrations.
660 *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 387, 40–55.

661 Aurell, M., Robles, S., Bádenas, B., Rosales, I., Quesada, S., Meléndez, G., Garcia-Ramos, J.C., 2003.
 662 Transgressive–regressive cycles and Jurassic palaeogeography of northeast Iberia. *Sediment. Geol.*
 663 162, 239–271.

664 Baeza-Carratalá, J.F., García Joral, F., Tent-Manclús, J.E., 2011. Biostratigraphy and
 665 palaeobiogeographic affinities of the Jurassic brachiopod assemblages from Sierra Espuña
 666 (Maláguide Complex, Internal Betic Zones, Spain). *J. Iber. Geol.* 37, 137–151.

667 Baeza-Carratalá, J.F., García Joral, F., Giannetti, A., Tent-Manclús, J.E., 2017. Evolution of the last
 668 koninckinids (Athyridida, Koninckinidae), a precursor signal of the early Toarcian mass extinction
 669 event in the Western Tethys. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 429, 41–56.

670 Bailey, T.R., Rosenthal, Y., McArthur, J.M., Van De Schootbrugge, B., Thirlwall, M.F., 2003.
 671 Paleoceanographic changes of the Late Pliensbachian–Early Toarcian interval: a possible link to
 672 the genesis of an Oceanic Anoxic Event. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 212, 307–320.

673 Bambach, R.K., Knoll, A.H., Sepkoski, J.J., 2002, Anatomical and ecological constraints on
 674 Phanerozoic animal diversity in the marine realm, *PNAS* 99, 6854–6859.

675 Barbin, V., 2013. Application of cathodoluminescence microscopy to recent and past biological
 676 materials: a decade of progress. *Miner. Petrol.* 107, 353–362.

677 Barrón, E., Comas-Rengifo, M.J., Trincão, P., 1999. Estudio palinológico del tránsito
 678 Pliensbachense/Toarciense en la Rambla del Salto (Sierra Palomera, Teruel, España). *Cuadernos*
 679 *de Geología Ibérica* 25, 181–187.

680 Belanger, C.L., 2012. Individual to community-level faunal responses to environmental change from a
 681 marine fossil record of Early Miocene global warming. *PLoS ONE* 7(4), e36290.

682 Bennington, J.B., 2003. Transcending patchiness in the comparative analysis of paleocommunities: a
 683 test case from the Upper Cretaceous of New Jersey. *Palaios* 18, 22–33.

684 Bjerrum, C.J., Surlyk, F., Callomon, J.H., Slingerland, R.L., 2001. Numerical paleoceanographic study
685 of the Early Jurassic Transcontinental Lurasian Seaway. *Paleoceanography* 16, 390–404.

686 Bodin, S., Mattioli, E., Frölich, S., Marshall, J.D., Boutib, L., Lahsini, S., Redfern, J., 2010. Toarcian
687 carbon isotope shifts and nutrient changes from the Northern margin of Gondwana (High Atlas,
688 Morocco, Jurassic): palaeoenvironmental implications. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.*
689 297, 377–390.

690 Bodin, S., Krencker, F., Kothe, T., Hoffmann, R., Mattioli, E., Heimhofer, U., Kabiri, L., 2016.
691 Perturbation of the carbon cycle during the late Pliensbachian – Early Toarcian: New insight from
692 high-resolution carbon isotope records in Morocco. *J. Afr. Earth Sci.* 116, 89–104.

693 Brand, U., Logan, A., Hiller, N., Richardson, J., 2003. Geochemistry of modern brachiopods:
694 Application and implications for oceanography and paleoceanography. *Chem. Geol.* 198, 305–
695 334.

696 Bray, J.R., Curtis, J.T., 1957. An ordination of upland forest communities of southern Wisconsin. *Ecol.*
697 *Monog.* 27, 325–349.

698 Brazier, J.-M., Suan, G., Tacail, T., Simon, L., Martin, J.E., Mattioli, E., Balter, V., 2015. Calcium
699 isotope evidence for dramatic increase of continental weathering during the Toarcian oceanic
700 anoxic event (Early Jurassic). *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 411, 164–176.

701 Burgess, S.D., Bowring, S.A., Fleming, T.H., Elliot, D.H., 2015. High-precision geochronology links
702 the Ferrar large igneous province with early-Jurassic ocean anoxia and biotic crisis. *Earth Planet.*
703 *Sci. Lett.* 415, 90–99.

704 Callomon, J.H., 1979. Marine boreal Bathonian fossils from the northern North Sea and their
705 palaeogeographical significance. *Proc. Geol. Assoc. Lond.* 90, 163–169.

706 Caruthers, A.H., Smith, P.L., Gröcke, D.R., 2013. The Pliensbachian–Toarcian (Early Jurassic)
 707 extinction, a global multi-phased event. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 386, 104–118.
 708 Caswell, B.A., Coe, A.L., 2012. A high-resolution shallow marine record of the Toarcian (Early
 709 Jurassic) Oceanic Anoxic Event from the East Midlands Shelf, UK. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.*
 710 *Palaeoecol.* 365–366, 124–135.
 711 Caswell, B.A., Coe, A.L., Cohen, A.S., 2009. New range data for marine invertebrate species across the
 712 early Toarcian (Early Jurassic) mass extinction. *J. Geol. Soc. London* 166, 859–872.
 713 Cecca, F., Macchioni, F., 2004. The two Early Toarcian (Early Jurassic) extinction events in
 714 ammonoids. *Lethaia* 37, 35–56.
 715 Cohen, A.S., Coe, A.L., Harding, S.M., Schwark, L., 2004. Osmium isotope evidence for the regulation
 716 of atmospheric CO₂ by continental weathering. *Geology* 32, 157–160.
 717 Comas-Rengifo, M.J., 1985. El Pliensbachense de la Cordillera Ibérica. Colección Tesis Doctorales,
 718 1985. Univ. Complutense Madrid, Spain. 594 pp.
 719 Comas-Rengifo, M.J., Goy, A., Yébenes, A., 1988. El Lias en el Sector Sur occidental de la Sierra de la
 720 Demanda (Castrovido, Burgos). *Cienc. Tierra Geol.* 11, 119–141.
 721 Comas-Rengifo, M.J., Gómez, J.J., Goy, A., Arias, C.F., Bernad, J., García Joral, F., Herrero, C.,
 722 Martínez, G., Perilli, N., 1996. The Toarcian in the Rambla del Salto (Sierra Palomera) section. 1st
 723 Toarcian and 4th Aalenian working groups meeting. International subcomission on Jurassic
 724 stratigraphy. Field Trip Iberian Range Guide Book, pp. 27– 48.
 725 Craig, H., 1961. Isotopic variations in meteoric waters. *Science* 133, 1702–1703.
 726 Damborenea, S.E., 2002. Jurassic evolution of Southern Hemisphere marine palaeobiogeographic units
 727 based on benthonic bivalves. *Geobios* 35, 51–71.

728 Danise, S., Holland, S.M., 2017. Faunal response to sea-level and climate change in a short-lived
729 seaway: Jurassic of the Western Interior, U.S.A. *Palaeontology* 60, 213–232.

730 Danise, S., Twitchett, R.J., Little, C.T.S., Clémence, M.-E., 2013. The impact of global warming and
731 anoxia on marine benthic community dynamics: An example from the Toarcian (Early Jurassic).
732 *PLoS ONE* 8, e56255.

733 Danise, S., Twitchett, R.J., Little, C.T.S., 2015. Environmental controls on Jurassic marine ecosystems
734 during global warming. *Geology* 43, 263–266.

735 Dera, G., Neige, P., Dommergues, J., Brayard, A., 2011. Ammonite paleobiogeography during the
736 Pliensbachian–Toarcian crisis (Early Jurassic) reflecting paleoclimate, eustasy, and extinctions.
737 *Glob. Planet. Change* 78, 92–105.

738 Dunhill, A.M., Foster, W.J., Azaele, S., Sciberras, J., Twitchett, R.J., 2018a. Modelling determinants of
739 extinction across two Mesozoic hyperthermal events. *Proc. R. Soc. Lond. B* 285, 20180404.

740 Dunhill, A.M., Foster, W.J., Sciberras, J., Twitchett, R.J., 2018b. Impact of the Late Triassic Mass
741 Extinction on functional diversity and composition of marine ecosystems. *Palaeontology* 61, 133–
742 148.

743 Durbin, J., Watson, G.S., 1950. Testing for serial correlation in least squares regression I. *Biometrika*
744 37, 409–428.

745 Erwin, D.H., Bowring, S.A., Yugan, J., 2002. End-Permian mass extinctions: a review. *Geol. Soc.* 356,
746 363–384.

747 Foster, W.J., Danise, S., Sedlacek, A., Price, G.D., Hips, K., Twitchett, R.J., 2015. Environmental
748 controls on the post-Permian recovery of benthic, tropical marine ecosystems in western
749 Palaeotethys (Aggtelek Karst, Hungary). *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 440, 374–394.

750 Fürsich, F.T., Berndt, R., Scheuer, T., Gahr, M.E., 2001. Comparative ecological analysis of Toarcian
 751 (Lower Jurassic) benthic faunas from southern France and east-central Spain. *Lethaia* 34, 169–
 752 199.

753 Gahr, M., 2002. Palökologie des Makrobenthos aus dem Unter-Toarc SW-Europas. *Beringeria* 31, 3–
 754 204.

755 Gahr, M., 2005. Response of Lower Toarcian (Lower Jurassic) macrobenthos of the Iberian Peninsula to
 756 sea level changes and mass extinction. *J. Iberian Geol.* 31, 197–215.

757 García Joral, F., Goy, A., 2009. Toarcian (Lower Jurassic) brachiopods in Asturias (Northern Spain):
 758 stratigraphic distribution, critical events and palaeobiogeography. *Geobios* 42, 255–264.

759 García Joral, F., Gómez, J.J., Goy, A., 2011. Mass extinction and recovery of the Early Toarcian (Early
 760 Jurassic) brachiopods linked to climate change in northern and central Spain. *Palaeogeogr.*
 761 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 302, 367–380.

762 Gómez, J.J., Goy A., 2005. Late Triassic and Early Jurassic palaeogeographic evolution and depositional
 763 cycles of the Western Tethys Iberian platform system (Eastern Spain). *Palaeogeogr.*
 764 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 222, 77–94.

765 Gómez, J.J., Fernández-López, S.R., 2006. The Iberian Middle Jurassic carbonate-platform system:
 766 Synthesis of the palaeogeographic elements of its eastern margin (Spain). *Palaeogeogr.*
 767 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 236, 190–205.

768 Gómez, J.J., Arias, C., 2010. Rapid warming and ostracods mass extinction at the Lower Toarcian
 769 (Jurassic) of central Spain. *Mar. Micropaleontol.* 74, 119–135.

770 Gómez, J.J., Goy, A., 2011. Warming-driven mass extinction in the Early Toarcian (Early Jurassic) of
 771 northern and central Spain. Correlation with other time-equivalent European sections.
 772 *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 306, 176–195.

773 Gómez, J.J., Comas-Rengifo, M.J., Goy, A., 2003. Las unidades litoestratigráficas del Jurásico inferior
 774 de las cordilleras Ibérica y Costero Catalana. *Rev. Soc. Geol. Esp.* 16, 227–237.

775 Gómez, J.J., Goy, A., Canales, M.L., 2008. Seawater temperature and carbon isotope variations in
 776 belemnites linked to mass extinction during the Toarcian (Early Jurassic) in Central and Northern
 777 Spain. Comparison with other European sections. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 258,
 778 28–58.

779 Hesselbo, S.P., Gröcke, D.R., Jenkyns, H.C., Bjerrun, C.J., Farrimond, P., Morgans Bell, H.S., Green,
 780 O.R., 2000. Massive dissociation of gas hydrate during a Jurassic oceanic anoxic event. *Nature*
 781 406, 392–395.

782 Hesselbo, S.P., Jenkyns, H.C., Duarte, L.V., Oliveira, L.C.V., 2007. Carbon–isotope record of the Early
 783 Jurassic (Toarcian) Oceanic Anoxic Event from fossil wood and marine carbonate (Lusitanian
 784 Basin, Portugal). *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 253, 455–470.

785 Hicks, G.R.F., Marshall B.A., 1985. Sex selective predation of deepsea meiobenthic copepods by
 786 pectinacean bivalves and its influence on copepod sex ratios. *New Zeal. J. Mar. Fresh.* 19, 227–
 787 231.

788 Holland, S.M., 1995. The stratigraphic distribution of fossils. *Paleobiology* 21, 92–109.

789 Holland, S.M., 2000. The quality of the stratigraphic record – a sequence stratigraphic perspective. In:
 790 Erwin, D.H., Wing, S.L. (Eds), *Deep time: paleobiology’s perspective*. The Paleontological
 791 Society, Lawrence, KS., pp. 148–168.

792 Holland, S.M., 2015. The stratigraphy of mass extinction. *Palaeontology* 58, 903–924.

793 Kearsey, T., Twitchett, R.J., Price, G.D., Grimes, S.T., 2009. Isotope excursions and palaeotemperature
 794 estimates from the Permian/Triassic boundary in the Southern Alps (Italy). *Palaeogeogr.*,
 795 *Palaeoclimatol.*, *Palaeoecol.* 279, 29–40.

796 Korte, C., Hesselbo, S.P., 2011. Shallow marine carbon and oxygen isotope and elemental records
797 indicate icehouse-greenhouse cycles during the Early Jurassic. *Paleoceanography* 26, PA4219.

798 Imai, N., Terashima, S., Itoh, S., Ando, A., 1996. Compilation of analytical data on nine GSJ
799 geochemical reference samples, “Sedimentary Rock Series”. *Geostand. Newslett.* 20, 165–216.

800 Immenhauser, A., Kenter, J.A., Ganssen, G., Bahamonde, J.R., Van Vliet, A., Saher, M.H., 2002. Origin
801 and significance of isotope shifts in Pennsylvanian carbonates (Asturias, NW Spain). *J. Sediment.*
802 *Res.* 72, 82–94.

803 Immenhauser, A., Schöne, B. R., Hoffmann, R., Niedermayr, A., 2016. Mollusc and brachiopod skeletal
804 hard parts: Intricate archives of their marine environment. *Sedimentology* 63, 1–59.

805 Izumi, K., Miyaji, T., Tanabe, K., 2012. Early Toarcian (Early Jurassic) oceanic anoxic event recorded
806 in the shelf deposits in the northwestern Panthalassa: evidence from the Nishinakayama formation
807 in the Toyora area, west Japan. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 315–316, 100–108.

808 Jenkyns, H.C., 1988. The early Toarcian (Jurassic) anoxic event; stratigraphic, sedimentary and
809 geochemical evidence. *Am. J. Sci.* 288, 101–151.

810 Jenkyns, H.C., 2010. Geochemistry of oceanic anoxic events. *Geochem., Geophys., Geosy.* 11, Q03004.

811 Jenkyns, H.C., Clayton, C.J., 1997. Lower Jurassic epicontinental carbonates and mudstones from
812 England and Wales: chemostratigraphic signals and the early Toarcian anoxic event.
813 *Sedimentology* 44, 687–706.

814 Jenkyns, H.C., Gröcke, D.R., Hesselbo, S.P., 2001. Nitrogen isotope evidence for water mass
815 denitrification during the Early Toarcian (Jurassic) oceanic anoxic event. *Paleoceanography* 16,
816 593–603.

817 Jenkyns, H.C., Jones, C.E., Gröcke, D.R., Hesselbo, S.P., Parkinson, D.N., 2002. Chemostratigraphy of
 818 the Jurassic system: applications, limitations and implications for palaeoceanography. *J. Geol.*
 819 *Soc. London* 159, 351–378.

820 Johnson, A.L.A., 1984. The palaeobiology of the bivalve families Pectinidae and Propeamussiidae in the
 821 Jurassic of Europe. *Zitteliana* 11, 1–235.

822 Kemp, D.B., Coe, A.L., Cohen, A.S., Schwark, L., 2005. Astronomical pacing of methane release in the
 823 Early Jurassic period. *Nature* 437, 396–399.

824 Kendall, M.G., 1948. Rank correlation methods. Oxford, England, Griffin, 160 pp.

825 Lande, R., 1996. Statistics and partitioning of species diversity, and similarity among multiple
 826 communities. *Oikos* 76, 5–13.

827 Lear, C.H., Elderfield, H., Wilson, P. A., 2000. Cenozoic deep-sea temperatures and global ice volumes
 828 from Mg/Ca in benthic foraminiferal calcite. *Science* 287, 269–272.

829 Legendre, P., Legendre, L., 1998. Numerical Ecology, 2nd edn. Elsevier, 853 pp.

830 Levinton, J.S., 1970. The paleoecological significance of opportunistic species. *Lethaia* 3, 69–78.

831 Little, C.T.S., Benton, M.J., 1995. Early Jurassic mass extinction: a global long-term event. *Geology* 23,
 832 495–498.

833 Littler, K., Hesselbo, S.P., Jenkyns, H.C., 2010. A carbon–isotope perturbation at the Pliensbachian–
 834 Toarcian boundary: evidence from the Lias Group, NE England. *Geol. Mag.* 147, 181–192.

835 Ludvigsen, R., Westrop, S.R., Pratt, B.R., Tuffnell, P.A., Young, G.A., 1986. Dual biostratigraphy:
 836 Zones and biofacies. *Geosci. Can.* 13, 139–154.

837 Manceñido, M.O., 2002. Paleobiogeography of Mesozoic brachiopod faunas from Andean–Patagonian
 838 areas in a global context. *Geobios* 35, 176–192.

839 Marshall, J.D., 1992. Climatic and oceanographic isotopic signals from the carbonate rock record and
840 their interpretation. *Geol. Mag.* 129, 134–160.

841 Martindale R.C., Aberhan, M., 2017. Response of macrobenthic communities to the Toarcian Oceanic
842 Anoxic Event in northeastern Panthalassa (Ya Ha Tinda, Alberta, Canada). *Palaeogeogr.*
843 *Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 478, 103–112.

844 McArthur, J.M., Donovan, D.T., Thirlwall, M.F., Fouke, B.W., Matthey, D., 2000. Strontium isotope
845 profile of the early Toarcian (Jurassic) oceanic anoxic event, the duration of ammonite biozones,
846 and belemnite palaeotemperatures. *Earth Plan. Sci. Lett.* 179, 269–285.

847 McArthur, J.M., Algeo, T.J., van de Schootbrugge, B., Li, Q., Howarth, R.J., 2008. Basinal restriction,
848 black shales, Re-Os dating, and the Early Toarcian (Jurassic) oceanic anoxic event.
849 *Paleoceanography* 23, PA4217.

850 Mettam, C., Johnson, A.L.A., Nunn, E.V., Schöne, B.R., 2014. Stable isotope ($\delta^{18}\text{O}$ and $\delta^{13}\text{C}$)
851 sclerochronology of Callovian (Middle Jurassic) bivalves (*Gryphaea (Bilobissa) dilobotes*) and
852 belemnites (*Cylindroteuthis puzosiana*) from the Peterborough Member of the Oxford Clay
853 Formation (Cambridgeshire, England): Evidence of palaeoclimate, water depth and belemnite
854 behaviour. *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol. Palaeoecol.* 399, 187–201.

855 Morrison, J.O., Brand, U., 1986. Geochemistry of recent marine invertebrates. *Geosci. Can.* 13, 237–
856 254.

857 Morton, B., Thurston, M.H., 1989. The functional morphology of *Propeamussium lucidum* (Bivalvia:
858 Pectinacea), a deepsea predatory scallop. *J. Zool.* 218, 471–496.

859 Nawrot, R., Scarponi, D., Azzarone, M., Dexter, T.A., Kusnerik, K.M., Wittmer, J.M., Amorosi, A.,
860 Kowalewski, M., 2018. Stratigraphic signatures of mass extinctions: ecological and sedimentary
861 determinants *Proc. R. Soc. B*, 20181191.

862 Nieuwenhuize, J., Maas, Y.E.M, Middelburg, J.J., 1994. Rapid analysis of organic carbon and nitrogen
 863 in particulate materials. *Mar. Chem.* 45, 217–224.

864 Osete, M.L., Gialanella, P.R., Gómez, J.J., Villalaín, J.J., Goy, A., Heller, F., 2007. Magnetostratigraphy
 865 of Early–Middle Toarcian expanded sections from the Iberian Range (central Spain). *Earth Planet.*
 866 *Sci. Lett.* 259, 319–332.

867 Parkinson D., Curry G.B., Cusack M., Fallick A.E., 2005. Shell structure, patterns and trends of oxygen
 868 and carbon stable isotopes in modern brachiopod shells. *Chem. Geol.* 219, 193–235.

869 Price, G.D., 1999. The evidence and implications of polar ice during the Mesozoic, *Earth Sci. Rev.*, 48,
 870 183–210.

871 Price, G.D., Twitchett, R.J., Smale, C. Marks, V., 2009. Isotopic analysis of the life history of the
 872 enigmatic squid *Spirula spirula*, with implications for studies of fossil cephalopods. *Palaios* 24,
 873 273–279.

874 Price, G.D., Twitchett, R.J., Wheeley, J.R., Buono, G., 2013. Isotopic evidence for long term warmth in
 875 the Mesozoic. *Sci. Rep.* 3, 1438.

876 Quesada S., Robles S., Rosales I., 2005. Depositional architecture and transgressive–regressive cycles
 877 within Liassic backstepping carbonate ramps in the Basque–Cantabrian basin, northern Spain. *J.*
 878 *Geol. Soc.* 162, 531–548.

879 R Core Team, 2017. R: a language and environment for statistical computing, v. 3.3.3. [http://www.R-](http://www.R-project.org/)
 880 [project.org/](http://www.R-project.org/).

881 Rhodes, M.C., Thayer, C.W., 1991. Mass extinctions: ecological selectivity and primary production.
 882 *Geology* 19, 877–880.

883 Rodríguez-Tovar, F.J., Reolid, M., 2013. Environmental conditions during the Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic
884 Event (T-OAE) in the westernmost Tethys: influence of the regional context on a global
885 phenomenon. *Bull. Geosci.* 88, 697–712.

886 Rosales, I., Quesada, S., Robles, S., 2001. Primary and diagenetic isotopic signals in fossils and
887 hemipelagic carbonates: the Lower Jurassic of northern Spain. *Sedimentology* 48, 1149–1169.

888 Rosales, I., Quesada, S., Robles, S., 2004. Paleotemperature variations of Early Jurassic seawater
889 recorded in geochemical trends of belemnites from the Basque–Cantabrian basin, northern Spain,
890 *Palaeogeogr. Palaeoclimatol.*, 203, 253–275.

891 Salas, R., Guimerá, J., Mas, R., Martín-Closas, C., Meléndez, A., Alonso, A., 2001. Evolution of the
892 Mesozoic Central Iberian Rift System and its Cainozoic inversion (Iberian Chain). In: Ziegler,
893 P.A., Cavazza, W., Robertson, A.H.F., Crasquin-Soleau, S. (Eds.), *Peri-Tethys Memoir 6: Peri-*
894 *Tethyan Rift/Wrench Basins and Passive Margins. Mém. Mus. Natn. Hist. Nat.* 186, Paris, France,
895 pp. 145–185.

896 Schneider, S., Crampton, J.S., Lukeneder, A., 2013. *Propeamussiidae*, *Inoceramidae*, and other Bivalvia
897 from the Lower Cretaceous Puez Formation (Valanginian–Cenomanian; Dolomites, South Tyrol,
898 Italy). *Cretac. Res.* 46, 216–231.

899 Scholle, P.A., Arthur, M.A., 1980. Carbon isotope fluctuations in Cretaceous pelagic limestones:
900 potential stratigraphic and petroleum exploration tool. *AAPG Bulletin* 64, 67–87.

901 Seiter, K., Hensen, C., Schröter, J., Zabel, M., 2004. Organic carbon content in surface sediments—
902 defining regional provinces. *Deep Sea Res. Part I: Oceanogr. Res. Pap.* 51, 2001–2026.

903 Sepkoski, J.J., 1981. A factor analytic description of the Phanerozoic marine fossil record. *Paleobiology*
904 7, 36 – 53.

905 Sepkoski, J.J., 1996. Competition in macroevolution: the double wedge revisited. In, Jablonski, D.,
 906 Erwin, D.H., Lipps, J.H. (Eds.), *Evolutionary Paleobiology*, University of Chicago Press, Chicago,
 907 pp. 211–255.

908 Shackleton, N.J., Kennett, J.P., 1975. Paleotemperature history of the Cenozoic and the initiation of
 909 Antarctic glaciation: oxygen and carbon isotope analyses in DSDP sites 277, 279, and 289. *Initial*
 910 *Reports of the Deep Sea* 29, 743–755.

911 Simpson, E.H., 1949, Measurement of diversity. *Nature* 163, 688.

912 Smith, A.B., Gal E., Monk, S.N., 2001. Sea-level change and rock-record bias in the Cretaceous: a
 913 problem for extinction and biodiversity studies. *Paleobiology* 27, 241–253.

914 Suan, G., Mattioli, E., Pittet, B., Mailliot, S., Lécuyer, C., 2008. Evidence for major environmental
 915 perturbation prior to and during the Toarcian (Early Jurassic) oceanic anoxic event from the
 916 Lusitanian Basin, Portugal. *Paleoceanography* 23, PA1202.

917 Suan, G., Mattioli, E., Pittet, B., Lécuyer, C., Suchéras–Marx, B., Duarte, L.V., Philippe, M., Reggiani,
 918 L., Martineau, F., 2010. Secular environmental precursors to Early Toarcian (Jurassic) extreme
 919 climate changes. *Earth Planet. Sci. Lett.* 290, 448–458.

920 Swart, P.K., Eberli, G.P., 2005. The nature of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ of periplatform sediments: Implications for
 921 stratigraphy and the global carbon cycle. *Sediment. Geol.* 175, 115–129.

922 Trabucho-Alexandre, J., van Gilst, R.I., Rodriguez-Lopez, J.P., de Boer, P.L., 2011. The sedimentary
 923 expression of oceanic anoxic event 1b in the North Atlantic, *Sedimentology* 58, 1217–1246.

924 Trecalli, A., Spangenberg, J., Adatte, T., Föllmi, K.B., Parente, M., 2012. Carbonate platform evidence
 925 of ocean acidification at the onset of the early Toarcian oceanic anoxic event. *Earth Planet. Sci.*
 926 *Lett.* 357–358, 214–225.

927 Twitchett, R.J., Krystyn, L., Baud, A., Wheeley, J.R., Richoz, S., 2004. Rapid marine recovery after the
 928 end-Permian mass extinction event in the absence of marine anoxia. *Geology* 32, 805–808.

929 van de Schootbrugge, B., McArthur, J. M., Bailey, T. R., Rosenthal, Y., Wright, J. D. Miller K. G.,
 930 2005. Toarcian oceanic anoxic event: An assessment of global causes using belemnite C isotope
 931 records. *Paleoceanography* 20, PA3008.

932 Veizer, J., 1983. Chemical diagenesis of carbonates: theory and application of trace element technique.
 933 *SEPM Short Course Notes* 10, 3.1–3.100.

934 Vörös, A., 1993. Jurassic brachiopods of the Bakony Mts. (Hungary): global and local effects on
 935 changing diversity. In: Pálffy, J., Vörös, A. (Eds.), *Mesozoic Brachiopods of Alpine Europe*.
 936 Hungarian Geological Society, Budapest, pp. 179–187.

937 Vörös, A., 2002. Victims of the Early Toarcian anoxic event: the radiation and extinction of Jurassic
 938 Koninckinidae (Brachiopoda). *Lethaia* 35, 345–357.

939 Vörös, A., 2005. The smooth brachiopods of the Mediterranean Jurassic: refugees or invaders?
 940 *Palaeogeogr., Palaeoclimatol., Palaeoecol.* 223, 222–242.

941 Vörös, A., Kocsis, Á.T., Pálffy, J., 2016. Demise of the last two spire-bearing brachiopod orders
 942 (Spiriferinida and Athyridida) at the Toarcian (Early Jurassic) extinction event. *Palaeogeogr.,*
 943 *Palaeoclimatol., Palaeoecol.* 457 233–241.

944 Ward, J.H., 1963. Hierarchical grouping to optimize an objective function, *J. Am. Stat. Assoc.* 58, 236–
 945 244.

946 Wierzbowski, H., 2015. Seawater temperatures and carbon isotope variations in central European basins
 947 at the Middle-Late Jurassic transition (Late Callovian-Early Kimmeridgian). *Palaeogeogr.*
 948 *Palaeoclimatol., Palaeoecol.* 440, 506–523.

949

Fig. 1. Geographic location of the studied sections and early Toarcian palaeogeographic reconstruction of the NW Tethys. A, Location map showing the Castrovido and Sierra Palomera sections on the Iberian Range. Note that the system of shallow platforms deepened towards the N-NW, so that Sierra Palomera is in a shallower setting compared to Castrovido. B, Palaeogeographic reconstruction of the NW Tethys. Black star indicates the location of the system of shallow platforms now uplifted in the Iberian Range. A, Modified after Gómez and Goy (2011); B, modified after Dera et al. (2011).

Ammonite Zones & Subzones			Lithostratigraphy	Sequence Stratigraphy
TOARCIAN	<i>Variabilis</i>	<i>Vitiosa</i>	Casinos Fm	R
		<i>Illustris</i>		
		<i>Variabilis</i>		
	<i>Bifrons</i>	<i>Bifrons</i>	Turmiel Fm	T
		<i>Sublevisoni</i>		
	<i>Serpentinum</i>	<i>Falciferum</i>		R
		<i>Elegantulum</i>		
	<i>Tenuicostatum</i>	<i>Semicelatum</i>		T
		<i>Paltum</i>		
	PL. <i>Spinatum</i>	<i>Hawskerense</i>		R
		<i>Apyrenum</i>	Barahona Fm	

Fig. 2. Stratigraphic framework, including ammonite stratigraphy, lithostratigraphy and sequence stratigraphy, of the uppermost Pliensbachian – lower and middle Toarcian of the Iberian Range. Most of the lower Toarcian deposits are represented by an alternation of hemipelagic marls and lime mudstones of the Turmiel Formation. LJ3-1, LJ3-2, LJ3-3 represent third-order cycles within the upper Pliensbachian and the lower – middle Toarcian transgressive interval of the second-order cycle LJ-3. Abbreviations: PL., Pliensbachian. Modified after Gómez and Arias (2010).

Fig. 3. Cathodoluminescence images showing different degrees of preservation of belemnites and brachiopods. A, Well preserved, non-luminescent, belemnite rostrum. Only exception is the apical canal, which is filled with matrix (m). B, Moderately well-preserved belemnite rostrum. Luminescence is low with the exception of a microfracture (mf) and a microboring (mb) filled, respectively, with secondary calcite and matrix. C, Diagenetically altered rostrum, with multiple and extensive microfractures, stylolites filled with highly luminescent calcite and the microboring filled with matrix. D, Well preserved, non-luminescent, rhynchonellid brachiopod shell in matrix. E, Well-preserved rhynchonellid brachiopod, with a microfracture filled with luminescent carbonate matrix. F, Moderately well-preserved (slightly luminescent) lophothyrid brachiopod shell, with endopunctae (ep) filled with carbonate matrix. Abbreviations: m, matrix; mf, microfractures; mb, microboring, ep, endopunctae.

Fig. 4. Cross-plot of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ data from bulk-rock samples, belemnites and brachiopod shells from Castrovido and Sierra Palomera. The linear trend towards very negative values ($\delta^{13}\text{C} < -1$ ‰; $\delta^{18}\text{O} < -6$ ‰) of some Castrovido bulk samples suggests a possible diagenetic overprint.

955

956

957

Fig. 5. Stratigraphy, geochemistry (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and palaeoecology (Richness, Evenness, nMDS1) of the Pliensbachian-Toarcian section at Castrovindo. Black lines represent the smoothed line (Loess smoothing factor 0.1) of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ bulk-sediment values (grey dots). Yellow boxes, defined by negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{maricite}}$ excursions, indicate the Pliensbachian-Toarcian and early Toarcian CIEs. nMDS1 curve represents values of axis 1 of the nMDS ordination of Fig. 7A. Coloured dots on the nMDS1 curve represent different biofacies, as identified from the cluster analysis (see Fig. 8). Abbreviations: Pl-To: Pliensbachian-Toarcian; T-OAE: Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic Event. Lithostratigraphic units, ammonite zones, and transgressive-regressive cycles after [Comas-Rengifo et al. \(1988\)](#). (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

Fig. 6. Stratigraphy, geochemistry (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}$) and palaeoecology (Richness, Evenness, nMDS1) of the Plensbachian-Toarcian section at Sierra Palomera. Black lines represent the smoothed line (Loess smoothing factor 0.1) of the $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ bulk-sediment values (grey dots). Yellow boxes, defined by negative $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{micrite}}$ excursions, indicate the Plensbachian-Toarcian and early Toarcian CIEs. nMDS1 curve represents values of axis 1 of the nMDS ordination of Fig. 7B. Coloured dots on the nMDS1 curve represent different biofacies, as identified from the cluster analysis (see Fig. 8). Abbreviations: Pl-To: Plensbachian-Toarcian; T-OAE: Toarcian Oceanic Anoxic Event. Lithostratigraphic units, ammonite zones, and transgressive-regressive cycles after [Comas-Rengifo et al. \(1996\)](#). (For interpretation of the references to colour in this figure legend, the reader is referred to the web version of this article.)

Fig. 7. Non-metric multidimensional scaling (nMDS) ordination of quantitative palaeoecological samples. A, Ordination of the dataset from Castrovido. B, Ordination of the dataset from Sierra Palomera. C, Ordination of the total dataset, which includes samples from both Castrovido and Sierra Palomera. In A, B, and C, samples are labelled according to the Subzone (legend in A); polygons group samples from the same ammonite zone. Grey area groups samples dominated by *Soaresirynchia bouchardi*. D, Ordination of the total dataset where samples are labelled according to the biofacies identified by the cluster analysis (Fig. 8, Table 1). Abbreviations: B1, *Gryphaea* cf. *sublobata* - *Plicatula spinosa* biofacies; B2, *Lobothyris* cf. *subpunctata* - *Pleuromya alduini* biofacies; B3, *Pseudopecten aequivalvis* - *L. arcta*; B4, *S. bouchardi* biofacies; B5, *Parvamussium pumilum* - *Homoeorhynchia batalleri* biofacies; B6, *Telothyris jauberti* - *T. pirenaica* biofacies; B7, *T. pirenaica* - *H. meridionalis* biofacies.

Table 1

Species composition of Pliensbachian-early Toarcian biofacies obtained with the cluster analysis on the total dataset (Fig. 8). Motility, tiering and feeding categories are shown for each species. Only species over 3% abundance are included. Abbreviations: FAC MOB: facultatively mobile; ST, stationary; EPI: epifaunal; D-INF: deep infaunal; INF: infaunal; SF: suspension feeder; GR: grazer; DF: deposit feeder; CARN: carnivore.

	%	Motility	Tiering	Feeding
B1				
<i>Gryphaea</i> cf. <i>sublobata</i>	36.8	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Plicatula spinosa</i>	15.0	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pseudopecten dentatus</i>	10.7	FAC MOB	EPI	SF
<i>Quadratrhyndia attenuata</i>	7.7	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Lobothyris arcta</i>	4.7	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Lobothyris</i> cf. <i>subpunctata</i>	4.3	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Plagiotoma subpunctatum</i>	3.4	ST	EPI	SF
B2				
<i>Lobothyris</i> cf. <i>subpunctata</i>	34.1	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pleuromya alduini</i>	24.4	FAC MOB	D-INF	SF
<i>Gryphaea</i> cf. <i>sublobata</i>	8.1	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Zeilleria culeiformis</i>	5.7	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pholadomya ambigua</i>	4.9	FAC MOB	D-INF	SF
<i>Pseudopecten aequivalvis</i>	4.9	FAC MOB	EPI	SF
Ostreidae indet. 2	3.3	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Plagiotoma subpunctatum</i>	3.3	ST	EPI	SF
B3				
<i>Pseudopecten aequivalvis</i>	24.4	FAC MOB	EPI	SF
<i>Lobothyris arcta</i>	8.2	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Gryphaea</i> cf. <i>sublobata</i>	7.1	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Lobothyris</i> cf. <i>subpunctata</i>	6.8	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Liospiriferina falloti</i>	6.6	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Plicatula spinosa</i>	6.3	ST	EPI	SF
Lobothyridae indet. 2	5.5	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pleuromya alduini</i>	4.9	FAC MOB	D-INF	SF
<i>Aulacothyris iberica</i>	4.1	ST	EPI	SF
Ostreidae indet. 2	3.6	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Mactromya</i> sp.2	3.3	FAC MOB	INF	SF
B4				
<i>Soarestrhyndia bouchardi</i>	67.9	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Parvamusstum pumilum</i>	14.6	FAC MOB	EPI	CARN
<i>Plicatula auricula</i>	9.4	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Gryphaea crickleyensis</i>	3.8	ST	EPI	SF
B5				
<i>Parvamusstum pumilum</i>	20.0	FAC MOB	EPI	CARN
<i>Homoeorhynchia batalleri</i>	11.1	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Telothyris ptrenatica</i>	10.0	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Entolium corneolum</i>	7.9	FAC MOB	EPI	SF
<i>Chlamys textoria</i>	7.4	FAC MOB	EPI	SF
Ostreidae indet. 2	5.8	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pseudolimea</i> sp.	5.3	ST	EPI	SF
<i>Pseudopecten aequivalvis</i>	4.2	FAC MOB	EPI	SF

Table 2
 Spearman's rank correlations between geochemical (TOC, $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{brac}}$, $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$) and palaeoecological (Richness, Evenness, nMDS1) variables. In brackets, the number of observations (n) for each correlation. For each section, palaeoecological variables are measured for the total dataset, and for the bivalve and brachiopod dataset alone. In bold, correlations with $p < 0.05$.

	Castrovido			Sierra Palomera		
	TOC	$\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{brac}}$	$\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$	TOC	$\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{brac}}$	$\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{brac}}$
S	-0.25 (n = 22)	0.31 (n = 13)	0.13 (n = 13)	-0.41** (n = 43)	0.23 (n = 12)	0.44 (n = 12)
S bivalves	-0.37 (n = 22)	0.19 (n = 13)	0.17 (n = 13)	-0.50*** (n = 42)	0.41 (n = 12)	0.36 (n = 12)
S brachiopods	-0.043 (n = 21)	0.43 (n = 13)	0.37 (n = 13)	-0.16 (n = 34)	0.01 (n = 12)	0.17 (n = 12)
Evenness	-0.12 (n = 22)	0.16 (n = 13)	0.18 (n = 13)	-0.33* (n = 43)	0.08 (n = 12)	0.36 (n = 12)
Evenness bivalves	-0.23 (n = 22)	0.019 (n = 13)	0.18 (n = 13)	-0.45** (n = 42)	0.29 (n = 12)	0.21 (n = 12)
Evenness brachiopods	-0.04 (n = 21)	0.42 (n = 13)	0.37 (n = 13)	-0.21 (n = 34)	-0.02 (n = 12)	0.07 (n = 12)
nMDS1	-0.4 (n = 20)	-0.48 (n = 13)	-0.62* (n = 13)	0.31 (n = 23)	-0.57 (n = 7)	-0.14 (n = 7)
nMDS1 bivalves	0.17 (n = 19)	-0.52 (n = 13)	-0.61* (n = 13)	0.24 (n = 21)	-0.54 (n = 6)	0.08 (n = 6)
nMDS1 brachiopods	0.24 (n = 11)	-0.092 (n = 9)	0.14 (n = 9)	-0.31 (n = 12)	0.1 (n = 5)	-0.5 (n = 5)

significance: $p < 0.05$: *, $p < 0.01$: **, $p < 0.001$: ***.

968

969

970